

**International Conference on  
Changing Contours of Women's Paid  
and Unpaid Work  
jointly organised by  
School of Management and Labour Studies &  
School of Development Studies,  
Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Deonar, Mumbai**



**In partnership with**



# **International Conference on Changing Contours of Women's Paid and Unpaid Work**

## **BOOK OF ABSTRACTS**

**Jointly organised by**

**School of Management and Labour Studies &**

**School of Development Studies,**

**Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Deonar, Mumbai**

**In Partnership with**

**ActionAid Association (AAA), Citizens' Rights Collective (CiRiC),  
European Commission (EC), Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES),  
UNI-APRO, International Centre For Development and Decent Work  
(ICDD), German Academic Exchange (DAAD), Federal Ministry For  
Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), Excellent Centre For  
Exchange And Development (EXCEED), Bharat Petroleum, Indian Oil  
Corporation of India**



**Patron**

Prof Shalini Bharat

**Deans**

Prof Sasmita Palo School of Management and Labour Studies-

Prof Ritambhara Hebbar -School of Development Studies-

Prof Vibhuti Patel- **Convener**

Dr. Nandita Mondal- **Co-Convener**

Ms. Ayatakshee Sarkar- **Program Coordinator**

**Organizing Committee**

**School of Management and  
Labour Studies**

Prof. Sasmita Palo (Dean)

Prof. Bino Paul

Dr. Sharad T. Sawant

Prof. Samapti Guha

Dr. Sarala Rao

Dr. Varsha Ayyar

Dr. Unmesh Patnaik

Dr. Nandita Mondal

Dr Aman Jageshwar Borkar

Dr. Johnson Minz

Zafar Khan Pathan

**Prof. Christoph Scherrer**

Executive Director

International Centre for Development  
and Decent Work

University of Kassel, Germany

**School of Development Studies**

Prof Ritambhara Hebbar (Dean)

Prof Vibhuti N. Patel

Prof Nishi Mitra

Prof R. Ramakumar

Prof. Meena Gopal

Dr. Sandya Iyer

Dr Bindhulakshmi P

Dr Aardra Surendran

Dr Gopinath P

Dr. Sujatha Deverapalli

Dr. Sujata Chavan

Dr. Asha Achutan

Ms. Sangita Thosar

Ms. Sashikala Mudgal

Ms. Laxmi Banjan

Mr. Vishal Kamble

*Editorial Assistants for Book of Abstracts:*

**Ayatakshee Sarkar, Anantika Mehra, Aastha Kumar, Utpal Gore**

*Administrative Support :* **Manali Patil,**

*Book of Abstracts (design):* **Mr Vishal Kamble**



## Contents

<b>Foreword</b>	i
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	iii
<b>Introduction</b>	v
<b>Schedule</b>	xv

## List of Paper Contributors

<b>No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Author</b>	<b>Page no.</b>
1.	Outsourcing Maternity? Women, Labour, and Surrogacy	Aishwarya Chandran	1
2.	The Contribution of Women in the Development of Railway in British India: A Historical Feminist Analysis (1853 A.D. - 1947 A.D.)	Akhil Kumar Gupta	7
3.	Existential Struggles of Women Engaged in Informal Sectors –An Appraisal from the Perspectives of Gender Inequality Prevailing in Kolkata	Alolika Mangal	8
4.	Women’s Working World: A Mirror to their World	Amita Sahaya	11
5.	Civil Society Responses to Livelihood Deficits of Women Smallholder Farmers in Ghana	Angela D. Akorsu	17
6.	Women’s Struggle in Trade Unions In Banking Industry in India	Ms. Anjali Bedekar,	21
7.	Nature and Forms of Discrimination Experienced by Dalit Women in Urban Labour Market in Delhi	Anuradha Banerjee	26
8.	The Curious Case of Returning Mothers: A Phenomenological Enquiry into the Lived Experiences of Working New Mothers	AparnaVarma& Rahul Sivarajan,	34
9.	Role of Transport Infrastructure on Female Work Participation and Shifting from Agricultural to Non-Agricultural Sector	Apoorva Shukla & Dr. Reshmi R. S.	40

No.	Title	Author	Page no.
10.	Ignorance of Women's Role in Pastoral Economy: Condition of Pastoral Women in Maharashtra	Arati Kade	48
11.	Women in Mining	Asanda Benya,	49
12.	An Empirical Investigation on the Role of Gender Influencing Nonviolence (NV) Behaviour at the Workplace	Ayatakshee Sarkar & Prof. Sasmita Palo	50
13.	Marginalization of Women in Agriculture and Allied Activities: A study on Santhal Women in Santhal Pargana, Jharkhand	Binay Tudu & Mr. Binit Lakra	54
14.	Century Long Women's Movement in Nepal	Binda Pandey	58
15.	Domestic Workers in the Informal Sector: A Case Study of Delhi (NCR)	B. Srinivasu & Manvi Aggarwal	60
16.	Women and Trade Union	Ceena Paul	61
17.	Exploring Livelihood & Support Strategies for Unpaid Care Work by Indian Women	Ms. Celin Thomas	68
18.	Self-Confidence of Professional Women and Their Business-Bloom	Dr. Chayanika Singh	72
19.	Women in the Bahrain Financial Sector: Opportunities, Challenges and Strategic Choices	Dr. Chitra Sinha	77
20.	The Current Reorganisation of Social Reproduction, Care Extractivism and Care Struggles: A Topical Perspective from Europe	Christa Wichterich	79
21.	Policy Communities' Gender Knowledge on Women in Agriculture	Christoph Scherrer	84
22.	Gender, Migration and Work: Lived experience of women migrant as home based worker in informal economy of Mumbai	Debanita Biswas	86
23.	Women in Global Production System : Conditions of Farm Labour in Tea Plantation	Debdulal Saha	91
24.	Social Framework Analyses of Organizational Role Stress among Working Women in India	Dr. Deepmala Baghel	92

<b>No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Author</b>	<b>Page no.</b>
25.	Professionalism Gendered!	Diana Thomas	96
26.	Rise In Unpaid Domestic Work Drives The Decline In Labour Force Participation Of Women In India—A Field Study	Dr. Diya Dutta	98
27.	Women in Corporate: as Workers, Staff and Management Cadre	Gaurangi Kaushik	103
28.	Intersectionality and Unpaid Rural Female Labour: A Study from Unit level NSSO Employment Unemployment Data	Ishita Mukhopadhyia & Sanghamitra Bhaduri Kanjilal	108
29.	Married Women in Urban Workforce in India: Insights from NSSO DATA	Jyoti Thakur	112
30.	Women Gender and Livelihood in Post Cocoon Activity: Understanding Patriarchal Construction in Raigarh, Chhatisgarh	Kanchan Thomasina Ekka	120
31.	Women's Paid Work as a Bubble of Empowerment: A Case Study of a Social Enterprise Working with Women Artisans	Kaniska Singh & Asfia Jamal	124
32.	Women in Urban Formal and Informal Labour – A Study of Garment Industry in Bengaluru	Karan Peer	128
33.	Paid and Unpaid Works in the Agriculture Sector by Caste: A Study on a Rural Area in Tamilnadu	Karuppasamy M.	134
34.	Women in the Workforce and Criminal Justice	Kavita Chohan	139
35.	Maternity Protection and Policy Deficiencies: Recent Evidences from India	Lakshmi Lingam & Rahul Suresh Sapkal	141
36.	A Critical Interrogation of The Role Of Self-Help Groups In Securing Livelihoods And The Rehabilitation Of Former Devadasis In Belgaum District Of Karnataka	Lavanya Shanbhogue Arvind	145
37.	HRD Programs And Women Executives: Are The Current HRD Initiatives Right For Women Executives?	Liji James	149
38.	Influence of Organizational Commitment and Subjective Well-Being on Work Engagement of Nurses	Lima Raj & Dr. K. Manikandan	152



No.	Title	Author	Page no.
39.	From Zari Work To Zero Work- Unraveling The Crisis Of The Invisible Crafts Women Of The Zari Hub Of Bauria Area Of West Bengal	Malinee Mukherjee	153
40.	Young Women Workers in Textile and Garment Sectors - A Global Concern	Prof. N.Manimekalai	160
41.	Unorganized Women Workers and Cooperative Movement	Dr. Medha Purao Samant	164
42.	The Labour Side of the Story: Informalization and New Forms of Mobilizationof Women Workers	Meera Velayudhan	167
43.	Collective Action and theory of Change A Case Study of Two Largest Women Producers Collectives of India	Dr. Mushtaq Ahmad Malla	178
44.	Does Gender Equality Invigorate the Growth and Development in India? :Evidence from Worldwide Studies	Dr. Neha Tomar & Dr. Seema Singh	179
45.	Childcare and Employment Experiences of Young Mothers in Public and Private Sectors: Case Studies from New Delhi	Neha Wadhwa	183
46.	Women and Forest: Understanding the Changing Gender Relation among the Kondhs in Odisha	Nikita Mishra	188
47.	Invisible Cottage Industries in North East India: Brewing Rice Beer as a Source of Livelihood among Women in Urban Informal Labour	Padmini Sharma	193
48.	Economic Empowerment of Women and the Criminal Justice Delivery System in India	Dr. Paramita Majumdar	197
49.	Gaay Leke Jane Vali Auratein – Begging or Caste-Based Urban Occupations?	Pournima Arvel	199
50.	Paid and Unpaid Work of Dalit Women in Mumbai and Pune	Pratibha Kamble	200
51.	Securing Women Workers' Rights at Workplace	Pravin Sinha	203
52.	Women, Work and Empowerment: A Case Study of the IT Sector	Priyanka Dwivedi	205

No.	Title	Author	Page no.
53.	Breaking Boundaries- Women In The Non-Traditional Sector	Radhika Uppal & Amrita Gupta	209
54.	The Travails Of Doing Business On The Streets Of Aizawl: A Gendered Perspective	Rama Ramaswamy	213
55.	Socio-Economic Exclusion and Discrimination Of Women In Domestic Work And Sanitation Work (Scavenging)	Ravi A Gajbhiye & Kavita Chohan	215
56.	The Precarity among Women Workforce in Handloom Sector at Sualkuchi, Assam	Reshmi	217
57.	Women In Workplace: Gender Issues	Ms Ruby Ahluwalia	219
58.	Gender Inclusion and Information Technology Industry	Dr. Ruby Ojha	221
59.	Understanding Perceptions and Experiences of Aspiring Teachers: A Comparative study between D.Ed. and B.Ed students	Ms. Rupali Sakpal	228
60.	Work, Domesticity and Domestic Workers: Recent Developments in Kolkata	Samita Sen	229
61.	Workplace Discrimination Against Women in the Formal Sector: Bias in the Quality of Work in the Metropolitan Cities of India	Sampriti Biswas	232
62.	Making Visible the Invisible: Women Artists and Herstory	Saptam Patel	235
63.	Feminization of Low Paid Work – Condition of Grassroots Workers in the Health Sector	Seemi Zafar	239
64.	Exploring Perpetrators’ Motives of Sexual Harassment at Workplace: Seeing and Understanding Things through the Victims’ and Observers’ Lenses	Ms. Selvi Nadar & Prof. Sasmita Palo	242
65.	Social Security Schemes in India for the Informal Sector with Special Reference to the Urban Female Domestic Worker	Shanti Neela	246
66.	A Study of Women’s Lived Experiences of Leadership at the Workplace: A Feminist Study of Organizations	Ms Shashikala Mudgal	251
67.	Nursing and Informalisation: A Study of Medical College and Hospital: Punjab	Sneha Baldeo Makkad	256

<b>No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Author</b>	<b>Page no.</b>
68.	Female Labour Force Participation & Enterprise Development: Role of Self Help Promoting Institutions (SHPIs)	Dr. Sunita Jadhav	260
69.	Employer branding with a focus on Employees' Retention	Dr. Sunita Kaistha	261
70.	Visible and Invisible Labour: An Ethnographic Study of Women in Traditional Entertainers Community	Dr. Surbhi Dayal	266
71.	Are Women-Run Dairy Co-Operatives A Success or Failure in A Rural Scenario?	Swaathylakshmi M P, Paul Jebaraj, Prashanth H R, Shantidani Minz MD, Carol Devamani, Bhavya Balasubramanya	267
72.	Gender Equality in German Higher Education Analyses and strategies to increase women's participation	Dr. Sylke Ernst	272
73.	Identities and Negotiations between Women Householders and Domestic Workers: A Case Study of Select Areas of Aligarh	Dr. Tauseef Fatima	278
74.	Women in Agriculture and Allied activities	Vaibhav Bansal	282
75.	Paid and Unpaid Work of Women in Home Based Job Work in Mumbai	Dr Vaijayanta Anand	283
76.	Role of Women in Livestock Economy	Vijayamba R	287
77.	In Pursuit of a Brighter Tomorrow: Women's negotiations to work in a resettlement colony of Delhi	Yogita Naruka	290

## Foreword

We are happy to present before you this Book of Abstracts that captures wide range of concerns with regards to changing Contours of paid and unpaid work of women of the world due changing macro economics reality, cultural milieu, economic globalization, policy mix operationalised by the nation states in consultation with the international agencies, collective voice of working women, gender-sensitive and gender responsive perspectives legitimised by feminist economists, sociologists, anthropologists, ethnographers, legal practitioners and the most crucial- the activists of women's rights movement and trade unions working with the communities of women in the different sectors of the economy and society.

At the end of collective efforts of our team and paper presenters, we have achieved this treasure of research papers that will contribute towards evidence based policy recommendations and road map to ensure gender equality in the all sectors of the economy as well as in the society.

We express our heart-felt thanks to all our colleagues at TISS, co-travellers in academic world and collaborating partners for making the conference a meaningful endeavour and publication of the Book of Abstracts.

With warm regards,

Yours Sincerely,

**Prof. Vibhuti Patel and Dr. Nandita Mondal**

Convener and Co-convener

5-7-2018



## **Acknowledgements**

We would like to extend heartfelt thanks to our co-travellers in this journey:

Prof. Shalini Bharat, Acting Director for her support and encouragement.

Prof Surinder Jaswal has enriched our endeavour by bringing in entire panel regarding women and health.

Dr. Mohan Kumar (Registrar), Ms. Indira Pashupati (Finance Officer), Ms. Smita Patil (Computer section), Mr. Parag (Transport), Mr. Mahendra Singh for facilitating the administrative tasks. Ms. Nirmala Momin (Section Officer) for accommodation.

To our partners- ActionAid Association (AAA), Citizens' Rights Collective (CiRiC), European Commission (EC), Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung (FES), UNI-APRO, International Centre For Development and Decent Work (ICDD), German Academic Exchange (DAAD), Federal Ministry For Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), Excellent Centre For Exchange And Development (EXCEED), Bharat Petroleum, Indian Oil Corporation of India.

Prof. Sasmita Palo and Prof. Ritambhara Hebbar for the school level support.

Prof Christoph Scherrer, Prof. Bino Paul, Prof R Ramakumar, Prof. Nishi Mitra, Dr. Sandhya Iyer and Prof. Meena Gopal for solidarity and moral boost. Prof. Christoph Scherrer, Executive Director, ICDD and Birgit Felmeden, Executive Manager, ICDD who gave us generous help for International travel of our guests.

Ms. Shashikala Mudgal for extending help in fund raising and bringing in speaker for panel.

Prof S Siva Raju, Deputy Director, TISS Hyderabad, in spreading the call for papers at TISS Hyderabad campus.

Faculty and administrative staff of School of Management and Labour Studies and School of Development Studies.

Prof. Madhushree Sekher and Jennifer Mujawar (TISS International Relations Office) have helped us immensely in different parameters for the success of the conference.

Hemantika Basu, TISS ICDD PhD scholar, under whose assistance the call for papers were spread across north-eastern region of India.

Executive Committee members of Indian Association of Women's Studies for their participation.

Mr. Karunakar Shetty and Mr. Litesh Ghonge for seamless catering services rendered to all the guests.

Gupta travels for arranging air tickets for the partner delegates and guests.

To the research scholars and paper presenters for submitting the papers for the abstract proceedings.

We are also thankful to Homibhabha Science Center, Nuclear Power Corporation India Limited, and International Institute of Population Sciences for arranging stay of our guests.

**Prof. Vibhuti Patel and Dr. Nandita Mondal**

## **Introduction**

**Prof. Vibhuti Patel (ACWS, SDS) and Dr. Nandita Mondal (CLS, SMLS)**

**Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai**

February 6, 2018 marked a century of women's suffrage for which the first generation of women's rights activists fought relentlessly making great personal sacrifices in the face of tremendous patriarchal resistance. Though the suffragist movement began with striving for adult franchise for women as a fundamental right as a citizen; it snowballed into struggle for rights of the women as paid and unpaid workers. During the last century, in spite of sustained collective actions in several parts of the North and the South, discrimination against women in the world of work still persists due to caste/race/ethnicity/sexuality/gender based segmentation in the labour market and non-recognition of unpaid care economy.

### **Concept and Analysis of Women's Work- - Paid and Unpaid Work**

Women constitute ½ of the world's population, 2/3 of the world's work force but get 1/10th of the world's income and 1% of the world's wealth".-United Nations

According to International Labour Organisation (ILO), East and South Asia are the only two regions where work participation rate of women has continuously declined over last 2 decades. In most of the developing world, Increasing proportion of women are pushed into care economy and unpaid family labour. Colonisation of women of coloured women for maintaining high level of profits in productive sphere and marginalisation of care economy subsidize the neo-liberal economic globalisation.

### **Valuation of Productive and Unproductive Work**

The Housewife

If the woman's husband is asked

What does his wife do

The answer is

My wife does not work.

Then, Who bears this world in her womb?

Who gives birth to the farmers, the workers?

Who cooks, washes, cleans and fills water?

Looks after the child and the sick?



Whose labour gives men leisure for liquor, tobacco and card session?

Whose labour gives men their strength to go to work?

Who labours without being noticed?

Mutely working, without being paid,

Without being appreciated ever-----

***by Amrita Pritam***

The debate about the economic and social function of housework and its relation to women's oppression is an old one that has been a feature of both the first and second wave the international women's movement during 1970s and 1980s. In both eras, the underlying issue is how to handle the public/private split of capitalist societies in which women's reproductive functions have either limited their work to the home or created a second shift problem of unpaid housework and childcare as well as waged work. In the first wave, located as it was in the Victorian period where the dominant ideology for middle and upper class women was purity, piety and domesticity (also called the cult of true womanhood), the debate centered on whether to keep housework in the private sphere yet make it more scientific and efficient, or whether to socialize it by bringing it into the public sphere, as socialist Charlotte Perkins Gilman advocated (1898).

### **Path Breaking Contribution of Socialist Feminists**

It was socialist feminists who established that the reproduction of labor-power involves a far broader range of activities than the consumption of commodities, as food must be cooked, clothes have to be washed, bodies have to be stroked and made love to. Their recognition of the importance of reproduction and women's domestic labor for capital accumulation led to a rethinking of Marx's categories, and a new understanding of the history and fundamentals of capitalist development and the class struggle. Starting in the early 1970s, a feminist theory took shape that radicalized the theoretical shift which the Third Worldist critiques of Marx had inaugurated, confirming that capitalism is not identifiable with waged, contractual work, that, in essence, it is un-free labor, and revealing the umbilical connection between the devaluation of reproductive work and the devaluation of women's social position (Oakley, 1974).

This paradigm shift also had political consequences. The most immediate was the refusal of the slogans of the Marxist left, such as the ideas of the "general strike" or "refusal of work," both of which were never inclusive of house-workers. Over time, the realization has grown that Marxism, filtered through Leninism and social-democracy, has expressed the interests of a limited sector of the world proletariat, that of white, adult, male workers, largely drawing their power from the fact that they work in the leading sectors of capital industrial production, at the highest levels of technological development (Molyneux, 1979).

On the positive side, the discovery of reproductive work has made it possible to understand that capitalist production relies on the production of a particular type of worker, and therefore a particular type of family, sexuality, procreation, and thus to redefine the private sphere as a sphere of relations of production and a terrain of anti-capitalist struggle. In this context, policies forbidding abortion could be decoded as devices for the regulation of the labor-supply, the collapse of the birth rate and increase in the number of divorces could be read as instances of resistance to the capitalist discipline of work. The personal became political and capital and the state were found to have subsumed our lives and reproduction down to the bedroom (Mackintosh, 1977).

By the mid-1970s women's struggles in economic front included an open repudiation of the sexual division of labor, with all its corollaries: economic dependence on men, social subordination, confinement to an unpaid, naturalized form of labor, a state-controlled sexuality and procreation. Contrary to a widespread misconception, the crisis was not confined to white middle class women. On the contrary, the first women's liberation movement in the US was arguably a movement of Black Women. It was the Welfare Mothers Movement that, inspired by the Civil Rights Movement, led the first campaign for state-funded wages for housework women have fought for in the country, (under the guise of Aid to Dependent Children) asserting the economic value of women's reproductive work, and declaring "welfare" a women's right.

In India Economists Interested in Women's Issues Group established in 1981 and feminist economists have taken lead in deconstructing paid and unpaid nature of women's work (Dewan et al, 2017), linkages of unpaid work with macroeconomy (Hiraway, 2015) and political economy of housework (Jain and Banerjee, 1985), Domestic Work (Sen and Sengupta, 2016) .

Women were on the move also across Africa, Asia, Latin America, as the first United Nations Global Conference on Women held in Mexico City in 1975 demonstrated. The conference and those that followed proved that women's struggles over reproduction were redirecting post-colonial economies towards increased investment in the domestic workforce and were the single most important factor in the failure of the World Bank's development plans for the commercialization of agriculture. In Africa, women had consistently refused being recruited to work on their husbands' cash crops, defending, instead, subsistence oriented agriculture, in this process transforming the village from a site for the reproduction of cheap labor to a site of resistance to exploitation. By the 1980s, this resistance was recognized as the main factor in the crisis of the World Bank's agricultural development projects, prompting a flood of articles on "women's contribution to development."

### **Visible and Invisible Work**

Women's household work is invisible as it is performed inside four walls of their house and their work is not recognized and remunerated. Invisibility of women's household work is the outcome of definition of work in economics that defines work as any type of physical and mental activity

undertaken in anticipation of economic returns. Women's household work remains invisible as it is ignored in estimating national income. National income is defined as the sum total of all production. Production is defined as the creation of utility--form utility, place utility, time utility and service utility. Women are continuously producing one or more of these utilities. Yet, it is not included in the national income. Production by women in the household has use value but not an exchange value as it is not traded in the market. Women's production in the household is ignored as there is no price tag attached to it.

Work done for income, remuneration, honorarium, wages and salary is visible work as it has an exchange value and it also has social recognition as Employment.

### **Economically Productive and Socially Productive Work**

In the second wave movement, theorists can be grouped by their theory of how housework oppresses women. Typically, liberal feminists critique housework because it is unpaid. This makes women dependent on men and devalued since their work is outside the meaningful sphere of public economic production. Marxist feminist theorists see this as part of the problem, but some go further to maintain that housework is part of a household feudal mode of production of goods for use that persists under capitalism and gives men feudal powers over women's work. Other Marxist feminists argue that women's housework is part of the social reproduction of capitalism. That the necessary work of reproducing the working class is unpaid allows more profits to capitalists. It is the sexual division of labour in productive and reproductive work that makes woman unequal to men and allows capitalists to exploit women's unpaid labour. Some even make this analysis the basis for a demand for wages for housework. Federici (1975) has done an analysis of the transition to capitalism in Europe. She argues that it was the emerging capitalist class's need to control working class reproduction, to eliminate working class women's control over biological reproduction, and to assure their unpaid reproductive work in the home by restricting abortions, that fueled the campaign against witches during this period.

One of the philosophical problems raised by the housework debate is how to draw the line between public and private domain.

### **Work Efficiency and Women**

Ideological bias of considering men's activities as productive and women's activity as unproductive help relegate women's work as inefficient. During last three decades, researches on work efficiency have proved that if proper training and skills are imparted to women, women surpass men in efficiency as they concentrate on work, don't take break from work to smoke chit-chat or drink alcohol.

## **Gender Implications of the Public/Private Split**

Liberal, Marxist and radical feminists have all characterized women as doubly alienated in capitalism because of the public/private split that relegates their work as mothers and house workers to the home, and psychologically denies them full person-hood, citizenship and human rights. Noting that women workers on average only have about 70% of the average salary of men in the contemporary U.S. feminists have claimed this is because women's work, tied stereotypically to housework and hence thought unskilled is undervalued, whether it is cleaning or rote service work, or nurturing work thought to be connected to natural maternal motivations and aptitudes. Hence some feminists have organized campaigns for comparable worth to raise women's wages to the same level as men's wages when comparable skills are involved.

*They say it is love. We say it is unwaged work.*

*They call it frigidity. We call it absenteeism.*

*Every miscarriage is a work accident.*

*Homosexuality and heterosexuality are both working conditions...but homosexuality is workers' control of production, not the end of work.*

*More smiles? More money. Nothing will be so powerful in destroying the healing virtues of a smile.*

*Neuroses, suicides, desexualization: occupational diseases of the housewife.*

**Silvia Federici, Power of Women Collective and Falling Wall Press, U.K. 1975**

Many radical feminists maintain that women's work is part of a separate patriarchal mode of reproduction that underlies all economic systems of production. According to them, men exploit women's reproductive labour pioneered in combining this radical feminist assumption with a perspective of Marxist theory of knowledge. It argues that one's relation to the work of production and reproduction gave each gender and each social class a different way of knowing the social totality. Women's work, they argued, ties them to nature and human needs in a different way than men's work does, which creates the possibility of a less alienated and more comprehensive understanding of the workings of the social totality. Collins argues further that the racial division of labour, institutional racism and different family structures put African-American women in yet a different epistemic relation to society than white and other women. Writing in a post-modernist re-articulation of this feminist standpoint theory, Donna Haraway argues that the breakdown of the nature/culture distinction because of scientific technology and its alteration of the human body make us into cyborgs. Hence, our perspectives are so intersectional that they cannot be unified simply by a common relation to work. What is required for a feminist politics is not a situated identity politics, whether of gender and/or race and/or class, but an affinity politics based on alliances and coalitions that combine epistemic perspectives.

Like these radical feminists, some socialist-feminists have tried to develop a dual systems theory. This involves theorizing a separate system of work relations that organizes and directs human sexuality, nurturance, affection and biological reproduction. However, rather than seeing this as an unchanging universal base for patriarchy, they have argued that this system (thought of as the sex/gender system, or as sex/affective production) has different historical modes, just as Marx argued that economies do. Rubin argues that sex/gender systems have been based in different kinship arrangements, most of which have supported the exchange of women by men in marriage, and hence have supported male domination and compulsory heterosexuality. She is hopeful that since capitalism shifted the organization of the economy from kinship to commodity production, the power of fathers and husbands over daughters and wives, and the ability to enforce heterosexuality, will continue to decline, and women's increasing ability to be economically independent will lead to women's liberation and equality with men.

### **Modernist vs. Postmodernist Feminist Theory**

Useful anthologies of the first stage of second wave socialist feminist writings which include discussions of women, class and work from psychological as well as sociological and economic perspectives are Eisenstein (1979), Hansen and Philipson (1990), Hennessy and Ingraham (1997), and Holmstrom (2002). Jaggar (1983) wrote perhaps the first philosophical text explaining the categories of liberal, radical, Marxist and socialist-feminist thought and defending a socialist-feminist theory of male domination based on the notion of women's alienated labour. Others such as Jaggar and Rothenberg (1978), Tuana and Tong (1995) and Herrmann and Stewart (1994) include classic socialist feminist analyses in their collections, inviting comparisons of the authors to others grouped under the categories of liberal, radical, psychoanalytic, Marxist, postmodern, post-colonial and multicultural feminisms.

Various post-modern critiques of these earlier feminist schools of thought such as post-colonialism as well as deconstruction and post-structuralism challenge the over-generalizations and economic reductionism of many of those constructing feminist theories that fall under the early categories of liberal, radical, Marxist or socialist feminism. Others argue that part of the problem is the master narratives of liberalism or Marxism, the first of which sees all domination relations due to traditional hierarchies and undermined by capitalism, thus ignoring the independent effectivity of racism; and the second of which ties all domination relations to the structure of contemporary capitalism and ignores the non-capitalist economics contexts in which many women work, even within so-called capitalist economies, such as housework and voluntary community work.

In spite of the *pomo* critiques, there are some powerful thinkers within this tendency who have not completely rejected a more general starting point of analysis based on women, class and work. For example, Spivak (1988), Mohanty (2003), Carby (1997) and Hennessy (2003) are creating and re-articulating forms of Marxist and socialist-feminism less susceptible to charges of over-

generalization and reductionism, and more compatible with close contextual analysis of the power relations of gender and class as they relate to work. They can be grouped loosely with a tendency called materialist feminism that incorporates some of the methods of deconstruction and post-structuralism.

### **Race, Class and Intersectional Feminist Analyses**

Many in the contemporary feminist theory debate are interested in developing concrete intersectional or integrative feminist analyses of particular issues which try to give equal weight to gender, race, class and sexuality in a global context without defining themselves by the categories, such as liberal, radical or materialist, of the earlier feminist debate categories. Nonetheless, strong emphasis on issues of race and ethnicity can be found in their work on women, class and work. For example, Brewer shows that white and African-American working class women are divided by race in the workforce, and that even changes in the occupational structure historically tend to maintain this racial division of labour. Hooks argues that women of colour and some radical feminists were more sensitive to class and race issues than those, primarily white, feminists whom she labels reformist feminists.

Sylvia Walby (1990) deals with this ambiguity of economic class as applying to women as unpaid house workers by claiming against Delphy (1984) that the relevant economic sex classes are those who are housewives vs. those who are husbands benefiting from such work, not those of all women and men, whether or not they do or receive housework services. Ferguson, however, sides with Delphy (1984) in putting all women into sex class, since all women, trained into the gender roles of patriarchal wife and motherhood, are potentially those whose unpaid housework can be so exploited. Such an identity is usually formed through political organizing and coalitions with other women at her place of employment, in her home and her community. In this sense the concept of sex class is exactly analogous to the concept of a feminist epistemological standpoint: not a given identity or perspective, but one that is achievable under the right conditions.

### **Contemporary Concern**

Overarching concerns with respect to work force participation of women in the 21st century have been changing labour processes, labour/employment relations and labour standards in different sector of the economy. Only minuscule proportion of women in the world economy is in the organised sector with relatively better standards of social security and social protection. The rest face back-breaking, long hours of dead-end work without any chances of upward social and economic mobility, mostly in the precarious working situation. There is south in the North and north in the South. Thus it is not only in Africa, Latin America and Asia, that women workers face inhuman work condition and below subsistence wages, but non-white women in the workforce in the industrialized world also face the same predicament as footloose pricariates in

the informal economy. The world capitalism has found coloured women as “the last colony” for capitalist accumulation. In the poverty groups, self-employed women end up self-exploiting as the returns for their hard work are deplorably low.

Even in sunrise industries such as information technology- business process outsourcing, knowledge process outsourcing, medical transcription and transliteration women are in lowest rung of hierarchy without any chances of promotion. Couple of women as CEOs of financial sector or fortune 500 companies, are showcased as symbols of empowerment of women but large majority of professionally qualified women are stuck as middle to lower level cadre in the corporate sector. Presence of women in the board rooms across the Industries worldwide is negligible. Apparently, they are better placed, but are not getting level playing field due to patriarchal biases.

Segmentation factor market and product market does not allow self-employed women and women entrepreneurs’ to upscale their ventures. Masculinity of capital is inclined towards investing resources among 'old boys club' that also operates on caste, religion and ethnic identities. In spite of such adversities, networks such as Women Working Worldwide, Homenet, Committee of Asian Women, rural and urban working class women’s united front such as Gabriela in the Philippines, Greenbelt movement of women farmers in Africa, Domestic Workers Unions in several countries, women's cooperatives such as Annapurna Mahila Mandal and women's trade union such as Self Employed Women's Association, Women's Bank such as Mandesh Mahila Sahakari Bank in India have served as role models for individual women and women's collectives to challenge the status quo. Experiments have been made with WID, WAD and GAD perspectives. How to survive in the neo-liberal, neo-conservative economic eco-system has been a mind boggling issue confronting labour economists, trade union activists, development thinkers, gender studies scholars and International Labour Organisation of the UN .

With this perspective, The School of Management and Labour Studies and School of Development Studies of Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Deonar, Mumbai hosted International Conference during July 12-13, 2018.

The objectives of this conference are:

- to deliberate upon the issues and experiences of women across organised and unorganised sector to excavate the contour that women are struggling to create as their own in the contemporary world.
- to identify the varied forms of strategies and tactics evolved by women to meet the challenges thrown up by neoliberal ecosystem.
- to critically evaluate various theories of labour studies to search for a gender responsive answers.

**The thematic areas covered by papers submitted by researchers and practitioners encompass women's work in the following sectors:**

1. Women in Corporate: as Workers, Staff and Management cadre
2. Women in Profession
3. Women in Urban formal and informal labour
4. Women in Agriculture and Allied Activities
5. Women and Public Sector Undertaking
6. Women in Education
7. Women in Service Sector: Conventional and Modern (Hospitality, Transport and care economy)
  - a. Women's Cooperatives
8. Women in Sunrise Industries
9. Women in Financial Sector
10. Women in Administration and Governance
11. Women's Work and the State

Women all around the world have been doing paid, underpaid and largely unpaid work in homes, factories, fields, forests and mines. Over and above the 3 Cs-cooking, cleaning and caring, a large number of women do activities such as collection of fuel, fodder and water, animal husbandry, kitchen gardening, raising poultry that augment family resources. If women would not do this work, these goods would have to be purchased from the market.

Continuous non-recognition of contribution of women in paid and unpaid work create a deep wound and results in low self-esteem among women who start believing in 'nothingness' of her existence even if her 'labour', her professional contribution matters in progression of family, community and state. Here, it is important to note that, Labour is not merely a form of instrumental action, it is essentially a mode of social interaction in which she seeks and deserves mutual recognition.

The collection of abstracts received for the **International Conference on Changing Contours of Women's Paid and Unpaid Work** are depicting the epitome of evidences across world where time and again the voices are raised to ask for the dignity of labour of women to uphold, to recognize that “women hold half of the sky” in this globalised era.

Based on an interdisciplinary perspective, we hope that this volume would bring forth the debate before the august audience and enrich the discussion.

## **References**



- Charlotte Perkins Gilman (1898) *Women and Economics*, Boston: Small, Maynard & Co.,
- Chodorow, Nancy (1979) *The Reproduction of Mothering: Psychoanalysis and the Sociology of Gender*, USA: University of California Press.
- Delphy, Christine (1984) *Patriarchy, domestic Mode of Production, Gender, and Class*. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.
- Dewan, Ritu, Indira Rani, Ravi SK, Radha Sehgal, Aruna Kanchi, Swati Raju (2017) *Invisible Work Invisible Workers The Sub-Economies of Unpaid Work and Paid Work Action Research on Women's Unpaid Labour*, Delhi: Actionaid
- Donna Haraway (1991) *Simians, Cyborgs, And Women. The Reinvention Of Nature*, USA: Columbia University Press.
- Eisenstein, Zillah (1979) *Capitalist Patriarchy and Case for Socialist Feminism*, UK: Monthly Review Press.
- Federici Silvia (1975) *Wages Against Housework*, Power of Women Collective and Falling Wall Press.
- Ferguson , Ann and Folbre, Nancy (1981) “The Unhappy Marriage of Capitalism and Patriarchy”, in Sergent, Lydia (ed.) (1981) *Women and Revolution*, Boston: South End Press.
- Hirway, Indira (2015) “Unpaid Work and the Economy: Linkages and Their Implications”, Levy Economics Institute, Working Paper No. 838
- Jain, Devaki and Banerjee Nirmala (1985) *Tyranny of the household: investigative essays on women's work*, Delhi:Vikas Publishing House
- Mackintosh, Maureen (1977) “Reproduction and Patriarchy: A Critique of Claude Meillassoux, *Femmes, Greniers Et Capitaux*”, UK: Capital & Class, June.
- Molyneux, Maxine (1979) “Beyond the Domestic Labour Debate, UK: New Left Review, 1/116, July-August.
- Oakley, Ann (2018) *Sociology of Housework*, U.K.: Policy Press
- Patricia Hill Collins (2010) “Work, Family and Black Women’s Oppression”, in *Black Feminist Thoughts: knowledge, consciousness and Politics of Empowerment*, UK: Routledge
- Sen, Samita and Nilanjana Sengupta (2016) *Domestic Days Women, Work, and Politics in Contemporary Kolkata*, Delhi: OUP
  - Sylvia Walby (1986) *Patriarchy at Work : Patriarchal and Capitalist Relations in Employment, 1800-1984 (Feminist Perspective)*. UK : Polity Press.

# **International Conference on Changing Contours of Women's Paid and Unpaid Work**

**Dates: 12-13 July, 2018**

**School of Management and Labour Studies & School of Development Studies**

**In partnership with**

**ActionAid Association (AAA), Citizens' Rights Collective (CiRiC), European Commission (EC), Friedrich Ebert Stiftung(FES), UNI-APRO, International Centre For Development and Decent Work(ICDD), German Academic Exchange(DAAD), Federal Ministry For Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), Excellent Centre For Exchange And Development (EXCEED), Bharat Petroleum, Indian Oil Corporation of India**

**Registration starts from 8.30 am – 9.00 a.m.**

<b>PROGRAMME SCHEDULE DAY 1</b>	
<b>DATE : 12-07-2018</b>	
<b>VENUE : Library conference hall</b>	
<b>Inaugural Session : 9.00 am- 9.45 am</b>	
<b>Prof. Shalini Bharat</b> Dr. Nandita Mondal Prof. Vibhuti Patel Prof. Sasmita Palo Prof. Ritambhara Hebbar Prof. Bino Paul, Prof. Christoph Scherrer, Prof. R. Ramakumar, Prof. Chhaya Datar Prof. Shalini Bharat Ms. Ayatakshee Sarkar	<b>Chairperson for Inaugural Session</b> Welcome Address Over view About School of Management and Labour Studies About School of Development Studies Release of Book of Abstracts  Presidential Address Vote of Thanks
<b>Plenary Session : 9 45 a.m. - 11.00 a.m.</b>	
<b>Panel 1</b>  <b>Chairperson</b> Prof. Ritu Dewan	<b>Macroeconomic Perspectives on Paid and Unpaid Work of Women</b>  <b>Dr. Uma Chakravarty</b> Macroeconomic Policies and Sub-economies of Paid and Unpaid Work.

Prof. Christoph Scherrer	Policy Communities Gender Knowledge on Women in Agriculture.
Dr. Meera Velayudhan	The labour side of the story: Informalization and New Forms of Mobilization of Women Workers.
Dr. Indira Hirway	Discourse on Measurement of Paid and Unpaid Work of Women.
<b>Tea break : 11.00 a.m. – 11.15 a.m.</b>	
<b>Plenary Session : 11.15 a.m. -12.15 pm</b>	
<b>Panel 2</b> <b>Chairperson</b> Dr. Pravin Sinha Prof.N. Manimekalai Dr. Sylke Ernst Dr. Vaijayanta Anand	<b>Globalization, Culture and Labour</b> <b>Prof. Lakshmi Lingam</b> Securing Women Workers Rights at Workplace. Young Women Workers in Textile and Garment Sectors - A : Global Concern. Gender equality in German higher education: Analyses and Strategies to Increase Women's Participation. Women in Home-Based Job Work
<b>Plenary Session : 12. 15 p.m. - 1.30 p.m.</b>	
<b>Panel 3</b> <b>Chairperson</b> Prof. Ishita Mukhopadhyay Prof. Samita Sen Prof. Anuradha Banerjee Dr. Chitra Sinha	<b>Paid and Unpaid Work of Urban and Rural Women</b> <b>Prof. Madhura Swaminathan</b> Intersectionality and Unpaid Rural Female Labour: A Study from Unit Level NSSO Employment Unemployment Data Work, Domesticity and Domestic Workers: Recent Developments in Kolkata Nature and forms of discrimination experienced by Dalit women in urban Labour market in Delhi Women in the Bahrain Financial Sector: Opportunities, Challenges and Strategic choices
<b>Lunch Break: 1.30 p.m. - 2.30 p.m.</b>	
<b>Parallel Sessions on Women in Formal Sector</b>	
<b>Parallel Session A    Venue: Library conference hall</b>	
<b>Time    2.30 p.m. – 5.30 p.m.</b>	
<b>Tea Break: 4.00 pm – 4.15 pm</b>	
<b>Chairperson:</b>	<b>Prof Manisha Desai</b>
<b>Discussant:</b>	<b>Dr. Sharad T. Sawant, Dr. Sarala Rao</b>

Kavita Chohan	Women in the Workforce and Criminal Justice
Aparna Varma & Rahul Sivarajan	A Phenomenological Enquiry into the Lived Experiences of Working New Mothers.
Dr. Chayanika Singh	Self-Confidence of Professional Women and their Business-bloom.
Deepmala Baghel	Social Framework Analyses of Organizational Role Stress among Working Women in India.
Diana Thomas	Professionalism Gendered!
Sampriti Biswas	Workplace discrimination against women in the formal sector: Bias in the quality of work in the metropolitan cities of India.
Liji James	HRD programs and Women Executives: Are the current HRD initiatives right for women executives?
Ayatakshee Sarkar	An empirical investigation on the role of gender influencing NV (NV) behaviour at the workplace.
Shashikala Mudgal	A study of Women's lived experiences of leadership at the workplace: A feminist study of organisations
<b>Parallel Session B    Venue: Old conference hall</b> <b>Time    2.30 p.m – 5.30 p.m.</b>	
<b>Tea Break: 4.00 p.m. – 4.15 p.m.</b>	
<b>Chairperson:</b> <b>Discussant:</b> Manasi Vahia Dr. Neha Tomar & Dr. Seema Singh  Rupali Sakpal  Priyanka Dwivedi  Gaurangi Kaushik  Akhil Kumar Gupta  Lima Raj	<b>Dr. Gopinath</b> <b>Dr. Johnson Minz; Dr. Sujatha Devarapalli</b> Women in Masculine Jobs. Does Gender Equality Invigorate the Growth and Development in India? Evidence from Worldwide Studies Understanding Perceptions and Experiences of Aspiring Teachers: A Comparative study between D.Ed. and B.Ed students Women, Work and Empowerment: A Case Study of the IT Sector Women in Corporate: as Workers, Staff and Management cadre The Contribution of Women in the Development of Railway in British India: A Historical Feminist Analysis (1853 A.D. - 1947 A.D.) Influence of Organizational Commitment and Subjective Wellbeing on Work Engagement of Nurses.
<b>Parrallel Sessions of Women on Informal Sector</b>	

<p align="center"><b>Parallel Session C Venue: Social Work Committee room</b></p> <p align="center"><b>Time 2.30 p.m. – 5.30 p.m.</b></p>	
<p align="center"><b>Tea Break: 4.00 p.m. – 4.15 p.m.</b></p>	
<p><b>Chairperson:</b></p> <p><b>Discussant:</b></p> <p>Ms. Aishwarya Chandran</p> <p>Ms. Alolika Mangal</p> <p>Ms. Arati Kade</p> <p>Celin Thomas</p> <p>Debanita Biswas</p> <p>Saptam Patel</p> <p>Pratibha Kamble</p> <p>Dr. Sandhya Limaye</p>	<p><b>Dr. Sujata Chavan</b></p> <p><b>Dr. Bindhulakshmi P. &amp; Vaijayanta</b></p> <p>Outsourcing Maternity? Women, Labour, and Surrogacy</p> <p>Existential Struggles of Women Engaged in Informal Sectors –An Appraisal from the Perspectives of Gender Inequality Prevailing in Kolkata</p> <p>Ignorance of women’s role in pastoral economy: Condition of pastoral women in Maharashtra</p> <p>Exploring livelihood &amp; support strategies for unpaid care work by Indian women?</p> <p>Gender, Migration and Work: Lived experience of women migrant as home based worker in informal economy of Mumbai</p> <p>Making Visible the Invisible: Women Artists and Herstory</p> <p>Paid and Unpaid Work of Dalit Women in Mumbai and Pune</p> <p>Intersections between Work, Gender and Disability: Experiences of Women with Disabilities</p>
<p align="center"><b>Parallel Session D Venue: Green Room, New Campus</b></p> <p align="center"><b>Time 2.30 p.m – 5.30 p.m.</b></p>	
<p align="center"><b>Tea Break: 4.00 p.m. – 4.15 p.m.</b></p>	
<p><b>Chairperson:</b></p> <p><b>Discussant:</b></p> <p>Kaniska Singh &amp; Asfia Jamal</p> <p>Radhika Uppal and Amrita Gupta</p> <p>Rama Ramswamy</p> <p>Ravi A Gajbhiye &amp; Kavita chohan</p> <p>Reshmi</p> <p>Pournima Arvel</p>	<p><b>Dr. Moulashri Vyas</b></p> <p><b>Dr. Varsha Joshi</b></p> <p>Women’s Paid Work as a Bubble of Empowerment: A Case Study of a Social Enterprise Working with Women Artisans</p> <p>Breaking Boundaries- Women in the non-traditional sector</p> <p>The travails of doing business on the streets of Aizawal: A gendered perspective</p> <p>Socio-economic exclusion and discrimination of women in domestic work and sanitation work (Scavenging)</p> <p>The Precarity among Women Workforce in Handloom Sector at Sualkuchi, Assam</p> <p>“Gaay leke jane vali auratein – begging or caste-based urban occupations?”</p>

Prof. Lakshmi Lingam & Dr. Rahul Sapkal	Maternity Protection and Policy Deficiencies: Recent Evidences from India
Lavanya Shanbhogue	A critical interrogation of the role of self-help groups in securing livelihoods and the rehabilitation of former devadasis in Belgaun district in Karnataka
<b>Parallel Session E</b>	<b>Venue: D2 new campus , New Campus</b>
<b>Time</b>	<b>2.30 p.m – 5.30 p.m.</b>
<b>Tea Break: 4.00 p.m. – 4.15 p.m.</b>	
<b>Chairperson:</b>	<b>Dr Varsha Ayyar</b>
<b>Discussant:</b>	<b>Dr. Asha Achuthan</b>
Karan Peer	Women in Urban formal and informal labour – A study of garment industry in Bengaluru
Diya Dutta	Rise in unpaid domestic work drives the decline in labour force participation of women in India-A field study
Jyoti Thakur	Married women in urban workforce in India: Insights from NSSO data
Kanchan Thomasina Ekka	Women Gender and Livelihood in Post Cocoon Activity: Understanding Patriarchal Construction in ,Raigarh Chhatisgarh
Shobha Jadhav & Chaaya Kamble (5 mins each)	Cleaning worker M ward Chembur; E Ward Byculla
Nikita Mishra	Women and Forest: Understanding the Changing Gender Relation among the Kondhs in Odisha
Malinee Mukherjee	Influence of organizational commitment and subjective well-being on work engagement of nurses
B. Srinivasu & Manvi Aggarwal	Domestic Workers in the Informal Sector: A Case Study of Delhi (NCR)
<b>Parallel Session F</b>	<b>Venue: Boardroom, new campus</b>
<b>Time</b>	<b>2.30 p.m – 5.30 p.m.</b>
<b>Tea Break: 4.00 p.m. – 4.15 p.m.</b>	
<b>Chairperson:</b>	<b>Dr. Sandhya Iyer</b>
<b>Discussant:</b>	<b>Prof.Christoph Scherrer</b>
Mr. Apoorva Shukla; Dr. Reshmi R. S	Role of Transport Infrastructure on Female Work Participation and Shifting from Agricultural to Non-Agricultural Sector
Binay Tudu & Mr. Binit Lakra	Marginalization of Women in Agriculture and Allied Activities: A study on Santhal Women in Santhal Pargana, Jharkhand

Karuppasamy M	Paid and Unpaid Works in the Agriculture Sector by Caste: A Study on a rural area in Tamilnadu
Vaibhav Bansal	Women in Agriculture and Allied activities
Vijayamba R	Role of Women in Livestock Economy
Dr.Debdulal Saha	Women in Global Production System: Conditions of Farm Labour in Tea Plantation
Mushtaq Ahmad	Collective action and theory of change: A case study of two largest women producers collectives of India
Medha Purao Samant	Unorganized Women workers and cooperative movement
<b>Parallel Session G</b>	<b>Venue: Room number C1, new campus</b>
<b>Time</b>	<b>2.30 p.m – 5.30 p.m.</b>
<b>Tea Break: 4.00 p.m. – 4.15 p.m.</b>	
<b>Chairperson:</b>	<b>Dr Christa Wichterich</b>
<b>Discussant:</b>	<b>Prof. Bino Paul, Dr. Unmesh Patnaik</b>
Shanti Neela	Social Security Schemes in India For the Informal Sector with Special Reference to the Urban Female Domestic Worker
Dr. Surbhi Dayal	Visible and Invisible Labour: An Ethnographic Study of Women in Traditional Entertainers Community
Swaathylakshmi M P, & others	Are Women-Run Dairy Co-Operatives A Success or Failure in A Rural Scenario?
Tauseef Fatima & Shafey Anwarul Haque	Identities and Negotiations between Women Householders and Domestic Workers: A Case Study of Select Areas of Aligarh
Angela D Akorsu	Civil society responses to livelihood deficits of women smallholder farmers in Ghana
Seemi Zafar	Feminization of low paid work – condition of grassroots workers in the health sector
Yogita Naruka	In Pursuit of a Brighter Tomorrow: Women's negotiations to work in a resettlement colony of Delhi
Dr Sunita Jadhav	Female Labour Force Participation & Enterprise Development: Role of Self Help Promoting Institutions (SHPIs)

## **PROGRAMME SCHEDULE DAY 2**

**Date 13-07-2018**

**VENUE : Library conference hall (all sessions)**

<b>Plenary Session 9.00 a.m. – 10.15 a.m.</b>	
<b>Panel 4 Equal World Equal Spaces</b>	
<b>Chairperson</b> Ms. Amita Sahaya Dr. Christine Nathan Ms. Niki Kaur Dr. Sunita Kaistha	<b>Prof. Surinder Jaswal</b> Women's Working World- A Mirror to their World Women in the Working World – the challenges? Women with Spinal Disease Work Related Health Issues
<b>Plenary Session 10.15 a.m. – 11.15 a.m.</b>	
<b>Panel 5 Women in Collective Struggles</b>	
<b>Chairperson</b> Ms. Binda Pandey  Ms. Ceena Paul Ms. Mehnaza Ms. Indira Gartenberg	<b>Ms. Damyanty Sridharan</b> Century Long Women's Movement in Nepal: Achievement and challenges ahead Women in Trade Union My Struggle as a Woman Entrepreneur in Conflict Zone Building Grassroots Democracy
<b>Tea Break 11.15 a.m-11.30 a.m.</b>	
<b>Plenary Session 11.30am – 12.30p.m.</b>	
<b>Panel 6 Women in Corporate World</b>	
<b>Chairperson</b> Ruby Ahluwalia Anjali Bedekar Aparna Asthana Renuka Varma Ms. Elis George Ruby Ojha	<b>Prof. Sasmita Palo</b> Women in Indian Railways Women in Banking Industry Women in Public Sector Undertaking Women in HPCL Women in Public Sector Gender Inclusion and Information Technology Industry
<b>Plenary Session 12.30 pm-1.30pm</b>	
<b>Panel 7 Informality, Gender and Cities (ActionAid)</b>	
<b>Chairperson</b> Anchita Ghatak Shalini Sinha	<b>Ms. Kiran Moghe</b> Rights of the domestic workers Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing



Nirja Bhatnagar	Informality, Gender and Cities
<b>Lunch break 1.30 pm- 2.30 pm</b>	
<b>Plenary Session</b>	<b>2.30 pm – 3.30 pm</b>
<b>Panel 8</b>	<b>Women in the Workforce &amp; The State</b>
<b>Chairperson</b> Prof. Christa Wichterich Ms. Hafiza Muzaffar Dr.Paramita Mazumdar Dr. Asanda Benya Prof Seeta K Prabhu	<b>Dr. Elizabeth</b> Current reorganisation of Social Reproduction, care extractivism and care Struggle. State Commission for Women, Jammu & Kashmir and Women's work Economic Empowerment of Women and the Criminal Justice Delivery System in India Women in Mining Industries Role of State and Social Security in the Developing World: Challenges and Opportunities
<b>Tea break: 3.30 pm-3.45 pm</b>	
<b>Valedictory Session</b>	<b>3.45 p.m. - 5.00 p.m.</b>
<b>Chairperson:</b> Chief Rapporteur Report Valedictory Address Concluding Remarks Final Vote of Thanks	<b>Prof. Bino Paul</b> Prof. Samapti Guha Prof. Wandana Sonalkar Prof. Vibhuti Patel and Dr. Nandita Mondal Ms. Ayatakshee Sarkar
<b>Networking on tea/coffee</b>	<b>5.00 pm -5.30 pm</b>

# **Outsourcing Maternity? Women, Labour, and Surrogacy**

**Aishwarya Chandran**

Research scholar, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

aishwarya713@gmail.com

## **Background**

India has been a booming market for commercial surrogacy for close to two decades now. In October 2015, India's medical tourism sector was estimated to be worth US\$3 billion, and the Indian Council for Medical Research estimates \$450 million of this to be from commercial surrogacy. The laws pertaining to commercial surrogacy in India have had a history of being ambiguous. The first instance of the government's recognition of commercial surrogacy was perhaps in the case of the landmark Baby 'M' trial in 2008. Baby 'M' was born to a surrogate mother through in-vitro fertilisation using the sperm from the intended father and an anonymous egg. A month before the birth of the child, the commissioning couple filed for divorce, leaving the fate of the child uncertain. The commissioning father filed for custody, but surrogacy was not legal in Japan at the time, and under the Guardians Act of 1890, a single man cannot adopt in India. Eventually, the child was handed over to her grandmother by the court, and was also granted a Japanese visa. The Indian court recognised the validity of the surrogate agreement and accorded the commissioning father the status of being the biological parent of the child. Commercial surrogacy has been legal in India since 2002. It developed as a combination of IVF and egg donation. The Indian Council for Medical Research was the first to lay down a set of guidelines governing the practice of commercial surrogacy. It was published in 2005 as the National Guidelines for Accreditation, Supervision and Regulation of ART (assisted reproductive technology) clinics in India. This was later revised and prepared as a Draft ART (Regulation) Bill in 2008, and again in 2010. In all drafts of these guidelines, one thing was consistent – the proposal to legalise commercial gestational surrogacy. It laid down regulatory criteria, such as the need to register clinics providing surrogacy services, the imperative to maintain confidentiality, the surrogate's right to exercise informed consent, etc. However, in 2016, the Surrogacy (Regulation) Draft Bill was proposed, in complete dissonance with the previous ART bills. Not only does this bill propose an unconditional ban on surrogacy against payment, but it also reduces the understanding of ART to surrogacy alone.

The new surrogacy bill permits only childless heterosexual couples, married for at least five years, with a demonstrable history of infertility to get a surrogate. The surrogate has to be a 'close relative', must be married herself, and must have a child of her own. The surrogate must carry the fetus to term not against a payment, but merely for purposes of altruism. The Bill also bans transnational surrogacy, permitting only Indian citizens to engage in surrogacy within India.

I will attempt to explore three predominant themes in my paper. These are as follows:

- Attempting to understand how the binary of domestic labour and commercial labour is challenged through commercial surrogacy.
- To understand how the neoliberal economy has enabled and sustained a marketplace for the transaction of reproductive labour.
- To understand the way technology interfaces with women's bodies in the business of surrogacy. One of the questions I wish to address through this paper is whether technology has enabled, mediated, or produced the business of surrogacy, and the consequences that the intervention may have on women's bodies, particularly their reproductive capacities.

At first glance, what seems most startlingly apparent is the Bill's attempt to separate reproduction from the realm of commerce. The family is often read as "the antithesis of the market relations of capitalism; it is also sacralised in our minds as the last stronghold against the state, as the symbolic refuge from the intrusion of a public domain that consistently threatens our sense of privacy and self determination." Motherhood is a private affair, a matter of the private domain. These two realms must never overlap. But what is strikingly absent in the Bill is the recognition of the surrogate's loss of livelihood sustained during the pregnancy and the potential for loss of livelihood after childbirth, and what provisions may be in place to ensure that she is adequately compensated for her labour.

The understanding of women's childbearing and childrearing role as reproductive labour was first pushed forward by the socialist feminists in the 70s. Contesting the dominant binary that existed in classical political philosophy between productive and unproductive labour, feminists argued that women's engagement with domestic activities including childbearing was labour, and must not be couched under the rhetoric of feminine duty, or filial responsibility.

Most discourses on surrogacy begin by juxtaposing two evidently exaggerated images: One, a morally overdeterministic rhetoric of motherhood, such as "mothering and pregnancy are acts of love", and "children are priceless". This is then pitted against the rather dystopian image of reproductive brothels, baby machines and baby farms. What is startlingly absent from these polarised opinions is the idea of surrogacy, and motherhood by extension, as labour. Paid mothering has existed in societies from long before, in the form of wet nurses, boarding mothers (temporary foster mothers to care for children in shelter homes), baby farmers (hired by parents to raise illegitimate children in secret), governesses, nannies, etc. Why then does surrogacy problematise the economics and politics of hiring maternal services?

The language of the Law has been consistently dismissive of women's reproductive capacities as viable labour, in the case of surrogacy particularly. For example, in the Fasano case of 1998, the hospital's negligence brought about placing the wrong fertilised egg in Donna Fasano's uterus and resulted in her carrying to term and delivering a child that didn't belong to her or her husband. In a lawsuit that ensued, where the Fasanos handed over the child over to its biological parents but demanded visitation rights, the court dismissed Donna's role in the pregnancy as only "nominal"

and denied visitation rights. The court's rejection of Donna's role in the process of childbirth simply because there was no intention to do so, or the process of childbearing and childbirth was brought on sans any love or emotional attachment directed to the child in the womb, devalues her gestational labour.

Amrita Pande posits surrogates as 'mother-worker subjects', where being a mother is constantly at odds with being a worker. The worker takes wages for their job and delivers the service/good/labour. A worker's detachment in delivering the good and moving on to the next task is directly at conflict with a mother's duty towards her child. The surrogate's role as both mother and worker threatens her claim to one or the other of these roles, no matter how religiously she attempts to fulfil both.

Daisy Deomamapo, in "Gendered Geographies", speaks about the problems encountered when speaking about the body in the context of commercial surrogacy. In traditional birthing, the biological and social aspects of mothering, i.e., the pregnancy and the process of motherhood thereafter, are temporally distinct. But in the case of commercial surrogacy, they are spatially stratified as well. The disaggregated, divided nature of labour is temporally as well as spatially divided, bringing to the table a whole host of additional dilemmas about the body to grapple with. She further delineates how this spatial division of labour is geopolitically determined, where a certain social location is invariably the consumer, while another is left with performing the labour.

The neoliberal impulse to fashion 'designer babies' has been spoken about at length by bioethicists like Nikolas Rose in *The Politics of Life Itself*. Kumkum Sangari in *Solid: Liquid – A (trans)national reproductive formation* draws disconcerting patterns between sex selective abortion and commercial surrogacy. IVF with PGD (In-vitro fertilisation with Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis) and sperm sorting are methods through which sex selection is possible. While these methods are not very common in the country, and are extremely expensive, they aren't impossible. Sangari recalls the case of 2013 where an Australian couple who had come to India for commercial surrogacy sought to circumvent the Prenatal Diagnostics Techniques Act (Prohibition of Sex Selection), to have sex selective surrogacy so that they may have a "balanced family", comprising a girl and a boy. The Court rejected the plea and refused to make the exception. In a compelling argument that compares sex selection and commercial surrogacy, Sangari says that sex selection *expels* prospective daughters while commercial surrogacy *encloses* reproductive bodies. Both practices emerge from a sense of 'propertarianism'. To elucidate, she says that sex selective abortion is performed as a result of the calculation of dowry costs, dependence on son during old age, and general 'low status' of women. Similarly, surrogacy is an 'entrepreneurialisation' of reproductive practices, where the birthing potential of women is used to manipulate reproductive outcomes. While one is a technology of conception and the other of contraception, they seek to reinforce the s ideals of patrilineity, maternalism, the value of the child, and a state-cum-market-cum-familial patriarchy, she contends.

Feminists have had a somewhat ambivalent relationship with technology. When Shulamith

Firestone first remarked that technology alone can liberate women from the tyranny of their bodies, it was a lauded idea. But over time, this neutrality of technology has been contested. Scholars like Judy Wacjman, in *Feminism confronts Technology* have pointed out how this rhetoric has pushed unsuspecting women into unverified medical trials and have also made medical establishments make guinea pigs out of women. The penetration of technology into the field of reproduction has caused women's bodies a medical project that can be perfected through technological intervention. Infertility is no longer merely a description of a condition, but is a problem needing to be fixed.

Children are culturally considered priceless gifts and that idea permeates popular discourse as well. Jan Sutton, the founder and spokeswoman of the National Association of Surrogate Mothers (a group of more than 100 surrogates who support legislation in favour of surrogacy), stated in her testimony before an information-gathering session of the California state legislature in 1989: "My organization and its members would all still be surrogates if no payment was involved". The symbol of the pure surrogate who creates a child for love was pitted against the symbol of the wicked surrogate who 'prostitutes her maternity'. Our culture, too, pushes forth the idea of 'daan' or gifting, of something precious and irreplaceable to oneself, as the exemplar of sacrifice and selflessness. It is against this backdrop that altruistic surrogacy is placed on a pedestal and even granted legal sanction, whereas surrogacy for commercial gain is frowned upon, stigmatised, and censured. The presupposition that altruistic surrogacy cannot be exploitative is a self-defeating argument, that chooses to turn a blind eye to the forces of coercion and compulsion that exist within familial structures.

Within such conflicting, contradicting narratives, it becomes particularly problematic to begin to talk about surrogacy as labour, surrogates as labourers, and the process of childbirth as a commercial transaction driven by the demands of the adoptive parents.

### **Research Questions:**

- ☐ How does commercial surrogacy re-imagine the contours of 'work'? Does this contractual form of 'employment' present the possibility of release and redemption for women who may be able to escape poverty, or does it trap them further into a vicious cycle of exploitation?
- ☐ What potential does the division, fragmentation, and stratification of maternal labour hold in our reimagination of notions of motherhood? How do intersections of caste, class and other social categories aid this division of labour?
- ☐ How do we conceive notions of exploitation in the case of surrogacy? Does wilful, consensual engagement in the service hold emancipatory potential for surrogates who transform a domestic chore into a marketable service? Or does the business thrive on the vulnerabilities of marginalised women by exploiting them further?
- ☐ Does altruistic surrogacy seek to rescue women from the exploitative potential of

commercial surrogacy or does it make women more vulnerable by being coerced into being surrogates by their families, additionally receiving no compensation for their services and devaluing their labour?

### **Research objectives:**

- To understand the shifting nature of gendered labour in the form of surrogacy, and how it problematizes the traditional idea of motherhood as filial duty.
- To unpack the politics of gendered labour, along intersections of caste, class, and social mobility where the task of childbearing is assigned to a certain category of women, while childrearing is commissioned by a different category.
- To understand legal, medical and feminist perspectives on surrogacy, vis-a-vis theoretical frameworks of labour and exploitation.

### **Methodology:**

The research is predominantly theoretical in nature, drawing in parts, from my ongoing field work on the subject.

The research will employ a feminist methodology, focusing on the experiences of women. Analysing the intersections of gender with other forms of marginalisation, such as caste, class, and other categories of discrimination will be pertinent to my research.

I will use Discourse Analysis as a method to carefully and critically analyse the legal, medical, and academic discourse around the subject of surrogacy, and its deliberate, concerted refusal to acknowledge the practice as gendered labour. The purpose of the research will be to understand how the private practice of motherhood enters the realm of commerce and the public through commercial surrogacy. Additionally, critically evaluating theories of labour and exploitation, I will attempt to understand the arguments leveraged against commercial surrogacy on grounds of exploitation. I will contest the myth of altruism in surrogacy, where the coercive nature of family is often overlooked at best, romanticised at worst.

### **References:**

- Deomampo, Daisy. "Gendered Geographies of Reproductive Tourism." *Gender and Society*, Aug 2013.
- Pande, Amrita. "Commercial Surrogacy in India: Manufacturing a Perfect Mother-Worker Subject". *Signs*. Vol. 35, No. 4 (Summer 2010).
- Petchesky, Rosalind. *Abortion and Woman's Choice: The State, Sexuality, and Reproductive Freedom*. Verso Publications, 1986.
- Ragone, Helena. *Surrogate Motherhood: Conception in the Heart*. Routledge, 1994.

- Ragone, Helena. *The Gift of Life: Surrogate Motherhood, Gamete Donation and Constructions of Altruism*. New York University Press, 2000.
- Rose, Nikolas. "The Politics of Life Itself". *Theory Culture & Society*, December 2001.
- Sangari, Kumkum. *Solid:Liquid – A (Trans)national Reproductive Formation*. Tulika Books, 2015.
- Shrage, Laurie. *Abortion and Social Debate: Depolarising the Debate*. Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Wajcman, Judy. *Feminism confronts Technology*. Pennsylvania State University Press, 1991.

# **The Contribution of Women in the Development of Railway in British India: A Historical Feminist Analysis (1853 A.D. - 1947 A.D.)**

**Akhil Kumar Gupta**

Research Scholar, Dr. Harisingh Gour Vishwavidyalaya Sagar, Indore

[guptaakhil2015@gmail.com](mailto:guptaakhil2015@gmail.com)

In human society the origin of labour power is a natural process for the livelihood. In every area of manual labour we find male oriented or male centric structure. The British India is known the changeable period as modern science, technology, medical, education, administration and transportation. The development of railway in transportation helped industries, rise of labour class and various un-organized working groups. On Saturday 16, 1853 the first train to run officially in India transported a large group of dignitaries along the twenty one miles of track connecting Bombay with Thana. Newspaper accounts describe a fourteen-carriage train pulled by three engines transporting some four hundred people on a day designated a public holiday. Large crowds, a band and a 21 gun salute marked the 3:30 P.M. departure of the train from Bombay. The arrival at Thana at 4:45 P.M. was followed by a great banquet and many laudatory speeches. This occasion is the milestone of Indian History, in next years the development of railway in India was a massive process. In 15 August, 1854 the East Indian Railway Company opened Howrah-Hooghly section with 24 miles distance, in 1856 Madras-Arakonam opened and in 3<sup>rd</sup> March, 1857 in north India the first train run between Allahabad and Kanpur. In 1861 the length of railway was 1587 kilometer which increased 54694 kilometer in 1947.

The aim behind the development of railway in India was consume the resources, political expansion and help to military but railway gave such a platform which built a nation as we called modern India. It helped to unify or centralized our country. In other words railway made a political formation, cultural unification, developed vernacular languages and mass communication. It also helped to develop telegraph, post and newspapers. The development of railway in India was a long process that is why a huge number of labours worked. The labour is not group of men but it is also consist women. There were a lot of unskilled labours who nearer the villages and their whole family working under the Mistari or Mukaddam, in 40 % women and children of total working class. Building the railway in the Raj the women also worked with men as cut or embanked earth and rock, often in massive quantities that reshaped landscapes, founded permitted level, except in the rare instance where conditions permitted ballasting and plate laying directly on ground that required little preparation. Men dug the earth and rock, women and children moved it. These people often came to worksites as families. As one observer of earth working near Bangalore in 1860 reported: there were crowds of boys, girls and women engaged in transporting earth in baskets of truly solar topee dimensions. In my research paper I want to try in what way the development of railway in India in pre independence period and how the women make it with their contribution.



## **Existential Struggles of Women Engaged in Informal Sectors –An Appraisal from the Perspectives of Gender Inequality Prevailing in Kolkata**

**Alolika Mangal**

Lecturer, Vivekananda College, Kolkata

[alolika.pinki@gmail.com](mailto:alolika.pinki@gmail.com)

From time immemorial the disparities between men and women have been prevailing almost in every aspects of life across the world. Deeply unequal sharing of burden prevails between the genders. Ancient history depicts women have been regarded as unequal and subordinate to male and believed to be irrational, fearful, ruled by physical desires. Women are considered as only caretaker of the family and man as all in all, the authority who grants women's freedom to make life choices. Although it seems like society has been evolved, culture is progressive, still some of the basic equality rights are stripped off from women. So it is agreed and accepted that gender inequality is deeply rooted in today's world from the Western part to Far East. Gender inequality is not one homogenous phenomenon but a collection of contrasting and interlinked problems. It has been an utter reality practice in our society. The society is not free from any kind of social and cultural prejudices that will protect women's rights and freedom. Gender inequality is a challenge not only faced in India but also it's a matter of concern worldwide. In India gender inequality exists in the form of deep-rooted historical, cultural, social constructions and believes where economic and political facets are the most substantial parts. Though the reality of gender inequality in India is very complex and diversified, still asymmetrical treatments towards women is the focal issue while it comes to education, employment opportunities, enjoying civic rights, liberties etc. To prosper in the modern time women are now trying to take over the autonomy of their own destiny. Even while dealing with development and progress of our nation, gender issues are thrust areas of concern. Females are considered as weaker section of the society and are being deprived of having equal education, occupational as well as health status in comparison with her male counterparts. Though women play a crucial role in the overall development of any country as it occupies almost half of the nation's population. India being a developing country always dealt with the issues concerning women and their rights, opportunities, actions and freedom. Gender inequality results in disparities of income and opportunity. In our country cities have a different pattern of inequality where its rural counterparts follow another route. Gender inequality act as a mainstream objection to both for formal and informal economy in rural and urban India.

Gender inequality in work force participation implies treating women in a different manner which is different from their male counterparts as it is not totally dependent on their individual merit or necessity of the job. Examples show that women in paid work earn less than men because a superficial concept of male dominancy is always prevailing there. Unequal relations between genders have a tremendous impact on the participation rate of women in working sector both informal and formal. They are deprived of accessing resource, can't get representatives who speak

for their rights and deprived of getting benefits from organizations, lacks in skill development programme. This picture is very common both in rural and urban areas. Due to lack of proper education a major percentage of women are forced to get into informal sectors. The urban and rural part of India encountered a good involvement of women workers in informal sectors which are important and perhaps the only source of income for their family as well.

According to the Ministry of Welfare (1987), India there are three forms of labor involved in the informal sector i.e. self-employed, wage workers, house workers. Unfortunately the Census of India does not recognize the activities of women in urban areas, who used to vendor goods at local market, serve as sales girls, work as labor force in various government projects etc. Recent studies suggest that women work participation in formal sectors are mainly confined within the educated urban womenfolk because they wish to live a better quality of life along with its associated facilities in the ever changing urban circumstances. Whereas the counterpart (illiterate and comparatively less educated) forcefully engage themselves in informal working situations for their hard earnings necessary for the survival of their family. Their thrives push them to engage themselves in economic activities who form a larger part of informal working sectors in the metro cities like Mumbai, Delhi, Kolkata, Chennai, Bengaluru etc.

Women empowerment can be the sharp tool to achieve gender equality. Empowering women is not only redefining and raising women's status but it is replacing patriarchy with parity. In India, cities are the growing centres of women empowerment compared to rural areas as the cities are experiencing a major influx of rural to urban migration. As a result, women are thriving for their own subsistence which is the result of growing urban informal sectors. Kolkata being the capital hub of eastern India is always served as a source region of income, livelihood to its citizens irrespective of their economic background. For the study purpose, one of the busiest and crowded markets (bazars) of central Kolkata has been selected. The market is run by a vast group of people coming from lower economic background. Majority of them especially women, depend totally upon the financial activities associated with this market for their survival. The focus of the work is to access how well the market is run by economically backward people satisfying the daily needs of the local people and to analyze how an informal employment sector of economy is developed from the perspective of gender inequality.

The major objectives of this study have been established on the existing socioeconomic conditions of the sellers and the hostile situations which they are facing on the daily basis. It's also focus on the work participation rate of women in informal sectors and to what extent these sectors help to raise the status quo of women.

To fulfill the methodological requirements and to synthesize above mentioned objectives the study has been done on the basis of observational survey by collecting information directly from the respondents engaged in this particular sector. Qualitative analyses compiled with a few statistical approaches have envisaged drawing major inferences.

The study intends to search some hidden facts which are often overlooked by the authority. To raise the status of women, overcoming the hurdles associated with economic growth, achieving equality in terms of resource consumption, women's should raise their voice to establish their rights. The Union Government has launched various missions, regulatory policies in ensuring women's development specially who are economically and socially lagging behind. Strategies and policies should be properly implemented for the social advancement and economic development for the women engaged in this sector as well as for the entire nation. The holistic concept of gender equality lies under the equal distribution of opportunities, status, attitudes etc. between male and female. So the broad notion of development will not be successful without achieving the balance between income, growth and productivity. It's an alarming call for our society to act, accept and accomplish the work which womenfolk possess. Whether the work is confined strictly within formal sectors or informal sectors or even confined within households. Proper recognition, understanding and synthesis between men and women will ensure gender equality leading to a sustainable society.

## **Women's Working World: A Mirror to their World**

**Amita Sahaya**

Founder Secretary, Women Work & Health Initiative; Director, FINDIA FOUNDATION;  
Director, EQUAL WORLD EQUAL SPACES

[amitasahaya@gmail.com](mailto:amitasahaya@gmail.com)

This paper examines the reasons that have resulted in the declining FLFP rate in India. We have collated the aspects that impact her working career linking its trajectory to her socio economic situation and the socialisation processes that shape and facilitate her work life. We argue that women's work life and labour participation is impacted by those various factors that constitute the gender situation in a country e.g ownership and right to education, job opportunities, property, health etc. This paper argues that Gender inequality is reflected in women's low FLFPR, the quality of the jobs she has access to, pay parity, leadership position, including the ambition to shape her life.

The paper can be included in the thematic area of: Women in Urban formal and informal labour.

There is a bidirectional relationship between economic development and women's empowerment defined as improving the ability of women to access the constituents of development—in particular health, education, earning opportunities, rights, and political participation. Esther Duflo (1) This perspective is further reinforced by others such as Kofi Annan, the former Secretary General of the United Nations who opines that development can be a major driver for bringing down inequalities between women and men. He has argued that achieving gender equality is a “prerequisite” to achieving the other Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), including eliminating poverty, reducing infant mortality, achieving universal education, and eliminating the gender gap in education. Amartya Sen (2) further argues that continuing discrimination against women can hinder development therefore Empowerment is necessary to accelerate development.

Paid employment is known to increase women's agency and empowerment (World Bank, 2011 and 2012). Money gives women a sense of empowerment within their marriage and their households, gives them higher levels of decision-making power and mobility. Those engaged in the household also marry late and have children later. Given the incontrovertible arguments towards economic activity and its linkage to greater equity and empowerment, India's female labor force participation (FLFP) rate is a cause for extreme concern. It is also a reflection of deeper social and cultural fissures that arrest women's possibilities for living a dignified and autonomous life, while also an indictment of policy failures that have not been innovative or creative enough to address these barriers.

At 121 out of 131 countries, India's FLFPR is one of the lowest in the world. In 2013, India had the lowest in South Asia, with the exception of Pakistan. Moreover, the FLFP rate dropped from

49.0 percent to 38.0 percent in rural areas between 2004-5 and 2009-10 (NSSO, 2011) (3) despite an annual population growth rate of 1.74 percent. The same pattern continued into the most recent round of the National Sample Survey (NSSO) in 2011-12. Among the Asian economies, only China experienced a marginally higher drop in FLFP rate from 1990 to 2013. Further, for the first time in recent history, estimates suggest that between 2004-05 and 2009-10, not only was there a decline in India's FLFP rate, but also a shrinking of the total female labor force. Less than a third (27 percent) of women 15 years or older are working or actively looking for a job. Three of every five prime working age Indian women (26-45 years) are not economically active, meaning that they are neither working on a farm or in businesses nor are they earning any wage. There are just a few countries such as Afghanistan, Pakistan and Saudi Arabia, which rank lower than India, making for an unusual situation as it has far lower female LFPRs compared to most countries at the same level of income. Neighbouring Bangladesh, Nepal and Sri Lanka have FLFPR as 57.4 % ; 79.9% & 35.9 % respectively. ( ILO Stat 2015). Translated it means that 20 million women from different sectors: formal - informal, rural - urban, educated and otherwise, were removed from the employment graph between 2004-05 to 2011-12. Another potentially disturbing finding is that India is unique in having the biggest percentage of women dropping out of the workforce, known as the "leaking pipeline," between the junior and middle levels. In other countries, the biggest drop-off takes place between the middle and senior levels. The earlier the drop-off occurs, the smaller the base of people who could move up the ranks, and therefore the fewer women there will be in senior positions.

This dire figure can be partially attributed to the (4) mismeasurement of women's work, since the NSS does not capture a sizeable part of female employment that is related to home-based subsidiary work. Some decline in female LFPR can also be expected with development as female LFP is often seen as exhibiting a U-shaped relationship. However in India, the impact of the U curve is more pronounced than elsewhere in Asia, for they perhaps reflect the extent to which cultural patterns, and the associated societal pressures on women are entrenched here. As Harvard Economics Professor Claudia Goldin has pointed out, "gender equality and economic development share a synchronous existence."

Women with less income and education, are largely forced into working and are found in mostly poor quality jobs, largely in agriculture. Conversely as household incomes rise and the men find jobs in industry or services, women may drop out of the labor market as their reservation wage increases or as often happens in countries like India where patriarchal values devalue women's paid labour, families try to gain status by forcing their women out of the paid labour force and engage instead in unpaid home and care work. Andres et al. (2017) also argue that women move out of the labour force as they are often secondary workers, whose incomes are used to augment family incomes on a temporary basis. We also find that since women share a disproportionate percentage of childcare responsibility, lack of crèches and day care facilities also force many women particularly in urban centres or those living in nuclear families to stay at home.

Increasingly, in India a large number take time off to look after their elders. Almost 80 percent of

women surveyed said they were leaving for eldercare, as compared to 30 percent in US and only 18 percent in Germany. “In India women have learnt to outsource childcare but not elder care. Daughterly guilt is now bigger than motherly guilt”, says Sylvia Ann Hewlett. (5). Household duties, seen as a woman’s preserve underlined by patriarchal notions of a woman’s traditional role in the kitchen, too adversely impacts LFP.

Reinforcing the argument linking gender inequality and poor FLFP, we find that in India higher levels of education for women may have actually exacerbated the situation. Given the interaction between higher education and better employment and marriage prospects in the Indian context, this may have actually forced women out of the labour force, considering the social stigma associated with low skilled jobs or work in general (Klasen and Pieters, 2015).

Chatterjee, Murgai and Rama (2015) add another dimension to this premise by stating that the key fundamental driver of the decline in female LFPR in India is the lack of “suitable” jobs for women. Between 2005 and 2012, the number of farm jobs dropped substantially, without a parallel increase in jobs in offices and factories. The World Bank team held a survey wherein it conducted interviews with more than 400 women and girls in two cities: Bhopal and Indore (Madhya Pradesh) across a cross spectrum of respondents belonging to different age groups, income and education level to ascertain the cause for declining FLFP. While most respondents were willing to work, they wanted to have a suitable job, which is defined as well-paying, close to their homes, and with flexible working hours. Underlying the need for proximity and flexibility were strong social norms around women’s chastity, marriage, work, and household duties. Most women interviewed said they could only work after attending to household chores and childcare duties. Many girls who were not married said that although they wanted to work, their families were hesitant to send them out for work. Childcare was a significant constraint, more so in urban areas where families tended to be nuclear. Das and Zumbyte (2017) for instance find that having a young child in the home depresses mothers’ employment, a relationship that has intensified over time.

In another survey (6) the author (Bhandare) cites the case of one Usha Devi, wife of a construction worker in Rajasthan who took up a job to augment the family income, for which crime she was hacked to death by her husband’s uncle. In her survey, where she interviews a cross section of women from various backgrounds, she found that the biggest factor that keeps women away from employment is the family. It imposes traditional gender roles, where it sees women’s primary responsibility as the home. In another twist to this situation, a woman unlike a man, has to seek permission from various relatives, husband, in-laws, father and sometimes even the Panchayat before taking a job. These gender norms are deeply entrenched. Women too largely believe that paid care compromises women’s duties to their families and children and that men should have preference over jobs. In another shocking revelation (7) as per a UNFPA survey of the 1500 men and 500 women, surveyed in each of 6 states of India, totalling some 9500 respondents, 94 % men believe that a woman must obey the husband, and that he has a right to punish her if she does something wrong.

In a developing economy with a dynamic and modern service sector such as India, one would expect that the growing demand for skills would have employers create jobs that would be attractive to educated women, particularly as women comprise a large share of science, technology and business graduates. The Indian IT and BPM sector employs 3.9 million people, of which over 34% are women, which amount to 1.3 million. About 51% of entry-level jobs in the technology services sector went to women in 2015, according to a joint study by the Nasscom and PwC. Between 40 and 50% of computer science graduates in India are women, which is significantly higher than the US which is about 18%. Though both women and men in India's technology sector start out on an equal footing, with equal opportunities, yet over time a gender gap emerges with Indian women dropping out. It's the case of a leaking pipeline. Women drop out of companies at every level of technology.

Indian women are underrepresented in traditional services such as trade, hotels and restaurants, as well as modern services such as finance, real estate and other business services, which includes the IT industry. The only exceptions are public administration, education and health, but even in those sectors the share of women is lower than in other countries.

According to a global survey by Grant Thornton (2017), only 17 percent of senior roles are held by women in India. Among senior management roles, the figure is even smaller, with only 7 percent of the senior management (CEO/ Managing Director) roles held by women. Conversely, 41 percent of the Indian businesses surveyed have no women in leadership roles. As of 2010, a survey by Banerji et al. (2010) suggests that out of a total of 1,112 directorships on the BSE (Bombay Stock Exchange)-100, 59 (or 5.3 percent) were held by women. Less than half of the companies have women on their boards, and of a total of 323 executive directorships on the BSE-100, only eight are held by women. As argued by Cuberes and Teignier (2016), gender gaps in entrepreneurship and management positions negatively affect both income and aggregate productivity, since they reduce the average talent of pools of managers and entrepreneurs.

Therefore, it appears that factors other than a lack of skills is restricting job creation. Indeed, a 2014 World Bank Enterprise Survey only 9.4 percent of firms identified an inadequately educated workforce as a major constraint.

From the earlier arguments it clearly emerges that India's social realities riven with deeply entrenched patriarchal norms creates a deeply gender unequal society which in turn is reflected in gender inequality at work. The economic size of the gender gap is only part of a larger divide that affects society.

Therefore, any analysis of gender inequality and how to tackle it needs to include both economic and social aspects. The MGI index has identified 3 dimensions to ascertain gender roles.

The first dimension is gender equality in work, which includes the ability of women to engage in paid work and to share unpaid work more equitably with men, to have the skills and opportunity to perform higher-productivity jobs, and to occupy leading positions in the economy. This

dimension is driven by the choices men and women make about the lives they lead and the work they do. The next three dimensions—essential services and enablers of economic opportunity, legal protection and political voice, and physical security and autonomy—relate to fundamentals of social equality. They are necessary to ensure that women (and men) have the opportunity to build human capital and the resources and ability to live a life of their own making. We refer to these three dimensions collectively as gender equality in society,(8) a term that embraces issues that are important from a moral or humanitarian standpoint and affect many women - for instance, the more than one million girls who are not born each year due to sex-selective abortion, and the two-thirds of the world's illiterate adults who are women.

Keeping the above in mind, we propose to interview some 40 women & some men across a cross section of socio economic situations, educational and income backgrounds, job profiles, which will also include daily wage and home based workers, IT & Management workers, Employers, Entrepreneurs etc. 50 per cent of the respondents will be from the economically weaker sections i.e living in an urban slum, whilst the other half belong to the urban middle class. The questions based on the (9) 15 gender outcome based indicators employed by MGI shall determine the norms within their backgrounds, particularly in terms of equality or lack of in childhood care, nutrition, education opportunities, marriage prospects and to what extent those factors determined their entry into the labour force and career prospects. We shall also look at the availability of jobs and the work profile that the women opted for. We shall analyse and collate the reasons why the women have dropped out of the work force. This shall be juxtaposed against managerial policies and other interventions that have helped to appoint and retain female employees

#### **References:**

- Women Empowerment and Economic Development Esther Duflo\* Journal of Economic Literature 2012, 50(4), 1051–1079
- An Uncertain Glory, India and its Contradictions by Jean Drèze & Amartya Sen
- Precarious Drop Reassessing Patterns of Female Labor Force Participation in India Luis A. Andres Basab Dasgupta George Joseph Vinoj Abraham Maria Correia, World Bank Paper
- Hirway, Indira (2002): Employment and Unemployment Situation in 1990s: How Good Are NSS Data? Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. 37, No. 21, May 25.
- Hirway, Indira (2012): Missing Labor Force: An Explanation. Economic and Political Weekly, Sept 15, Vol. XLVII, No 37, September 15.
- NSSO (2011): “Key Indicator of Employment and Unemployment in India, July, 2009 - June, 2010.” p. A2.
- See also [asiafoundation.org/2016/03/09/where-are-indias-working-women/](http://asiafoundation.org/2016/03/09/where-are-indias-working-women/)
- Why Aren't India's Women Working? NYT AUG. 23, 2015



- Research Center for Talent Innovation (CTI), founded by Sylvia Ann Hewlett, one of the world's top 50 thinkers)
- Why women are falling off the employment map NamitaBhandare , HT March 24th 2018)
- (<http://www.dnaindia.com/business/report-50-indian-men-feel-violence-against-women-endemic-to-happy-family-2034020>)
- [http://ma.mckinsey.com/practicecrm/MGI\\_Power\\_of\\_parity.pdf](http://ma.mckinsey.com/practicecrm/MGI_Power_of_parity.pdf)
- Gender Equality Indicators - Professional and technical jobs; Perceived wage gap for similar work; Leadership positions; Unpaid care work; maternal mortality; educational qualification ; financial inclusion, digital inclusion, child marriage, violence

# **Civil Society Responses to Livelihood Deficits of Women Smallholder Farmers in Ghana**

**Angela D. Akorsu**

Institute for Development Studies, University of Cape Coast, Cape Coast, Ghana

aakorsu@ucc.edu.gh

**Keywords:** Civil Society, farmers, Ghana, Gender, livelihoods, Women

## **Extended Abstract**

Agriculture is one of the oldest sectors and the mainstay of Ghana's economy. Ghana's economy is considered agrarian because the sector immensely contributes to the nation's Gross Domestic Product (GDP), foreign exchange earnings, and absorbs a substantial proportion of its labour. In 2015, the estimated contribution of the agriculture sector to Ghana's GDP was a little over 20 percent, a fall from the 30 percent mark at the beginning of the third millennium (GSS, 2013; MoFA, 2016). The sector generates about 75 percent of the country's export earnings and employs about 70 percent of its workforce (GSS 2013).

Women play significant roles in the sector, as they constitute an estimated 52 percent of agricultural labour force, 70 percent of food producers and 95 percent of agro-processors (World Bank, 2008). Agriculture is highly gendered and governed by patriarchal structures, which ensures that women and men engage in different agricultural activities (Apusigah, 2009). The documentation of women's contribution to agricultural production is extensive starting with Ester Boserup, who first chronicled women's paid and unpaid labour in agriculture in the 1970s and FAO flagship publication, *State of Food and Agriculture on Women in Agriculture* (FAO, 2011). Thus, important role of women in agriculture in Ghana cannot be overemphasized.

This fact notwithstanding, women in agriculture are daunted by many problems, including social norms and expectations, gender division of labour, lower access to factors of production such as land, fertilizers, mechanisation, labour, human capital, technology and credit, less likelihood to be commercial farmers (Croppenstedt, Goldstein & Rosas, 2013). This renders women in agriculture vulnerable and often places them among the working poor. Many other researchers have highlighted the problems associated with women's work in agriculture in Ghana (Britwum and Akorsu, 2016; Doss, Kovarik, Peterman, Quisumbing, and van den Bold, 2015; Britwum, Tsikata, Akorsu and Aberese, 2014; Apusigah, 2009), and this paper only reiterates these as background information.

Though land forms the main resource in farming systems, women do not have equal access to land for pursuing their productive roles in agriculture. Traditionally in Ghana, land ownership is communal in the sense that, allodial title to land is held only by lineage heads who are expected to

distribute land equally to all members of landholding groups, regardless of their sex (Tsikata, 2008; Sarpong, 2006; Rünger, 2006). This seeming equal opportunity to access land is however tainted with several gendered norms and practices that limit women's control over, and even access to farm land. First, usufruct right to farm land is often tied to gender roles and sexual division of labour in agricultural production. For instance, the clearing of virgin land, which is a major means of acquiring usufruct right over land, is a male task. The implication is that, women access land through their male relatives and a derived or secondary right to land means smaller land and less fertile land. Even among migrant communities where hiring and sharecropping are the dominant means of access land, sexual division of labour dictates that men grow cash crops, while women grow food crops for family provisioning and since cash crops are perennial, women are often confronted with the challenging of having to re-negotiate land annually, with all the insecurity associated.

Second, since women are traditionally required to work on their husbands' lands as well as perform reproductive chores, their ability to cultivate large plots of land is often limited and this in turn limits their craving for bigger plots of land. Secondly, lineage inheritance norms in both patrilineal and matrilineal systems affect women's land rights negatively (Britwum et al. 2014). In patrilineal systems, inheritance and therefore access to lineage land is through a father's ancestral lineage and only children, not wives can inherit a man's property in case of interstate death. Indications that even female children have been excluded on occasions have been reported (Tsikata, 2008; Duncan and Brants, 2004). This is especially in Northern Ghana, female children, even under their patrilineal system do not have the right to inherit property (Dittoh 2000). Though the matrilineal inheritance systems trace one's lineage through the mother's ancestral lineage, it is never equal to inheritance by women. Within the lineage, inhibitions still exist. Thirdly, cultural norms governing marriages, regardless of type, is pivotal in either facilitating or inhibiting women's access to land. Marriage is often used as an excuse for denying women land in their lineage. Once married, a woman remains a stranger in her husband's family and is therefore not entitled to land. She is expected under customary law, to acquire land through her husband (Apuigah, 2009; Tsikata, 2008; Sarpong, 2006; Rünger, 2006; Minkah-Premo and Dowuona-Hammond, 2005; Duncan and Brants, 2004; Kevane and Gray, 1999). Thus, through a husband, a woman can gain a small plot of land to farm on her own or mostly work alongside her husband. Tenure security then is tied to the success of the marriage as well as other factors such as position in a polygamous marriage, number of children and even the sex of the children (sons offer higher security). The major losers are daughters, step and adopted daughters as well as women in consensual relationships.

Apart from inhibitions around land women in Ghana and elsewhere, are reported to have less access to non-land resources. Agarwal 2011; FAO 2011; Kumase et al. 2008; Duncan 2004; Duncan and Brants 2004; Bortei-Doku Aryeetey 2002; Quisumbing et al. 1999 have all lamented over women's lower yields in agricultural production and have indicated that these are potentially due to gender-specific inhibitions to agricultural resources other than land. In Ghana, women's

limited access to formal credit, extension services, social capital networks as well as to information and training are ubiquitous in all rural farming communities. Bortey-Doku Aryeetey (2013) has bemoaned the gender disparities in accessing extension services, especially in northern Ghana. In seeking the reasons, Britwum and Akorsu (2016) found that extension officers tend to be male and engaging with women farmers without the presence of their husbands raise suspicion and are therefore not encouraged in most communities. They found, in addition that, extension services focus on cash crops to the abandonment of subsistence crops, where women dominate.

Other areas where women are deficient in agricultural production, which areas all derive from patriarchal limitations, include: The use of technology; receiving information and training; social capital and networking as well as the use of their labour as well as their access to labour for their work. (Britwum and Akorsu, 2016; Britwum et al, 2014; Kelkar 2013; Agarwal 2011). As regards labour, the general indications of most findings is that males tend to have better access to labour than women and there are differences in the forms of labour employed on female and male farms (Anaglol et al. 2014). Granted, women are mostly inclined towards the use of unpaid household labour and mutual self-help groups. Another area with obvious gendered deficits in agricultural production is occupational safety and health. The gendered division of labour in agricultural production produces different occupational health and safety outcomes as well as differences in decision-making regarding their occupational health and safety needs. The health and safety issues of women is often either trivialised and/or completely ignored.

Thus, the livelihood situation of women smallholder farmers generally, and in Ghana is confronted with many persistent challenges. Regarding resolutions, there have been several and sometimes competing positions. While some writers opine that governments are the primary duty-bearers and must be held accountable to provide support for rural women in agriculture, others are of the view that the government alone cannot do it. Akorsu (2018) for instance have explored the role of women to take control of their lives and demonstrate agency in addressing their gendered problems, particularly with respect to land rights. Still others suggest civil society interventions as the way to go.

Civil society refers to an essentially participatory, broad-based and self-governing formation that is voluntarily constituted, non-state, autonomous, largely self-generating and self-supporting, and is concerned with civil and public purposes. Its activities are largely for articulation and mobilization, and its engagements usually have to do with struggles, protests and mass actions. The presence of active and proactive civil society makes democracy stronger and brings social progress. Civil society organisations are generally less open to public scrutiny than government bodies, and the multiple accountabilities they do have create difficulties of prioritising and reconciling the many demands placed upon them. Indeed, to the extent that they represent particular interest groups they do not necessarily act in the interests of the wider public. The rise in civil society organization seem to stem from the increasing withdrawal of state support, creating what has been called a democratic vacuum in most societies as well as

the distance between markets and humans - Both, the results of the neo-liberal paradigm. Teegan et al (2004) note that CSOs emerge when market mechanisms ignore these human needs and governmental regimes are deemed too repressive, too weak, or too resource-strapped to serve them. However, many critiques are concerned about civil society work for a number of reasons, which will be explored in this paper. Regardless of the contestations around civil society work in development discourse, civil society interventions generally, and around women's rights in agriculture have been growing in recent years.

The focus of this paper, therefore, is to interrogate the responses from civil society organisations (CSOs) and/ or Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs). It draws on the case of two such organisations in Ghana to ascertain their potential to address women specific agrarian problems. The paper draws heavily on secondary data sources as well as the several qualitative works of the author in rural livelihoods between 2015 and 2018 and in Sunyani and the three Northern regions of Ghana. The contact persons of the organisations agreed to the use of the names of their organisations. Conceptually, the paper is framed around discourses on the connection between political economy and civil society organisations.

The paper is organised into six sections including this introductory one. In section two, literature is reviewed on the civil society organisations. This is followed by a description of the nature of women's problems in agricultural work in section three. Section four comprises a brief contextual description of civil society action in Ghana. In section five, the specific interventions of the selected cases are discussed. Conclusions are presented in the six section.

The paper argues that, while some practical benefits of such interventions are acknowledgeable, CSOs are constrained in their ability to address the depth of women's problems. Whatever their achievements may be, they have been at best, superficial. To a very large extent, this is because, they have failed to incorporate social relations of production in their interventions and have instead focused on mere livelihood approaches and their emphasis on production resources such as land and even social capital. The paper demonstrates that agricultural production relations in Ghana are highly gendered, bothering on inequalities in the control of resources, tasks segregation, triple role burdens and even the wider institutional environment in maintaining these. Thus, for any CSO's effort to be far reaching, it must tackle the root of the problem, which is the patriarchal subordination of women to men and the super-ordination of men over women in agricultural production systems.

## **Women's Struggle in Trade Unions In Banking Industry in India**

**Ms. Anjali Bedekar**

GL 2008-10 Alumni Coordinator, UNI Global Union, Indian Liaison Council

anjalibedekar@uni.apro.org.sg

In Corporate India barely 10% of the companies are led by women and out of those 10%, 50% companies are in Finance Sector. Some of the public Sector and private sector large commercial banks in India are headed by women. Women have been working in Banking Industry since early 50's and today nearly 50% of bank employees in urban areas are women. Several branch heads or departmental heads are women in both the public and private sector banks and more and more women are opting for promotions in banks. In a country where female labour force participation is only 27.6% and majority of women workers work in informal economy, this level of presence of women is remarkable.

Public Sector Banking Industry also has traditionally strong unions. These unions have been established since before independence and come together under an umbrella organisation called United Forum of Bank Unions (UFBU) to negotiate Industry level wages and other working conditions with the employers' body, Indian Banks Association (IBA) in bipartite settlements. Currently 11<sup>th</sup> Bipartite Settlement is due and is under negotiation.

### **Brief Background –Banking Industry Unions**

The trade unions in Banking Industry date back to British Era. The presidency banks like Bank of Bengal and Bank of Bombay had staff associations which were a smaller version of present day trade unions. Today 9 Banking Unions have come together to form the United Forum of Bank Unions(UFBU) to form a body for negotiating jointly with the Employers Body, viz. Indian Banks Association (IBA). These unions are representing about a million members from all nationalized banks and some private banks. Out of the 9 unions, 5 represent clerical and subordinate staff and 4 unions represent supervising staff.

The unions which represent clerical and subordinate staff are as follows.

1. All India Bank Employees `Association (AIBEA)
2. National Confederation of Bank Employees (NCBE)
3. Bank Employees` Federation of India(BEFI)
4. Indian National Bank Employees`Federation(INBEF)
5. National Organisation of Bank Workers (NOBW)

The employer's body IBA represents 50 banks including all nationalized banks and State Bank group for the wage negotiations. IBA was formed on 26<sup>th</sup> September 1946 with 22 banks as its

members. Today it has 160 banks as its ordinary and associate members.

An unfortunate fact is the new generation banks which came up after the liberalisation of Finance Sector in India viz ICICI Bank, HDFC Bank, Axis Bank etc. have very low level of union representation as most of these banks actively discourage any union organising activity. Hence the scope of this article is limited to unions in public sector banks.

## **Union Representation For Women**

### **All India Bank Employees Association-AIBEA**

There is a sizable percentage of women in the membership of AIBEA. All the state units and Bank units have been encouraged to have at least one woman office bearer. They are also directed to form a women's council. Each AIBEA conference strives to get better participation of women. Since 1995, AIBEA convened 5 women's conventions. The AIBEA conference of year 2000 elected a woman office bearer in the apex body. AIBEA had 8 women Central Committee members and 12 General Council members in 2000. Today AIBEA has one woman office bearer in its apex body. AIBEA also has 13 women as Central Committee members and 40 women in its General Council today. AIBEA is the only organization in Banking Industry who had a woman signatory for 8<sup>th</sup> Bipartite Settlement. Ms. Lalita Joshi of AIBEA has the distinction of being the first woman in the Banking Industry to sign Bipartite Settlement.

AIBEA also has women members in the delegations visiting other countries.

It is a remarkable fact that AIBEA had a woman signatory in the Industry Level Bipartite Settlement. No other constituent of United Forum of Bank Unions (UFBU) has a woman signatory for bipartite settlements. This is indeed a highest level participation of women in the Banking Industry Unions.

### **INBEF-**

All India Central Bank Employees Congress (AICBEC) is affiliated to INBEF. AICBEC has 21 office bearers including General Secretary, President, Treasurer etc. in its Central Committee and 54 committee members. Out of these office bearers 2 seats are for women and 5 committee members are women. One post of Lady Secretary is reserved for women. In Central Bank of India in the unions affiliated to INBEF, at each branch level, 3 representatives are elected by the branch unit members. One of them is a woman.

### **NCBE-**

AIBOBEF is affiliated to NCBE and is one of the major constituent of NCBE.

The Mumbai Region affiliate of AIBOBEF has 1 post per region reserved for women members in its Central Committee. They also have 6 positions reserved for women in their managing committee.

AIBOBEF has a Central Committee of 110 members. Out of these 110 members 36 office bearers are elected. In this Central Committee 2 seats are reserved for women as Lady Joint Secretary.

AISBISF, the major constituent of NCBE has women in its affiliates from different circles holding positions in their unions but no woman is holding any position in apex body of AISBISF.

### **Why Low Representation Of Women In Decision Making Bodies?**

The above information from some of the major unions in banking industry clearly shows the meagre representation of women in these strong unions which have their membership from that strata of the society which has good access to education and is financially stable. And yet the women employees aren't proportionately represented in the decision making bodies in their unions. It is certainly not because the women are incapable of working in decision making capacities in the unions. If women have been heading the banks for many years now, why they can't be successful leaders in the trade unions in the banks?

There are several factors responsible for this situation which also includes the women members' aversion to participate in the union activities.

The large intake of women employees was resented by many in the Bank Management as well as staff in the initial stages in '60s. The management was afraid that such large intake may lead to paucity in supervising cadres in future as the women employees will not opt for promotion due to their family responsibilities. Also being transferred to far off places was the occupational hazard of the promotion. So women employees of the banks were not expected to opt for promotions. The male staff was sceptical about the competence of women to handle cash, to handle risks involved in working in the branches of the banks. Initially women were not given more complicated work where certain expertise was required. Women employees were given more routine work which was more or less monotonous and required little expertise.

All this changed when more and more women employees joined the banks. The Bank job was perceived as attractive for women as the pay was good among the Public Sector, there was job security, social security and due to rapid expansion of branches all over India, the married women could accompany their husbands wherever the husband was working. The good pay and other benefits lent certain desirability to bank jobs. Fresh graduates from colleges joined the ever-expanding network of banks; many among them were young women.

These women were posted in branches in cities. As a result, there were more women in city branches than men. The growing percentage of women in branches crumbled the barriers and women had to handle all types of work, including the hitherto male domain of cash and other work where specific expertise was required.

The fear about shortages in supervising cadres due to women not opting for promotions also was proved baseless. Women opted for promotions and shouldered the enhanced responsibility and



increased working hours. Initially women who had opted for promotions were posted at the centres where they had their homes. But this policy changed after the number of women officers steadily increased. The prospect of being posted away from home did not deter the women employees from opting for promotion.

Today we find many women in Banking Industry working at all levels, from attending the counters to being the Chairperson of the bank.

This steady growth in number of women working in all positions in Banks means that the strength of women membership in Unions and in Officers Associations is also increasing. But that does not show its reflection in the number of office-bearers in the Banking Industry Unions or Officers Associations. Women have been loyal members of unions, have been paying subscriptions and participating in all the calls given by the unions for agitations etc. But they have been little hesitant in accepting the responsibilities of office bearer of the Trade Unions.

There are several reasons why women in Banking Industry, though willing members of unions, are not taking up more active part in the unions.

One of the most important reasons is the shortage of time. Employed Women in India are expected to work at home and all household duties are the primary responsibility of women. The woman has to take up her share of work at the workplace. After reaching home, she cannot rest. She has to look after the family chores. Thus the working woman is already overburdened with dual responsibilities. Therefore it is no wonder that she is unwilling to spare time for union work and add to her responsibilities.

Another important reason is the image of trade unions. Generally trade unions in India have image of being tough. Women have been in the forefront of trade union activity since the trade union movement started in India. One of the first known strikes in India was in a textile mill and women were active in that agitation. Yet, unfortunately, the image of trade unions is more masculine. Trade Union is seen as one more male domain in the society.

Unfortunately, the unions haven't done much to integrate women in the trade unions. There is no separate budget for capacity development of women members, no programs/projects to develop leadership among the women members and no conscious efforts to equip the women to take on better responsibility in the trade unions. Very few unions have given encouragement and attention to develop the mainstreaming of women in union activities and enhancing the role of women in decision making. Most unions have reserved very few seats in their higher level bodies for women and that is shown as women empowerment.

### **Real Empowerment Of Women In The Unions**

The real empowerment of women in trade unions can come only when women representatives are a part of unit level to highest level representative bodies of the union. This requires a focussed

approach where awareness about the possibilities is created by the unions for their men as well women members, the meetings and other events are held in safe places and convenient timings for women to attend and women's voices and issues are heard in every meeting. Capacity development programs for identified, promising potential women members to enable them to take up the responsible positions need to be held on an ongoing basis and opportunities need to be created by the union for women to take part in union activities in a free and safe way. All this cannot be left to a chance.

Role of women in the PSU Bank Unions thus becomes crucial. The number of women in apex level committees and at decision making level is minimal. The Unions must concentrate on the fact and consciously try and get more women in the decision making bodies of the Unions.

Participation of women in decision making will get better involvement from women membership and thus strengthen the Unions. The PSU Bank unions need all their strength to face challenges thrown at them by the new globalised economy. Here the women members can play a decisive role in strengthening the union might.

### **Role Of UNI Global Union In Empowerment Of Women In Affiliates**

UNI Global Union and UNI Asia Pacific have made it their priority agenda to have proportionate women representation in their affiliates. 40/40 is a campaign run by UNI for its affiliates where the affiliates pledge to have minimum 40% representation of women in all decision-making bodies of the unions and in all UNI events. The Asia Pacific region is making resolute progress to achieve this under active encouragement from Bro. Christopher Ng, Regional Secretary, UNI Asia Pacific. UNI APRO has been holding empowerment programs and capacity development projects for women members from its affiliates. UNI Indian Liaison Council (UNI ILC) has affiliates from strongest unions in Public Sector Banks and their women members have participated in the programs and are inspired to take up more responsible positions in the unions. The affiliates are also encouraged to form Women Committees to discuss the issues of women members. Safety and security at workplace and the Sexual Harassment Prevention and Protection Act is discussed in all UNI ILC programs.

UNI APRO regularly invites its affiliates to nominate women in their programs within India and abroad which gives the opportunity for women to share their experiences and best practices in the unions. It also helps build a strong network of women activists across the nations and the region. UNI APRO has an active Women Committee which meets regularly to decide strategic priorities and discusses the women's issues in the society and the trade unions where the women from affiliates across the Asia Pacific region participate.

# **Nature and Forms of Discrimination Experienced by Dalit Women in Urban Labour Market in Delhi**

**Anuradha Banerjee**

Professor, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi

banerjee.anb@gmail.com

## **Background**

Limited access to urban labour market and discrimination at work place experienced by women is the result of a complex set of cross cutting issues of gender, caste and class marginalisation in the Indian society, which not only debar women's access to education and skill formation, but also force them to a 'low-paid, low-income' situation. Liberalisation, globalisation and rural-urban migration have increased in formalisation of the urban labour market and women are found at the lowest segment in the work and income hierarchy. Gender configuration in patriarchal society already delimits women's access to education and skill formation. Dalit women constitute the lowest rung of the entire endemic process. They are often distress driven and forced to enter low paid casual work which requires no special skill or education. These casual works are informal in nature and are characterised by low wage, irregularity in wage payment, uncertain job tenure, lack of leaves and vacation during ill health and pregnancies. Moreover, lack of legal protection often makes workers vulnerable to verbal, physical and sexual abuses by the employers. All these factors are accentuated into multiple vulnerabilities of Dalit women of ten transgressing the 'women workers' under similar circumstances.

## **Conceptual Framework**

The study has attempted to take cognizance of the multiple layers of discrimination in order to capture the problems of the Dalit women in low income jobs in the urban labour market. Social discrimination as in case of the Dalit woman often transcends class differentiation. Hence, the problems become compounded several times because of the Dalit identity, even in similar circumstances.

### *i. Overt Barriers to Access in the Urban Labour Market / Background Variables*

Barriers are due to several factors like Poverty, Poor Education and Gender Discrimination reinforced by Caste, and it results in either few years of schooling, higher levels of dropouts, and low quality of education. This ultimately leads to low skill formation, low levels of acquired training and finally gets manifested in less or nil work experience. Poverty, class and caste have complex ramifications that shape the background variables.

### *ii. Forced entry in Low/Poor income jobs*

The first set off actors as given above results in 'Necessity' driven or 'Push' driven entry into the low income sector of the labour market either in the form of casual/ informal work or 'low-end

low-paid' job in any sector. This also results in the forced acceptance of low end jobs, contractual jobs, home based jobs and piece rate jobs that fetch either subsistence or below subsistence level earnings.

### *iii. On-Job Problems*

These are associated with the professions in which these women are engaged- like lop –sided division of labour even within the same profession, physical segmentation of the labour market, women working under the constraints of the binding decision of the male members, discriminations in earnings, disadvantages in combining household jobs within come, getting a job through informal contacts and resultant low bargaining power, issue of constrained choice and limited contacts; residual labour participation restricting skill formation and upward mobility; hazardous nature of the job and multi - jobs of 'dead-end' variety. All these have implications on the well-being of Dalit women including health.

### *iv. Compounded Problems of Dalit Women*

Unequal outcomes between the Dalit women and women from other communities under similar circumstances of the already existing multi-layered deprivation result in compounded problems and extended vulnerability of this group, reinforcing negative outcomes in various spheres like earnings, health including mental health, dignity and integrity of human being and women in particular. Manifestations of caste based discrimination / deprivation may surface through various forms of unequal behaviour, untouchability in low end jobs, indecent behaviour / harassment on part of the employers or colleagues, verbal or sexual abuse or violence, unfair terms and conditions of work and in general insecurity and alienability to both work and work environment.

Therefore, Dalit working woman's problems are not only vis-à-vis men and the institutions, but also vis-à-vis other women in the same socio-economic category. These intersections of the adverse factors, as described above, reinforce vulnerability of more than one type as a result of multiple forms of discrimination amongst women belonging to these groups. Thus, a vicious cycle of discrimination, low income, poverty and vulnerability exists among this group, and the escape from this poses an arduous and an uphill task.

## **Objectives**

The main aim of this empirical study is to identify the problems and experiences; particularly the multiple layers of discrimination and their inter- sectionalities faced by Dalit women in low paid jobs in the urban labour market vis-à-vis other women under similar circumstances in Delhi. The specific objectives are:

- To trace the background factors / barriers against access/ entry into the urban labour market or forced entry into casual/informal service sector or other low paid jobs.
- To examine the nature of problems, exclusion and discrimination faced by Dalit women

as compared to her women in three types of ‘tail-end’ jobs viz.

1. House hold jobs as domestic maids
  2. Sweepers and cleaners or sanitation workers
  3. Other self-employed women
- To explore “perceived discrimination” of Dalit women in the low-paid low-end jobs in the urban labour market.

## **Research Hypotheses**

The study has considered certain workable hypotheses such as:

- i. Access/entry of women in the urban labour market in some occupation is restricted due to caste factor and the stigma of untouchability.
- ii. Forced entry into casual / informal or other low paid jobs get even more entrenched due to the caste factor often transgressing gender, patriarchy and class.
- iii. Dalit women face multiple deprivations and discrimination at work that transcends those faced by women in similar conditions.
- iv. Adversities faced by Dalit women in low income jobs have negative consequences on their well-being including health.

## **Data And Methods**

The study though based on a mixed method approach, is more inclined towards the analysis of field based evidences.

The secondary sources include documentation of literature, information and data obtained from the NSSO Rounds (for example the 55<sup>th</sup> and 66<sup>th</sup> Rounds) for ascertaining macro level picture of casualisation in India and Delhi with a focus on male female differentials.

Primary or field data has been generated through structured questionnaires on domestic maids, sweepers and cleaners for sanitation workers and other self- employed women during March to May, 2013.

The research methodology, therefore, includes structured questionnaires, collection of experiences through both self-reporting as well as inferential observations, focus group discussions to capture additional patterns of discrimination and finally a telephonic audit study of job providers “*to catch the discriminators in the act of discrimination*”.

The information compiled thereof has been subjected to quantitative and qualitative methods of data handling for analytical purposes. Quantitative analysis includes percentages, cross-tabulations, chi-square tests and regression / logistic regression analysis whereas qualitative techniques include case studies / in-depth interviews, FGDs and audit study.

## **Main Findings**

Though marginalisation is the common feature of women in casual work, the nature and forms of deprivations, vulnerabilities and discrimination varied across the three occupation types. Among social factors, caste has been of primary importance and Dalit women have found to face discrimination of a higher order than the SC and OBC women under similar circumstances.

Certain features were found common for all women in casual work. These include the deplorable conditions of their settlements, large family size, poverty, debt burden mostly from informal sources, uncertainty of work and fluctuating income; low levels of literacy and awareness, occupational shifts, and poor health outcomes. However, the caste factor was found to cut across all these features, and the aggregate discrimination results show Dalit women being even more marginalised in the process.

Dalit women in casual labour were found to be discriminated and deprived both at the household level, work sphere as well as in social life. In addition to the data and tests of significance, the audit study and case studies exemplify instances of discrimination existing in our society. They have been discriminated at the entry point to labour market because of their caste. This had arisen also because of their history of discrimination in literacy, education and skill development though similar for all women across different caste categories engaged in casual work. Hence, they are forced into informal work and here employer's decisions play a major role in recruiting them. Many of the Dalit women, it had been noticed, do not get work of their choice and are thus forced into jobs not desired by them. Sometimes they hide their identities themselves, or the placement agencies change their name before providing them to their clients.

Discrimination of Dalit women was also observed in their work place. However, the nature and forms of discrimination are variable across the occupation groups. These include rude behaviour of the employer and other colleagues, non receipt of wages on time, not getting work of their preference (like cooking in case of domestic maids), discriminatory treatment during festivals or ill health, sexual abuse as well as other on-job denials.

Of all the work categories, the highest discrimination was found among the sweepers and cleaners, who are entirely Dalit women, mostly Balmikis. They have often reported harsh behaviour by the employers and indifference by them towards their problems. Among the self employed women and Dalit women, various forms of discrimination have been noticed both from the raw material providers as well as from the clients.

Again, various problems have been observed in social life among women in informal work, particularly the Dalits. In spite of earning, they often do not have autonomy over spending their money. Domestic maids, for instance, often reported that they do not disclose their income to their husbands or other family members for the fear of shelling out their meagre income for unproductive purposes by other family members, particularly by husbands. Moreover, domestic violence and husbands vices have been reported in some cases. Again in certain cases, women did not receive equal treatment at the natal place commensurate to their brothers or other male members.

Though occupation based social discrimination is found across women from the three categories, this is particularly marked among the sweepers and cleaners as well as the self – employed women signifying that Dalit women in particular face such discrimination because of their job profile. This kind of behaviour is usually by the upper castes as found in the survey.

Because of social stratification, practice of untouchability and discrimination of the so called lower castes particularly, the Dalits have created certain perceptions about them selves. Therefore, questions were administered regarding perceived discrimination or the discrimination envisaged by them as it arises out of them being Dalits. Questions were asked on how they perceive the caste factor acting as a hindrance in seeking employment opportunities. Most women, particularly the Dalits and the SCs, exhibited very strong perceived discrimination based on their caste.

Therefore, certain policy initiatives are required on part of the Government as well as that of the civil society to address the problems of women in casual work, particularly the Dalits. The Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment, Ministry of Urban Development and Poverty Alleviation and various other Ministries should work in liaison to redress their problems. The most crucial of all the problems is the unregulated nature of the informal sector that makes the workers not only vulnerable due to the lack of bargaining power, but they are also often exploited in the absence of any labour unions and labour laws. The problems get accentuated by the low levels of literacy, lack of skills hence lack of manpower development, lack of family support and exploitation by employers. All these issues are of utmost significance and should be redressed for societal upliftment.

## References

- Abramo, Laís (2003) *Notas Sobre la Incorporación de la Dimensión de Género a la Políticas de Empleo y Erradicación de la Pobreza en América Latina*, in Janina Fernández-Pacheco (ed.), *Género y Mercado de Trabajo. Honduras y Nicaragua: Proyecto: Género, Pobreza y Empleo en América Latina* (San José: Organización Internacional del Trabajo) 15–41.
- Banerjee, Biswajit and J.B. Knight (1985), “Caste Discrimination in the Indian Urban Labour Market.” *Journal of Development Economics*. 17:277-307. [Re-

published in William Darity, Jr. (ed.). 1995. *Economics and Discrimination: Volume II*. Aldershot: U.K. Edward Elgar Publishing Limited].

- Chan, Anita (2003) *A 'Race to the Bottom': Globalisation and China's Labour Standards*, China Perspectives, 46 (March–April), 41–49.
- Deshpande, Ashwini (2001) *Caste at Birth? Redefining Disparity in India*. Review of Development Economics. 5(1):130–44.
- El-Solh, Camilla Fawzi (2003) *Gender, Poverty and Employment in the Arab Region, Capacity-Building Programme on Gender, Poverty and Employment Discussion Paper* (Geneva: International Labour Office).
- Fernández-Pacheco, Janina (2003a) *Género, Pobreza y Mercado de Trabajo para las Mujeres en Honduras*, in Janina Fernández-Pacheco (ed.), *Género y Mercado de Trabajo. Honduras y Nicaragua: Proyecto: Género, Pobreza y Empleo en América Latina* (San José: Organización Internacional del Trabajo) 43–153.
- Geetika, Tripti Singh and Anvita Gupta (2011), *Women Working in Informal Sector in India: A Case of Lopsided Utilization of Human Capital* International Conference on Economics and Finance Research IPEDR vol.4(2011) ©(2011) IACSIT Press, Singapore.
- Jauch, Herbert (2002) *Export-processing Zones and the Quest for Sustainable Development: A Southern African Perspective*, Environment and Urbanisation, 14:1, 101–13
- Jhabvala, Renana (2007) *A Bottom-up Approach in India*, Habitat Debate 13:2, A Look at the Urban Informal Economy (Nairobi: UN–HABITAT) [Online] Available at: [www.unhabitat.org/pmss/getElectronicVersion.asp?nr=2366&alt=1](http://www.unhabitat.org/pmss/getElectronicVersion.asp?nr=2366&alt=1) [Accessed September 2016].
- J. Jeyaranjan and Padmini Swaminathan (Reviewed) (1999): *Resilience of Gender Inequities: Women and Employment in Chennai*, Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. 34, No. 16/17 (Apr. 17–30, 1999), pp. WS2–WS11.
- Harriss-White Barbara and Prakash Aseem, 2010 *Social Discrimination In India: A Case For Economic Citizenship*, Oxford University CSASP - Work in Progress Paper 5,
- (<http://www.southasia.ox.ac.uk/sites/sias/files/documents/Oxford%20University%20CSASP%20Work%20in%20Progress%20Paper%205%20SOCIAL%20DISCRIMINATION%20IN%20INDIA%20A%20CASE%20FOR%20ECONOMIC%20CITIZENSHIP.pdf> accessed on 16/9/2016)
- Heintz, James (2006) *Globalisation, Economic Policy and Employment: Poverty and Gender Implications* (Geneva: International Labour Office, Employment Policy Unit, Employment Strategy Department) [Online] Available at: [www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/download/esp2006-3.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/download/esp2006-3.pdf) [Accessed September 2014].



- Kalpagam,U. 2001; *Globalisation, Liberalisation and Women Workers in the Informal Sector* in Kundu and Sharma (eds.)
- Kundu, Amitabh and Alakh.N.Sharma (eds) (2001): *Informal Sector in India: perspectives and Politics*, Institute for Human Development, New Delhi
- MaitreyiBordiaDas,(2006),*DoTraditionalAxesofExclusionAffectLaborMarketOutcomesinIndia?*PartI:FemaleLaborForceParticipationAndtheEffectsofGenderPartII:Caste,EthnicityandtheIndianLaborMarketSOCIALDEVELOPMENTPAPERSPerspectives”,InternationalLabourOrganisation(ILO),SubregionalOfficeNewDelhi,India.
- Mitra,Arup (2001), —Employment in the Informal Sector□, in A. Kundu and A. N. Sharma (eds.) *Informal Sector in India: perspectives and Policies*, Institute of Human Development, Delhi.
- Mitra,Arup  
(2005)*WomenintheUrbanInformalSector:PerpetuationofMeagreEarningsDevelopmentand Change*36(2):291–  
316(2005),InstituteofSocialStudies2005.PublishedbyBlackwellPublishing,9600Garsington Road,OxfordOX42DQ,UKand350MainSt.,Malden,MA02148,USA.
- RosemaryCromptonandFionaHarris,(1998),*ExplainingWomen'sEmploymentPatterns:'OrientationstoWork'*,*TheBritishJournalofSociology*,Vol.49,No.1(Mar.,1998),pp.118-136;Publishedby:BlackwellPublishingonbehalfofTheLondonSchoolofEconomicsandPoliticalScience.
- Sen, Gita and Sen, Chiranjib (1984): 'Women's Domestic Work and Economic Activity: Results from the National Sample Survey; *Economic and Political Weekly* 20 (17).
- ShaktiKak(1994),  
*RuralWomenandLabourForceParticipation*,*SocialScientist*,Vol.22,No.3/4(Mar.-Apr.,1994),pp.35-59.
- Silveira, Sara and Matosas, Ana Clara (2003) *Género y Economía Informal en América Latina.NuevosRetos y RespuestasPosiblesdesdelasPolíticas de Formaciónpara el Trabajo*, BoletínCinterfor, 155, 231–262.
- Srivastava,N.andSrivastava,R.(2010),“Women,WorkandEmploymentOutcomesinRuralIndia”,*EconomicandPoliticalWeekly*,Vol.XLV,No.28.
- StephanKlasenandJannekePieters(2012):DiscussionPaperNo.6395,February,UniversityofGöttingenandIZA.
- SurjitS.BhallaandRavinderKaur(2006)*LabourForceParticipationofWomeninIndia:Somefacts,somequeries*ASIARESEARCHCENTREWORKINGPAPER40PartII:Caste,EthnicityandtheIndianLaborMarketSOCIALDEVELOPMENTPAPERSPerspectives”,InternationalLabourOrganisation(ILO),SubregionalOfficeNewDelhi,India.

- Sylvia Chant and Carolyn Pedwell, (2008) *Women, gender and the informal economy: An assessment of ILO research and suggested ways forward* London School of Economics (Discussion paper).
- Rosemary Crompton and Fiona Harris, (1998), *Explaining Women's Employment Patterns: 'Orientation to Work'*, *The British Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 49, No. 1 (Mar., 1998), pp. 118-136; Published by: Blackwell Publishing on behalf of The London School of Economics and Political Science.
- Xaba, Jantjie; Horn Par and Motala, Shirin (2002) *Informal Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa*, Working Paper on the Informal Economy No. 10 (Geneva: International Labour Office).
- Valenzuela, María Elena (2005) *Informality and Gender in Latin America*, Policy Integration & Statistics Department (INTEGRATION) Working Paper 60 (Geneva: International Labour Office). [Online] Available at: [www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/integration/download/publicat/4\\_3\\_375\\_wp-60.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/integration/download/publicat/4_3_375_wp-60.pdf) [Accessed September 2007]

# **The Curious Case of Returning Mothers: A Phenomenological Enquiry into the Lived Experiences of Working New Mothers**

**AparnaVarma & Rahul Sivarajan**

Integrated M. Phil-Ph.D Scholars, School of Management and Labour Studies, TISS, Mumbai  
[mm2017mls004@tiss.edu](mailto:mm2017mls004@tiss.edu)

## **Background**

Understanding ideal motherhood and motherhood in organisations

Traditionally women left paid employment and stayed at home while their children were still young. The social role of that of the carer and nurturer has bestowed the child rearing duties to them. However, the number of married women working outside their homes after the Second World War rose rapidly despite widespread criticism of working wives and mothers. A more consumer-oriented society drew women into the work force, even as affluence changed the way women defended a desire to work. Women started to enter the workforce in large numbers before affluence was particularly widespread, and many women stated that they worked to help their families acquire the accoutrements of affluence—although any status as affluent workers has been denied them. The discourse of working mothers, families and extras created a vicious circle. The tendency to characterize women's work as being for pin money ironically strengthened the male breadwinner ideal in the face of the major social shift regarding married women's work. It also upheld the notion of women's position as second-tier workers outside the real workforce, depriving them of any possible status as affluent workers in their own right. (Wilson, 2006) Several studies over the years have spoken vividly about motherhood being a significant reason for the career burnouts in women (Juliette, Doris, & Carter, 2013) (Kanji & Cahusac, 2015). What they jangle between is not just the concept of 'home' and 'work', but an entire question that revolves around their changed identities and a notion of what is considered 'ideal'. Motherhood is a term that is long associated with the concept of ideal, primarily because the society endows the nurturing and upbringing of the child as a little more of a mother's responsibility than the fathers'. Nevertheless, studies on intensive mothering calls it a child-centered, expert-guided, emotionally absorbing, labor intensive, financially expensive ideology in which mothers are primarily responsible for the nurture and development of the sacred child and in which children's needs take precedence over the individual needs of their mothers. (Johnston & Swanson, 2006)

Motherhood as a process starts with conceiving the off spring, pregnancy, childbirth and nurturing the child to adulthood, where in, in an organizational setup, each of these processes are seen with a certain amount of stigma attached to it. The work culture's labor expectations are more consistent with the breadwinner-father and stay-home-mother reality of the 1950s and 1960s than with the parent-workers of today who are struggling to enact both roles simultaneously. (Hochschild&Machung, 2003) However, (Johnston & Swanson, 2006) also argues that what we

consider the “dominant” mothering ideology is the privilege of married middle-class women who can afford to stay at home with their children; indeed, many have argued that the parental attention and involvement of stay-home mothering is a means of transferring middle-class status to children. The ideologies of ‘good mothers’ are significantly different in the cases of the at-home mother, the part-time employed mothers and the full-time employed mothers. In the same study, when asked what makes a “good mother,” by far the most frequent, dominant, and repeated theme in the responses of at-home mothers was “being there.” A “bad mother” is the one who is “not there” or who “works” and consequently is not always available to her child. Although “being there” reflects a rather passive mother role, it discursively constructs the mother as central, essential, and irreplaceable for the child’s development. Entirely different from this is the idea of a ‘good mother’ for the full-time employed mother, who isn’t always physically accessible or available to the children. Therefore, it is not surprising that they primarily constructed good mothering in terms of psychological and emotional accessibility.

However, despite a long history of theoretical endeavours, the ‘maternal body’ is still, often, unwelcome within professional and managerial settings. The term ‘maternal body’ has become accepted parlance within sociological and management studies to describe women’s capacity for reproduction, with a focus on pregnancy and the nurturing of infant children. Although there are differences between the experiences of pregnant and newly maternal women, especially relating to the transition from pregnancy to motherhood, the term maternal body aptly encapsulates those characteristics which link pregnancy and new maternity, such as exhaustion, anxiety and the potential of the maternal body to change shape and produce fluids. It also articulates employers’ discomfort around maternity.

Within organizational contexts, mothers are often cast as ‘other’ (Young, 2005). Their position is ‘tenuous’ and may be unfavourably ‘revised’ during pregnancy and new maternity (Ashcraft, 1999: 275; Mäkelä, 2009). Employed mothers’ situation is thus much debated, yet continues to evade resolution. More often than not, pregnancy and new maternity mark the point when professionally and managerially employed women find it most difficult to conform to organizational expectations about bodily comportment (Longhurst, 2008; Warren and Brewis, 2004). Within managerial and professional life, as (Wolkowitz, 2006) observes, ‘implicit organizational rules concerning the presentation of the body’ are problematic for female workers. Even without the added complication of pregnancy and new motherhood, professionally and managerially employed women may engage in complex forms of body work, moulding their bodies to try and fit into the terms of ‘prevailing masculine’ cultures. Shilling (2008), further observes how such women are under conflicting pressures as they navigate the embodied demands of masculine organizational cultures while also endeavouring to display ‘expected traits of a feminine persona’. Additionally, as women strive to be identified with the ‘symbolic order of professionalism’ (Haynes, 2011), they feel under pressure to present bodies which appear ‘controlled, self-contained and slender’ (Haynes, 2011), such outward ‘control of the body’

symbolizing a form of self-regulation which is ‘central to the embodiment of the professional’ (Haynes, 2011; Warren and Brewis, 2004).

### Defining maternal stoicism and self-efficacy

(Gatrell, 2013) studies 22 women in their attempts to avoid marginalization, engaged in the maternal body work of stoicism or in other words, ‘working through’ periods of ill health without complaint during pregnancy and new maternity, which she calls the ‘maternal body work of stoicism’. The practice of stoicism, especially when unwell, has previously been observed among pregnant women and defined as ‘pregnant presenteeism’. However, there remain uncertainties regarding why some mothers continue stoically ‘working through’ ill health. Reflecting on reasons for their stoical approach to paid work, mothers in this study cited their wish to maintain separation between the borders of the ‘private’ world of reproduction (Ashcraft, 1999) and their workplaces. Mothers’ desire to avoid marginalization induced them to ‘work through’ tiredness and ill health in an attempt to associate themselves with the traits of immutability, sociability and intellect.

(Bandura, 1997) defines self-efficacy as “beliefs in one's capabilities to organize and execute the courses of action required to produce given attainments.” Generalized self-efficacy beliefs can be distinguished from domain-specific self-efficacy beliefs. As the research sites explored in this study are based in formal workplace environments, occupational self-efficacy beliefs of respondents would be examined in detail. They denote the belief in one's capacity and motivation to master work-related challenges and to successfully pursue one's occupational career (Higgins, Dobrow, & Chandler, 2008).

### Objectives

The paper intends to articulate the maternal tensions of negotiating borders between private and public worlds of reproduction and work and its effects on the new mothers’ self efficacy. In doing so, it also intends to cover the following objectives:

- To explore the various strategies employed by the new mothers to reduce the dissonance between maternal body work of reproduction and paid work, and how much this would potentially affect their self-efficacy.
- To highlight the problems experienced by mothers regarding workplace and societal expectations that they should maintain ‘workplace sanctity’ by delineating the extensive labour of good mothering (as defined within health narratives) from the normative code and conduct of the workplace.
- To understand whether stoicism is the preferred and prevalent mode of practice for women in India for coping with workplace discrimination post partum, or if the feminist discourses have encouraged open discussions on the stigmas related to pregnancy at the workplace.

Its contribution to the existing literature would be to understand how maternal stoicism help in negotiating boundaries between reproduction and organisation and whether it will have an effect on the self-efficacy perceived by the new mothers. This relationship is briefly suggested in (Cioffi, 1991) where he says that at least four psychological mechanisms could account for the association between self-efficacy and behavioral outcome of an individual, of which one is that the efficacious person perceives and is distressed by physical sensations but simply persists in the face of them; or in other words, displays stoicism. However, this area appears niche especially in the case of motherhood, which this study intends to further explore.

## **Research Methodology**

This is a working paper where the study is being conducted across various organized sectors, where women engage in a plethora of jobs: from IT consultants to school teachers to scientists. The study is intended to be pan-industrial to be exhaustive in the coverage of the experiences of pregnancy for all these returning women, still in consideration of the reality that the treatment of it is different in different sectors. While BPO's and schools are more rigid in their work-time, the same isn't the case with scientists. The study participants who were considered for the study had common characteristics, in that they were all first-time married mothers who had returned to full-time paid work after paid maternity leave. This helped to minimise the likelihood of the present experience being coloured by previous happenings of motherhood. The sampling method used for this particular study was purposive sampling as it is considered to be appropriate when conducting phenomenological studies (Polit, Beck, & Hungler, 2001). Participants were carefully selected; individuals who had experienced the phenomenon in question and willing to give detailed descriptions about their own personal experience. Fifteen participants were recruited to take part in the study, because in phenomenological studies, small sample sizes are allowed since the emphasis is on gaining the detailed accounts of individual experiences (Smith, Flowers, & Larkin, 2009). The participants had infants aging from 26 weeks (two weeks after their re-entry into the organisation after a 24 week paid maternity leave) to 40 weeks, which meant that the experiences could be traced to have had significant changes in the few weeks after the re-entry. A semi-structured interview guide containing eight general questions are specifically planned for the purpose of the study. Open-ended questions are used in order to encourage respondents to explain their answers and reactions to the questions being asked. The interview guides are planned in both Malayalam and English languages, since the study is based in Trivandrum, Kerala (14 out of the fifteen women had Malayalam as their mother-tongue). The languages were used interchangeably, when the participants felt the need to use their mother-tongue to express certain experiences better. The study by Smith, Flowers, & Larkin (2009) served as a guide in the formulation of questions for the interview guides wherein roughly the experiences of transition and support systems were also emphasized upon, alongside the experiences of stoicism and its effects on the self-efficacy.

Since the study is in the phase of data collection, data analysis is intended to be done using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) as described by (Smith, Flowers, & Larkin,

2009) where each individual transcript needs to be read over and over again while notes were made on significant issues identified by the participants. The resultant data/text is being coded and labelled using key words. Code families are then created; indicating various relationships between the selected codes grouped into emerging types. When the code families or the emergent themes in interpretative phenomenological analysis are generated, they can be visualised according to the plausible networks.

This is intended to bring in more clarity via a resultant code-to-code network thus enabling insights into a higher level of analysis, resulting in potential theory generation.

## References

- Ashcraft, K. L. (1999). Managing maternity leave: A qualitative analysis of temporary executive succession. *Administrative Science Quarterly* 44(2). , 240–280.
- Bandura, A. (1997). *Self-efficacy. The exercise of control*. New York : Freeman.
- Cioffi, D. (1991). Beyond attentional strategies: a cognitive-perceptual model of somatic interpretation. *Psychological Bulletin*, 109(1) , 25–41.
- Haynes, K. (2011). Body beautiful? Gender, identity and the body in professional services firms. *Gender, Work and Organization* .
- Higgins, M. C., Dobrow, S. R., & Chandler, D. (2008). Never quite good enough: The paradox of sticky developmental relationships for elite university graduates. *Journal of Vocational Behavior* , 207–224.
- Hochschild, A. R., & Machung, A. (2003). *The Second Shift: Working Families and the Revolution at Home*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Johnston, D. D., & Swanson, D. H. (2006). Constructing the “Good Mother”: The Experience of Mothering Ideologies by Work Status. *Sex Roles* , 509-519.
- Juliette, S., Doris, R. E., & Carter, S. (2013). Opting out of corporate careers: portraits from a women's magazine . *Employee Relations*, 33-48.
- Kanji, S., & Cahusac, E. (2015). Who am I? Mothers’ shifting identities, loss and sensemaking after workplace exit. *Human Relations*, 1415-1436.
- Longhurst, R. (2008). *Maternities: Gender, Bodies and Space*. New York: Routledge.
- Mäkelä, L. (2009). Representations of change within dyadic relations between leader and follower: Discourses of pregnant followers. *Leadership* 5(2) , 171–192.
- Polit, D., Beck, C., & Hungler, B. (2001). *Essentials of nursing research; Methods, appraisal and utilization* (5th ed.). Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Smith, J., Flowers, P., & Larkin, M. (2009). *Interpretative phenomenological analysis: Theory, method and research*. . Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications Ltd.

- Warren, S., & Brewis, J. (2004). Matter over mind? Examining the experience of pregnancy. *Sociology* 38(2): , 219–236 .
- Wilson, D. S. (2006). A New Look at the Affluent Worker: The Good Working Mother in Post-War Britain. *Twentieth Century British History* , 206-229.
- Wolkowitz, C. (2006). *Bodies at Work*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Young, I. M. (2005). *On Female Body Experience: ‘Throwing Like a Girl’ and Other Essays*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.



# **Role of Transport Infrastructure on Female Work Participation and Shifting from Agricultural to Non-Agricultural Sector**

## **Apoorva Shukla**

M.Phil. Scholar, IIPS, Mumbai

apoorva.iips@gmail.com

## **Dr. Reshmi R. S.**

Assistant Professor, IIPS, Mumbai

reshmi@iips.net, srreshmi@gmail.com

## **Background**

India is a developing country with almost 70% of population living in the rural area (census 2011) of which many of them are engaged and dependent on agricultural sector for their livelihood. In India, majority of females are economically weak as compared to males because most of female population have not knowledge to access economic resources. The female work force participation is very low which is only 25 % as compared to male work participation 53% (census 2011). Due to lack of autonomy and decision making power, participation of rural women is concentrated more in the agricultural sector. Women participation in decision making is influenced by various factors such as social norms governing gender biasness while allocation roles and responsibility also related to economic and structural factors. According to the National Sample Survey (NSS, 2009-10) the rural workforce in non-agricultural sectors, accounts for about 37 percent males and only 20 percent of the females.

Generally education, age, marital status, and fertility and family background are considered for the significant changes in women's labor market outcomes. Very few attention has been paid to transportation. Transportation also play a vital role in accessing employment opportunities. Transportation gives path to connect with employment opportunities especially in rural area. Construction and development of roads leads to a large reallocation of female labor out of agriculture and into labor markets (Lei & Vanneman, 2017). Transportation builds a convenient platform and environment for women to get involved in nonagricultural employment and increases access to education and market benefit for women. Evidences show improvement in transportation infrastructure is very important with it to make sure that the opportunity to use these facility is passed on to both the genders equally especially women only then we would be able to bridge the gender gap as then both the gender gets and equal opportunity of exposure and chance to earn livelihood and reduce the dependency on other.

## **Objective**

- To examine the role of transportation infrastructure on female work participation and shifting from agricultural to non-agricultural sector.

## **Data Sources and Methodology**

### **Data Sources**

The present study used secondary data from national representative Indian Human Development Survey (IHDS-I, 2004-05) and the follow up of the same households in IHDS-II (2011-12) conducted by NCEAR and university of Maryland. The survey covered all the states and union territories of India except Lakshadweep and Andaman & Nicobar Island and 83% of the household are reassessed in the later survey.

### **Methodology**

This analysis is based on combined data of four files namely household file, individual file, eligible women file and the village file of both the rounds of IHDS. The analysis of levels and trends is based on the same respondents who were involved in IHDS I and II. Those respondents who were not involved in both the rounds of the survey, urban population and population aged less than 15 years were excluded from the analysis.

In this study we are focusing on change in only women's shifting from agricultural to non-agricultural employment. The dependent variable for this analysis is a dichotomous variable reflecting participation in non-agricultural work at each wave of the IHDS. It is coded 1 if the respondent participates in any type of non-farm work for more than 240 hours per year. This includes manual labour at daily rates, salary work, and work in own business. The reference category (coded 0) is not participating in any non-farm work, meaning that the respondent could be not working, working on own farms, or working as an agricultural labourer.

The analysis was based on a sample of 32,428 women population. To showing the level and trends in types of employment bivariate analysis has been done. Panel analysis was used to examine the effect of time-varying is an appropriate statistical method for longitudinal data analysis. For panel analysis, the random effect logit model was used. Whereas dependent variable is types of employment which is classified in two categories in which reference category is agricultural employment and other is non-agricultural employment.

### **Women employment status**

Women face unequal treatment and restriction throughout their life, due to which women are mostly concentrated to household and agricultural sector. The unequal accesses to resources, opportunities and rewards and to rights between men and women are legitimized by patriarchy across societies and cultures (Grusky,2001). Majority of them have no right to accesses opportunities and resources like men as a reason for which women become economically weaker than men.

**Table-1.1: Types of employment among rural women, (2005-2012), India**

	<b>2005</b>		<b>2012</b>		
<b>Types of employment</b>	<b>Percent</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Percent</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Absolute change</b>
<b>Agricultural</b>	75.9	24,636	69.5	22,562	-6.4
<b>Non-agricultural</b>	24	7,792	30.4	9,866	6.4
<b>Total</b>	100	32,428	100	32,428	

Types of employment among rural women presented in above it is observed that between inter survey period women has shifted from agricultural to non-agricultural employment. In 2005, 75.9% women were involved in agricultural employment but it has decreased in 2012, 69.5%. Whereas increment has seen in non-agricultural employment in 2005, 24% women were involved in non-agricultural employment which has reached to 30.4%. The absolute change found positively in involvement in non-agricultural employment.

**Table-1.2 Types of employment among rural women by background characteristics.**

<b>Background Characteristics</b>	<b>2005</b>			<b>2012</b>		
	<b>Agricultural</b>	<b>Non-agricultural</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>Agricultural</b>	<b>Non-agricultural</b>	<b>N</b>
<b>Age-group***</b>						
Less than 20	83.7	16.3	3,035	80.4	19.6	138
21-30	75.8	24.2	8,690	68.6	31.5	5,549
31-40	67.4	32.6	8,125	60.5	39.5	8,385
41-50	72.9	27.1	5,782	62.2	37.8	7,201
51 & above	85.5	14.5	6,796	81.5	18.5	11,155
<b>Religion***</b>						
Hindu	74.0	26.0	27,291	67.7	32.3	27,291
Muslim	87.8	12.2	2,979	83.1	17.0	2,979
Christian	85.3	14.7	830	72.2	27.8	830
Sikh	95.9	4.1	901	83.9	16.1	901
Others	62.1	37.9	427	57.9	42.2	427
<b>Caste Group***</b>						
General	89.5	10.6	8,917	85.8	14.2	8,917
OBC	76.9	23.1	13,208	71.1	28.9	13,208
SC	67.5	32.5	6,952	55.4	44.6	6,952
ST	54.1	45.9	3,351	49.8	50.2	3,351
<b>Marital Status***</b>						
Married	75.5	24.5	27,340	68.2	31.8	25,367
Unmarried	86.2	13.8	1,399	78.3	21.7	1,174
Widow/separated	75.3	24.7	3,682	73.7	26.3	5,882

Background Characteristics	2005			2012		
	Agricultural	Non-agricultural	N	Agricultural	Non-agricultural	N
<b>Education***</b>						
No	62.2	37.8	19,234	66.2	33.8	19,234
Primary	74.7	25.3	5,262	70.4	29.6	5,262
Middle	83.0	17.0	4,720	76.3	23.7	4,720
High School	89.9	10.1	1,521	82.8	17.2	1,521
Intermediate	87.6	12.4	929	76.6	23.4	929
Higher	79.8	20.2	729	71.6	28.4	729
<b>Wealth Index***</b>						
Poorest	46.8	53.2	3,467	47.1	52.9	3,389
Poorer	65.3	34.7	3,959	55.1	44.9	3,393
Middle	67.3	32.8	2,388	56.4	43.6	3,422
Rich	80.0	20.0	2,889	65.6	34.4	3,301
Richest	92.7	7.4	3,157	84.4	15.7	3,374

When we try to understand the data from the socio economic and demographical point it can be observed that there is positive increase in the non-agricultural employment in all the various distinguishing factors. Age wise classification shows that women who are in age group less than 20 are more involved in agricultural sector as compared to that of non-agricultural. In the age group of 21- 30 which is the working and active age group here also change has found in involvement in agricultural employment which was 75%, in 2005 and 68%, in 2012. Changed in non-agricultural employment has found in the age group of 31 to 40 also, among them 32.6% population involved in non-agricultural employment which has increased 39.5% in 2012. In the age group of 41 to 50 the overall shift of more than 10% from 2005 to 2012 in involvement in non-agricultural employment. Religion wise result shows that the women from Hindu and Muslim religion among them involvement in non-agricultural grew from 2005 to 2012 by 6% and 4% only whereas in Christians religion grew exceptionally from 14.7% to 27.83% in inter survey period. In the Sikhs religion 4% women involved in non-agricultural employment in 2005 and 16 % in 2012. On the basis of caste groups, it is observed that general category's participation has grown by 4%, in involvement in non-agricultural employment whereas OBC by roughly 5%, SC 12% and ST by 5% from 2005-2012. The other important factor is marital status of women. In case of the married women the percent of non-agricultural employment increased 6% from 24.4% in 2005 to 31.7%. The representation of unmarried women in agriculture related activity is highest amongst the all. It was at 86.2% which got down 78.28% in 2012. Amongst the widow/ Divorced and separated there was slight improvement for the people who shifted towards non agriculture related jobs by 2% which was at 24.6% to 26.3%. In case of educational status, the trend seen women with no education were initially more in non-agriculture work but with time shifted to agriculture related work. In case of wealth index it is found that poorest and poorer women more involved in non-agricultural employment in both rounds as compared to other class.

Whereas their involvement in agricultural sector has decreased from 2005 to 2012. When we look at the middle income group the population the transition at 11% women has shift to non-agricultural work to earn their livelihood, in the rich class the shifting was maximum at almost 14% increase of people shifting towards non-agricultural work. For the richest class the increase in percent was almost double which was at 7.35% in 2005 it increased to 15.65%. Which means the women with more economical stability are seen more shifting towards the non-agricultural means of income for their livelihood.

**Table-1.3: Accessibility of roads by rural women, (2005-2012), India**

Road Accessibility	2005		2012	
	Percent	N	Percent	N
<b>Katcha</b>	36.8	11,957	16.5	5,376
<b>Pucca</b>	63.1	20,471	83.4	27,052
<b>Total</b>	100	32,428	100	32,428

Accessibility of roads by rural women has increased by the time. In 2005, 36.8% women were accessing katcha roads and it's got decreased in 2012 and reached to 16.5%. In counterparts katcha roads accessibility of pucca roads has increased from 2005 to 2012. In 2005 it was 63.1% which has reached to 83.4% in 2012.

**Table-1.4: Types of employment and accessibility of transportation, (2005-2012), India**

	2005			2012		
	Agricultural	Non-agricultural	N	Agricultural	Non-agricultural	N
<b>Katcha</b>	72.0	28.0	11,957	69.01	31.0	5376
<b>Pucca</b>	78.3	21.7	20,471	69.69	30.3	27052
<b>Total</b>	76.0	24.0	32,428	69.58	30.4	32428

Accessibility of roads by women has leads shifting from agricultural related work to non-agricultural among women, in 2005, 28% women were involved in non-agricultural work whose were accessing katcha roads which increased by 3% in 2012. In case of whose are accessing pucca roads among them great change has found in non-agricultural employment in 2005 21.7% and 30.3% in 2012 women were involved in non-agricultural sector. Which indicates with good infrastructure people shift towards non agriculture for their earnings increases.

**Table-1.5: Result of random effect logit model for types of employment, (2005-2012), India**

Selected Characteristics	Odds Ratio
<b>Age-group</b>	
less20®	
21-30	1.6***
31-40	2.5***
41-50	2.0***
51 above	1.1

<b>Selected Characteristics</b>	<b>Odds Ratio</b>
<b>Caste Group</b>	
General®	
OBC	2.9***
SC	5.1***
ST	8.6***
<b>Religion</b>	
Hindu®	
Muslim	0.3***
Christian	0.6***
Sikh	0.4***
Others	1.2
<b>Marital Status</b>	
Married®	
Widow/Separated/Divorce	3.5***
<b>Educational Status</b>	
No®	
Primary	0.8***
Middle	0.5***
High School	0.5***
Intermediate	0.7**
Higher	3.4***
<b>Wealth Index</b>	
Poorest®	
Poorer	0.6***
Middle	0.6***
Rich	0.3***
Richest	0.1***
<b>Accessibility By Roads</b>	
Katcha®	
Pucca	0.9**
<b>Constant</b>	0.1
/lnsig2u	1.1
sigma_u	1.7
<b>Rho</b>	<b>0.5</b>

Result of random effect logit model for types of employment given in table-2.6 it is observed that in case of age group the odds of change in involvement of non-agricultural employment is higher in every age group compared to less than 20 age group, change in the odds of non-agricultural employment is 1.6 ( $p<0.001$ ) times observed in age-group 21-30, 2.5( $p<0.001$ ) times change in age-group 31-40, 2( $p<0.001$ ) times change in 41-50 age-group and 1.1( $p<0.001$ ) times higher in women who belongs from 50 and above age group. Caste group wise also odds of change observed higher in every category compared to general category. In OBC change in odds of non-

agricultural employment is 2.9( $p<0.001$ ) times in SC and ST category change in odds of employment is 5.1( $p<0.001$ ) and 8.6( $p<0.001$ ) times higher. Religion wise scenario is opposite compared to Hindu religion change in odds of involvement in non-agricultural employment is less in other religions. In Muslim religion change in odds of non-agricultural employment is 0.3( $p<0.001$ ) times less in Christian and Sikh odds is 0.6( $p<0.001$ ) and 0.4( $p<0.001$ ) times less has observed. In case of marital status change in odds of involvement in non-agricultural employment is 3.5( $p<0.001$ ) times higher in widow/separated/divorced women compared to married women. Educational status wise change in odds of involvement in non-agricultural employment is 0.7( $p<0.001$ ) times higher in who have qualified primary compared to them who are illiterate. It is observed change in odds of involvement in non-agricultural employment is more in who are highly qualified change in odds are 3.3( $p<0.001$ ) times higher. In case of wealth index change in odds of involvement in non-agricultural employment is less in every class compared to poorer classes. In High richest class odds is 0.1( $p<0.001$ ) times less. In accessibility of transportation change in odds of involvement in non-agricultural employment is less in those are accessing pucca roads as compared to katcha roads the odd of change is 0.9( $p<0.001$ ) times less has observed. The result of rho shows 5% of the variance in the propensity to belong to in involvement in non-agricultural employment can be attributed to individuals.

## Conclusion

The study shows that in rural area majority of women are concentrated to agricultural sector. Low employment status can probably be one of the reasons for low status of women in the society. Increasing involvement in non-agricultural employment varies significantly by the socio-economic and demographic characteristics of the study population. For development of the country development in employment status is a major requirement. Involvement in non-agricultural employment is increasing all over India which could lead to growth of economic development of country and also accelerate development of rural areas. The transition in composition of output and occupation from agriculture to more productive non-farm sectors is considered as an important source of economic growth and transformation in rural and total economy (Chand & Srivastava, 2017).

There are various factors which can have impact on participation in non-agricultural employment. This study has used various parameters such as type of road accessibility (Kutch/Pucca), level of education, socio-economic characteristics of women in terms of caste, religion, marital status and age groups. As the previous studies indicate that there is a significant association between transport infrastructure and women's employment status, role of transport infrastructure on participation in non-agricultural employment has been analysed. The findings show that accessibility of transportation has increased and also the change in non-agricultural employment from 2005 to 2012 is more among them who are accessing pucca roads as compared to katcha roads. Roads provides connectivity from one place to other place. Availability of pucca roads is generally found out of the village and katcha roads are found in the village. Women accessibility

of pucca roads has increased which shows that they are willing to work in those areas which is far from their village.

Village transportation plays a major role in shaping women's employment in the non-agricultural sector. Transportation and female labour force participation are interrelated in India, both female labour force participation and transportation infrastructure has been on a continuous rise from 2005 to 2012. Employment is a tool for improving women status in society and earned income is more effective for better life of women. This study overall highlights that if proper opportunity will be given to women for employment through improved infrastructure and technology with modern thinking then they can also contribute well enough through non agriculture activities. Their participation shows that their competency has increased which indicates that they are more dependent on improved infrastructure to earn their livelihood through other means of income as well.



# **Ignorance of Women's Role in Pastoral Economy: Condition of Pastoral Women in Maharashtra**

**Arati Kade**

Women's Studies MPhil. Scholar, TISS, Mumbai  
arati.k2212@gmail.com

The Pastoral communities are defined by their mode of labor i.e. by kind of work these communities indulge in. There has not been much research on these communities not only due to the fact that they are marginalised by their location in caste structure but also due to constant erosion of their livelihood which is invisibilising these communities. The gender question in the communities doesn't in fact form part of any discussion in many studies which is why there is a huge need to study the gender aspect of these communities. This paper will look paid and unpaid labour of women of Pastoral communities in Maharashtra which are nomadic or semi nomadic communities.

According to report of ActionAid India the contribution of women in animal husbandry is significant. Survey indicates that 40 % of women in pastoral community contributes to this occupation. Although pastoralist women contribute significantly to the pastoral economy, they are not taken into account by mainstream economists. Women does household work and also does livestock breeding and herding.

Women also do the work of weaving blankets from wool or cotton, selling milk. Some movies and autobiographies on pastoral communities shows that women work as labourers in others farm, does household work and take care of livestock, children and carry several kilograms of weight on her head while migrating.

Degradation of traditional pastoral lands force women to spent more time in searching for fodder and also to go to long distance from their pala in search of water and for gathering fuelwood which become less safe for them.

Pastoralists women have poor access to health care facilities and the maternal mortality rate among these women is higher. These women also faces violences such as genital mutilation,

child marriage and rape. These women generally have greater workload than men in this community.

## **Women in Mining**

**Asanda Benya**

Lecturer, University of Cape Town, South Africa

asanda.benya@uct.ac.za

### **Abstract**

One of the biggest shifts the mining industry has witnessed in recent years has been the inclusion of women in underground mining occupations. Previously, women were forbidden from working underground. In post-apartheid South Africa and in keeping up with democratic ideas of non-sexism, policies to redress the exclusion of women have been adopted. While legislatively women have been included in the underground workplace, their experiences tell a different story. The presentation will therefore look at their experiences underground and, from their perspectives and through a gendered lens, share what is happening with women in mining. While popular studies seem to present a single side that often perpetuates and justifies their exclusion from underground, through this presentation we hope to show other sides and the heterogeneity of women working underground. The focus will be on women's experiences and understandings of their work, unionization and how they negotiate the underground space. The inclusion of women in mining has also made clear the links between the home and work space. In our presentation we hope to create a conversation between these two spaces. Data to be presented was collected through the use of participant observation where I worked underground in a Platinum mine as a winch operator and lived with the workers for over a year in Rustenburg.

# **An Empirical Investigation on the Role of Gender Influencing Nonviolence (NV) Behaviour at the Workplace**

**Ayatakshee Sarkar**

PH. D student, SMLS, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

**Prof. Sasmita Palo,**

Centre for HRM&LR, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

## **Background and Literature Review**

Covert forms of harm doing behaviour are prevalent in organisation. Unfortunately most of the time, it goes unreported and lack media attention until it leads to major crisis in the form of prolonged absenteeism, propensity to leave, mass attrition and sometimes homicides or deaths. International labour Organisation in describing assaults in workplace, encompass the subtlety, in the form of ostracism, bullying, harassment, intimidation, aggressive posturing, threats or deliberate silence (Chappell & Martino, 2006). Popular cited results of Williams et al (1997) and Williams (2001) indicates these small subtlety of everyday incidents at workplaces have far greater psychological and physical impact, as they have compounding effect in the lives of the individuals and when they start spreading within the organisation, it not only damages the company's reputation at the same time the effect gets carry forward to the victim's family and social network, damaging both their mental and physical health. Such triggers of negative harm doing behaviour can be broken by organisation culture based on NV behaviour, which is a need in today's organization and society (Ramsbotham, Miall & Woodhouse, 2011; Webster, 1993, Bhalerao & Kumar, 2015).

A person demonstrating NV behaviour can stimulate a culture of peace in the organisation (Mayton, 2009). Personality and behavioural tendencies of nonviolent person are agreeableness, forgiveness, cooperativeness and trust (Mayton, Daniel, Diessner & Granby, 1996). Individuals who are prone to nonviolent behaviour associate themselves with spiritual transcendental values of endurance, justice, equality, wisdom and sheltering the environment (Mayton et al, 1996). A nonviolent individual will not only approach a problem or a conflict situation in a constructive manner but also with a concern for environment and business. Cooperative context which is predominant in NV approach always tends to foster constructive outcomes with more positive long term relations between several stakeholders involved. Integrative negotiation which is again a nonviolent approach deals with conflict, where it shows appreciations of their counterparts where negative emotions are avoided.

Contemporary feminism often advocates secular conceptions of justice, equality and transformation but studies have shown that gender plays a significant role in influencing both spiritual values; peace and NV behaviour. In a study conducted to find out the gender differences in spiritual development in college years, it was found that there were significant gender

differences in spiritual qualities and patterns of spiritual development among the adults (Bryant, 2006), the values inculcated through the process of spiritual development led to peace, compassion and other NV behavioural qualities. The same study have shown that women are more spiritually and religiously inclined than men. In another study, it says women leaders are more inclined to transformational leadership, giving attention to expressing appreciation, encouraging, supporting and inspiring employees positively contrary to men, who gave more importance to hierarchical relationships (Bouckaert & Zsolnai, 2012). Though some studies have shown the differences between men and women towards spiritual inclination, but this has to be looked critically to understand if the differences really exists or is it due to the differences in manifestation of spiritual expressions due to differences in personality of the two sexes (Bryant, 2006).

Not only in management literature, but also amongst peace psychology the gender perspective in understanding NV behaviour is still in nascent stage. Numerous studies have documented that women and girls are less physically aggressive than men and boys (Moghaddam, 1998). The causes for these gender differences are complex, with both biological and sociocultural factors influencing levels of aggression. Research on biological differences in levels of physical aggression points to hormonal factors and physiological differences in brain structure between men and women (Berkowitz, 1993). Geen (1998) reviewed socialization explanations for gender differences on physical aggression and identified the following sociocultural factors: (a) the different construal of potentially destructive conflict situations, (b) different beliefs about the consequences of aggression, (c) different perceptions of the harm aggressive acts will have on them if they behave aggressively, and (d) the disparate amount of guilt experienced for behaving aggressively. Geen noted that there is disagreement among psychologists as to the relative importance of biological versus socialization differences between men and women. Several studies have also found women to be more nonviolent than men (e.g., Mayton, 1999). If progress is to be made toward understanding nonviolent behaviour, a close scrutiny of the actions of women would be productive. McKay and Mazurana (1999) observed that nonviolent approaches developed by women are often innovative and distinct from men, yet they are infrequently recognized at the community, national, and international levels. This suggests some positive avenues for future research into women's peace building activities which this study is addressing and has clear implications for our understanding of NV. Efforts to investigate ways to build more nonviolent, peaceful, cooperative, and just societies must involve the inclusion of gender as an important variable

The outcomes of NV in organisation directly impacts job performance, job satisfaction, and organisational citizenship behaviours; however, there is literature which attributes to the benefits of NV behaviour in overall society.

### **Research Question**

Does gender of a person makes a difference in NV behaviour at the workplace?

## **Objectives**

- a) To understand the relationship between gender differences and NV behaviour at the workplace.
- b) To discern how such differences leading to better peace making strategies in organisations.

## **Research Methodology**

Quantitative research methodology is adopted to conduct the study. Primary data are collected through responses received from 347 respondents to whom structured questionnaires are distributed. The respondents are across functions such as Production, Research and Development, Purchase, Marketing, Human Resource Management, Finance, Legal. The respondents chosen for the study are full time employees with minimum two years of total work experience. Some of their designations are Consultants, Senior HR Manager, Legal Officer, Marketing Manager, Claims Analysts, Senior Software Engineer, and Vigilance Officer. Respondents belong to three different industries, that is, Manufacturing, Banking Financial Sector (BFSI) and Information Technology/ Information Technology Enabled Services (IT/ITES). Maximum variation sampling, which is a purposive sampling technique, is used to capture range of perspectives relating to the construct. It exhibits wide range of attributes, behaviours, experiences relating to the topic of study. The central notion of this sampling is to look at a subject from all available angles, which involves greater understanding (Etikan, Musa & Alkassim, 2016).

Demographic constituent of the sample includes female respondents which comprise only 30.3 per cent which means 105 of the total respondents were female and male contributed to 70 per cent, that is, 242 of the total respondents. The study revealed that out of the total sample surveyed, around 27.7 per cent were below the age of 30 years, 55.9 per cent between the age group of 31 to 49 years and 16.4 per cent were above 50 years. A total of 20.7 percent were employed for less than 5 years, 43.8 per cent were employed between 5 to 15 years, 19.3 per cent between 15 to 25 years, 14.1 per cent employed between 25 to 35 years and only 2 per cent employed above 35 years.

## **Findings**

The data analysis is conducted in SPSS 16.0. Gender and NV is negatively correlated  $-.128^*$ , with  $nv\_stress$   $-.140^*$ ,  $nv\_constructive$   $-.112^*$ ,  $nv\_ability$   $-0.62$  and  $nv\_ignore$   $-.114^*$  at 0.05 level of significance. The Mann-Whitney test showed the actual significance value of the test such as U statistic and significance p value. From the data it can be said that gender is significant with NV at 0.01 level. Also the Levene's statistic for the test of homogeneity of variance for each dimensions of NV are as follows ( $nv\_stress$ : 7.331;  $nv\_constructive$  15.088,  $nv\_ability$  11.407 and  $nv\_ignore$  1.388) with t statistic as 2.388, 2.618, 2.084, 1.153 and 2.138, except,  $nv\_ignore$ , all variances are significantly different as the significance value is less than 0.5.

## **Implications**

This study holds both theoretical and practical implication in the area of Social Sciences discipline.

Gender as a pioneer social factor influencing NV behaviour has been explored. It will help organisation policy making and decision making process to recruit more women in peace making roles such as conflict negotiation, mediation, reconciliations etc.

## References

- <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/spirit>
- Berkowitz, L. (1993). *Aggression: Its causes, consequences, and control*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press
- Bhalerao, H., & Kumar, S. (2015). NV at Workplace—Scale Development and Validation. *Business Perspectives and Research*, 3(1), 36-51.
- Bouckaert, L., & Zsolnai, L. (2012). Spirituality and business: An interdisciplinary overview. *Society and Economy*, 34(3), 489-514.
- Bryant, K. (2006). Making gender identity disorder of childhood: Historical lessons for contemporary debates. *Sexuality Research & Social Policy*. 3(3), 23-39.
- Chappell, D., & Di Martino, V. (2006). *Violence at work*. International Labour Organization.
- Geen, R. G. (1998). Processes and personal variables in affective aggression. In R. G. Geen & E. Donnerstein (Eds.), *Human aggression: Theories, research, and implications for social policy* (pp.1–21). San Diego, CA: Academic.
- Mayton, D. (2009). *NV and peace psychology*. New York: Springer.
- Mayton, I. I., Daniel, M., Diessner, R., & Granby, C. D. (1996). NV and human values: Empirical support for theoretical relations. *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology*, 2(3), 245.
- McKay, S., & Mazurana, D. (1999, July) An analysis of women's peacebuilding: Implications for psychology. A paper presented at the Sixth International Symposium for Contributions of Psychology to Peace, San Jose, Costa Rica.
- Moghaddam, F. M. (1998). *Social psychology: Exploring universals across cultures*. New York: Free- man.
- Ramsbotham, O., Miall, H., & Woodhouse, T. (2011). *Contemporary conflict resolution*. Polity
- Sommer, K. L., Williams, K. D., Ciarocco, N. J., & Baumeister, R. F. (2001). When silence speaks louder than words: Explorations into the intrapsychic and interpersonal consequences of social ostracism. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 23(4), 225-243.

# **Marginalization of Women in Agriculture and Allied Activities: A study on Santhal Women in Santhal Pargana, Jharkhand**

**Binay Tudu**

Dy. Manager (HR), Damodar Valley Corporation (DVC), Kolkata  
tudu.binay@gmail.com, binay.tudu@dvc.gov.in

**Mr. Binit Lakra**

PhD. Scholar, TISS

## **Abstract**

This paper is an empirical study conducted in the Santhal Pargana division of Jharkhand state. A survey was carried out across the six districts of Santhal Pargana to know the socio-economic and socio-political state of Santhal women using a structured schedule of field visit to the place of study. Around 70-80 % of Santhal women are engaged as agricultural labourers and rest engage in agricultural related work, indirect employment in government and non-government institutions. The study also showed that Santhal women are paid unequal wages even having skill at par with their male counterpart. Their status in the society is vulnerable and nothing is provisioned for them in the name of safety, security and protection of their interests. Hence, attempts were made to address their issues in front of policy makers and government agencies to give attention towards them and make structured and solid steps for their holistic development and social upliftment.

Studies have shown that Santhal Pargana is an area in Free India where the condition of women is still pathetic and helpless. This paper is an attempt to address the issues and critically assess the causes to find the solutions.

## **Literature Review**

Women play a vital role in the social, spiritual and economic transformation of a country. The contribution of women is matchless especially in the field of society building, community development and family rising. But as per the UN Report, women are the most deprived and underprivileged community and own least part in the society. The classical and neo-classical economic thoughts have not contributed much to the understanding of the contribution of women to the economy, as household activities were not included in the valuation of the national income of the country. The Marxian concept of exploitation is based on the extraction of surplus value at the point of production and hence could not explain much of women's problems. The Institutional School maintains that the role of women is confined to certain sectors of the economy and under restriction as imposed by the market. All these theoretical explanations have not been able to assess properly the women's contribution to the economy. In the similar way, Santhal women too are touched by this effect.

Santhal women play a vital role in the family management as well along with labour hard in the field. They grow the food, crops, provide water, gather fuel and perform most of the other work

which sustains the family. Women are generally responsible for sowing, weeding, crop maintenance and harvesting etc. This paper explains the contribution of Santhal women in the Santhal community and in parallel also explains their deprivation, exploitation and marginalization.

## **Background**

Santhal Pargana is one of the most backward and neglected region in India. This territory is located in the northern part of Jharkhand state. Santhal Pargana basically comprises of six districts i.e. Dumka, Deoghar, Pakur, Sahebganj, Godda and Jamtara. The study will primarily cover the socio-economic environment of Santhal women, particularly in agriculture and allied activities in all the six districts and some extent in the district of Burdwan, West Bengal. Burdwan is a place where paddy cultivation is the highest and also known as “Rice Bowl of India”. Santhals come from Santhal Pargana in the district of Burdwan for paddy cultivation. Therefore, Burdwan district also has been included in the study in some extent to expose the Santhal’s women exploitation, abused and deprivation.

Dumka town is Administrative divisional and Commissionaires headquarter of Santhal Pargana. Agriculture is the principal source of livelihood in this region. There are mainly two agricultural seasons i.e. the rainy season for Kharif crops start with the onset of monsoon and Rabi crops grown during winter season, harvested before the advent of the summer season. Agricultural activities are basically done by traditional methods. The plow is used to plough the fields, which is usually drawn by oxen. Farmers are totally dependent on monsoon and rain fed farming. There are no irrigation and waterways facilities across the region. Santhal Pargana is far away from adoption of utilizing modern agricultural tools and machines for cultivation. It causes huge impact for the production of grain and other agricultural products. Farmers do not get the higher production even soil is fertile and appropriate for cultivation. Another drawback is no scientific orientation and farming education facility available for cultivation. Lack of information in respect of new trends of farming somehow put them behind in comparison to the farmers of other state. There are no sources of information available for gathering innovative ideas and tools used for agricultural activities. This is one of the biggest disadvantages for Santhal women not to come up with the contemporary world.

Apart from the agricultural activities, Santhals are also engaged in making of handicrafts industry i.e. Grass broom, bamboo strip baskets, leaf plates, date palm mat, palm leaf fan etc. Mostly all the handicrafts commodities are especially made by Santhal women. These products are made for home use as well as to sell at local markets. The biggest irony is that even having such high skill in handicrafts; opportunities to grow for them are limited. From making to sell, women do themselves. While selling the products, there are no safety and security available. They don’t have reach to the commercial market. They don’t get appropriate value for their goods. A question arises here that there are many world NGOs, Welfare Agencies and United Nations as well, have taken solid and strong initiatives for the protection of interests of women and to bring them at equal status in the area of mutual respect, political participation, empowerment and so on.... but Santhal Pargana is a place where still women are ages behind from the current world and continue



to live in weak and suppressed condition. It needs to be studied in large that where is the lapse and how it can be overcome? Training infrastructure needs to be firmed up for them so that Santhal women will have better access of modern technology, equipment and tools to make handicraft goods. Santhal women are behind in all angles whether it is a social, political right or a wealth allocation. They are oppressed, neglected, deprived and discriminated everywhere. The average annual income of Santhal women is very less. Women are considered inferior to men in all aspects. Among these are inheritance laws, legislation on land ownership and transfer, social restrictions on women, which seriously denigrate their activities and aspiration (Sinha, U. Prakash & Sinha, Rekha, 2007).

The condition of women in Santhal Pargana is pathetic socially, economically, educationally and especially in terms of agricultural labour, they are considered as bonded labour. They are disadvantaged, exploited and marginalized in all aspects of life. They are paid less wages as remuneration. They have poor health conditions. They face many problems during the birth of children and even worse when children take birth during the rainy season. Rainy season is the agricultural period, but because of poverty and family pressures, women have to go to the fields for accompanying husband in farming. No one understands women's condition that she needs to take rest for at least a few months after delivery of the child. During the rainy season, there are many occasions wherein Santhal women are compelled to take part in farming, even the infant baby is in her lap. A female literacy rate and sanitation facility for Santhal women is extremely poor. Agriculture is based on entirely rain fed and it causes huge unemployment amongst Santhal women. It is because of that Santhal people are mainly engaged in cultivators (48.6%), agricultural labours (38.4%), household industry workers (1.4%) and other workers (11.6%) (Censes of India, 2001). If there is no rain, agriculture activities stop. As per Censes of India 2011, Santhal women who are engaged as marginal workers, cultivators and agricultural labourers are 85442, 19676 and 55215 respectively in Pakur district only. Maximum number of Santhal women are engaged as agricultural labourers in Dumka, Santhal Pargana.

Another side of Santhal women's deplorable condition is after completion of farming activities in Santhal Pargana, poor Santhal women migrate to West Bengal state, particularly in the district of Burdwan for harvesting of paddy from the month of November to January. Their condition is pitiful during this period in Burdwan. They are treated like bonded labour, working under Mahajan Sahukar (Moneylender). They are beaten, mocked, exploited and misbehaved. Keeping all these key issues in mind, this paper attempts to critically evaluate the cause of getaway from Santhal Pargana and the marginalization of Santhal women. Efforts have also been put to find out the solutions to lessen the torture and social disparity of Santhal women.

## **Research Questions**

Following research questions for the study can be outlined:

- Does poverty is the fundamental cause of Santhal women not to come up with the contemporary world?
- Do cultural beliefs, social and traditional rituals and customs resist Santhal women not to

move for education?

- Does unequal right and lower social status of Santhal women compel to stick with traditional mindset and attitude?
- As agricultural labourer, why Santhal women are paid unequal remuneration in compare to their male counterpart?
- Do policymakers have not taken any solid steps for the upliftment and development of Santhal women? If not, then why not? If yes, where is the lapse?

## **Objectives**

The objectives of the study are as follows:

- To attract attention of policymaker/Government agencies/practitioners for taking appropriate policy decision and immediate action for the socio-economic development of Santhal women.
- To go deeper into the causes for such existing condition of Santhal women.
- To study the social, economic and educational status of Santhal women.
- To highlight the methods used by Santhal women in agricultural activities.
- To find out the solutions for bringing them out from such condition and way forward to connect them with the contemporary world.

## **Research Methodology**

The paper adopts an ethnographic research mainly highlighting the study of Santhal women and their social environment across the territory. Following methods such as observation, face-to-face interaction, communication and one-to-one interviews etc. have been used for data collection and survey to come to the conclusion. Santhal Pargana is a place wherein maximum land is covered by forests. Villages are located both in short and long distance. An extensive empirical field visit of the actual place of study has been conducted to know the real condition of Santhal women. Spending time with the group of Santhal women under study actually helped a lot to get a sense of how they live, their beliefs and rituals, and interactions with each other and those around. Data were collected with the help of structured schedule, personal interview, participant and non-participant observation and informal interview. In addition, secondary sources were also utilized.

Apart from the above methods, different NGOs, local Panchayats, Head of the Village (Gram Pradhan) and Block Development officials were also contacted to know the schemes, improvement initiatives and welfare programmes that are operated by them for the social upliftment and holistic development of Santhal women.

## **Century Long Women's Movement in Nepal**

### **Binda Pandey**

Women's Rights Activist and Member of House of Representatives, Nepal

binda.pandey@gmail.com

### **Achievement and Challenges Ahead**

Nepali women movement has completed a century. Nepali women first came out on the field to fight for national sovereignty in Nalapani in 1814, where Nepali fought against the British colonial force. That war was linked with patriotism and led by national arm force. After a century of that, Yogmaya, a woman from eastern rural Nepal pioneered the social movement, who voiced out against social oppression of Rane oligarchy, based on gender, class and caste at once. She started the movement on 1917 and continued until taking Jalsamadhi in 1942. During the time, the Satee and Dass system was abolished. The level of social awareness among people including men and women both was increased.

Chandrakanta took another initiation with starting women school as means of making women aware in Kathmandu onward 1935. Rewantakumari, Seeta Sharma and Rammaya poudel were closely supporting those political prisoners, as supporter of Praja Parisad as first political party in the country, onward 1937. Arriving in 1947, women chanted slogan for civic right on the street and arrested for the cause. As result of all these movement, Rana oligarchy system was overthrown in 2051 with establishment of multiparty democracy. Women got equal right to education, employment and suffrage.

Fighting for the equality in practical level was continued. Women started to demand women participation in the state mechanism. Sadhana was elected as first woman representative in municipality in 1953 and Dwarikadevi in parliament in 1958. Unfortunately, monarchy banned all the democratic institution, dissolved elected body and took back the power to palace in 1960.

After a decade, progressive forces started to consolidate the democratic forces from Jhapa in 1975 and it was slowly expanded over the country. Arriving in 1979, student movement took lead and the workers, peasants and women movement as well took the new shape. Monarchy was compelled to declare for referendum in 1980. Democratic forces took this opportunity to reach to people in the wider range. Finally in 1990, people's movement succeeded to end the autocratic party-less Panchayat system and re-stored multiparty democracy. Women got the constitutional recognition to be part of the state mechanism. Their scope in all sphere of the society was opened equally.

Women participation in education, employment as well as politics started to scale up. Civil society movement was grown very fast. Feminist perspective and movement started to re-shape. Women's level of awareness and motivation was geared up. Arriving in the 2006, they took equal

part in the people's movement second in 2006, which successfully overthrown the monarchy and established federal republic Nepal.

Arriving at this point, gender agendas have been crystallised. Basically the five major agendas such as one-third women participation, equal property right, violence against women, citizen identity and affirmative action to mainstream women in different sectors are in priority. All these issues have been achieved as constitutional right in 2015. As part of enforcement, 41 per cent women (41+ percent in local level and more than one-third in provinces and federal parliaments) have been elected in total in all three tiers of the elected body of the state in 2017. Social gender perspective is gradually being changed. The level of the women's participation as quantity and quality in different sectors including mass movement as well as community and professional level are being gearing up.

In short, gender dimension in the country has been changed. Constitutionally, women have achieved almost equality in all aspect including some affirmative provision except citizen identity. In that sense, Nepali women movement proudly claimed that the century long movement have been fruitful enough from feminist perspective. Now the challenges ahead are proper enforcement of those constitutional and legal provision as part of living.

## **Domestic Workers in the Informal Sector: A Case Study of Delhi (NCR)**

**B. Srinivasu**

Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, Jamia Millia Islamia, New Delhi

bsrinivas07@gmail.com

**Manvi Aggarwal**

Research Scholar, Department of Economics, Jamia Millia Islamia, New Delhi

maannvvi@gmail.com

### **Abstract**

In India, there is an abundant supply and availability of labour at cheap rates possessing low skills and low education who can only be absorbed in the informal sector. India's informal economy is very large and as per ILO estimate, about 92 percent of India's workforce is engaged in informal sector. With such a major contribution in the economy, it becomes necessary that this sector is studied in detail. The need for an in-depth analysis of the sector also arises because India's GDP statistics take into account only the formal sector whereas it is estimated that informal sector contributes to about 50 percent of the GDP. There are various domains in which the workers are engaged in informal sector. The sector witnesses unskilled and semi-skilled persons working as construction workers, engaged in manufacturing works, employed as domestic servants or working on their own as street vendors, peddlers and hawkers etc. Among the sub-categories of informal sector occupations, the share of domestic work needs to be identified. Today, paid domestic work not only comprises a significant part of the workforce in the informal employment but also has been emerging in different ways. Despite of its growing importance and demand, domestic work still remains undervalued, underpaid, unorganised and poorly regulated.

The present paper makes an attempt to bring forth some of the issues and concerns of domestic workers in Delhi (NCR) by taking a region Maharajpur. The paper tries to analyse the socio-economic profile of domestic workers with a sample of 50 female live-out domestic worker respondents with a structured questionnaire. To capture the profile of domestic workers, variables such as place of origin, literacy levels, income levels, housing conditions, marital status have been calculated with the help of percentages, correlation by using SPSS software. Also the study finally tries to identify the inclusive nature of the domestic workers in informal economy.

# **Women and Trade Union**

**Ceena Paul**

Associate Professor, Shri M.D.Shah Mahila College of Arts and Commerce, Malad, Mumbai  
ceenapaul10@gmail.com

## **Introduction**

Trade union primarily a voluntary organization of workers as well as of employers is formed to protect and promote the interest of its members. The genesis of which, can be traced back to 14th Century in England(Varghese, 2010).However as an organized movement, trade unionism originated only in the 19th century in Great Britain, Continental Europe, and the United States(<http://www.britannica.com/>)and in India trade unionism has known history of over 100 years. Despite a history of over 100 years and significant share of female in the India's total workforce-24.5% in 2017 (<https://data.worldbank.org>) the participation of Indian women in the trade union movement has been historically low.Their share in trade union membership is only 37.5% in 2010 .( Koodamara,2016) phenomena is not Indian centric, it exists all over the globe cutting across developed and developing countries. Susan Hayter and Valentina Stoevska(2011) in their study on Statistical indicators on trade union density of 77 countries and statistical indicators on collective bargaining of 62 countries cities that in most of the countries in comparison to women, more men are members of trade union. Another worldwide study was carried out by ILO and ICFTU (2000) on all ICFTU members and International Trade Secretariats at the end of the 1990s. The report also reproduces the same facts that the percentage of women joining trade unions remains generally lower than the percentage for men. Not only women's share in trade union membership is low but participation of women in the decision-making bodies of trade unions is also low.Variou studies have confirmed these facts. To cite a few of them-.A cross-national study undertaken by Queen Mary, University of London (2012) found that in both the UK and the US, women still have fewer top positions in trade unions despite growth in overall female membership. The result of the study indicated that among UK's 10 larger unions, only four women are serving as general secretaries. In USA, even though women's representation has increased since the 1970s, men continue to take up the top and most powerful positions in the trade union. In nine major US unions with significant female membership, women comprise only 24 percent of top leaders, but in none of these unions does the female proportion of leaders reflect membership rates. Walloon Sociology Group (1999) carried out a study among the various organisations affiliated to the European Trade Union Confederation. The report indicated that despite an increase in the number of women in decision-making bodies between 1993 and 1999 there is gross under-representation of women in trade union decision-making.

Another interesting fact noted is even in trade unions in which women make up a majority of union membership they are underrepresented in the union leadership. Education International in 2009-2010 conducted a survey among its member organisations (member organisation of

Education International are organisations of teachers and other education employees across the globe). The survey report indicated that almost two thirds of the unions that responded to the survey had between 50 to 80% of female members but the % of women who were holding leadership position in the period between 1995-2010 was less than 36%. Also the pattern of “more power – fewer women” was visible in all regions of the globe, and the pattern was strongest in Africa and Latin America, where the percentage of women in the membership is twice as high as the percentage of women in executive boards. The study conducted by ILO and ICFTU (2000) also conferred that there was no proportional representation for women in trade union management. The study emphasized that women held less than a third of senior decision making posts in over 60% of the trade unions. The situation is no different in India for instances Sarkar and Bhowmik (1998) studied 157 workers working in the plantation industry of north Bengal to ascertain the involvement of women workers in trade unions. They observed that though women form half of the workforce in the plantations they have remained marginalised in the trade union of plantation workers. Of the 157 women workers only 17 percent women regularly attended union meetings and participated in the meetings and only 17 women hardly ever took in negotiations with employers or conciliation before government machinery.

The question which arise from the above facts is why do only few women enroll as trade unions members and even fewer women participate in the decision-making bodies of trade unions. The paper tries to identify the factors which have caused poor participation of women in the trade union activities and also measures which have been implemented by the trade unions to overcome the obstacles that prevent women from joining trade unions and sharing power and improve gender sensitivity in a trade union.

#### Measures to Improve Gender Sensitivity in a Trade Union

Trade unions across the world to enhance the women participation in trade union decision making have initiated measures such as gender- segregated statistics, creating awareness about the benefits of trade unions, leadership development programmes and mentoring, convenient location and timing of the meetings, special women-only structures like committees and working group, gender mainstreaming and union commitment to gender equality

##### a) Gender Disaggregated Statistics

European Trade Union Confederation (ETUC) carries out 8th March annual survey to assess the progress in reducing the gender representation gap and highlighting successful gender mainstreaming activities. In the United Kingdom, the Trade Union Confederation conducted two Equality Audits between 2003 and 2007 to survey the union’s structure, policies and services (OECD, 2014).

##### b) Creating Awareness about the Benefits of Trade Unions

##### c) Leadership Development Programmes and Mentoring

Teacher's Union of Ireland arranges specific training courses for women members to improve their confidence level and also build capacity in negotiation and speaking skills. Also a mentoring programme is initiated by the Union to ensure that the potential women candidates are identified and supported to take on leadership roles and positions of responsibility. Solidarność – a trade union from Poland also organises a training programme called Leader that consists of a 2.5-day seminar for educating future leaders. At least 20% of those attending must be women. Another example is the National Union of General and Municipal Workers, UK has set up a number of training activities to encourage more women to take an active role in the union in order to promote equal opportunities. The training courses tackle issues of direct relevance to women such as:

- Stress management
- Sexual harassment
- Communication and negotiation in the workplace
- The importance of collective agreements

Similarly National Association of Schoolmasters Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT) (UK) has introduced trade union training. The training targets women members with the aim to increase the participation of women members within the union. Training has included assertiveness training for women, which teaches women assertiveness skills in the context of school, college and the trade union. This has been particularly useful for women seeking career progression within the trade union office (Homa, 2006).

#### d) Convenient Location and Timing of the Meetings

One of the difficulties which have been highlighted by various studies on women and trade union is the inconvenience faced by women members in attending union meetings on account of the inappropriate timing of union meetings and the location of the meetings. To overcome these issues, unions should ensure that activities/meetings should take place during the office hours which makes easier for women to attend them. Further attempt should also be made to curtail the number of meetings held and new technology should also be utilised more effectively, for example, meetings can be held through teleconferencing.

#### e) Gender Equality Quotas

German Unions have adopted constitutional provisions to establish quotas for proportional representation in leadership. Similarly Irish Congress Trade Union (ICTU) from Ireland has also reserved seats for women on its Executive Council. The ICTU has amended the Constitution to take account of these provision and states that the election of members to the Executive Council "...must result in the selection of at least 8 women members in accordance with Standing Order Rules on the Election of Executive Council and Method of Voting (26); as well as the requirement "...to ensure that at least one of the Vice-Presidents must be a



woman” (28). In practice, now more than 8 women are elected onto the ICTU Executive and this direct measure has created a positive impact on Irish trade union culture and the visibility of women in the trade union movement of Ireland (Pillinger, 2010).

#### f) Special Women-Only Structures

ITUC Women’s Committee- International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) women’s committee provides a unique voice for women; it helps women to sharing their experience, to bring out their hidden issues, to develop a collective voice and to build a gender equity policy. The women’s committee carries out policy decisions in between Congresses. It develops action programmes towards:

- Gender equality at the workplace, the labour market and society
- The full integration of women into trade union organisations and their access to leadership positions
- Gender perspectives in trade union work, at all levels.

It also represents the voice of working women in the ILO, the United Nations (UN) and other intergovernmental organisations. The Committee has recently launched and coordinated worldwide campaigns against violations of women’s rights, for maternity protection and on organising women into unions. The Women’s Committee is a statutory body, which meets once a year. It nominates eighteen members for election by Congress as titular and substitute members of the General Council and six members for election at the Executive. Similar committees also exist also at regional level (ITUC, 2008).

#### h) Gender Mainstreaming

Gender Mainstreaming is a long term strategy, thus it requires sufficient resources for a longer period of time (Kirsch Anja, 2013). Consequently without a budget in place to put the actions into practice and to finance the human resources little progress can be made in gender equality. Many trade unions have considered this fact and have provided a budget for gender equality. Few e.g. of Trade Unions who have created a budget for achieving Gender Equity.

- CFDT France provides a specific budget line called ‘insertion of women activists’ to encourage female members to take up trade union posts. Under this budget childcare, domestic expenses or loss of wages can be reimbursed.
- LO Norway makes provision for the reimbursement of childcare costs.
- Finland has also realised there is a cost in reducing the pay gap so they have earmarked a specific budget to help close the gap.
- Solidarnosc Poland is one of a few unions from the new member states that has a fixed budget for gender equality actions and staff. ( Homa, 2006).

#### i) Union commitment to Gender Equality

## References

- Webb S. and Webb B., (1965), *The History of Trade Unionism*, A.M. Kelly, New York.
- M.Varghese, (2010), *Origin and Development of Trade Unions*. Available:[http://www.shodhganga.inflibnet.ac.in/bitstream/10603/610/1/11\\_chapter3.pdf](http://www.shodhganga.inflibnet.ac.in/bitstream/10603/610/1/11_chapter3.pdf) (Accessed on 1-7-2015)
- <http://www.britannica.com>
- (<https://data.worldbank.org>)
- Government of India, (1999), *Report of the second national commission on labour*. Available: <http://www.prsindia.org/uploads/media/1237548159/NLCII-report.pdf> (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Government of India, (2014), *Statistical Profile on women Labour*, Available: [http://wwwlabourbureau.nic.in/Statistical\\_Profile\\_2012\\_13.pdf](http://wwwlabourbureau.nic.in/Statistical_Profile_2012_13.pdf) (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Government of India, (2011), *Census*. Available: <http://censusindia.gov.in/>. (Accessed on 1-7-2015) (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Hacourt Bernard et Garcia Ada (supervised by) and Lega Hervé (with the help of); “The “Second Sex” of European trade unionism. Research into women and decision-making in trade union organisations. Study of the existing literature and survey carried out among organisations affiliated to the European Trade Union Confederation”; Walloon Sociology Group linked to UCL; 1999. Available at <http://www.etuc.or>. (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Hayter S. and Stoevska V., (2011), *Social Dialogue Indicators International Statistical Inquiry 2008-09*
- ILO (2000), *The role of trade unions in promoting gender equality and protecting vulnerable women workers. First report, ILO-ICFTU survey*; International Labour Organisation. Available at <http://www.ilo.org>. (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- (anonymous)(2012), *Trade unions still fail to lure women leaders*. Available at <https://sciencex.com/> (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Jain, Harish, (2002), *Equality in Employment: Issues and Politics*, Emerald Group Publishing Ltd.
- Education International (2011), *Quadrennial Report on the Status of Women in Unions, Education and Society, On the move for Equality*, Education International’s First World Women’s Conference. Available at [www.ei-ie.org/congress7/en/.../169\\_d8735ce03ae3fa85216fbaeb0cc141..](http://www.ei-ie.org/congress7/en/.../169_d8735ce03ae3fa85216fbaeb0cc141..) (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Singh B.D. (2008), *Industrial Relations Emerging Paradigms 2nd Edition*, Excel Books, New Delhi

- Sarkar. K and Bhowmik S. K. (1998), Trade Unions and Women Workers in Tea Plantations, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 33, No. 52 (Dec. 26, 1998 - Jan. 1, 1999), pp. L50-L52 Available <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4407515> . (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Education International (2011), Quadrennial Report on the Status of Women in Unions, Education and Society, On the move for Equality, Education International's First World Women's Conference. Available at [www.ei-ie.org/congress7/en/.../169\\_d8735ce03ae3fa85216fbaeb0cc141](http://www.ei-ie.org/congress7/en/.../169_d8735ce03ae3fa85216fbaeb0cc141). (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- European Trade Union Confederation (ETUC) 2003: Women in Trade Unions: Making the Difference. <http://www.etuc.org/a/234> (accessed on 15.7.2015)
- International Labour Organisation (ILO), 2000: The role of trade unions in promoting gender equality and protecting vulnerable women workers. First report, ILO-ICFTU survey, <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/ampro/cinterfor/temas/gender/doc/ilo.htm> (accessed on 10-7-2015)
- Pillinger Jane (2002), Pay Equity Now! Pay Equity Resource Package. <http://www.eiie.org/payequity/EN/docs/PSI/PSI%20Dossier%20Equity.pdf> (accessed on 10-7-2015)
- OECD (2014), Women, Government and Policy Making in OECD Countries: Fostering Diversity for Inclusive Growth, OECD Publishing. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264210745> (accessed on 1-7-2015)
- Dean Homa, (2006), Women in trade unions: methods and good practices for gender, European, Trade Union Institute for Research, Education and Health and Safety (ETUI-REHS), Brussels. <http://www.newunionism.net> (accessed 16-3-2018 )
- Pillinger, Dr Jane, (2010), Improving the representation of women on the Teachers' Union of Ireland Executive Committee
- ILO – Gender Promotion Programme (2001) 'Promoting Gender Equality – A Resource Kit for Trade Unions', Report of the ILO-ICTFU Survey. ILO, Geneva. [http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/eeo/tu/cha\\_1.htm](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/eeo/tu/cha_1.htm) (accessed on 10-7-2015)
- Kirsch Anja, (2013), Union Revitalisation through Gender Equality in the German Service Sector Union Ver.di In : Ledwith Sue, Hansen Lise Lotte, (ed.) Gendering and Diversifying Trade Union Leadership, Routledge, New York.
- ITUC, (2008) Achieving Gender Equality- A Trade Union Manual, ITUC, Brussels
- Kirton, Gill (2006), The Making of Women Trade Unionists, Ashgate Publishing Ltd, Hampshire.
- Gill Kirton and Healy Geraldine, (1999), Transforming union women: the role of women trade union officials in union renewal, *Industrial Relations Journal*, Volume 30, Issue 1,

pages 31–45, March 1999.

- Heery, E. and Kelly, J. (1988) 'Do Female Representatives Make a Difference? Women Full-Time Officials and Trade Union Work', *Work, Employment and Society*, Vol.2, No. 4
- Koodamara N. K. (2016) The Changing Role and Perspective of Trade Union in India, *International Journal of Management and Applied Science*, ISSN: 2394-7926 Volume-2, Issue-5, May.- 2016 <https://www.researchgate.net> (accessed 16-3-2018 )
- Dickens L. (2000), Collective bargaining and the promotion of gender equality at work: opportunities and challenges for trade unions ,*European Review of Labour and Research*, vol. 6, 2: pp. 193-208. , First Published May 1,2000.<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/102425890000600205> (accessed 16-3-2018 )

# **Exploring Livelihood & Support Strategies for Unpaid Care Work by Indian Women**

**Ms. Celin Thomas**

CMR University, Bangalore

celin.thomas1106@gmail.com

## **Abstract:**

The contribution of unpaid care work done by many individuals is usually overlooked and undermined. The direct influence of unpaid care work is not visible *prima facie*; as it is neither accounted for, nor even measured. However, unpaid care work is the main factor that offers stabilization to the economy, families and societies at large to be able to support the noticeable and tangible financial and developmental indicators of a country.

Cooking, nurturing young ones, educating children, home up keep & maintenance, provision of resources, caring for the old are just some of the types of unpaid care work. These works are predominantly done by women for which they are usually unpaid. Their contribution in these areas is neither recognised nor remunerated, since the assumption is that this is their duty. Women typically spend disproportionately more time on unpaid care work than men.<sup>1</sup>

It is important to note that all of these activities take up a lot of time and energy on a daily basis. Unpaid care work has been conveniently dumped on women across the world over a period of time. This pattern is observed throughout the world as women are stereotyped as being the primary care giving gender. This research paper attempts to explore the strategies that are support and income-based for unpaid care work by Indian women.

On account of gendered social norms that view unpaid care work as a female prerogative, women across different regions, socio-economic classes and cultures spend an important part of their day on meeting the expectations of their domestic and reproductive roles.<sup>2</sup>

There is compelling evidence that states that a lot of time women receive no support to pursue their own dreams and ambitions mainly because they have to provide care to someone at home. One of the main drivers' for women to take on care giving responsibilities is the guilt factor that has an overriding effect of societal expectations. This expectation has patriarchal undertones attributed to it. Such women feel it's their duty and failing to do so destroys them slowly due to guilt.

---

<sup>1</sup> Gaëlle Ferrant, Luca Maria Pesando and Keiko Nowacka Unpaid Care Work: The missing link in the analysis of gender gaps in labour outcomes. OECD Development Centre, December 2014

<sup>2</sup> Ibid

The other driver is the economic factor that is known to make a woman the de facto care giver. Since, the family cannot afford a care giver, the woman in the family has to let go of all her wishes and inhibitions and provide for the family in every way possible. In such a case, her age, her dreams, ambitions and goals find no place or empathetic audience even in her immediate family.

Another noted driver is the dearth of or access to resources such as water and food to name a few. Adolescent girls are known to have dropped out of schools as they had to ensure water availability at home for everyone, for all household purposes where availability of water is scarce. The number of trips, which varies during and across seasons, is needed to calculate time and caloric expenditures. A study in Haryana found that women fetched and carried on the head, on average, 23 vessels of water each day during the summer (17 in the morning and 6 in the evening).<sup>3</sup> The weight of the vessel and the drudgery of water carrying, along with multiple trips to fetch water for daily needs of a family are widely studied.

Generally, care work done by women is underappreciated and not recognized at all. This trend has existed and continues even today also because people have always assumed that women are meant to do all the care work. There is another popular assumption that women are genetically pre-programmed to do care work.

‘Work’ as a noun simply means activity involving mental or physical effort done in order to achieve a result, it also means a task or series of tasks undertaken. This simple definition of work will make it easier to understand what constitutes work and what simply does not qualify as work as per its literal meaning. Interestingly that bodies and authorities that make labour laws are surprisingly quiet about the definition of work.

The reason for not recognising unpaid care work also has its own set of problems. Prospective problems of unions, remuneration that is commensurate to the work done, etc. are few deterring reasons for lack of recognition of care work. Also the bigger questions – who will provide care and who will remunerate for the care work done? Perhaps the apprehension of these problems is the main constraints in recognizing the unpaid care work done by women.

One of the main reason unpaid care work affects women is mainly as it takes away all their time and energy in providing for family needs and resources. The participation of a woman in the economy, polity and even in educational fields is minimal or inconspicuous especially if she spends most of her day providing care or doing unpaid care work. The only way women can make changes to their own stature in society and several other fields is by participating in it actively.

---

<sup>3</sup> Susan B. Sorenson, Christiaan Morssink, Paola Abril Campos, Safe Access to Safe Water in Low Income Countries: Water Fetching in Current Times. Departmental Papers (SPP), May, 2011. School of Social Policy and Practice, University of Pennsylvania

India's Female Labour Force Participation (FLFP) rate has remained visibly low and the International Labour Organisation ranks India's FLFP rate at 121 out of 131 countries in 2013, one of the lowest in the world. <sup>3</sup>Female Labour Force Participation<sup>4</sup> (FLFP) dropped by 19.6 million women from 2004–05 to 2011–12. Participation declined by 11.4% — from 42.6% to 31.2% — from 1993–94 to 2011–12. There are several contributing factors to these figures indicated.

One of the positive looking factor is approximately 53% of this drop occurred in rural India, among those aged between 15 and 24 due to an increase in educational enrolment among the younger cohort, attainment of socio-economic status, and household composition largely contributed to the drop.<sup>5</sup> So long as the economic participation of women will be measured in terms of labour force, the efforts and initiatives taken to ensure their participation will somehow never match or give out the kind of results expected. A woman's actual contribution to the economy is not limited to her participation in the labour force, it also extends largely in terms of her providing stability to a home through the care work done on a daily basis.

Unpaid work is valued less from paid work for the simple reason that work that gets money is always considered important as it gets the cash rolling in. However, unpaid care work done by women has no monetary benefits assigned to it. Time-use survey method and replacement cost method are two ways to capture the contribution of women with respect to unpaid care work.

The encumbrance of unpaid household work hinders women from seeking employment and income.<sup>6</sup> An increase in their household responsibilities, either through marriage or childbearing, forces many women either to withdraw themselves from the labour market; or to find more flexible, part-time jobs; or to enter into self-employment that offers more flexible time management. Women are known to struggle to get back into the workforce after a long break in their careers are childbirth and even after breaks taken to care for elderly or sick relatives at home.

The year 2030 agenda for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) includes two major goals of Gender Equality and Decent Work. The International Labour Organisation (ILO) has prescribed what needs to be done<sup>7</sup> to bring about the necessary change in this area of discussion. Unpaid care work has been recognized and the need for it to be supported has been appreciated by ILO in its endeavor to achieve the 2030 target for SDGs. ILO recommends recognition and

---

<sup>3</sup> Labour participation rate of women in India visibly low, says World Bank study. Nagesh Prabhu BENGALURU, APRIL 17, 2017 08:00 IST. UPDATED: APRIL 17, 2017 08:00 IST

<sup>4</sup> 'Precarious Drop Reassessing Patterns of Female Labour Force Participation in India', published by the World Bank in April 2017

<sup>5</sup> Ibid

<sup>6</sup> Measurement of Unpaid Household Work of Women in India: A Case Study of Hooghly District of West Bengal Anindita Sengupta (University of Burdwan, India) 34th IARIW General Conference Dresden, Germany, August 21-27, 2016

<sup>7</sup> Decent work and the 2030 agenda for sustainable development, International Labour Organization (ILO) Department of Communication and Public Information

valuation of unpaid work through the provision of public services, infrastructure and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate.<sup>8</sup>

In many parts of the world, women are often in undervalued and low-paid jobs, and lack access to education, training and recruitment. They have limited bargaining and decision-making power and still shoulder responsibility for most unpaid care work. Globally, only about half of the world's women are in the labour force, compared to nearly 80 per cent of men, earning on average 23 per cent less than men, with mothers particularly hard hit.<sup>9</sup>

This paper looks at the role that policymakers and authorities & laws can play proactively to ensure the recognition and support that unpaid work done by women truly deserves in India. The ways and means by which the effects of age old biases and notions that could be changed and positively influenced such that the workload of care work done by women can be shared by other members in the family. It is understood that the care work even if unpaid would continue to remain as long as people stay in families and actively participate in the society and economy. Hence it is imperative to look for ways and methods in which the current state of affairs can be changed or at least mitigated to some extent.

The current and existing schemes by the government and policy makers will be examined in this paper. This will highlight the strategies for income and support for care work that are working and in practice in India. One of the major outcomes of such schemes and projects or practices would be of that women who seek a break from care work and wish to pursue their interests and maybe even take rest, would benefit from them immensely. A policy document is a precursor to a legislation. It is also important to see how the laws in India also view unpaid care work as. And how can legislations play a role in recognizing unpaid care work done by women in India.

---

<sup>8</sup> Ibid

<sup>9</sup> Ibid



# **Self-Confidence of Professional Women and Their Business-Bloom**

**Dr. Chayanika Singh**

Consultant Psychologist, Kolkata

chayanika.singh8@gmail.com

## **Background**

For decades, women of India are oppressed by the dominance of patriarchal society, where they intend to keep women subservient and peripheral. Several researches on the Indian women have been conducted on women's depression and anxiety while staying at home and becoming puppets in the hands of men in authority. They surmised that feeling of insecurity led to high stress and neurotic depression. Domestic-matters, interactions with a large family (Joint family) and fulfilling the expectations singly may play a devastated role in their everyday life, which may be instrumental in increasing the rate of anxiety and depression. The patriarchal society does not allow women to take their own decisions, might be they exclude them from the financial front. Thus, making them more dependent on the male authority. It may be one of the crucial factors for women to keep themselves behind the background, evaluating themselves worthless with a poor self-esteem. Evolution in the status of today's professional women and their increased anxiety related to make a place in male-dominating sectors now seem to be a matter of great concern for the psychologists and social reformers from all over the world to find out the causal-factors for the intervention. However gradually, women started revolting against the patriarchal system in India. They explored that to get financial independence is the key to their evolution and happiness. With the steady rise in economic independence, now the professional women are facing the challenges at their work-front where majority of males are placed. Thus, coping with this change, would be seen as threatening and challenging.

Reasons were manifold, related to home and office. Home front is still considered as a woman's zone. Increased responsibilities, poor home environment, dealing with male customers, managing male staff and commuting from home to work-place seem to be the risk-factors for the professional women's mental health. This study is based on the professional non-Bengali-women who are struggling a lot to make their own identity in the male dominant society, in terms of business. Since dealing with business is considered to be solely males zone, it was a challenging area for women in setting and getting profit out of their business.

In Bengal, women are considered straight forward and downright, however, the conditions of non-Bengalis, living in Kolkata, have their opposite tales.

## **Objective**

1. To discuss and highlight the issues of professional non-Bengali-women, who set-up their own business in different fields, in Kolkata, West Bengal, India.

2. The tactics professional women are using in coping with the problems arising from several sources.

## **Methodology**

Kolkata is the political and business capital of the state of West Bengal under the Government of India. It is situated on the banks of the river Hooghly, a distributary of the Ganges and has a cultural heritage going back over 310 years. The city is under the administrative control of the Calcutta Metropolitan Corporation (CMC), headed by the Mayor of Calcutta. For better execution of services to the residents of Calcutta, the city has been divided into five regions, viz. north, south, east, west and central. Northern region of Calcutta is highly populated with Hindi-speaking families and hub of business which is highly controlled by businessmen.

This research has been conducted on non-Bengali professionals, living in the Northern zone of Kolkata, struggling to set-up their own small business.

Altogether 80 non-Bengali professional women have been studied. All the women were married with one or two kids. They belong to middle class family and are the residents of North Kolkata. Their educational level is Higher secondary to Graduation. Age falls between 30 years to 40 years. Income level is Rs. 15,000-30,000. These women started their own business in various fields. Their set-up includes sari shops, readymade garments, gift shops, boutique, imitation and artificial jewelry. Interview with 80 professional women on the above mentioned, “self-made scale”, was conducted. The Direct-Interview method had been applied during their Individual Counselling Sessions. This “self-made scale”, consists of a wide range of their familial, business and stress areas along with their coping mechanisms. The four relevant fields had been addressed in the questions, relevant to their problem-areas as:

1. Family related issues.
2. Work related issues
3. Stress
4. Coping-mechanism

1. Family related issues cover areas like co-operation from family members (Joint family) or husband (nuclear family).

2. Work related issues cover the areas of relationship with staff and co-workers, insufficient financial benefit and frustration over customer behavior.

3. Stress over the demanding situations ranging from home to work. It covers, payments to staff, home-management, shop management. Absence of co-workers, commuting between home to office, crowd, face lewd comments, stalking, ogling etc.

1. Family-related issues: This area was covering the following statements with “Yes” or “No” answer.

- A. Do you perform all the household work singly?
  - B. Does your husband participate in baby care?
  - C. Does your husband like your business?
  - D. Does he take your earnings?
  - E. Do you have frequent big fights with your husband over your business?
2. Work-related issues: This area covers the following statements:
- A. Do you have good communication with your male staff?
  - B. Do you face discomfort while dealing with the male customer?
  - C. Do you face any challenge at your work place?
  - D. Does your family show objection for the business you do?
  - E. Do you face difficulty while communicating with the customer?
3. Stress: This area consists the statements to record their stress which arises from their everyday life-routine:
- A. Do you often get tired?
  - B. Do you have sufficient sleep?
  - C. Do you eat properly?
  - D. Do you lack any entertainment in life?
  - E. Does your family co-operate when you suffer from any illness or sickness?
4. Coping-Mechanisms:
- A. Self-care technique: Eating right kind of food, exercising for 15 minutes at least 3 times in a week.
  - B. Self-realization: Altering the situations which arise from their own mistakes/or others, with a positive attitude.
  - C. Communication-skill: Business blooms with communication. To give the priority to business, avoid the negative comments of customers.
  - D. Letting-go-of-negative thoughts: Overcome fears and insecurities related to personal and business front.
  - E. Avoid the persons ogling: There is no room for the person who ogles. Avoiding completely is the best way rather than giving importance to them.

## **Result**

The result revealed that the women who were vulnerable to family issues, adopted less Self-care-techniques and Letting-go-off-negative thoughts and, were perhaps unhappier and had less financial gains as compared to the women who adopted Self-care-techniques and

Letting-go-off-negative thoughts. They were also found to be prone to any stress easily, resulting in migraine or other psychosomatic complaints compared to the latter. However, the interview revealed that all the women were victims of either mental or physical abuse from the men in authority, here, husband. The husbands, according to the subjects, took their business as a threat to their “self (ego)”, insecurity, losing power. The support from the husband was negligible at the home and business front for the women in general. The analysis of interview also revealed that husbands also suffered from social-anxiety which includes the comments of the surroundings/peer groups. Furthermore, it is not related to only husbands, the threats come from other businessmen of that area too, who were jealous of the progress of women or took an insult if their business got hampered, or if the women took the driver’s seat. These professional women also encountered men’s ogle, having their business at the same place. Being a woman, this kind of behavior of men was inevitable, particularly in male-dominating areas where men have their own set-ups. The women who were more apt in utilizing the “Avoid-the-person ogling technique” were found to be more successful than the women who lacked this skill. However, in the Indian set-up, the businessmen might have an opinion that it was an indirect insult of their masculinity. They were very much opinionated about the females’ business set-up. Since the communication skill of women is known to be far better, in terms of business, compared to men, so the threats of their masculinity, particularly related to business could not be ruled out. All the women related to this study, reported that their communication skill was positive, in terms of dealing with the business.

It was found that women who were applying the coping mechanisms like Self-care Technique and Letting-go-of-negative thoughts more efficiently, were found to be more satisfied than the women who did not take care of self and got over-loaded with external stress. Stressors were mostly emerging from the Family-front, particularly husbands. They were unwilling to give pocket money or money for running their household, the head of the house, in a nuclear family, husband or joint family, husband’s father. This was a quite surprise finding throughout the interview, where the women have to beg for their needs. The outcome of the result was worse that the head of the family, men, were found to indulge in tobacco chewing, alcohol or other luxuries if they have any, than fulfilling the needs and desires of their families. It was also recorded that the men of the family discouraged their women and instilled in them the fear of losing money. The most astonishing thing seen in the interviews recorded was that all the women were victims of their husbands’ atrocities.

It was found in another result that women were getting less profit and they were unable to upgrade their business further. Thus due to scarcity of finance to improve their business, their business was at stake in want of generating financial resources.

Another relevant finding was that the women who adopted, “Avoid-the person-ogling technique” were more successful than women who were disturbed with the males’ attitude.

## **Discussion**

According to women, it is the tactic of men to overpower women through their aggressive behaviour to defend themselves from their counter-aggression. It is quite apparent from the above result that the harsh and rigid treatment of men (husbands) could most likely be a defensive function to cover up their own ego-functions and perceive themselves as powerful ones. Thus, the aggressiveness in males could most likely be a defensive function so as to present themselves as more powerful.

Another significant finding was that women who completely ignored the ogling and other derogatory remarks made by males in the contemporary business set-up, used it as a strategy to weaken their gesture which the women found a biggest hindrance in the prospect of their business, thus making them more confident. Furthermore, men's jealousy by perceiving women's business-bloom, might be their strategy to discourage those women to quit by giving them a lecherous look. Thus, it can be explained with the available studies that the women who were much concerned about their business and avoided external stressors, were more confident and had a steady growth in their business compared to those women who were highly sensitive and easily swayed by the external stressors.

## **Conclusion**

Self-confidence and positive attitudes in women were the most contributing parts of their skill to cope-up with the above-mentioned challenges.

# **Women in the Bahrain Financial Sector: Opportunities, Challenges and Strategic Choices**

**Dr. Chitra Sinha**

Guest Researcher, Centre for Gender Research, Uppsala University; Research Fellow, University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa

chitra.sinha@gender.uu.se

## **Abstract**

The financial crisis of 2007-08 and its global fallout has brought to the fore several shortcomings related to the functioning of financial institutions, including excessive risk taking and disregard to early warning signals emanating from the market. From a gender perspective, aggressive profit oriented behavior was demonstrated by male dominance in the financial world where ethical concerns were brushed aside, a phenomenon aptly summarized by the IMF Chief Christine Lagarde in an interview with International Herald Tribune – “ If Lehman Brothers had been Lehman Sisters, today’s economic crisis clearly would look quite different” . Indeed, evidence exist that women, when bestowed with authority and decision making power in financial firms (whether in microfinance institutions of Bangladesh or in the all women investment banks of Iceland), have demonstrated their ability to manage finances judiciously through the avoidance of imprudent risk taking. In reality, however, very few women could move into the corridors of power in financial Institutions to have a say on strategic issues. While the presence of women at the entry level – secretaries, analyst, coordinators even as heads of back office departments have increased over the last few decades, very few could penetrate the “glass ceiling” to reach senior managerial positions, , which have remained a male preserve .

The present paper explores the pattern and reasons behind such exclusion of women in decision making process in one of the major financial centres of the middle east (vibrant with over four hundred institutions) – the Bahrain financial sector. The paper attempts to throw light on the social, cultural and economic causes influencing the representation of women in strategy setting and in determining the Bank’s risk appetite. The paper reviews disclosures by Bahraini banking sector on gender related issues and supplements this with qualitative assessment of the existing legal framework, gender perceptions in society and work environments in the industry.

Available empirical evidence suggest that while Universities put great emphasis on financial education, and a significant proportion of Bahraini women work in the financial sector, their career progression is distinctly slower than men, due to a variety of socio- cultural constraints, perception bias, job requirements and policy choices underscoring the need for a detailed assessment of opportunities and challenges faced by women in Bahrain financial sector. Using

Bank level public disclosures and data from Government sources, the paper attempts to understand the opportunities and constraints of women's work participation in the financial sector. It attempts to contribute towards the felt need for such analysis spelt out by the Supreme Council for Women in Bahrain :“to monitor and measure the status of the change in the attitudes and values of individuals, organizations and society through quantitative and qualitative data about the extent to which mainstreaming women's needs and providing equal opportunity is achieved.” At the same time, it observes the challenges in conducting such research due to data limitations and inconsistencies of available statistics.

# **The Current Reorganisation of Social Reproduction, Care Extractivism and Care Struggles: A Topical Perspective from Europe**

**Christa Wichterich**

Center for Gender Studies, University of Basel

wichterich@femme-global.de

Care – care work, care economy and care ethics – has been at the centre of research and theoretical reflection of feminist political economics in the past decades (Folbre 1994; Elson 2002; Razavi 2007). My paper suggests the concept of care extractivism as a space- and time-diagnostic tool for research of intersectional power relations in the context of neoliberal policies. Care extractivism – shaped analogue to the recently popular concept of resource extractivism – marks firstly the intensification and expansion of the ongoing economisation and commodification of work in national and transnational markets. It is a form of accumulation based on reckless exploitation of resources assuming that they are endlessly available. Secondly, strategies of care extractivism similar to resource extractivism are supposed to cope with crises situations of social and biological reproduction without burdening the state with additional costs and social responsibilities.

The prevailing strategy of care extractivism is the economisation of care as paid work, meaning that the rationale of capitalist accumulation expands into earlier non-commercialised areas such as family, household, and community relations, “last colonies”.<sup>10</sup> Commodified care as personal services gets subjected to the capitalist principles of competition, efficiency, growth and profit making.

The essentialistic assumption that care work is deeply rooted in the female nature, women’s skills, feelings and ethics serves as justification for low recognition and little payment. Additional, migration alongside class, race and North-South asymmetries reinforce the low valuation of care work<sup>11</sup>. As capitalist markets have little appreciation of labour with no increase in productivity, they attribute low value and little payment to care work because it has its own speed and it is not possible to increase efficiency of feeding a baby or a dement person like an industrial process.

## **Professionalisation of care work and the making of neoliberal subjects**

Two striking features of the reconfiguration of social reproduction which shape its new extractivist quality are its professionalisation and its transnationalisation.

In Western Europe, care work in the health sector, including care for the elderly, has been subjected to a modulisation and standardisation similar to industrial labour. It gets fragmented, taylorised and scheduled into time units. All activities have to be documented. In hospitals, the

---

<sup>10</sup> Maria Mies, Veronica Bennholdt-Thomsen, Claudia v. Werlhof: *Women, the Last Colony*, London 1988; Silvia Federici: *Caliban and the Witch: Women, the Body and Primitive Accumulation*. NY 2004; David Harvey: *The New Imperialism: Accumulation by Dispossession*. In: *Socialist Register*

<sup>11</sup> Helma Lutz: *The New Maids. Transnational women and the care economy*. London/New York 2011



US accounting system according to 'Diagnosis Related Groups' classifies patients and pays flat rates for standardised medical and care services.

This is a mode of cost containment which measures and remunerates care labour like industrial piece work, controls work in a technocratic, productivist manner and disciplines the care workers.

The modulisation of nursing in hospitals and of the care for elderly in old age homes and by ambulant services in private households is considered to be a professionalisation and an indicator for quality in a growing and highly competitive market of public and private entrepreneurs. These strategies of rationalisation disembed care from social relations and construct care workers as competitive neoliberal market subject.

The key problem of modulisation from a perspective of caring is that these schedules and modules don't leave any time for showing empathy and applying a human touch towards the patients. However, "emotional work" as coined by Arlie Hochschild<sup>3</sup>, is inseparable from care work. Thus waged care labour is organised in a way that it includes unpaid work, resulting in a systematic underpayment and in the construction of a cheap reproductive labour force.

In the case of ambulant services for the elderly Germany, the modules of rationalisation and industrialisation put a tremendous pressure on the caregivers who drive in small company cars from one client to the next. Their services and car rides become a race against time and humaneness, with strains on the body, psyche and energy level of the caregivers.

An unfolding form of care extractivism in Western Europe are 24 hours live-in services for the elderly with the highest possible degree of just-in-time availability and flexibility, mostly done by migrant workers from Poland and the Balkan states. These 24 hours services in private households resemble a semi-feudal form of care work, often without a proper contract, meaning that not 24 hours are paid because the care workers are supposed to enjoy a lot of leisure time. Thus the boundaries between paid and unpaid are fluid resulting in an appalling underpayment of live-in workers. On the national level, migrant care workers from the Global South and East compensate for the acute shortage of caregivers for the elderly in the Global North. And on the household level, they cushion the employment and professional career of qualified middle class women.

### **Transnational care chains and the shifting of crises**

Care chains are care drain. Transnational reproductive networks and care chains withdraw care capacities and emotional work from the Global South shifting care energy from poorer to more affluent households, from poor to richer countries<sup>4</sup>. Thereby the local crisis of social reproduction is transferred from the Global North to the countries of origin of the recruited care worker. Due to care extractivism, care and emotional capacities are missing in the households and countries of origin. The care worker from the Global South has to cope with the care shortage caused by the

---

<sup>3</sup> Arlie Hochschild: Global Care Chains and Emotional Surplus Value, in: A. Giddens/W.Hutton (eds.): On the Edge. Globalization and the New Millennium, London, 2000, pp 137-179; Rahel Salazar Parrenas, Servants of Globalisation. Women, Migration and Domestic Work. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001

<sup>4</sup> Nancy Yeates: Globalizing Care Economic and Migrant Workers. Explorations in Global Care Chains. London 2009

care drain in her own family. Mostly, the care of her own children and of elderly family members is handed over to female relatives, or for a minimal payment to neighbours or migrant women coming from poorer regions or countries, e.g. in Poland to women from the Ukraine. However ultimately, many care gaps remain unfilled and exert severe strains on the reproductive systems on the microlevel of households and the national level. This results in a reproductive regimes based on a new international division of care work and transnational landscape of stratified reproduction, care inequalities and care shortages<sup>5</sup>.

Germany has a long standing history of care extractivism. In 1963 a lack of nurses in west-german hospitals resulted in the recruitment of 10000 highly qualified nurses from South Korea under the auspices of “technical development aid”. However, their diplomas were not recognised in Germany, their work got devalued. Additionally 6000 young women, some of them nuns, from Kerala, South India, were recruited through catholic networks<sup>6</sup>. When in 1977 the migrant nurses were told to return home, the South Koreans protested and argued that their services in Germany were „reversed development aid“ and stated: „We are not a commodity“.

Since a few years the German government took once again initiative to recruit care workers from the Global South and to normalise transnational care extractivism. GIZ (German International Cooperation) trains caregivers for the elderly in China, Philippines, and Vietnam, the Federal Agency for Labour recruits skilled care workers in Bosnia, Serbia, Tunisia and calls it a „triple win“, actually for the sending country, Germany and the individual worker. This transnational care extractivism is legitimised by a racio-culturalistic discourse, that people from the global South are more loving and respectful towards elderly people.

### **Surrogate mothers as entrepreneurs of their body**

A new form of care extractivism is the transnational reconfiguration of biological reproduction with surrogacy as a metaphor for a new form of reproductive labour and new labour relations. The landscape of bioeconomy, fertility markets and reproductive tourism is largely mapped out by the laws, licences and bans by nation states and biopolitics.<sup>7</sup>

India functioned for more than a decade as a transnational hub for the reproductive industries till in 2016 the hindu-nationalistic government announced a ban on surrogacy and egg donation after years of laissez faire and of public debates on the transnational commercialisation and industrialisation of (re-)production. This ban, however, has not yet passed the parliament.

The commodification of surrogacy constructs the surrogate mother’s pregnancy and delivery as waged labour, and the woman as an entrepreneur of her body. The legal framework for this work

---

<sup>5</sup> Helma Lutz/ Ewa Palenga-Möllenbeck: Care Workers, Care Drain, and Care Chains: Reflections on Care, Migration, and Citizenship, In: Social Politics, Vol 19 (1), 2012, pp15-37; Lise Widding Isaksen, Sambasivan Uma Devi, Arlie Russell Hochschild: Global Care Crisis. A Problem of Capital, Care Chain, or Commons? In: American Behavioral Scientist, Vol 52, Issue 3, 2008, pp 405 - 425

<sup>6</sup> Urmila Goel: Heteronormativity and intersectionality as perspective of analysis of gender and migration: Nurses from India in West Germany, In: Perspectives on Asian Migration, RLS, Berlin 2013, 77-83

<sup>7</sup> Catherine Waldby. Reproductive Labour Arbitrage: Trading Fertility across European Borders, In: Martin Gunnarson/Fredrik Svenaeus: The Body as Gift, Resource, and Commodity. Stockholm, 2012, pp 267-295; Sama Resource Group for Women and Health: Birthing a Market: A Study on Commercial Surrogacy, New Delhi 2012

is a contract that stipulates a wage payment - called compensation - to be paid only after the delivery of the ordered baby, the quality product. This taylorised and outsourced contract labour facilitates an extractivism of care, bio-resources and bodily energy. As per the contract, the surrogate mother rents out her unused uterus as a vessel for somebody else's baby. As no social or health protection is foreseen in the labour contract and the women carry the full risk in case of a miscarriage or stillbirth the work qualifies as precarious informal labour.

With the contract the surrogate mother signs away her rights over her body to the reproductive entrepreneurs, mainly the clinic and agrees to the expropriation of control, medicalization of the pregnancy and to frequent quality control of the product. The accommodation of the women in hostels near the hospital is an entrepreneurial strategy of disciplining, similar to the accommodation of export workers in dormitories adjacent to factories in China.

Professionalisation means that the process gets subordinated to the market rationale of efficiency and competition. Clinics compete with regard to the success rate of In-vitro-fertilisation (IVF) and nesting of the embryo in the women's uterus. In order to multiply the chances of an embryo to nest, after IVF normally five embryos are transferred, or embryos of one couple are tentatively implanted into two surrogate mothers. If several pregnancies occur the "surplus" embryos are "reduced" according to the wish of the commissioning parents, often without informing the surrogate mother<sup>8</sup>. The contracted women have to accept several attempts of embryo implantation, as they have to accept also the abortion of disabled and "surplus" embryos, however, they are not allowed to stop the process themselves Amrita Pande: *Wombs in Labour. Transnational Commercial Surrogacy in India*, New York 2014; Sharmila Rudrappa: *Discounted Life. The Prize of Global Surrogacy in India*. New York/London 2015<sup>9</sup>.

Responding to the omission of social protection and entitlements in the contract and in the whole process, some scholars proposed "fair trade" surrogacy with labour rights and social security and "reproductive justice" for the contract mothers<sup>10</sup>. However, this regulation makes for a normalisation of reproductive work and care extractivism.

The uneasiness felt by feminists with the Indian ban on commercial surrogacy is caused by the claim of moral superiority of the identitarian hindu-chauvinist government and the lack of interest in women's rights and the elimination of poverty which forces women to take up this income generation opportunity.

The ban set another chain of care extractivism in motion: Reproductive entrepreneurs went underground, women are driven into illegality, mobile arrangements and even greater vulnerability<sup>11</sup>. First, agencies and clinics set up branches in Cambodia but when a few months

---

<sup>8</sup> Kalindi Vora: Potential, Risk, and Return in Transnational Indian Gestational Surrogacy, in: *Current Anthropology*, Vol 54, Supplement 7, 2013, pp S97-S106

<sup>9</sup> Amrita Pande: *Wombs in Labour. Transnational Commercial Surrogacy in India*, New York 2014; Sharmila Rudrappa: *Discounted Life. The Prize of Global Surrogacy in India*. New York/London 2015

<sup>10</sup> Casey Humbyrd, Fair Trade International Surrogacy, In: *Developing World Bioethics*, Vol 9, No 3, 2009, pp 111-118;

<sup>11</sup> Sarojini Nadimpally/ Sneha Banerjee/ Deepa Venkatachalam: *Commercial Surrogacy: A Contested Terrain in the Realm of Rights and Justice*. Sama Resource Group for Women and Health, New Delhi 2016.

later Cambodia announced its own ban, they moved on to Laos and Vietnam. Presently Ukraine is new hub of reproductive technologies and fertility business.

### **Care struggles and politisation of care**

Care extractivism has recently been exposed and contested in a growing number of care struggles, protests and campaigns in Europe by 24-hours-migrant workers, educators in kindergardens and schools, doctors and nurses in hospitals, and caretakers in old age homes. These feminised labour struggles make two features of the mostly invisible care work visible: the little appreciation and the low remuneration of care in the market economy.

An outstanding transnational campaign was the self-organised struggle of domestic workers for an ILO convention which resulted 2011 in the adoption of convention 189. Core of the convention is the recognition as ‘normal’ workers in order to secure labour rights, social security provisions and a right to organise. However, the adoption of the convention remains a kind of symbolic victory as long as only few countries ratified it: 24 countries in 2017 only.

The protests and strikes by the care staff and nurses at the Charité hospital in Berlin, Germany’s largest clinic, were paradigmatic in terms of politicising care extractivism in a neoliberal system. They marked a shift of focus from payment to the quality of care. The intensification and taylorisation of medical and nursing work permanently overburden care workers, result in ‘burn out’ effects and render the provision of high quality services impossible. Therefore the key demand of the late strikes was to employ more staff so that quality care could be provided: „More of us is better for everybody“.

This slogan actually corresponds with the hunger strike of young doctors in Poland in 2017 against the underfunded and understaffed health system. The doctors mostly work independently and take up several jobs in several shifts at several clinics to compensate for the miserable payment, resulting in severe overwork and depletion of health. Against this background, thousands of polish doctors, dentists and nurses migrated to Scandinavian and western European countries. Therefore, the striking doctors asked for an increase in the overall health budget as a precondition to improve their work situation. Stressing their care ethics, they claimed to go beyond egoistic group interests and to strike for the patients as well.

In Berlin, patients and ordinary citizens declared their solidarity with the striking nurses and doctors, and built a new alliance, jointly politicising the underlying crisis of social reproduction. Thus the current struggles go beyond the conventional trade unionist issues of wage and work place to policies of recognition and identity, and ultimately show that care is a highly contested area at the heart of the society.

# **Policy Communities' Gender Knowledge on Women in Agriculture**

**Christoph Scherrer**

Lecturer at the Center for Gender Studies, University of Basel

[scherrer@uni-kassel.de](mailto:scherrer@uni-kassel.de)

## **Abstract**

That knowledge is power and that traditional knowledge has been constructed in the interests of the powerful has been a critique of contemporary feminist scholarship from the start. This insight challenges the scientific claim about knowledge being universal and objective. In reality, such knowledge is usually partial, created by men, and based on men's lives. Mainstream theories informing policy making in agriculture are based on a very traditional understanding of gender roles. Most theories harbor a 'conceptual silence', i.e., the failure to acknowledge explicitly or implicitly the gendered nature of agriculture.

In contrast to the gender-insensitivity which underpins most of the policy discourse(s) and beliefs and normative assumptions of the policy community, I start from the premise that all knowledge is based upon a specific gender knowledge. The concept of gender knowledge (Geschlechterwissen) has been introduced by German sociologists, Sünne Andresen and Irene Dölling (2005) which draws on the sociology of knowledge and focuses on the construction of gender and gender relations in the policy making process. The gender knowledge concept starts from the assumption that every form of knowledge – be it everyday knowledge, expert knowledge and popularized knowledge – is based upon a specific, often tacit and unconscious, form of gender knowledge. From Foucauldian discourse theory we know that discourses 'produce' the criteria for judging truth claims. This implies that it is not enough to inquire into how women are represented, but what is even more important is to understand what unquestioned assumptions underpin the role of scientific knowledge claims and its input into the policy processes in national discourses. In contrast to the supposed gender-neutral assumptions of mainstream knowledge, the focus on gender knowledge allows to pay systematic attention to the articulation of different knowledge forms in national discourses and how normative and cognitive claims intersect and how countries peoples might differ with regard to the ways they evaluate such claims.

The presentation will in a first step explain the concept of gender knowledge. In a second step it will apply the concept to theories informing the agricultural policy communities. It will highlight the differences as well as the similarities between a traditional patriarchal and a neoliberal gender knowledge in agricultural policy making.

## References

- Andresen, Sünne, Dölling Irene 2005: Umbau des Geschlechter-Wissens von ReformakteurInnen durch Gender Mainstreaming? In: Ute Behning, Birgit Sauer (ed), Was bewirkt Gender Mainstreaming? Ansätze der Evaluierung durch Policy-Analysen, Frankfurt/Main: Campus.
- Young, Brigitte, und Christoph Scherrer (eds.), 2010: The Role of Gender Knowledge in Policy Networks, Baden-Baden, Nomos.

# **Gender, Migration and Work: Lived experience of women migrant as home based worker in informal economy of Mumbai**

**Debanita Biswas**

Doctoral Scholar, Advance Centre for Women Studies, SDS, TISS (Mumbai), India  
debanita.smcs@gmail.com, mp2017ws002@tiss.edu

## **Abstract**

Drawn from case studies from my doctoral research, this paper explores everyday lived experiences of three women migrant workers' home based informal work. In the current global context informal labour of women is located within the segmented labour market as temporary, insecure employment, labour exploitation and precarity. Their narratives reflect on their work, (paid and unpaid) and marginality within the intersection of gender, migration and slum living environment. The case studies are about home based private tuition, making of soft toy cover as piece work and helper of a panipuri vendor within family settings. Their gender, migrant status and slum dweller identities are intrinsic to the informality of labour. Their marginality and invisibility in official data sources is a mark of the absences in the policy that refers to gender and labour. This has an effect on their rights and entitlements as it does on the recognition of their economic contribution.

## **Key words**

Gender, Migration, Women and Work, lived experience, Urban Slum

## **Background**

The United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat) stated that one out of three people in the world live in a slum environment. Asia, the fastest-growing urban area hosts half of world's population. According to world urbanization prospect of 2014, there are twenty eight megacities worldwide. Mumbai being one of them is not geared infrastructurally to bear the pressure of such population, as a result of which, slums are abundant.

A Planning Commission report of Government of India (2011) mentioned that slums are a reflection of the exclusionary socio-economic policies and planning. People living in slums contribute significantly by being a source of affordable labour supply in both formal and informal economy of the country. The inability to take care and build accountability on behalf of marginal poor reflects poor capacity of the state (Sajjad, 2013). The State authorities have not given migration and problems of slums the attention it needs. The Indian Constitution allows a person the right to move, live and work in any part of the country but there is no migration policy at a state or national level. Migration is correlated with complexities of slum living environment, livelihoods and development in the urban context. There is complex interdependency between migrants and the political context of migration with micro – macro linkages of development.

“Migration, a physical and social transaction, is also an instrument of cultural diffusion and social integration even though most of the earlier studies on migration are centered on its economical aspect. Often framed by men’s experience, such research ignores women’s role therein”. (Banerjee and Raju, 2009)

Migration and slum as a settlement of the urban poor has different consequences for men and women. Women migrants face special problems. The official statistics and independent analysis have started accepting that migration patterns are highly gendered, in terms of the causes and consequences of movement (Ghosh, 2009). Other than gender, there are demarcations in the city space on the basis of caste, class, religion and area location such as lower, middle or upper class which create specific vulnerabilities for women.

### **Context of the Study**

The M-East Ward, (Municipal ward in Mumbai) the location of the study, is comparable to sub Saharan Africa on the basis of its score of 0.05 Human Development Index (Mumbai Human Development Report, 2009). Basic public services such as school, water and sanitation are deficient. For example, the population per hospital is 66,881; per dispensary 27,438 and per Anganwadi centre is 2175. The state has facilitated the development of M Ward as a slum ward (Bhide, 2017).

### **Migration, Gender and Work**

Singh (2006) stated the Indian constitution allows a person the right to move, live and work in any part of the country but there is no migration policy at a state or national level. Migration is correlated with complex urban questions of slums, livelihoods and development. The Census of India defined Migration by two distinct criteria, the place of birth (POB) and the place of last residence (PLR). The National Sample Survey uses PLR as single determinant of migration. Both the official method collects data on spatial and temporal aspect of migration by bracketing detail on various forms, types, information on slum and migration. The women migrants join work force and participate in economic and political activities without entitlement of basic services and dignity. Women's individual rights and entitlement have to be seen in the collective political dimension of community as gender power relations define women's access to food, shelter, health, education and mobility (Krishnaraj, 2009).

Banerjee and Raju (2009) discussed on the changing work profile of migrant women and the avenues available to them. The study noted the limitation to document multiple „reasons for migration” and failure to notice the status of women as worker. Due to these gaps majority of women in urban India are classified as „associated migrants” means a combined category such as marriage, migration with parents or other earning member of the family. Migration to urban location provides work opportunities. But labour market assemblage in terms of caste, class, enabling environment, gender constructs, membership of particular social and religious group, education, marital status encode migrant women’s employment pattern. The authors argued the chance of upward mobility for the lower castes and poor migrant women are very low. Since the negotiations



on economic and social space and contestation of traditional gender role and caste constructs by the migrant women are marginal.

## **Rationale**

The contribution of women in general and migrant women in particular to the economy of their families and communities is a less understood and under researched. The women migrants join work force and participate in economic and political activities without entitlement of basic services and dignity. Fleury (2016) holds that migrant women's human rights need to be protected which include access to services and resources like health, legal, and finance.

Women migrants face special problems as they are officially termed as „associated migrants“. The official statistics and independent research analyses have started accepting those women's experiences as data are invisible for policy formulation. Majumdar et al (2013) through a research project identified gender invisibility in government macro data as key block to study migration within development discourse. In that report the women migrant workers (rural and urban) identified poverty, debt, decline in income, lack of local employment or loss of such employment as their reason for migration. Moreover, the forms and patterns of marginality are changing across societies and locations. Research data proves gender based violence, desertion (for giving birth to girl child, or being born as a girl child), alcoholism, unemployment and denial of education and health care as various forms of violence that has direct link with women in vulnerable contexts like slums. The state acts as marker and maker of the marginal population and their marginality through power of Act, Law and Policies based on exclusion.

This paper proposes to address the precarious lived reality of women migrant as home based worker of informal economy. The invisibility of research data on their qualitative experiences marginalizes them in the existing framework of development. The exclusion at policy level is a need to be addressed in order to engage in their marginality. An analysis of gender, migration, urban slum context and informal work will help elucidate programs and policies which will increase the economic and social benefits for female migrant workers who are constitutive of half the global migrant population.

## **Research Objectives**

To document the lived experiences of migrant women living in the slum environment of M East Ward of Mumbai.

To understand the context of their migration, process of their engagement as informal worker and associated challenges

To examine the different aspects of their gendered informal labour and negotiations within the space they inhabit, both private and public.

To analyze their relationship with the State, and reflect critically on their rights and entitlements as worker and citizen.

### **Research Questions**

What are the experiences of women migrants in the context of slums of M-East ward? How do they articulate their migration context with uncertain livelihood opportunity?

What are the available work opportunities accessible to women migrants?

What their negotiations are with the work – both paid and unpaid? How are these gendered? How does their migrant status affect this?

How do they contest for their rights as informal worker (if any)?

How do gender, caste, marital status, age, education, skill and family support affect their work opportunities? How does their work contribute to the family?

How do women migrant worker experience citizenship rights and entitlements?

### **Research Methodology**

The paper aims to document and analyze the lived experiences of migrant women living in the slums of M-East Ward of Mumbai through qualitative exploratory case studies. The frame work of phenomenology is used to subscribe meaning to their lived reality as migrant women worker and available livelihood opportunities. Through critical discourse analysis the case studies attempt to comprehend the context of their migration, their negotiation within the space they inhabit, private and public spaces, their role and contribution within the informal labour sector for the development of the local and the global. The narratives will reflect critically on their relationship with the state as worker and citizens.

### **Findings**

Women face discrimination as worker on the basis of their gender and status of slum living habitat. Their migration background, lack of education and skill influences their status and choices of work. Their narrative describes their journey as migrant worker with exploitative informal work, culture of patriarchy, quality of life and aspirations.

The narratives reflect on the nature of their precarious work, (paid and unpaid) and marginality within the intersection of gender, migration and slum living environment. The three case studies about home based private tuition, making of soft toy cover as piece work and helper of a panipuri vendor within family settings contribute to their family income, community and social development. Their gender, migrant status and slum dweller identities are constitutive towards their labour as urban informal worker. Their marginality and invisibility in official data source impede their right and entitlement as worker irrespective of their contribution.

## References

- Bhide, Amita. (2017) "Colonising the Slum: Changing Trajectories of State-Market Violence in Mumbai." *Economic & Political Weekly*, 18 February, pp 75-82
- Fleury, Anjali. (2016) "Understanding Women and Migration: A Literature Review."
- KNOMAD: Global Knowledge Partnership on Migration and Development
- Hassan, Sajjad. 2013. State capacity for pro-poor delivery: Constructing ownership, forging accountability. New Delhi: Office of Commissioners of the Supreme Court, Action Aid India.
- Hensman, Rohini. 2011. Workers, Unions and Global Capitalism Lessons from India. New Delhi: Tulika Book.
- Ghosh, J. (2009). Migration and Gender Empowerment: Recent Trends and Emerging Issues." Human Development Research Paper 04, United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report Office, New York. (H. D. United Nations Development Programme, Ed.) New York.
- Krishnaraj, Maithreyi. (2007) "Understanding Violence against Women." *Economic and Political Weekly*, November 3, 2007
- Mander, H. (2015, May 7th). India and become more unequal society than any other time in recent history. Retrieved from Hindustan Times <http://www.hindustantimes.com/harshmander/the-margins-to-oblivion/article1-1344955.aspx>
- Mazumdar, Indrani., N. Neetha., & Indu, Agnihotri (2013). Migration and gender in India.
- *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. XLVIII, No. 10 (March 9, 2013).
- Mumbai, Municipal Corporation of Greater, 2010. Mumbai Human Development Report, 2009. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- National Commission for Enterprises in the Unorganised Sector (NCEUS) (2007): "Report on the Conditions of Work and Promotion of Livelihoods in the Unorganised Sector", NCEUS, Government of India, New Delhi. <http://sanhati.com/articles/8325/>
- Raju Saraswati and Arpita Banerjee. (2009). Gendered Mobility: Women Migrants and Work in Urban India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, Volume XLIV No. 28.
- Ramachandran, Vimala. 2015. "Women's Struggles Many Dimensions." *Economic and Political Weekly*, December 12: 2015.
- Singh, D. P. (2006). Migration and Slum in Mumbai:Part II (Vol. 3). Mumbai: ENVIS Centre. Retrieved from [www.iipsenvis.nic.in/newsletters/vol3no2/dpsingh.htm](http://www.iipsenvis.nic.in/newsletters/vol3no2/dpsingh.htm)
- UNICEF, United Nations Children's Fund. n.d. "The State of the World's Children 2012 Report" New York, USA.

# **Women in Global Production System : Conditions of Farm Labour in Tea Plantation**

**Debdulal Saha**

Assistant Professor, TISS Guwahati

debdulals@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

In India, one of the current employment strategies is promotion of entrepreneurial skills through enhancement of self-employment options. Tea cultivation is becoming a viable self-employment own account option in the rural economy which is increasing since mid-1990s. Tea has traditionally been grown in large plantations that cover several hundred hectares in India. This industry is in the formal sector and it employs over 1 million permanent workers making it the largest employer in the formal private sector. The Plantation Labour Act (1951) makes it mandatory to provide workers with various economic and social entitlements such as housing, minimum wage, bonus, ration, provident fund, education, and healthcare facilities. In recent times, there is dichotomy in the tea plantation in India. While significant number of tea estates/factories (around 43) is either closed or abandoned since 2007, total production of tea has been increasing since 2009-10. On the other hand, consumption and price of tea in the national market has been rising and the export sector too is expanding. Demand for tea is not serviced by an expansion of plantations but by the growth of self-employed tea cultivators, known as small tea growers (STGs). These STGs are peasant farmers possessing maximum of 10.12 ha of land for growing tea leaves who cultivate their own land either by using family labour or employing wage labour. The farm labour (wage earners) and family labour (unpaid) primarily are women. The aim of the present paper is to locate women labour within the 'alternative model' of tea production. The present study will examine how these smallholders/self-employed cultivators manage/use 'labour' as one of the factors of production and what are their [labour] conditions? Further, why are these workers engaged and what are their motivation will be critically discussed? The arguments have been developed in light of non-standard employment (Standing 1999; Kalleberg 2000) and 'structuralisation of dual economy' (Sallaz 2013; Haynes 2012; Moser 1978) theories within macro debates of 'mode of production' and 'means of production'. A mixed methods research approach (Creswell 2008; Bryman 2009) has been adopted in the study. The paper is based on a survey of 400 wage workers and case narratives from key respondents drawn from Assam and West Bengal.

In view of the visible development at the village level, employment generation, asset holding pattern, and investment on human capital at both individual and household levels; one can say that there is prospect of cultivating tea in the rural economy. However, low price determination leading to low profit, which has negative spill over on the lives of farm labour. The plight of farm labour and shadow wage of family labour raise the questions on the sustainability of the alternative model. The sector depends mainly on casual workers, and they are not under any labour market institution (such as, Plantation Labour Act 1951), which makes it more vulnerable and exploitative in nature. The restructuring in plantation economy leads to informalisation and proletarianisation. There is need of state intervention and effective innovative progressive instruments to manage and control over unblemished growth of smallholders and farm labour.

# **Social Framework Analyses of Organizational Role Stress among Working Women in India**

**Dr. Deepmala Baghel**

Maharashtra National Law University, Nagpur

deepbaghel2@gmail.com

## **Introduction**

Working Women is a commonly visible in today's public sphere, yet women in the public domain is not as an accepted norm. Why this paradox and how this paradox impact the women at the workplace is the interest of this article. For any person having satisfactory life both at work and personal front is the requirement of fruitful personality development. This is not for individual benefit alone, but needed for whole society's progress. As women make half of the contributory to the growth of society we cannot afford to neglect their issues.

In today's dynamic world, women have ventured into all the domains of work, which were previously restricted to only men. Day by day women's work participation is increasing. As per the press information bureau of government of India, the work participation rate for women has been 25.68 percent in 2001, 19.67 percent in 1981 and 22.73 percent in 1991. The report shows increasing rate of women work participation. In organized sector women workforce constituted 18.4 percent of the total organized sector employment in the country. In 2003 about 49.68 lakh women workers employed in the organized sector (public and private) (PIB, Govt. Of India, 2006). There are women at the top position in an organization who are performing successfully their respective duties. Naina Lal Kidwai, MD, HSBC, India; Lalita Gupta, COO, ICICI, Pragya Raman, group executive president of Aditya Birla group, Indra Nooyi, CEO, Pepsico to name a few.

Nevertheless, the participation of women in the workforce is much below the men's participation still it form a recognizable group, whose contribution cannot be ignored. Moreover, it is not difficult to realize various issues that women are facing at the workplace. One of such issue is or Role stress. Often role stress is recognized as psychological origin that has an impact on women's psychology. However, this article seeks to present the role stress as having originated in society's gender framework that put extra pressures on women's role and hence have very many links to the sociological understandings.

As women increasingly gain occupational mobility, they are not only exposed to the same physical hazards of work environment as men but also exposed to the pressures created by multiple role demands. (Malhotra and Sachdeva, 2005). Women in different professions, experience various types of role stressors. The stressors of situational constraints and work overload are perceived to be higher by the nurses, whereas interpersonal conflict is reported to a higher degree by the physicians.

Women in regular hourly jobs are experiencing less role conflict. Lecturers experience less role conflict, whereas doctors and nurses have more role conflict as they have to work in erratic shift duties. (Malhotra and Sachdeva, 2005). Moreover, women in private sector banks experience more stress than women in public sector banks.

Some stressors are unique to particular professions such as personal inadequacy, role stagnation, resource inadequacy for information technology sector. Women in IT sectors have to learn new knowledge, acquire mastery over complex technologies. This often results in personal inadequacy among women, especially married women as they do not get enough time to learn new things. Conflicts were considered likely when women perceived their home and career as highly desirable but mutually exclusive. (Malhotra and Sachdeva, 2005). Problems of women are multidimensional (Malhotra and Sachdeva, 2005). Variety of factors contribute to the role stress among women, therefore, they require deep probing.

In this context, through this study, the attempt was made to unravel different role stressors (role conflict, role overload, role isolation, role stagnation, role distance, role erosion, role ambiguity, personal inadequacy, resource inadequacy.) afflicting working women. And examine the job specific, if any, stressors. Different professions have different stressors, some are common and some are peculiar to particular professions.

This study has following objectives:

- (1) Study role stress among professional women as a social phenomenon,
- (2) Examine, if any positive or negative impact of role stress on women and organization.

### **Conceptual underpinnings: Stress**

The word stress derived from the Latin word *stringere*, which means to draw tight (Skeat, 1958). There is no single accepted definition of stress. The most well-known definition is of Hans Selye (1932). He related environmental stress with the release of adrenal gland hormones as a response to it. This stress response is termed as the general adaptation syndrome (GAS). This is body's response to stressful situations. In general stress is body's response to unwanted situation.

### **Role stress**

Role is the expected behaviour associated with a social position. It is a position one occupies in a system. G.H. Mead the psychologist and sociologist incorporated this term in context of occupational categories. Role stress is a stress person experienced because of his/her role in organization. Role stress includes various variables such as role conflict, role ambiguity, role overload, role isolation, role stagnation, role erosion, inter role distance, role inadequacy. Role stress is a conflict and tension due to the roles being enacted by a person at any given point of time. Disparity in role space and role set can also lead to stress.

## **Organizational stress**

When stress is generated in an organizational setting it is called as organizational stress.

From time immemorial, it is the men who have been the dominant figures in the work force while females were taught to regard marriage as the only thing needful. Their working outside was considered derogatory. But now this phase has given way to the period of liberation, feminization of employment being the highlight of this phase. As women increasingly gain occupational mobility, they are not only exposed to the same physical hazards of work environment as men but also exposed to the pressures created by multiple role demands and conflicting expectations. (Malhotra and Sachadeva).

Some literature supports that women, who are in professional occupations, perceive their jobs as secondary to the family, which takes the primary role. That is, although these women had taken up jobs, and perceived them as providing financial resources, they failed to achieve a high sense of involvement and self-expression, though they were loyal and sincere in their work (Bhatt, Seema, Verma, Prashant, 2008).

They are pulled and pushed between social and organization role demands, and their own entrenchment in stereotypes of role taking. The conflict between the desired and the aspired daughter-in-law, wife and mother roles on the one hand and desired, aspired professional and career role on the other hand create conflicts, stress and guilt. Women get caught with the internalization of the normative prescriptive modalities of social and work systems. The role models of family, culture and history are insufficient and inadequate for meaningful responses. This paper explores those areas of role taking by women that can help redefine and redesign new responses in both the systems. It deals with the reinterpretation of existing roles and arriving at an integrated perspective for women, which can bring convergence within both the systems of family and work. This paper suggests that women who encounter in themselves the women-person dilemma and take charge of their own destiny in their hands to give it a shape, form and a meaning finally come to make choices for the wellbeing of both themselves and the system. In the absence of such an integration, women when confronted with the turmoil of the two systems either become conformists or rebels or exile themselves and end up making compromises rather than choices (Parikh and Garge, 1988.)

From the study it is revealing that women, those who have the Social Support from their family and friends are able to cope better with stress. Women have to perform the act of balance between two spheres, the family as well as professional roles. During this performance various role stresses generate among women. They tend to transfer 'Home tensions' at work and 'work tensions' at home. Kaila (2004) in his study on women managers in Mumbai reported that married women face more stress due to balancing two spheres of life, and they are managing it very successfully. In some professions women have to experience more role stress as a result of their need to adapt to the predominantly male work environment. Especially in professions with masculinised work environment. E.g. prison organizations historically have offered considerable resistance to the

integration of women and where today the majority of correctional officers and supervisory officials are males (Griffin, 2006).

Women who do not have professional women as role models and mentors during their professional training in their country of origin. This frequently leads to self-imposed as well as culturally imposed expectations to be a superwoman and do it entirely. While some international female psychiatrists have succeeded in cultural adaptation, managing time, and receiving professional satisfaction, others have compromised by not pursuing leadership positions and sacrificing promotions and financial opportunities. While some international female psychiatrists have succeeded in cultural adaptation, managing time, and receiving professional satisfaction, others have compromised by not pursuing leadership positions and sacrificing promotions and financial opportunities.

Key nonprofessional issues included self-care, time for relationships with a partner, children, family and friends, and time management to allow pursuit of nonmedical interests. These conflicting demands made by female professionals diminish their job satisfaction and lead to stress and imbalance in their lives. A supportive family, an understanding work environment, and changes in culturally based self-expectations of female professionals can lead to more fulfilling and well-balanced professional and family lives for women.

Social framework analyses is required to understand the role stress among women. This will help us to locate the stimulators for role stress among women and thereby facilitate corrective measure development to reduce the role stress among women. This will also have a positive impact on increasing the productivity of women at workplace and thereby help the organization in a larger way. This will also help in formulating more productive policies for the organizational growth. More inclusive policy formation is another objective that requires proper social framework analyses in the area of role stress among women at working place.



# **Professionalism Gendered!**

**Diana Thomas**

PhD Scholar in Public Health at School of Health Systems Studies, TISS, Mumbai

dianamaria.thomas2015@tiss.edu

## **Abstract**

We live in a century where women's participation in the global workforce is currently miniscule. While, nursing as a profession stands out in itself as a professional arena predominantly lead by women since decades. Though a women centric profession, nurses face innumerable challenges to sustain in this professional arena. Among the vast number of challenges like multiple shifts due to attrition in nursing profession, lower wages which leads to burn out resulting in lack of job satisfaction, prolonged duty hours leading to health issues, imbalanced personal life due to shift duties, lack of autonomy and respect as professionals are a few to name. Few significant issues pertaining to nursing profession are discussed in the paper. The paper is based on experiences and observations of the author as a practitioner in nursing discipline.

## **Task shifting**

Nursing, predominantly considered as a feminine profession is dominated by the masculine medical profession. Despite rigorous knowledge in core medical science subjects like anatomy, physiology, medicine, surgery, psychiatry, paediatrics and gynaecology. A nurse's job is merely reduced to performing procedures like catheter or intravenous cannula insertion irrespective of their expertise in techniques, which at times are better than doctors. Task shifting among nurses is commonly seen across hospitals. Nurses are utilized as assistances by doctors for example by surgeons to perform suturing after surgeries instead of the surgeons, explaining the surgical or medical procedure to the patient and their relatives, addressing the concerns of patients whom the doctors fail to communicate etc. which acts as an additional burden to nurses, who is already overburdened. Additionally, the burden of clerical work on nurses acts as a barrier to nurses in delivering quality nursing care. Thus across each professionals in a hospital the overall burden on nurses are substantially higher.

## **Nurse as a care giver and not professionals**

Nurses are considered as care givers rather than professionals, though nursing itself is acknowledged as a profession. The professionalism of nursing is constantly under question. A nurse is considered professional with respect to the care provided rather than knowledge or expertise in her technical skills. Care is highly subjective phenomenon, due to which its measurement varies across public and private sectors; since care is evaluated by patients rather than a specific

professional criteria. In many of the private hospitals increments of nurses are based on patient satisfaction survey conducted as part of their exit interviews. An efficient nurse is always equated to a good care giver.

### **Professionalism in nursing**

Nursing is recognised as a profession due to its unique body of knowledge called “Nursing Diagnosis”. This unique body of knowledge is undermined in clinical practice in India, both public as well as private sectors. This undermining of the body of knowledge leads to a larger notion of repressing nurses in clinical setting where the task of each practitioners are water tight. A doctor prescribes medical treatment, a dietician prescribes diet and a physiotherapist prescribes physiotherapy, while the task a nurse lack definition.

Therefore, here the author raises a few research questions. Why are nurses failed to be acknowledged as professionals in the labour work force? What are the major concerns overarching among the predominantly female led workforce in the health care work force and are these concerns due to the dominance of women in the profession? In current scenario of shortage of health care professionals especially doctors in rural area of India, why aren't nurses considered to be elevated to level as nurse practitioners instead of bridging the gap with doctors from disciplines from alternate medicine who are not trained in allopathic medicine?

Therefore, today in India, though nurses are considered as a heart of the hospital they are suppressed and overlooked as menial in the larger health care labour market.

## **Rise In Unpaid Domestic Work Drives The Decline In Labour Force Participation Of Women In India—A Field Study**

**Dr. Diya Dutta**

Manager-Research, Policy Research and Campaigns, Oxfam India

Diya@oxfamindia.org

Oxfam works to fight poverty and injustice in all its forms, through development projects, humanitarian responses, and campaigning. Central to Oxfam's approach is women's rights and gender equality, acknowledging that many of the challenges faced by women and communities are structural and rooted in complex systems of power, social norms and macroeconomic and environmental contexts that can entrench poverty and inequality. One of the most universal and persistent barriers for women and girls to achieve economic equality is the exclusion in economic policy making of unpaid work including unpaid care and domestic work. This type of work, often backbreaking and time consuming, is essential to the human economy, yet disproportionately undertaken by women and girls, especially those in poor and marginalised communities.

Two opposing trends have been witnessed in India since the beginning of the millennium. Since 2004-05, India's GDP scripted its highest growth ever, since the economic reforms began in 1991. At the same time female labour force participation declined sharply. In India, women comprise half of the population, but less than a quarter of women-22.5% (EUS data in NSSO) participate in the labour market. Between 2000 and 2005, 60 million jobs were created, but women lost out as 14.6 million of those jobs were attributable to a rise in rural female unpaid family workers in the agriculture sector.

Economic growth is gender blind and while it has, in the past, created some employment opportunities, these opportunities were superimposed on a social fabric that was gender unequal and indisposed towards women. Unpaid domestic work (care and non-care unpaid work) falls within this ambit of gender inequality leading to unequal opportunities for women in the labour market. The term 'unpaid care work' describes the direct care provided to children, the elderly, ill and disabled people at the household and community level; as well as domestic work such as cooking, cleaning, washing and fetching water or firewood that facilitates this direct care. It is unpaid because it emerges out of societal or contractual obligations, and it is work because engaging in it has associated costs in terms of time and efforts (Elson 2000). Care is integral to the health, wellbeing and survival of the society and economy. However, its benefits are often not recognized, and its responsibilities and associated costs continue to disproportionately fall on women, who spend two to 10 times more time on unpaid care work than men (Ferrant et al. 2014). This limits their time to spend on personal care, paid work, leisure, social and political activities (Karimli et al. 2016; Ferrant et al. 2014). This in turn has implications on women's time poverty, depletion in their

health and well-being and fundamentally undermine their human rights (Sepulveda Carmona 2013).

Through this paper, Oxfam conceptualises and asserts the establishment of a human economy which is sustainable, equitable and based on social justice as the ultimate goals accounting for both monetized and non-monetized forms of work. Rather than believing that economic growth alone will deliver progress, we argue that a holistic and inclusive economy benefits women and men equally without harming the planet; closes gaps between women and men's enjoyment of rights; challenges instead of reinforcing discriminatory social norms; and recognizes and values both paid and unpaid contributions to the economy.

Oxfam GB study in Uganda (Butt et al. 2017) shows that unpaid care work emerges as a tool for maintaining unequal power relations between men and women and keeping women ill-equipped to take on income generating labour market opportunities. Drawing on feminist economics literature, studies have shown that unpaid care and domestic work is a key area where fiscal policy has a significant impact on gender equality (Seguino 2013; Catagay, Elson and Grown 1999). The work is disproportionately carried out by women—requires long hours, which limits their opportunities to engage in income generating economic, political and social activities (Elson 2000). Differences in time-use at home between men and women, differences in education and skill level, social norms, access to productive inputs, compositely lead to inequalities in decent work participation particularly for women (Mehrotra and Sinha 2017). Studies have also shown that public spending and investments in key services have the potential to reduce and redistribute the time women spend on unpaid care work to public and private sector actors (Agénor et al. 2010).

Cagatay, Elson and Grown (1995) demonstrate that macroeconomic policies have distributional effects with implications on gender equality even when they are intended to be gender neutral. Current macroeconomic policies focusing exclusively on GDP growth and reduction in inflation, have in many cases, undermined the achievements and contributions of women's rights and in turn perpetuated economic and gender inequality (Butt et al. 2018). The need is to formulate macroeconomic policies that deliver much more than narrow economic growth. Policies need to be based on priorities and evidence from the entire labour force, thus making visible, unpaid care work and products and services arising from such work which are currently excluded from economic policy making. Further, to push the limits of such policies, these policies need to meet not only women's practical gender needs such as promoting female employment, access to resources etc. but also strive to meet strategic gender needs in terms of equality in power relations and decision-making and the fulfilment of human rights by challenging social norms and public investments in areas which specifically benefit women such as water infrastructure (Elson 1992).

Feminist economists argue, that when governments fail to recognise and therefore provide physical and social infrastructure in terms of health, childcare, education, transportation; unpaid care work steps in to subsidize the public sector. In an ideal world, it should have been the other way round.

Because the costs of care are borne by the provider (her inability to participate in income generating labour market activities, inability to take care of her health, etc.) rather than the wider economy, which nonetheless benefits from this service, the market economy profits from the subsidies that unpaid care and domestic work provides (Antonopoulous 2009).

This chapter is based on a theoretical argument put forward by Santosh Mehrotra and Sharmistha Sinha (EPW 2017) recently explaining why female labour force participation is going down. One argument put forward is that the rise in domestic work burden is forcing women out of the labour market. In rural India, share of domestic duties increased from 51.8% to 59.7% between 2005 and 2012. This covers the whole gamut of care work, household duties, unpaid economic activities for household consumption and non-System of National Accounts (SNA) economic work. In this chapter we make this the basis of our hypothesis which we propose to test out in the field with primary data.

We hypothesise that recent years have witnessed a rise in domestic work duties (both unpaid work and unpaid care work) for women for a number of reasons: (a) the success of RTE leading to higher girls enrolment in schools, thus removing the traditional resource pool of older (mostly) female siblings minding the younger siblings; (b) nuclearisation of families leading to fewer women in the family to take care of domestic duties; (c) India's highest gender chore gap in the world putting disproportionate pressure on women to perform domestic duties; (d) restrictive social norms putting undue pressure on women to perform unpaid domestic duties; and (e) difficulty in accessing fuelwood and drinking water leading to more time spent in collecting the same by women.

The proposed field study will be a minimum 200 household and a maximum 600 household (divided between rural and urban) simple field study applying Oxfam GB's Household Care Survey tool to map the following:

- Reasons for dropping out of paid work by those female respondents who engaged in the same before.
- Women's rough allocation of time to different domestic duties in a day
- A comparative estimate of domestic duty burden having gone up over (say) a 5 year period
- Reasons for increased burden of domestic chores
- Role of social norms in putting undue pressure on women to perform domestic duties and simultaneously restricting women from participating in the labour market
- Assessment of whether, given the opportunity, these women would want to participate in the labour market
- If yes, what kind of occupation would they like to be involved in
- Do they feel they need certain kinds of start up and skilling support for this

- The impact of government schemes such as Ujjwala and National Rural Drinking Water Programme (NRDWP) on women's domestic duties burden

The paper will be divided into 3 sections. The first section, will try to corroborate or refute the government argument put forward by Mehrotra and Sinha (both from NITI Aayog). This will be a one of a kind study. Second, through primary qualitative data, the chapter will try and assess the role of social norms in maintaining unequal power relations between men and women and its effect on women's unpaid work/inability to participate in the labour market.

Third, studies in India have also demonstrated that collection of fuelwood and drinking water are the most time consuming unpaid domestic chores for women. As per NSSO (69th Round, 2012) only 46.1 percent households in rural India got drinking water within the premises of their house. When drinking water had to be fetched from a distance, female members did this work in 84.1 percent of rural households and male members only 14.1 percent (rural India). In urban India, women performed this task in 72 percent of the households and male members a mere 23.5 percent. Thus, on an average, in rural India, women spend 35 minutes in arranging drinking water for the household while their urban counterparts spend 31 minutes.

Similarly, in collection of fuelwood, women spend approximately 374 hours every year collecting firewood in India. Women with improved cook stoves save 70 hours per year, which means 1 hour 10 minutes every day when using a clean cook stove. The study (Gender and Livelihoods Impacts of Clean Cook Stoves in South Asia) found that households with clean cook stoves reported sending their children to school more often.

Through this field-based study, we will assess how fiscal policies—public spending through the government sponsored Ujjwala Scheme and NRDWP (National Rural Drinking Water Programme) could help achieve gender equality and improve women's labour force participation in India. It will make the following policy recommendations:

- If there is a strong correlation between the success of girls education and increase in domestic work duties of adult women, then the paper will argue that this is a temporary drop in FLFP until the young school educated girls enter the workforce. However, the question still remains as to who will take on the burden of domestic duties and we will explore the larger question of gender inequalities and social norms to address this question.
- This brings one to the broader argument that the twin issues of FLFP and domestic duties requires multi-pronged policy and programmatic interventions such as promotion of self employment of women through appropriate skilling and finance, the promotion and construction of crèches close to work site enabling women to work, promotion of positive gender norms whereby men take on greater responsibility of domestic duties and ease some of the burden from women, wage equality, etc.
- Other recommendations based on findings from the field study.

## References

- Agénor, P.R., O. Canuto and L.P. da Silva. (2010). On Gender and Growth: The Role of Intergenerational Health Externalities and Women's Occupational Constraints. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 5492.
- Antonopoulous, R. (2009). The Unpaid Care Work-Paid Care Work Connection. International Labour Office, Policy Integration and Statistics Department. Working Paper No. 86. Geneva: ILO.
- Butt, Anam Parvez, Jane Remme, Lucia Rost and Sandrine A. Koissy-Kpein. (2018). Exploring the Need for Gender-Equitable Fiscal Policies For a Human Economy. Oxford: Oxfam.
- Butt, Anam Parvez, Martin Walsh and Barbara Gärber. (2017). Transforming Care After Conflict: How Gendered Care Relations Are Being Redefined in Northern Uganda. Oxford: Oxfam.
- Catagay, N., D. Elson and C. Grown. (1995). 'Introduction to Gender, Adjustment and Macroeconomics', World Development, 23(11): 1827-36.
- Elson, D. (2000). Progress of the World's Women. UNIFEM Biennial Report. New York: United Nations Development Fund for Women.
- Elson, D. (1992). 'For Survival Strategies to Transformation Strategies: Women's Needs and Structural Adjustment', in L. Baneria and S. Feldman (eds), Economic Crises, Persistent Poverty, and Women's Work. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Ferrant, G., M. Pesando and K. Nowacka. (2014). Unpaid Care Work: The Missing Link in the Analysis of Gender Gaps in Labour Outcomes. Issues Paper. OECD Development Centre.
- Karimli, L., E. Samman, L. Rost and T. Kidder. (2016). Factors and Norms Influencing Unpaid Care Work: Household Survey Evidence from Five Rural Communities in Colombia, Ethiopia, The Phillippines, Uganda and Zimbabwe. Oxford: Oxfam.
- Mehrotra, S. and S. Sinha. (2017). 'Explaining Falling Female Employment during a High Growth Period', Economic and Political Weekly, L11(39), September 30, 2017:54-62.
- MOSPI. (2014). Employment and Unemployment Situation in India. NSS 68th Round. 2011-12. New Delhi: Government of India.
- Seguino, S. (2013). 'From Micro-level Gender Relations to the Macro-economy and Back Again', in D.M. Figart and T.L. Warnecke (eds), Handbook of Research on Gender and Economic Life. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.
- Sepulveda Carmona, M. (2013). Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extreme Poverty and Human Rights: Unpaid Care Work and Women's Human Rights.

## **Women in Corporate: as Workers, Staff and Management Cadre**

**Gaurangi Kaushik**

Human Resource Administrator, Willis Towers Watson, Gurgaon

gaurangikaushik48@gmail.com

### **Background**

Every 10% increase in the female labor force participation rate in a metropolitan area is associated with a 5% increase in median real wages — for both men and women. As per UN Women Report statistics, when more women work, economies grow. An increase in female labour force participation—or a reduction in the gap between women's and men's labour force participation—results in faster economic growth. Despite such a raging need for women empowerment in the workplace, women continue to participate in labour markets on an unequal basis with men. In 2013, the male employment-to-population ratio stood at 72.2 per cent, while the ratio for females was 47.1 per cent. This disparity in workforce coupled with other gender based biases limits the participation of women globally. The participation gets more dismal as we move up the corporate hierarchy from ground level associates to mid, senior and CEO levels.

The gender divide at workplace is further accentuated in developing countries. There is a marked decrease in the proportion of Indian women in senior positions in the workplace. According to the findings of a new study by Grant Thornton, titled International Business Report, the position of women in senior positions in the Indian work force fell from 19% in 2013 to 14% in 2014. According to study by McKinsey&Co, female representation on executive boards of Indian Companies currently stands at meagre 5%. Only 5% of working women in India make it to senior leadership positions in the corporate sector/ compared to the global average of 20%. A study revealed that in India, women's strength in the labour force stands at 28% in the junior level, 14.9% at the middle & 9.32% at the senior level. India also ranks at the top in the dropout rate as well.

A website has mentioned according to the list based on the Fortune 1000 list of companies published by Fortune magazine that women currently hold 6.4 percent of Fortune 500 CEOs. After dropping to 21 last year, the number of women CEOs on the Fortune 500 has increased from 21 to 32 in 2017. There are two ways to look at that news. On one hand, the increase means that women are progressing up the American corporate ladder. On the other, 32 is still very, very low—just 6.4% of the list—and in no way representative of the wider population. Geisha Williams and Indra Nooyi are the only two women of color on the list. There are no black women among the current Fortune 500 CEOs.

This significant jump in Fortune 500 list comes at a time when more attention is being paid by investors to the value of diversity in the boardroom. Investors are pushing shareholder proposals that urge companies to add diversity among their top ranks, and financial companies are adding



products that let investors bet on companies with more women at the top, as research demonstrates a link between diversity and better performance. The report —Women on Boards, by Biz Divas, a national network of professional women, and law firm Khaitan and Co, said that men hold 8,640 boardroom positions and women 350 in the country's 1,470 listed firms. India has two major companies in the fortune 500, Reliance Industries and Indian Oil, but only one of their total of 30 directors is a woman. The scarcity of women in the boardroom is not unique to India-nearly one fifth of the world's 200 largest companies have no women directors. Recent EY research, conducted in partnership with the Peterson Institute for International Economics, highlights that companies in only five countries around the world have at least 30% of women in corporate leadership. What is even more alarming is that despite the increasing impetus to improve female participation in the work force and address the lack of women at the top, half of all Indian business have no program to support or mentor women nor do they plan one in the near future.

### **Objectives and Research Methodologies:**

As an Indian corporate woman, I am one of a very small minority that contributes to the Indian workforce in the corporate sector today. Hence, through my paper I aim to uncover the current maladies that plague the working scenario of women workforce globally, with a particular focus on the developing countries like India. Furthermore, I would press upon the burning issues one

by one, in detail, like the Glass Ceiling Effect (invisible barrier which prevents women from reaching the top of the corporate hierarchy), Unequal Pay as compared to their male counterparts, Sticky Floor Effect (discriminatory employment pattern that keeps a certain group of people at the bottom of the job scale) ,Sexual Harassment at Workplace and Poor Security along with some challenges prominently faced by the corporate women in developing countries like lack of proper family support and consequently limited career growth, discrimination on the basis of pregnancy, career vs child dilemma, limited career opportunities and flexibility with reference to their domain of work, and some less admitted global challenges like the Attitude Bias, Limited Information Access and as admitted by a pool of U.S. corporate women workforce in a study- simply Being A Woman.

I would also touch base upon the unforeseen consequences in the long run proposed by the raging gender disparity at work, which is in turn detrimental to the organization. Some of them are listed below:

- Increased absenteeism and dropout rates of women
- Reduced efficiency of the overall workforce
- Lack of diversity in approaches and hence limited vision
- Additional costs of recruitment & training by the organization owing to the resignation by the female employees

- Damage to the organization's image in the market
- Lawsuits and high legal costs involving court fees, settlements, etc

I, owing to my experience as a part of the Indian corporate women workforce, who has been in both in the Information and Telecommunication sector as an engineer and now the Human Resources as an HR administrator, would use a few case studies, real life scenarios and a few personal experiences to further research on and discuss the challenges and consequences proposed in my paper.

With the aforesaid challenges and consequences, a sharp need arises to change status quo. Too many people are still not seeing that gender diversity matters now more than ever. Others believe we have long reached gender parity and they just ignore the data. This paper suggests and highlights some of the remedial measures we can ensure in organisations to promote a diverse and healthy environment at workplace, catering to the needs of women in general in addition to men. Let's start by asking ourselves and our management teams a number of pertinent questions, such as:

- Are we really doing all we can to support diversity or do we still have blind spots?
- Do our corporate policies support everyone's professional ambitions or are there any barriers that prevent true implementation?
- How can we make our workplace culture more inclusive and flexible – not just in theory but in practice?
- Do we have succession planning that puts diversity at the centre?
- Do our career coaching programmes fit the needs of women or are they one-size-fits-all?
- What more do we need to do to actively tackle conscious and unconscious bias?

By asking these questions and seeking honest answers, corporates are already part of the way towards taking action.

Business leadership teams should keep in mind that what they say and do to help women progress will set the tone for the rest of the organization. The same applies to mid-level managers. They need to actively foster a supportive culture that creates psychological safety, values diversity, calls out conscious and unconscious bias and supports the advancement of women. And for the ones just starting out – every voice matters. They need to use it to advocate for more gender-balanced teams and leadership and not just accept non-inclusive cultures tacitly. They need to seek decisive action from those in leadership.

Globally, with the campaigns such as HE FOR SHE and #MeToo gaining worldwide momentum and serving as an impetus to promote gender equality and lend voices against the exploitation and abuse of women in various forms, the people across the globe have started getting sensitized to this grave issue and the call for women empowerment in all sectors of economy, whether paid or unpaid is more than ever, women in corporate not being an exception to it.

UN Women, the UN organization dedicated to gender equality and the empowerment of women is leaving no stone unturned to achieve its objective.

Another very important need is to make women aware of their own rights while working in the corporate sector. We have numerous constitutional safeguards for women in corporate that can be exercised in case of any gender discrimination being subjected at the workplace. This paper would discuss in detail the below safeguards that Indian corporate women need to be aware of and can fall back on:

- Maternity Benefit Act, 1961 - An Act to regulate the employment of women in certain establishments for certain periods before and after child-birth and to provide for maternity benefit and certain other benefits. The Maternity (Amendment) Bill 2017, an amendment to the Maternity Benefit Act, 1961, was passed in Lok Sabha on March 09, 2017 , in Rajya Sabha on August 11, 2016 and received an assent from President of India on March 27,2017. Under the new Law, maternity leave is raised from current 12 weeks to 26 weeks. The prenatal leave is also extended from six to eight weeks.
- Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013- A legislative act in India that seeks to protect women from sexual harassment at their place of work.
- Equal Remuneration Act, 1976: The Act aims at providing equal remuneration to men and women workers and prevention of discrimination, particularly against women on the ground of gender.

The Constitution of India has several provisions which grant certain fundamental rights to its citizens, which includes right to equality.

Article 14 guarantees Equality before Law.

Article 15 prohibits state from discrimination on the grounds of religion, race, caste, sex and place of birth.

Article 39 in part IV of the constitution urges state to ensure that citizens ,men and women equally have the right to an adequate means of livelihood, right to shelter ,food, education and work.

In addition to spreading awareness about corporate women rights, we need to take the pivotal step and appoint more women to leadership roles. Just as technological advances have generated new forms of prosperity, it is proven that diverse workforces contribute significantly to performance. There are many women who are ready and able but their talents are not always recognized. Talent and capability come in many forms and do not always look, sound and feel the same. This is a good thing, so we should encourage everyone to take action.

## **Conclusion**

Policies and legal mechanisms alone cannot help in curbing the problems faced by women at work place - the overall attitude and acceptance level of the people needs to change. Just letting women work outside home does not mean that society treats men and women equally. The issues and problems that women face in their workplaces should be put to an end and then only it can be said that men and women have equal status. Although there are various laws that are made for protection of women in workplace but due to lack of proper implementation and interpretation of law, it has not been quite effective in protecting women from the crimes and inequality in the workplace. Organizations are going out of their way to ensure they provide safe work environment for their women employees, and are also putting up policies to ensure the women feel motivated to work and continue their career, even after child birth. We have corporates with the likes of Mary Barra, Indra Nooyi, Ginni Rometty, Marillyn Hewson, Sheryl Sandberg as their top business leads taking the organisations to new heights everyday.

Still the road to achieving whole hearted corporate gender equality is a long one and needs to be tread by both men and women alike for the common progress of all.

When we look at gender inequality as a whole, it seems like a vast, insurmountable challenge. But when we break it down there are real, tangible actions we can take to make the workplace better for women, and in doing so, increase prosperity for all.

# **Intersectionality and Unpaid Rural Female Labour: A Study from Unit level NSSO Employment Unemployment Data**

**Prof. Ishita Mukhopadhyaya &**

**Dr. Sanghamitra Bhaduri Kanjilal**

University of Calcutta, Institute of Development Studies, Kolkata

mukhopadhyayishita@gmail.com

## **Introduction**

Intersectionality between socioreligious and socioeconomic categories have deep impact on the extent, exploitation and coverage of unpaid female labour in India. While there is a concern about the falling female labour participation in India, the determinants of unpaid female labour gives us a distinctly different picture. The aim of this paper is to empirically analyse the composition of paid and unpaid work done by women in rural India, using nationally representative Employment Unemployment Survey (EUS) data from NSSO. The paper then unwinds the social hierarchies (intersections) woven around gender. Qualitative as well as quantitative aspects of female participation have been taken up and the relationships being created in the process of female employment have been analysed thus emphasizing on the centrality of gender relations to development as a process.

Within any given context, women and girls experience diverse challenges and advantages and therefore have different barriers and opportunities in terms of exercising choice and voice in the context of shifting power relations. Using an intersectional lens that considers gender and the multiple layers of identity and status is crucial to understanding a woman or girl's relative position in the labour market. It can enable a more holistic understanding of how gender intersects with age, ethnicity, class, caste, and other social markers, recognising that the most marginalised may face very different barriers to participation than relatively more privileged women and girls. Both paid and unpaid work contribute to the realization of human potential. In these two domains of work, men's and women's roles are generally very different<sup>1</sup>. Unpaid work is shaped by gender relations as they intersect with class, race, ethnicity and sexuality. It refers to the production of goods or services that are consumed by those within or outside a household, but not for sale in the market (OECD 2011).

## **Motivation**

The motivation for such a study was felt due to the following reasons:

- Puzzling behavior of female employment with its contradictory trends and patterns in the post liberalization era (Chowdhury, 2011; Sen et al. 2012; Neetha, 2013)

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/chapter4.pdf>

- Unexpected jump in female work participation in the 61st EUS Round of NSSO, 2004-05 (Srivastava and Srivastava, 2010)
- Declining rate of participation among female workers, in the 68th EUS Round of NSSO, 2011-12 (ILO, 2011, 2014; Rangarajan et al. 2014)
- Large gender gaps in participation among socio-religious groups (World Bank, 2014)
- The issue of unpaid work being sparingly explored by researchers in Indian context (Mukherjee & Majumder, 2015)
- A major gap in the existing literature being the limited attention paid to the intersectionality in the representation of class (as proxied by Landownership) and of Caste (Sen & Sen, 1985; Duvvury, 1989; Deshpande, 2007)

An activity is considered “work” (vs. “leisure”) if a third person could be paid to do that activity (OECD 2011). The total time spent on work by women tends to exceed that by men. Although women work more hours than men, their relatively limited participation in the labour force symbolises an imbalance. It points towards the fact that women perform the bulk of unpaid work in households. This work is often socially, politically, and economically devalued because “work” is often defined in conventional statistics as paid activities linked to the market (Beneria 1999). Despite the efforts of several generations of feminist scholars to make unpaid work visible, it remains marginalized in most methods of measuring economic activity<sup>2</sup>.

In this study, an attempt has been made to present a disaggregated picture of the unpaid work done by women belonging to different land ownership classes and socio-religious groups. . Results show that the double burden of socio-economic and socio-religious disadvantage is the same for women throughout rural India. A better economic position does not imply an enhanced participation in paid work, rather, it relegates them further into unpaid work which is non-remunerative.

## **Data and Methods**

The data used for analysis in this paper were collected as part of the all India quinquennial survey on Employment-Unemployment by National Sample Survey Office (NSSO). The NSSO carries out all India household survey programme about Employment and Unemployment every five years, called the quinquennial rounds of Employment and Unemployment Survey (EUS). NSSO employs three different methods of determining the activity status of the persons. The first method identifies the Usual Principal Activity Status (called ‘Usual Principal Status’, UPS) of a person by using a reference period of 365 days preceding the date of survey. The present study makes use of Usual Principal Status (UPS)<sup>3</sup> data.

---

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.genderwork.ca/gwd/modules/unpaid-work/>

<sup>3</sup> The NSSO has, over time, developed and standardised measures of employment and unemployment. Four different estimates of the Labour Force and Work Force are obtained based on the 3 approaches adopted in the survey for

Multinomial logistic regression methods have been used to enumerate the composition of the work done and to assess the relation of the social constructs with the employment process emerging thereof.

## Results

Interaction of the socio-religious and socio-economic variables has enabled this study to make certain conclusions about the behaviour of female employment. It has provided an insight into the employment aspects of women workers belonging to various land ownership classes of the different socio-religious groups. Results show that for the year 2004-05 there is a higher probability of participation in all the three categories of unpaid work. The highest probability of participation is in UPA21 which records the woman as being in the labour force but it is work for which she does not receive any remuneration. This may be one of the reasons why the 61st round depicted such high levels of female employment. Also, as this kind of work is included in labour force participation yet it is unpaid in nature so it focuses on the inequality and drudgery faced by women. There is a double burden of unpaid work for women workers. On the one hand, they are more into non-remunerative, monotonous kind of work and on the other hand they are not getting paid for the work inspite of being in the work force. This is an indication of distress driven work and a very disturbing situation for women workers. It also implies that land does not release female labour, rather it ties down female labour in the form of unpaid work done on own farms. Marginalisation of female labour is evident from this result. In 2011-12, the picture is quite the same. Studies have mentioned that the female employment levels had shown a perceptible increase in the 2004-05, from the trend of previous years (1993-94 to 1999-2000). There was again a downfall of the levels in 2009-10 and 2011-12. Although 2011-12 showed some improvement in the employment levels yet it could not match the fantastic heights achieved in 2004-05 (Rangarajan et al. 2014). However, results in this paper depict very clearly that in both years (2004-5, 2011-12), no matter what the quantitative levels of employment were for females, they seemed to be trapped in the vicious circle of invisible and non-remunerative work.

The pressure of extended domestic work is very high in rural areas. In 2011-12, nearly 13 per cent of rural women were engaged in extra domestic work. Extended domestic work (Upa93) accounts for the highest percentage of women workers doing unpaid work, belonging to landless, marginal and small land-ownership classes. When a household owns land above two hectares then the share of women workers performing unpaid work in family farms is highest. Percentage increase of the share of women workers doing unpaid family work is also greatest among all the land ownership classes. This states that women who belong to the upper echelons in socio-economic ladder do not

---

classification of the population by activity status viz: Usual Status, Current Weekly Status And Current Daily Status. These Are:

- (i) Number of persons in the labour/work force according to the 'Usual Status' (ps) i.e by considering usual principal activity only.
- (ii) Number of persons in the labour/work force according to the 'Usual Status' (ps+ss) i.e. by considering usual principal and subsidiary activity together.
- (iii) Number of persons in the labour/work force according to the 'Current Weekly Status' approach &
- (iv) Number of persons in the labour/work force according to the 'Current Daily Status' approach

necessarily withdraw into domestic work and out of the labour force. They may be in labour force, yet performing work for which they do not get any remuneration. This may be the *causa causarum* of over estimation of female labour force participation and the continued incidence of working poor among women. This fact is brought out clearly by the share of women workers in Upa21, Upa92 and Upa93 among the total unpaid work. Increase in the share of women doing unpaid family work is consistent as land ownership of the household increases beyond 0.40 hectares. Representation of women workers in domestic work and extended domestic work show a declining trend for households owning more than 0.40 hectares of land in rural areas. This brings to light a positive correlation between domestic work and poverty. There is an increase in the participation of unpaid work by women workers, but that work is within the traditionally defined labour force.

## **Conclusion**

It is established that the relationship between evolving socio-economic and demographic factors and how women participate in the world of work is multifaceted. The inter relationship of factors determining female participation is the most important aspect in ascertaining the gender relations evolving around their employment. At the micro level the disaggregation shows a very different scenario than the macro level (thus the variance in results of this study with the published facts, especially about 61st round, 2004-05). The results presented in this paper thus prove that the quantitative measure of female participation is not enough and it is essential to move beyond the dual aspect of the determinants of and the level of female labour force participation rate. What is essential is to look at the qualitative aspects of female labour force participation rate and the relations emerging thereof, which brings to light that relegation of women to unpaid work is a major issue. The story of exploitation of unpaid labour can be understood in the light of intersectionality as social labour conceptualization of the unpaid labour reveals the extent of marginalization in the stratified and layered society.



## **Married Women in Urban Workforce in India: Insights from NSSO DATA**

**Jyoti Thakur**

ICSSR Institutional Doctoral Fellow, Institute for Social and economic Change, Bengaluru  
jyotithakur@isec.ac.in

Women's participation in work is an indicator of their status in a society. Paid work offers more opportunities for women's agency, mobility and empowerment, and it usually leads to greater social recognition of the work that women do, whether paid or unpaid. However, in India despite of high economic growth, high female education levels and declining fertility rates, conditions which has translated into more female entering into work force in many countries<sup>1</sup>, the proportion of female participating in labour market is declining every year. The labour force participation rate for women of working age has declined from 42 percent in 1993-94 to 27percent in 2011-12 (NSS, 2014). Gap between the rate of labour force participation among male and female is high (UNDP, 2016) due to which on gender inequality index (GII)<sup>2</sup> India ranks 125 out of 148 counties. This unprecedented and puzzling drop in women's participation in the workforce, especially at a time when India's economy has grown at a steady pace, has caught the imagination of various scholars. Various studies have pointed towards that reasons behind this decline can be marriage, motherhood, vexed gender relations and biases, and patriarchy, enrollment into education, increased family income etc.

In Indian society, the institution of marriage and household dominate the life of women. After marriage the primary role of a woman is to be subservient to the need of the family members. Traditionally, it was not considered appropriate for middle and upper income married women to take up a job and inferior status was accorded to working women as generally they belonged to lower castes and worked in less prestigious occupations (Rao & Rao,1982). The same is reflected in the trends observed by various recent studies for example the labour force participation is highest among ST women followed by SC, OBS and general caste women (Andres et al 2007). In recent times, demographic group of married women has become highly conspicuous among working age (15-64 age) female population in India. Census reveals that 80 percent of female in this working group bracket are married. However, the Labour force participation among married women has decreased from 49.2 percent 1993-94 to 38.4 percent in 2011-12 rural areas and from 22.8 percent in 1993-94 to 20 percent in 2011-12 urban areas (Andres et al., 2017).

This paper is an attempt to analyze the extent and trends related to married women's participation in urban labour market. Traditional explanation for low Female Labour force U-Shape curve for female labour force participation GII is a composite measure reflecting inequality in achievement between women and men in three dimensions: reproductive health, empowerment and the labour market participation (FLFP) and the segmented patterns of female employment was focused on discrimination and low human capital accumulation among female. However recently this

individualistic context has changed to household context in which the female's decision to participate in paid work is a product of microsocial factors such as human capital, social norms and preferences, and household structure (Choida, 2011). This study approaches the perplexing question of workforce participation of married women from a household perspective and attempt to understand how household level characteristics drives the workforce participation of married women in Urban India.

## **Literature Review**

Conventionally, work/labour is defined as any activity undertaken in lieu of remuneration. The value of work is determined by the level of remuneration. Therefore, any work undertaken without remuneration is considered non-valuable and non-work. Likewise, any work done outside such as office, factory, and fields are considered more valuable than work done at home. The conclusion thus become that men working outside get remuneration, so their work is valuable; women work at home, get no remuneration and thus, their work is considered non-work having no or little value. Even when a woman enters the realm of paid work, the labour market is highly segregated along the gender lines, with differences between regions and cultures and differentiated pay scale between men and women.

Female work force participation is one of the drivers of growth and therefore, participation rates indicate the potential for a country to grow more rapidly. However, the relationship between women's engagement in the labour market and broader development outcomes is complex. Nam (1991) observed that the demand for female labour will increase in third world countries with the increase in economic development as well as in international trade. However, other studies show that in developed countries a positive relation between female labour force participation and economic development is observed but in the case of developing countries this relationship is not universal in nature (Chinchilla, 1977).

Globally, women's participation in the labour force has remained relatively stable in the two decades from 1990 to 2010, at approximately 52 per cent (ILO, 2014). At a more disaggregated level, participation of women varies considerably across developing countries and emerging economies, far more than in the case of men. In the Middle East, North Africa and South Asia, less than one-third of women of working age participate in the labour market, while the proportion reaches around two-thirds in East Asia and sub-Saharan Africa. Nonetheless, the gender gaps in labour force participation persist at all ages except the early adult years in South Asia (UN, 2016).

The participation of women in labour market has increased in Middle East and North Africa but has decreased in south Asia due to conservative attitude towards women work (Veric, 2014). Women in South Asia are far less likely to have a job or to be looking for one. The rate of female labour force participation in South Asia was just 31.8percent 2012, while the rate for males was 81.4 percent (Chaudhary & Veric, 2014).

Studies on India show a gloomy picture of women's participating in labour market. In comparison to countries such as South Korea, Indonesia, Philippines, Thailand female work participation in India is characterized by relatively low and stagnant rates (Mincer, 1962). Unlike developed countries where women's work force participation tends to increase with economic development, the relationship is not straightforward or consistent for developing countries. There is considerably more variation across developing countries in work force participation by women than by men. This variation is driven by a wide variety of economic and social factors, which include economic growth, education, and social norms. The socio-economic factors which can affect the participation of women in labour force are Level of economic development, Educational attainment, Social dimensions, such as social norms influencing marriage, fertility, and women's role outside the household, Access to credit and other inputs, Household and spouse characteristics, Institutional setting (laws, protection, benefits) (Verick, 2014).

In India the extent of women's participation in labour market is abysmally low at 27 percent, lowest among BRICS countries and among G-20 countries and better than Saudi Arabia only. FLFP rate has been declining for the last two decades (Mehrotra & Parida, 2017) and this decline is concentrated among 25-65-year-old married women (Afridi et al., 2016). The employment trends for women in India show that 25 percent rural and 15 percent urban female was part of workforce in 2011-12. The rate for unemployment was 2 percent for rural and 5 percent for urban female. Almost 94 percent of total women workers are engaged in informal sector, of which about 20 percent work in the urban centers. Majority of women workers in informal sector come from those sections of the society which need income at any cost (Geetika et al., 2011).

Cameron et al. (2011) observe that female labour force participation rates respond differently to education across different countries due to two prime reasons: a wage effect and a bargaining power effect. Higher wages encourage women to join the workforce because the opportunity cost of time at home rises. However, due to increase level of education women's relative bargaining power will also increase, and women prefer to not work, thus in this case increasing levels of female education could lead to a fall in women's labour force participation. Behrman et al. (1999) observed that return of education for female may rise in the labour market but they may not rise fast enough to counteract the rise in the returns to education in the marriage market and home production. Klasen & Pieters (2013) found that in Indian context, rise in female education actually resulted in decline of their labour participation. Due to high education achievements there is a rise in preferences for white-collar jobs as women complete more education. Despite high growth rates, however, the economy has not produced enough employment of this kind to keep up with the growth of high-skilled labour supply. The share of white-collar services in urban employment fell from 19 per cent in 1987 to 17 per cent in 2009, while the proportion of graduates in the working age population increased from 11 to 21 per cent. This has resulted in a strong crowding-out effects of the increased high-skilled labour supply on female labour force participation. Discrimination in wages is also discouraging women to take up jobs because still there is a huge gap between the earning/wages of male and female. Gender discrimination is still rampant in

Indian labour market; according to NSS (2014), in urban India daily wage for male was Rs. 467.87 while for female it was just Rs. 366.16.

Education should lead to jobs, but that's not happening in India. According to UNDP (2015) report, in rural India, 67 percent of girls who are graduates do not work and in towns and cities, 68.3 percent of women who graduate don't have paid jobs. Every year more and more women are opting out of about market. As Female labour force is a strong indicator of economic empowerment of women, this precarious drop will lead to disempowerment of women in long a run.

Age is one among many reasons for drop in FLFP in India. Andres (2017) study highlighted that from 2004-05 to 2011-12 approximately 53 percent of fall occurred among 15 to 24 years old, 32 percent among 25-34 years old and 15.6 percent among 35 and above. The participation of women is sensitive to the income of the household, increase in the household income has a negative effect on the participation of women.

Klasen and Pieters (2013) studied the decline in female labour force participation in urban India between 1987 and 2009 and found that demand and supply factors were at play. On the labour supply side, the main drivers were increasing household incomes, husband's education, and the stigma against educated women seeking menial work. On the labour demand side, they found that employment in sectors appropriate for educated women grew less than the supply of educated workers, leading to many women withdrawing from the labour force. As 80 percent of female in productive age group are married, similar pattern and trends can follow for married women.

The socio-cultural milieu of the Indian society exerts influences on women workforce participation. In India, societal norms, cultural trends, traditions and customs influence women's economic participation. Patriarchy has specified certain roles for women and men. And they have to act accordingly. Men are the bread earners in a family, while women's responsibility is only to do household works and serve the family (Kapur, 1970). NSS (2014) has also noted that 60 percent of rural and 64 percent of urban female in India reported that they were engaged in household work because no other member was there to carry out the domestic duties.

Women are not the principal decision makers in a family, their choices, their decisions are influenced by household status, the needs and requirements of the family members. As in most middle-class families in India, women are not allowed to work outside the home, especially after marriage (Oliva & Banerjee, 2011). The structure of household also influences the autonomy of women. A comparison of women in nuclear households with those still living in joint families revealed that the former enjoys greater decision-making power, greater freedom of movement outside the house premises and greater participation in jobs. Women in joint households not only had less decision-making power but they also needed the permission of other family members more often to execute even routine household activities (Debnath 2015). Indian women face tremendous struggle while trying to balance work and family life, regardless of profession. While extended families used to provide significant support for working women in the past, recent trends

in urbanization and family nuclearization are leaving women even more burdened with juggling care and work responsibilities (Tuli and Chaudhary 2010).

Another significant yet less researched aspect which influence married women's decision to participate in labour force is the imbalance in the spousal characteristics such as age gap, education gap etc. The age difference pattern between spouses somewhat reflects the socio-economic condition a society, because it is closely related to population and social structures. Traditionally the higher age difference between husband and wife was one of the way by which society maintained the control of husband over wife as the advantage of age could be add to the superiority sex (Ramachandran et al., 2002). In most Western countries, age differences are minimal, ranging from 2 to 4 years while in most developing countries, this difference is about 10 years and sometimes even more (IUSSP, 2013) The average age differences between spouses may influence the position of women in a society, while at the same time the position of women may be a factor which affects norms about appropriate age differences (Casterline et al, 1986). Bhalla and Kaur (2013) found that the education level of the husband has a larger negative effect (each extra year of male education means a drop in female participation of one percentage point) than the positive effect of increasing female education on participation.

Brozon (1991) observed that in India, social restrictions on the lifestyles of women tend to become more rigid as households move up in the caste hierarchy. If education of women and restrictions on women's mobility and work both increase with families' social status, one would observe a negative correlation between education and labour force participation.

Household and women's unpaid work also plays a very significant role in deciding whether women will enter the labour market or not. Women's normative responsibilities of care and domestic work impose a restriction on their mobility and employment (Mehrotra & Parida, 2015). Studies has shown that in various India states women express that it is difficult to take up wage work mostly due to family responsibilities and certain social norms in some communities (ILO 2014). In India the proportion of women involved in unpaid domestic & care work is higher in urban areas and among better educated class. This fact is corroborated by the NSS finding that 65 percent in urban and 62 percent (53percent -2004-2005) in rural areas reported to be engaged in domestic work (NSS, 2014). Study done by Craig (2007) found that Women are more likely than men to multitask in their domestic sphere because men have not increased enough of their participation in household sphere following women's entry into paid work. Leaving it to the women to manage both the sphere, work & family, single handedly. Due to which most of the married working women are 'time-poor'.

## **Objectives**

To study the levels and tends of work force participation of married women in Urban India

To Study the structure of workforce participation of married women

To study the extent to which household conditioning influence the labour force participation of married women

## **Methodology**

In order to understand the nuances related to workforce participation of married women in urban India this paper will use quantitative research methodology This empirical study will use primary as well as secondary data such as secondary literature, books, NSSO data etc. From NSS unit level data levels, trends of work force participation of married women will be extracted and examined. The household level determinants such as household income, household size, type of household (nuclear/joint, social & religious group), presence of children, presence of potential caregiver, etc., which influence the decision of married women will be analyze.

## **References**

- Afridi, F., Dinkelman, T., Mahajan, K. (2016). Why Are Fewer Married Women Joining the Work Force in India? A Decomposition Analysis over Two Decades. (IZA Discussion Paper No. 9722). Germany: IZA
- Andres, Luis et al. (2017). Precarious drop: Reassessing Patterns of Female Labour Force Participation in India. (Policy Research Working Paper no. WPS8024). Washington, D.C.: World Bank Group, South Asia Region, Social Development Unit
- Behrman, J.R. et al. (1999). Women's schooling, home teaching and economic growth. Journal of political economy, Vol.107(4), 682-71
- Bhalla, S., Kaur, R., (2011). Labour force participation of women in India: some facts, some queries. (Working paper no.40). London, UK: Asia Research Centre, London School of Economics and Political Science.
- Bozon, M. (1991). Women and the Age Gap between Spouses: An Accepted Domination? Population: An English Selection, Vol. 3,113-148
- Craig, Lyn. (2007). Is there Really a Second shift, and If So, Who Does It? A time diary investigation. Feminist review, Vol.86 (1) ,149-170
- Casterline, J., William, L., McDonald, P. (1986). The Age Difference between Spouses: Variations among Developing Countries. Population Studies, Vol. 40(3) ,353-37
- Chaudhary, R. Veric, S. (2014). Female labour force participation in India and beyond. (Asia-Pacific working paper series). Genève, Switzerland: International Labour Organization.
- Chioda, L. (2011). Work and Family: Latin American and Caribbean Women in Search of a New Balance. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Chinchilla, N. (1977). Industrialization, Monopoly Capitalism, and Women's Work in Guatemala. The university of Chicago press.Vol.3(1)

- Debnath Sisir. (2015). The Impact of Household Structure on Female Autonomy in Developing Countries. *The Journal of Development Studies*, Vol. 51(5), 485-502.
- Geetika, Singh, T., Gupta, A. (2011). Women working in informal sector in India: a saga of lopsided utilization of human capital. *International Conference on Economics and Finance Research. IPEDR. Vol.4.*
- UNDP. (2016). Human development report 2016: Human Development for Everyone. New York, USA: UND
- ILO. (2014). Key Indicators of the Labour Market, Eighth Edition. Geneva, Switzerland: Document and Publications Production, Printing and Distribution Branch (PRODOC),ILO
- IUSSP. (2013). Levels, trends and patterns of age difference among the couples in India. Retrieved from [https://iussp.org/sites/default/files/event\\_call\\_for\\_papers/Levelspercent20andpercent20trendspersent20ofpercent20agepercent20differencepercent20amongpercent20couplespercent20inpercent20India\\_IUSSP2013.pdf](https://iussp.org/sites/default/files/event_call_for_papers/Levelspercent20andpercent20trendspersent20ofpercent20agepercent20differencepercent20amongpercent20couplespercent20inpercent20India_IUSSP2013.pdf)
- Kapsos, S., Silberman, A., Bourmpoula, E. (2014). why is female labour force participation is declining so sharply in India? (Research paper no.10). Geneva, Switzerland: ILO.
- Klasen, S., Pieters, J. (2013). What Explains the Stagnation of Female Labour Force Participation in Urban India? (IZA Discussion Paper No. 5797). Bonn, Germany: IZA
- Klasen, S., Pieters, J. (2012). Push or Pull? Drivers of Female Labour Force Participation during India's Economic Boom. (IZA Discussion Paper No. 6395). Bonn, Germany. IZA
- Kapur, P. (1970). Marriage and the working women in India. Delhi, India: Vikas publications
- Mincer, J. (1962). Labour Force Participation of Married Women: A study of Labour Supply. *Aspects of Labour Economic Research.*
- Morrison A. (2007). Does gender equality matter for shared growth? Growth Commission Meeting at Yale University September 26, 2007
- Mehrotra, S., Parida, J. (2017). Why is the labour force participation of women declining in India? *World Development*, Vol. 98(C), 360-380
- Nam S. (1991). Determinants of female labour force participation: A study of Seoul, South Korea, 1970–1980. In *Sociological Forum*. Vol. 6(4), 641-659.
- NSS. (2014). Employment and Unemployment situation in India. [NSS report no. 554(6810/1)]. New Delhi, India: Mospi. GOI
- Ramachandran, S., Sureender, S. and Subbiah, A. (2002). Age difference between spouses in the union territory of Pondicherry. *Social Change Issues and Perspective, Journal of the Council for Social development*, Vol. 32 (3&4).
- Rao, P.V., Rao, N.V. (1982). Marriage, the family and women in India. Delhi, India .

Heritage publishers.

- Sudarshan, R., Bhattacharya, S. (2008). Through the magnifying glass: women's work and labour force participation in urban Delhi. (Asia-Pacific working paper series). Genève, Switzerland: International Labour Organization
- Thomas, J. J. (2012). India's Labour Market during 2000. Economic and Political weekly, Vol. 47(51),39-51
- Tuli, M., N. Chaudhary. ( 2010). Elective Interdependence: Understanding Individual Agency and Interpersonal Relationships in Indian Families. Culture and Psychology. Vol.16 (4), 477-496.
- Oliva, R. Banerjee, J. (2011). women labour force participation in Indian patriarchal society: an empirical study of the behavioral, demographic, socio-cultural, economic and cyclical factors. Man in India, Vol. 97 (2),561-588
- UN Habitat. (2016). Urbanization & Development :Emerging Futures: World cities
- report 2016. Nairobi, Kenya: United Nations Human Settlements Programme
- United Nations. (2010). The world's women 2010: Trends and statistics. New York, USA: Department of Economic and Social Affairs.
- UNDP. (2015). Women's Voices, Employment and Entrepreneurship in India. Retrieved from <http://www.in.undp.org/content/india/en/home/library/poverty/women-s-voices--employment-and-entrepreneurship-in-india.html>
- Veric, S. (2014). Female labour participation in developing countries. Germany. IZA world of labour. Retrieved from <https://wol.iza.org/uploads/articles/87/pdfs/female-labor-force-participation-in-developing-countries.pdf?v=1>



## **Women Gender and Livelihood in Post Cocoon Activity: Understanding Patriarchal Construction in Raigarh, Chhatisgarh**

**Kanchan Thomasina Ekka**

Research Scholar, School of Social Sciences, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai  
ekkakanchan@gmail.com

Women in India have been oppressed culturally, socially, economically and politically for centuries. They are exploited at home, in the families, in the society and in the country. In the multi ethnic and multi-cultural society like that exists in India, such exploitation takes various forms. The core of the problem is that they shoulder a number of responsibilities, but they are not given adequate participatory or decision making power in the family or elsewhere. Women can gain such power, if their economic status, cultural and social status improves. Such type of overall improvement of the power is known as women empowerment. The empowerment of women is one of the central issues in the process of development of countries all over the world. Involvement in Self Help Groups has enabled women to gain greater control over resources like material possession, intellectual resources like knowledge, information, ideas and decision making in home, community, society and nation. Thus empowerment means moving from a position of enforced powerlessness to one of the power UNDP has identified two crucial routes as imperative for empowerment. The first is social mobilization and collective agency, as poor women often lack the basic capabilities and self-confidence to counter and challenge existing disparities and barriers against them. Often, change agents are needed to catalyze social mobilization consciously. Second, the process of social mobilization needs to be accompanied and complemented by economic security. As long as the disadvantaged suffer from economic deprivation and livelihood insecurity, they will not be in a position to mobilize (UNDP 2001). In many developing countries (especially in South Asia), one strategy which has been found to be promising is participatory institution building in the self-help groups, often coupled with savings and micro credit loans (ESCAP, 2002).

Community level social norms, such as those constraining women's freedom of movement, access to economic resources and voices in the local community, may become more egalitarian as a result of strategic collective action by groups of women.

The deceptive invisibility of women's worth as well as their work is widespread and persistent. Women's work has, the whole, been severely devalued by universal ideological framework that regard them as inferior bearers of labour and generally defines their work as property of men. What kind of work is called work, how work is valued; the measures used to determine the value of their work are all determined by the perception of women's work by society, official agencies and men. As a result, women's work is undercounted, underestimated and often is invisible. SHG tries to integrate women in productive work as considered by the society which can bring about gendered equality by providing space for women to participate in the productive activity. It does

not challenge the gender division of labour. Even when she is involved in economic activities outside her household, she has to do her household work. This has been termed as double burden by feminists.

Therefore it is necessary to remember that changing the status of women in one level does not automatically carry on to the other levels i.e if power relations in the household are overturned, the community level ideologies might still hold women in their grip or the market through its discrimination against the labour force.

Sericulture is essentially a village-based industry that provides employment to both skilled and unskilled labor. Sericulture comprises of two major activities namely cultivation of mulberry for raising the leaf crop to feed the silkworm and rearing the silkworm to produce the cocoons which is the raw material for the silk reeling industries. Women are being involved at various stages of mulberry leaf production, silkworm rearing, reeling and spinning.

Coming to the post cocoon work the involvement of women is greater, commencing from silk reeling, weaving, and garment manufacturing industry. Post cocoon work is also considered as feminine as it requires the high concentration and nimbleness. This gendered knowledge of reeling and spinning activity involves a large number of women. Whether it is a charkha, cottage basin, steam filature, or automatic or semiautomatic reeling, women are preferred due to the nimbleness of their fingers in getting the fine filaments from the cocoons, casting of the ends, and their patience to work in hot water and seam for long hours. Women's greater involvement in reeling industry is seen not only in India but also in all silk-producing countries. The ultimate success of the post-reeling operations depends much on good winding, that is, yarn without breaks. The ultimate success of the post-reeling operations depends much on good winding, that is, yarn without breaks. There should be continuity in the yarn. Otherwise there will be too many knots which hinder good weaving, be it on a handloom or a power loom. However, their work has not always been properly recognized or suitably rewarded. Cultural factors have complicated the proper evaluation of the quantum and quality of women's contribution. This includes elements such as the structure of work in each society, segregation of women and men in specific occupations, and the division of labor. Due to normalizing household work as feminine, most women do not consider this as 'work' as against something like daily wage labour or agriculture. This is the distinction between productive and reproductive work, from the perspective of rural households. Women are not only responsible for households chores but also for economic management of the family. Hence they have to diversify their choice of livelihoods to include activities such as reeling and spinning and being part of Self Help Group. In the current context where empowerment of women is considered to be synonymous to their engagement with productive work, a large questions increases in women's work burden needs to be addressed. In the village under study, women are playing an important role in post cocoon processing activities. This research has endeavor to show how "post cocoon work," an agro-based activity, has brought about overall development of individual households, the village, and the community at large with the growth of women collective and how societal norms and traditions restrict its growth also.

## **Research Questions**

- How power and gender dynamics within Gender affects Livelihood?
- How patriarchal norms of the society leads to the marginalization of the women in livelihood?

## **Methodology**

The research paper is qualitative. The qualitative research methodology helps the researcher to capture the details of peoples' subjective experiences. The research carried out from the approach of phenomenology. According to Finlay (2013), Phenomenological research seeks to look beyond what appears at the surface, caste aside taken-for-granted assumptions to interpret and interrogate the phenomena of a lived experience and thus unearth the true essence or meaning of the phenomena. A phenomenological research starts with the passion of the researcher that translates into research questions and the research begins with the researcher “being open to the phenomena” and “seeing with fresh eyes” in order to give due credit to exploring experiences as subjectively experienced by the people. This paper is also the study of the lived experiences of women, looking to describe their motivations and actions as they perceive it. The researcher has interpreted and made sense of women lived and shared experiences from exclusively their point of view.

By listening to people closely, through deep and long engagements, their stories were captured through in-depth interviews and oral histories, and an attempt was made by the researcher to locate the universal nature of these shared experiences. This research with its focus on capturing the lived experience of livelihood struggles of women collectives in post cocoon activity, gendered experience of life, adopts the approach of phenomenology.

## **Key Findings**

Research shows that women collective strive to build an agency which empowers the women to seek the power within them. The driving forces which gives women collectives its power are its Group Cohesiveness, Expansion of resource base and bargaining power to negotiate the different challenges coming their way in economic and political form. The biggest hindering force of women collective to build its agency is the larger context of patriarchy present in the society. Overarching Patriarchal construction in community, society and in state controls women collective in different intersectionality of differences and discrimination.

Researcher wants to point out that how certain value and norms which are culturally and socially defined for gender takes a shape of a law and regulations by the state. The special provisions, which the government enforces when women are employed, are necessitate by many reasons. Women possess delicate health and cannot perform as arduous and difficult task as men. Also they have to look after their hearths and homes. It is encouraging to note that the State has been striving to provide them with work nearer their homes by throwing open employment

opportunities in such jobs as handlooms, village crafts, khadi, nursing and midwifery, teaching and other professions.

## References

- Anand Jaya, (2002), Self-Help Groups in Empowering Women: Case study of selected SHGs and NHGs, KRPLLD Centre for Development Studies, Thiruvananthapuram Discussion Paper No. 38 3.
- Alva Myrdal and Viola Klien,( 1956), Women's Two roles, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd.
- Batliwala, (1995), Women and Empowerment: Approaches and Strategies, New Delhi, Discovery Publication House
- Chambers, Robert, (1995), Poverty and Livelihood: Whose Reality Counts; Environment and Urbanisation, Vol. 7(1).
- Chambers,R.and Conway, G.R. ,( 1992), Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: Practical Concepts for the 21st Century, IDS
- Finlay, Linda; 2013; Unfolding the Phenomenological Research Orocess: Iterative Stages of "Seeing Afresh"; Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 53:172, Sage Publications.
- Kannan, V.A. (1987, May). Women in silk industry, Indian Silk, 26, 4-7.
- Kasi, E. (2000). Development and change due to sericulture—A study in Chittoor district University of Hyderabad, Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh, India.
- UNDP. 1995. Human development report 1995. United Nations Development Programme,

# **Women's Paid Work as a Bubble of Empowerment: A Case Study of a Social Enterprise Working with Women Artisans**

**Kaniska Singh**

M.Phil, Social Work, Department of Social Work, University of Delhi, Delhi

kkaniska.singh919@gmail.com

**Asfia Jamal**

Research Consultant, Tata Trust

asfia.jamal93@gmail.com

## **ABSTRACT**

### **Background Of The Study**

Women's status as the second sex in most societies of this world is not a shocker for any of us. Their status as second sex makes them not only vulnerable but also receiver of myriad nature of discrimination and exploitation. From 1960s many feminists have waged war against the practices, discourses, social and economic institutions which have systematically exploited women in different forms. Women empowerment and gender equality were at the center of demands made by the feminist of every school of thoughts.

The agenda of empowering women did not attract much attention of international organizations before 1990s. Women's empowerment as an end in itself was not a smart option for many of these organizations. But post-1990s, International organization like World Bank, IMF, United nations started to take special care of women empowerment. These international organizations were struggling to alleviate poverty through economic development at large. So to address the issue of poor economic growth and poverty, many steps like microfinance, SHGs, cooperative, social businesses emphasizing on engaging women as workforce have been undertaken through grassroots organizations, government initiatives through lobbying etc. Women empowerment was entwined with development discourse and women started to be perceived as key actors in poverty alleviation program and development paradigms. 'Feminization of poverty' caught attention of many actors who later realized that these women can be good investment for pushing neo-liberal development agendas. Post-1990s, more and more women were facilitated to be a part of paid economy with the anticipation that their inclusion in the economy will dole out dual purpose of empowering women as well as growth of the economy. What may seem as an effort for the betterment of women were actually catering to the growth of neo-liberal economy. The neoliberal economist claimed investment in women 'as smart economics' with high returns. To further this agenda of development through engaging women, microfinance programs, conditional cash transfer, SHGs and investment in girls increased manifold.

In spite of all these developments, Poststructural adjustments programs of 1991, the status of

women as labor changed significantly for worse. Women's participation in labour force was concentrated in informal economy with meager wages. The women, whose unpaid work was highly devalued, were entering the market as unskilled cheap labor. Now, their contribution in the informal economy is mainly limited to labor-intensive industries like textile and garment industry, food processing industries etc. and these industries are predominantly represented by women labor. These women are never vertically mobilized due to systematic structural constraints which hamper their development through belittling their work as unskilled and semi-skilled. In spite of their changing status from unpaid, unacknowledged worker to paid and acknowledged work, the empowerment component of the whole process is lost somewhere. When the financial inclusion programs were pushed in line for the women worker, the takeaway for the women worker was their increased purchasing power and an empowered self.

The demand that the feminists made for the women was experiencing a backlash as the nodal organizations and institutions responsible for implementing neoliberal idea of development and empowerment were actively changing the contours of empowerment and development limiting them to an individual self.

The inclusion of women in these programs resulted in a lopsided idea of growth where the women have ended up facilitating the development agenda rather than development being a facilitator in their development and empowerment. Women's participation in paid economy failed to increase their control on their money, body, and decisions. They have now dual responsibility of production and reproduction. While influx of women in paid economy has increased, the entry of men in private domains of reproduction is still not registered. Contrary to what paid work was supposed to do for women, it actually increased her burden twice. Participation of women in workforce did not prove out to be a magic bullet for the empowerment of women.

As a result of persisting gender inequality, discrimination, state of disempowerment for the women worker in spite of the initiatives taken many parallel organizations are also taking up the issue of women's empowerment through paid work. Social entrepreneurship and Social enterprises have claimed to have surfaced to address issues of inequalities through various sustainable mediums. Women, unlike earlier times, are being part of the economy through institutionalized support and mechanisms. Gender equality, feminist theories, Women empowerment, equality are some of the crucial goals that we have not only acknowledged but aspired to achieve as a society.

This research has studied the participation of women in the informal economy, their sector wise representation and the contribution of the sectors in GDP and cross-referenced it with women's participation in the respective sector. This resulted in envisaging the magnitude of betterment .if any, of the women labor in the informal economy. The research had been done with a social enterprise "Rangсутra" to understand the various strategies used by the women workers and the enterprise to initiative and further the empowerment process for these women. Finally, it critically analyzes the use of paid work and employment as a tool for the empowerment of women.

## **Objectives Of The Research Study**

- To critically analyze the status of women's paid work in the informal economy at the global level with special reference to the Indian economy.
- To analyze the strategies of engagement of women artisans labor devised by Rangсутra in a neoliberal economy.
- To critically analyze the use of paid work as a tool for empowerment of the women artisans of Rangсутra.

## **Research Methodology**

The descriptive research design is being employed in the research because the concept and practice of women's paid and unpaid work have been heavily studied and theorized.

The theoretical framework used in this research for investigating the research objective is that of the Marxist theory of political economy and society and socialist feminist theory to understand women's empowerment in the context of the research objective.

The participants were namely, artisans, craft managers, staff and the social entrepreneur. The participants of the study belong to two centers run by Saksham. The artisans who were participants of the research belonged to Mirzapur center, Varanasi, Uttar Pradesh and 2A.D center in Bikaner, Rajasthan. The staff participants were from three places namely Bikaner office, Varanasi office and Delhi office of Saksham. While the types of participants were pre-decided, who had to be interviewed under each category was decided later on. The participants under the staff, artisans, and participants from craft managers were chosen purposively. All the artisans interviewed were women. Although the researcher intended to include both men and women artisans for an interview from the centers, it could not be materialized because men did not work as artisans. At both, the places where the data was collected there were no male artisans. The rationale behind choosing both men and women artisans was to see the dynamics of workspace and interaction between different genders at workplaces. A total of 12 participants took part in the research study. In both, the centers two craft managers were interviewed who were also artisans.

The data was collected through primary as well as secondary sources. The primary sources of data collection were the participants of the study, the secondary sources are the documentaries, documents related to the women's paid and unpaid work. Interviews were conducted, and discussions were held under primary sources. Documentaries and written documents were analyzed from secondary sources.

There is no rigid way of generating data in the Qualitative study. Generally, Semi-structured interviews, unstructured interviews, group interviews, observation, conversations become part of the qualitative inquiry.

The interview was the primary method of data collection used by the researcher. The interviews

were conducted in the natural setting of the center. The interviews were semi-structured in nature and were guided by an interview guide. The initial interview included some pointers that needed to be covered. Therefore, the interview guide was updated as the data collection processed according to the responses of the participants. All the interviews were conducted in Hindi for artisans, while English was used while interviewing the founder of Delhi and project manager in Varanasi. Apart from the interviews, group interviews were also employed as a method of data collection in place of Focused group discussion. Group interviews were the best method of data collection where a lot of artisans sat together and contributed to the discussion.

The observation was employed as another method of data collection. The usability of observation differed according to the places the researcher went to. The choice of observation as a method of data collection is also informed by certain ontological and epistemological position of the researcher. Observation lets the researcher sink into the setting and generating data by experiencing as well as participating in the setting. In Varanasi and Bikaner office, the researcher used it as a complementary method while in the Saksham center of 2 A.D. village it was the major source of data collection in absence of the knowledge of the dialect used by the locals.

All the interviews were voice recorded which were later converted into transcripts. The transcripts were revised with time. The transcripts were not used as objectively rather it was contextualized to understand it as a construction of circumstances, interpersonal interaction, usage of words and expressions, an interplay of power relations and the material setting of the interactions. The data which would have been distorted and lost otherwise was used in a great deal while analyzing it. The themes like interpersonal communication between the participants, the linguistic tone of the participants were captured and critically analyzed through transcription assistance.

Data analysis is an ongoing process. Data analysis of the research started way before it started formally. The researcher kept analyzing the inputs, data coming from the participants in the light of its context. Later on, different themes emerged which were partially guided by the objectives of the research. Data analysis of the data collected was done according to thematic analysis. The researcher started the process of data reduction by extracting data from the pool of data which was generated through interviews, discussions, documents, documentaries etc. The data from transcripts were color-coded for sorting it according to the emerging themes. The researcher read each interview 6-7 times to familiarize herself with the data. The researcher also incorporated theories and articles which supports her findings as well as those theories which go against her own findings. Incorporation of different perspective helped the researcher to cross verify her understanding of the themes, sub-themes and the findings.



# **Women in Urban Formal and Informal Labour – A Study of Garment Industry in Bengaluru**

**Karan Peer**

M.A Development Studies, TISS, Mumbai

peer.karan@gmail.com

## **Introduction**

This paper looks at women in garment industry in Bengaluru. The garment industry in Bengaluru accounts for 20% of national garment production and 8% of all Indian garment exports. The city's garment factories employ about 5,00,000 workers, of whom 80% are women.<sup>1</sup> These factory workers fall under the category of formal labour. There is also unabated growth of small scale garment manufacturing units situated at the outskirts of Bengaluru city. A huge percentage of workers are women in these units. They come from lower socio economic conditions and are subjected to all kinds of exploitation, economic, sexual, emotional and social to mention a few. (Venkataramanappa, 2016) This part of work force constitutes of informal workers. They have the least bargaining power as they are not allowed to unionize and unions show reluctance to organize them, unlike the organised sector. The formal labour working in factories are also subjected to precarious working condition. The women workers face violence and discrimination at work, have poor access to maternity rights and child care facilities, have no job security, work overtime, lack social protection and living wages and have limited unionization. The paper gives brief information on these broad themes<sup>2</sup>.

## **Violence And Harassment Against Women**

Violence and harassments in garment factories takes place in the form of shouting, hitting, hair pulling or ridiculing a worker with sexual remarks. A survey conducted by Sisters of Change with Munnade, a Bengaluru based NGO, found that 1 women garment worker in 14 has experienced physical violence, while 1 out of 7 has been raped or forced into a sexual act. Their findings further revealed that over 60% of women have been intimidated or threatened with violence, while between 40-50% have experienced humiliation and verbal abuse. (Sisters for Change, 2016) This presents a hostile picture of workplace, where supervisors and managers use abusive and sexualised language to subordinate women workers. The survey notes three main reasons for prevalence of sexual harrasment. Firstly, male workers think that they have right to harass women. Secondly, senior management never punishes the supervisors or managers who harass women. Thirdly, the victims of sexual harassment and violence are threatened by perpetrators to stay silent. The tight production targets also put humongous pressure on the workers. Inability to

---

<sup>1</sup> Available at <http://www.cividep.org/2018/02/05/report-conditions-migrant-workers-bangalores-garment-industry/> (accessed 7, April 2018)

<sup>2</sup> Available at <https://www.fairwear.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/FWF-ILO-submission-final.pdf> (accessed 7, April 2018)

achieve these targets leads to verbal abuse by the supervisors. These incidents are clear violation of „The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (prevention, prohibition and redressal) Act 2013. The protection against sexual harassment and the right to work with dignity are universally recognised human rights by international conventions and instruments such as Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) which was ratified by the Government of India in 1993.

### **Maternity rights and child care facilities for women**

Factories Act 1948 in Chapter V pertaining to welfare insists on provision of crèche by factories employing more than 30 women for day care of children below 6 years of age of women workers. The Karnataka Factories Rule 1969 (2002 amendment) goes a step ahead of Factories Act 1948 by prescribing the following standards:

- The crèche facility should be away from any part of the factory where obnoxious fumes, dust or odours are present, or where excessively noisy processes are carried on.
- There should be 1.86 m<sup>2</sup> of floor area for each child and proper ventilation.
- Provision of cot or bedding for each child. There should be one chair or equivalent seating accommodation for use of mother while she is feeding or attending the child.
- At least one basin or similar vessel for every four children in the crèche along with a supply of water provided, if possible, through taps from a source approved by a Health Officer. The source of water should supply at least 23 litres water a day for each child.
- An adequate supply of clean clothes, soap and clean towels is mandatory for each child while they are in the crèche.
- At least 400 millilitres of clean pure milk (2 glasses) should be available for each child every day. The mother of the child must be allowed two intervals of at least fifteen minutes during the course of her daily work to feed the child.
- A woman-in-charge and one female attendant for every 20 children attending should be appointed for each crèche. There should be at least one sweeper and the woman-in-charge should possess a Nurse's qualifications.

The reality falls far away from these standards. A study of 118 garment factories conducted by Karnataka State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (KSCPCR) in 2012 brought out the fact that the garment manufacturing industry has not demonstrated full compliance with the statutory requirements. This survey was carried out in the aftermath of death of a little child in the crèche belonging to a major Bangalore-based exporter of a multinational brand. Out of 118 factories surveyed, 12 didn't have crèches at all. 4 factories out of 12 had less than 30 women workers and were automatically exempted; rest 8 factories didn't comply with law. The study found out that the capacity of crèches provided by factories was not in proportion with number of working parents employed. Only one factory, which had strength of 2,732 women out of which

40% were parents, ran two crèches. 10 factories of the sample had unutilised crèches. (KSCPCR, 2012) There are various reasons behind utilisation of crèches in factories. Majorly bad infrastructure, lack of sanitation, understaffing and absence of quality care of children contribute to negligence and underutilisation of the factory. A study conducted by Fair Labor Association, which is a Multi Stake holder Initiative (MSI) of universities, civil society organizations and socially responsible companies dedicated to protecting workers’ rights, found out that factory crèches do not allow admission of children below the age of 1 year and discourage the workers to bring their children above the age of 3. The management has also been found asking the workers to admit their children to schools above the age of 3 years.<sup>3</sup> Moreover women workers are not given breaks to breast feed their children. This is a grave concern which can have impact on children’s health and may have outcomes in the form of high infant mortality rates as well. The findings of the Report of the National Commission on Labour (2002) show that the provision of childcare facilities results in up to 50% enhancement in the productivity of the mother as well as in lower morbidity and better growth for the child.<sup>4</sup>

As per The Maternity Benefit Act, 1961, any woman worker who has worked for minimum of 80 days is entitled to claim the benefit of payment of twelve weeks paid holidays (six weeks prenatal and six weeks postnatal). A study conducted in 2015 by Cividep, a non-profit organisation which works for advocacy of workers’ rights, found out that that 3 months maternity leave is insufficient for them to take care of their new-borns. The study found out that around 50% of the women workers quit their job for 1 year during pregnancy and late re-join at the same position. Thus, they get break in their service and lose out on benefits such as provident fund and gratuity<sup>5</sup>. Though the Maternity Benefit (Amendment) Act 2017 has increased the maternity leave to twenty six weeks, whether these women workers are availing this benefit is still a pertinent question.

### **Emerging trends of migrant women workers in the garment industry**

Arthur Lewis in his paper “Economic Development with Unlimited Supplies of Labour” envisages the capital accumulation in the modern industrial sector so as to draw labour from the subsistence agricultural sector. Same has been the trend with garment industry in Bengaluru, which drew migrant labour from rural areas of Karnataka or neighbouring states like Tamil Nadu. Recently, workers from long distant states such as Odisha, Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh and Bihar are drawn to Bengaluru’s garment industry. They are predominantly from Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST), or Other Backward Class (OBC) communities, lack much formal education, and are generally unskilled. Trade union leaders from the Karnataka Garment Workers Union (KGWU) and the Garment Labour Union (GLU) estimate that between 15,000 and 70,000 migrant women from northern states are working in the Bangalore garment industry. These workers are lured by mediators or agents on false promises of high living wages.

---

<sup>3</sup> Available at [http://cividep.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/childcare-in-bangalores-apparel-industry\\_0-29.pdf](http://cividep.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/childcare-in-bangalores-apparel-industry_0-29.pdf) (accessed 8, April 2018)

<sup>4</sup> Report of the National Commission on Labour, 2002. P. 973

<sup>5</sup> Available at <http://cividep.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/needs-assessment-report-web-16.pdf> (accessed 8, April 2018)

Inter-State Migrant Workmen (Regulation and Conditions of Service) Act 1979, states that establishments employing migrant workmen must provide basic data to the labour department of the state from which an inter-state migrant worker is recruited, and in the state where the worker is employed, within fifteen days from the date of recruitment. The act also stipulates that a contractor must issue to each migrant recruited a passbook with a passport-sized photograph of the workman affixed, and indicating in Hindi and English languages (also in the language of the workman if needed) basic data like the name and address of the employer, period of employment, wage and deductions. Furthermore the Act mandates the agents to pay a displacement allowance. Majority of these workers are women in the age group of 18-20 years and a few in their early twenties. A study conducted by Cividep brings out the following startling facts about these workers<sup>6</sup>:

- They are not paid any displacement allowance. In some cases, the agents pay their families an amount of Rs 5,000 – Rs 10,000 before they migrate, but there is no clarity whether it is an advance payment or displacement allowance.
- These workers are trained in rural areas by skill development agencies such as Gram Tarang, which is a part of Government of India's Skill India Initiative. Gram Tarang does not register its trainees with the Labour Department as it is not a legal requirement to register trainees.
- These workers are promised paid accommodation and food at the time of recruitment. But in reality, deductions for both food and accommodation are made from their wages. One of the worker received Rs 3,300 in the first month due to deductions, which falls way below the official minimum wages of Rs 6,446.67 of a helper. Thus there is reduction in real wages of these workers due to food and accommodation charges.
- There were cases of informalisation of labour, as few migrants neither had an Employee State Insurance (ESI) or a Provident Fund (PF) account.
- These women workers are made to live in shabby hostels with poor sanitation, restrictions are imposed on use of mobile phones and behaviour of wardens and security staff is unfriendly. Poor ventilation and sleeping on mats instead of cots and mattresses make their living conditions more precarious.
- Restrictions on mobility of the workers imposed by warden/security of hostel create barriers to unionization. The hostels are located at proximity to the factories and thereby restrict movement of the women workers after their return from work. They buy their groceries and other essentials on the way back to hostel. In some cases, an employee walks them back from the factory to hostel. All these restrictions are imposed in the name of safety of the workers in an alien city.

---

<sup>6</sup> Available at <http://cividep.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/LabourWithoutLiberty.pdf> (accessed 8, April 2018)

- They are subjected to harassment as supervisors hurl abuses at them if they are unable to achieve their production targets. This discrimination on the basis of place of origin and linguistic differences is very prominent.

The main rationale in recruiting migrant workers is that local workers are no longer willing to work for low wages, and are, in many cases, organised as members of unions. By contrast, it is much harder to unionise young long-distance migrant workers, who are isolated and lack social capital in Bengaluru.

### **Presence of Informal sector in garment industry**

The Bengaluru garment industry, even though after having precarious working conditions, comes under organized sector. But as mentioned earlier, there are some small scale units situated at the outskirts of the city as well. These units have poorer working conditions than these factories. The reason for their existence is low wage paid at the factories. As a result, some women prefer to work under contractors as piece rate workers instead of joining factories. The wage that can be earned on a particular day by doing piece work is usually in the vicinity of Rs 500. This can be even higher, depending on the number of pieces. These workers are not covered under ESI or PF, and are bereft of any other benefits such as crèche for children. It is even more difficult to organize or unionize these workers.

### **Objectives Of The Study**

- ☐ To document the presence of informal sector in garment industry and to enquire whether they are employed throughout the year or not. To unravel the challenges faced by them at unionizing and collective bargaining.
- ☐ To enquire whether women workers have awareness of Sexual Harassment at Workplace Act, 2013 and the role of unions in preventing cases of violence and harassment.
- ☐ To study the role of Union in augmenting childcare facilities and maternity benefit for women workers in factories.
- ☐ To find out attempts by Unions to organize and unionize migrant workers and to spread awareness of labour rights amongst them.

### **Methodology**

The research aims to create a profile of women workers in both formal as well as informal sector in garment industry by use ethnographic methods stated below

- ☐ Semi structured interviews with women workers of both formal and informal sector of the industry to discover challenges faced by them in dealing with above mentioned issues.
- ☐ In depth interviews with workers of Garment Labour Union (GLU), Karnataka Garment Workers Union (KGWU) and other unions to understand the ways in which they address above mentioned issues.

- Analysis of secondary research data published by non profit organisations and Multi Stake holder Initiative (MSI) to explore their role in improving workers condition in garment sector.

## **References**

- Karnataka State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (KSCPCR).(2012). Study on Childcare Provisions in Bangalore's Garment Industry.Bengaluru
- Sisters For Change. (2016). Eliminating violence against women at work. Bengaluru.
- Venkataramanappa. (2016). Unorganized Workers in Bangalore City - A Study. International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research, 135-141.

# **Paid and Unpaid Works in the Agriculture Sector by Caste: A Study on a Rural Area in Tamilnadu**

**Karuppasamy M.**

Ph.D. Scholar, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Hyderabad

mksamy47@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

The engagement of women in paid and unpaid workers cuts across both productive and reproductive in the economy. In India, caste-based hierarchies exist within each sector in terms of working condition, wages, and nature of work. Generally, in agrarian studies, the wage differentials, wage system, the quantum of employment between men and women has enabled researchers to establish gender as an economic factor.

In this backdrop, this study attempts to understand how caste identity persists and directs productive work in the agricultural sector. Based on a survey conducted on 30 women agriculture workers it was observed that productive work performed on the land of dominant castes and reproductive work which is performed at home or domestic works of dominant caste. Productive work of women in agricultural sector could pay like in activities in weeding and transplanting and vegetable plucking. However, a part of the productive work can also be unpaid especially to the lower caste women. It was found that lower caste women go without any remuneration during post-harvest seasons- paddy, black gram, green gram cultivation and they devote their time for labor searching and manual labor. On the reproductive basis, women work as unpaid and undignified at the home of dominant caste families especially during the function of the marriage and funeral in the family of dominant castes. Thus, these works lead to their isolation and marginalized social status in the society. Moreover, the paid work includes the work under other dominants or upper caste families where they get remuneration in kind or cash and the unpaid work which cannot measure both their labor and remuneration in either productive (agricultural work) or reproductive works (both dominant castes and their own families).

Keywords: women workers, agriculture, paid and unpaid work, caste

## **Introduction**

Agriculture plays a crucial role in the socio- economic development of the country as it provides employment to vast majority of the population. It provides subsistence to a vast majority of the people and raw materials, capital for its own development and surpluses for national economic development. Generally, in agrarian studies, the wage differentials, wage system, quantum of employment between men and women has enabled researchers to establish gender as an economic factor. As employment has always been generalized as a result of education, urbanization and industrialization. While this is true to a greater extent, not many researchers have been capable of

addressing the subtle but crucial differences in the employment opportunities available and accessible for people across castes, which would enable a more grounded understanding of the development process.

Agricultural labourers are characterised by poor physical and human conditions and also the highest poverty levels, a vast majority of the landless agricultural labourers belong to socially backward groups like the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes. Agricultural labourers take up manual activities in agriculture in return for wages. While they had been serfs or bonded labourers for generations, currently most of them engage in agrarian works as casual labourers. However, one cannot completely rule out the existence of bonded labour in agriculture even today, as such agrarian labourers still remain bonded in many states. With agriculture largely in the unorganized sector and with little regulation or social security cover, agricultural labourers remain vulnerable to poor working conditions and economic exploitation.

### **Domestic work on women**

The Central Statistical Organization (CSO) of the Government of India (GOI) provided official visibility of workforce that the report classified the activities based on the 1993 System of National Accounts (SNA) into three categories: (i) those coming under economic activities that are included in the SNA; (ii) those that are not currently included in the SNA but are characterised as extended SNA, which include household maintenance and care for the children, old and the sick in the household; and (iii) non-SNA consisting of the social and cultural activities, leisure and personal care. The contribution of women to the economy is unvalued / undervalued because most of the works they are involved in are not recognized as labour, and in this scenario, bringing household maintenance works, child and old age care in the household brings the significance of these works to light. If women in general are confined to works which are mostly unaccounted, the contribution of women belonging to the oppressed social sections are even worse, as their activities both at home and also in work are domestic / household in nature. Thus the work force participation rate of women belonging to SCs/STs is higher as their engagement in work is influenced by caste, gender and their economic position. Due to these factors the domestic duties of the women belonging to the oppressed social sections are higher than that of other women. Women from the lower social strata are more likely to engage in economic activities and in collecting of household needs from their environment probably due to lower economic status of their households. While works like cooking, house-making, care for the sick, elderly and children are considered to be 'domestic,' then how can one account for additional activities at home such as rearing cattle, cleaning the cattle shed, collecting fodder for cattle, grazing for the cattle and collecting water, firewood and other household needs which these are the works closely relative with agriculture and land basis. However, one should also note that addition of these extended SNA is not going to give a higher income to the women. In spite of the stress from the double burden of work, the economic condition forces many women to be available for additional work.



## **Research gap**

It is extremely important to study in agriculture that the conditions of women labourers in unirrigated/dryland agriculture which is less explored and very limited number of studies have looked into the perception of labourers and their employers about impact of wellbeing of women agricultural labourers. Moreover, in Indian sociological studies there is a limitation, that doesn't take account gap between the nation- state and individual villages. If the sociological studies look into this limitation and contributes to the regional studies of ground realities of different eco-cultural zones then such study can help in future development of the different eco-cultural zone.

The engagement of women in paid and unpaid workers cuts across both productive and reproductive in the economy. In another factor in India caste based hierarchies exist within agriculture sector in terms of nature of work by paid and unpaid. Moreover, the role of caste in structurally determining the occupations of the people has not been addressed seriously. The present study attempts to understand the paid and unpaid works in the agrarian occupations of women's works.

## **Research questions**

Based on the aforementioned research gap, the study identifies the following research questions.

- I. Does caste play any role in determining works in agriculture in unirrigated/dryland area?
- II. How the paid and unpaid works influences women workers in agriculture?

## **The specific objectives of the study are:**

- To understand the remuneration exploit by caste and regional factors on women agricultural labourers.
- To examine the paid and unpaid works of women in agriculture in terms of nature of work and to understand the influence of caste system on their work

## **Paid and Unpaid in agriculture**

### **Paid work**

There are two types of labour- the landless daily labourer (marginalised castes) and the landholding labourer (dominant caste). Where most of the landless labourer work on daily basis due to marginalisation and poverty the landless labourers are going for daily basis work and prefer kind or cash wages. The landholding workers are going for the season time or the expert workers are getting wages in cash and kind. The agricultural works need some skill, however caste, gender and age plays a key role in the agricultural works through the kinship of social institutions. The study reveals that, unskilled works paid by cash are preferred by dominant castes, while skilled works paid by kothu are preferred by marginalized group workers. The marginalised workers are

prefer kothu for livelihood. Kothu is a kind of payment which provided by goods. kothu system has been replaced by cash in the paddy cultivation because the providing goods (Kothu) value more than their daily wages.

### **Unpaid work**

In the Indian context this is true for the women among the dominant social groups and in artisan castes, who have their own businesses, production, the women belonging to the marginalized social groups such as the scheduled castes and scheduled tribes, and poor women belonging to other communities engage in less paid or unpaid work even in the households of the dominant castes. On unpaid or reproductive basis they work as undignified workers at the home of dominant caste families especially during the function of the marriage and funeral in the family of dominant castes. On marriage time marginalised workers get saree for women and dhoti for men by their dominants caste wishes, during death, they get daily wage proportion. For this caste based works further, during the harvesting seasons they get payment in kinds which cannot measure both their labor and remuneration in either productive or reproductive works. Thus these works, lead to their isolation and marginalized social status. Moreover, the marginalised workers serve activities such as finding labourers for the dominant caste. There are two dimensions - one is the landowning or dominant caste person who doesn't want to visit the home of lower caste people, secondly they can save their time and energy. The intermediate do not get any commission or pay for their intermediate services. In addition by regional factor the people from the marginalized group engage in specific work which are highly polluted in agriculture.

The black gram and green gram cultivation happens through two methods a) pulling black gram, green gram pack separately from plant (b) cutting entire plant with black gram and green gram. In first method, it rarely happens when the plant partially has grams and raw grams, it leads to pull separate the grams from plant. Otherwise the gram will be exposed and wasted on land. Whereas on land without any raw grams, they use second method to cut entire plant. It is also labour intensive work. Just like transplanting is done by women and harvesting activities are done by males and females in Tamilnadu, similarly cutting and pulling those gram are done by women and threshing activities are done by men and women. In first method gram are put on rectangle or circle and beaten by stick for thresh. Now the second method has recently changed and grams are put on the road so that plants get threshed through buses and cars that pass by. Both man and woman workers collect and remove the dust through wind. When using the road, it become less labour intensive, that's why marginalised worker are majorly involved in this activity of black gram and green gram, who are mostly landless agriculture labour.

### **Research methodology**

This study has been used Mixed Method Research. Mixed Method Research allows us to get a full of understanding on the issue under study by integrating both Qualitative and Quantitative Research so, the reason choosing Mixed Method Research is that, it can help to get at 'subjugated

knowledge' and give voice to those whose viewpoints are often left out of traditional research. This is worth mentioning that, the Mixed Method Research the limitations of one method can be neutralized by another method. The in-depth interview were conducted to understand the lived realities of women agriculture labour. The purpose of in-depth interviews is to acquire rich qualitative data on a particular topic from the perspective of selected participants. The interviews are very useful for acquiring subjugated knowledge of marginalized groups in a society. Therefore, it can be considered an appropriate mode of collecting data for qualitative research approach. I used both primary and secondary modes of data collection. The secondary data in form of literature are collected through various government reports, e-resources articles for understanding the workforce participation between men and women and challenges of women labour in agriculture by various aspect of caste in agriculture, wage differentials, and etc.

For the in-depth interview the Semi-structured, open-ended and close ended questions were made to conduct those interviews to explore the accounts of participants' experience, their descriptions and explanations about the phenomena. The open-ended questions not only provide insight in participants understanding about phenomena but also allow the participants to get the freedom of answering and thus it gives more and varied information based on the participants logic and thought process. Based on a survey conducted on 30 women agriculture workers it was observed that productive work performed on the land of dominant castes and reproductive work which is performed at home or domestic works of dominant caste.

## **Women in the Workforce and Criminal Justice**

**Kavita Chohan**

Research Scholar, TISS

kavya.chauhan85@gmail.com

The certain kinds of socialization of the child lead them to follow the patriarchy, the mind consciously and sub-consciously abides the same what he/she observe from her experiences and practices surrounded her/him. The patriarchy is the one of the root causes in the bifurcation between to identifying the potential among women. That hidden practices clearly comes up in the reality when the news and facts of unequally assignment of works and the remuneration for the same work which man do,

The doctrine of glass ceiling is the reality when the potential women never allow to work and get equal treatment. As she deserve equally what her counterpart deserve and usually enjoy the labour of his work. The another problem of such issues are also nourish by the certain beliefs and dogmas which are challenged by the caste, class, gender and other prevalent form of binary.

The social norms and practices of caste and gender discrimination also comes as in hurdle to getting education and learn the innovative things such as technical or other professional things. The narrow vision is the sole based which keep the women to confine and adjust with limited scope and that limit never allow them to think bigger and something allow them to go beyond other places and change the practice of patriarchal norms.

The population ratio in India 2011 is 940 female per 1000 of males. The sex ratio of 2001 has revealed that there were 933 females to that of 1000 males. Women comprise 48.5percent of the population.

If look at the area women mainly engage in the unorganized sectors that covers the agriculture primarily and domestic worker as the less paid domestic helper and class forth jobs such as receptionist and nursing field. The work allotments and its acceptance in such unorganized area is the unambiguity that reflects the societal feudal mind set. In the whole work assignment process seriously implicate the gender biasness and their invisibility still exist when government count the GDP (gross domestic production) so their hard labor never counted even the nation's economy, with this insecure work atmosphere she has to bear the entire family and societal burden, she has to perform dual roles as a mother to brought up children and provide full time service whenever the family members call upon her.

So this busy schedule does not allow her to grow fully there are few exceptions when women grow even in the presence of the odd situations. When talk about the bench there also be no difference of discrimination. Once a woman express desire to join the judicial or litigation field she has to primarily take the consent from her parents if parents allow then the girl hardly join the

field because various challenges appears before her the societal pressure to marry and would be in-laws hardly allow her continuously in such field. There is dominance of male from the peon to judge posts. So the entire atmosphere turns hostile against her stranger in the court also premises. Former S.C judge Gyan Sudha misra reportedly told a fellow also reflect the discriminatory attitude usually male counterpart keep even he is advocate or clerk.

The 24 High courts in the country have only 64 woman judges compared to 557 male judges, and there is not a single woman judge in eight HCs. While women got the right to practice in 1922, Indira Jaisingh became the first woman additional solicitor general in 2009. A woman was appointed to the HC only in 1959. At no point have there are more than two women at a same time appointed as the SC judge. The feudal mindset never allows believing the potential of woman advocate and judges to deal with criminal and important issues. Such exclusion is the clear picture of discrimination not confined to lower works but it has heighten when goes up. The reservation for the judicial post is also not satisfactory only few states in lower judiciary provides women's reservation even though the Bihar is only one state which provides 35% reservation yet the pathetic position of women representation 9.88percent in judiciary in Bihar.

Keywords: unorganized sector, patriarchy, socialization, domestic worker, glass ceiling, supreme court, high court, litigation etc.

#### **Objective:**

- To find out the lower rate of women s' enrolment in bar council
- The counterpart is not ready to consider her potential enough to deal with the criminal cases.
- The number of women representation in HCs and SC is very unsatisfactory.
- Guidelines regarding Harassment at working places, studies the sexual harassment incidents within the court premises.
- To exposes the discriminatory attitudes of courts towards the female advocates and judges.

#### **Methodology:**

Secondary data is the prime source of this research paper.

## **Maternity Protection and Policy Deficiencies: Recent Evidences from India**

### **Lakshmi Lingam**

Professor, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

lakshmil@tiss.edu

### **Rahul Suresh Sapkal**

Assistant Professor (Economics), National Law University Mumbai

rahul@mnlumumbai.edu.in

In the past two decades, India's economy has grown fast on an average 6.4 percent point growth rate; the service sector has accounted for a large share of this growth (Shastry 2012). During this period, India has also experienced a sizable fertility decline, a rapid expansion of female education, and an overall empowerment of women (Pieters 2010; Agénor, Mares, and Sorsa 2014). Despite these achievements, it is ironic that the reported female labor force participation is the lowest among other emerging markets, and is gradually declining since the period of economic reforms started in 1990s (Pieters 2010 & Sapkal 2017). According to 68th round of NSSO (2011-12) survey has recorded that labour force participation rates<sup>1</sup> of women aged 25-54 years (including primary and subsidiary status) have stagnated at about 26 to 28 percent point in urban areas, and fallen substantially from 57 to 44 percent point in rural areas, between 1987 and 2011 respectively. Interestingly, there is an increase in the number of women attending educational institutions, however, steady increases in education among women in India, is not automatically leading to an increase in employment rates and this is a peculiar conundrum. Recently, it is estimated that bridging the gender gap in the labor market will translate into an economic boost of 1.4 percent per year incremental GDP growth and this could add Rs 46 lakh crore (\$0.7 trillion) to India's GDP in 2025 (MGI 2015). About 70 percent of the increase would come from raising India's female labor-force participation rate from the current 31 percent to 41 percent in 2025, bringing 68 million more women into the economy (ibid).

About 21 million female workers were out of the workforce<sup>2</sup> between 2004-05 and 2009-10. Contrary to a quantum leap of 13 million in the rural male workforce, the rural female workforce recorded a decline of 19 million during the same period, of which scheduled tribe, scheduled caste and other backward classes combined to add up to a significant proportion.

It is interesting to note that work participation rate of women in India is characterized with low levels of literacy and of women who have completed child bearing and/or initial years of child rearing. The majority of women in the reproductive age bracket, particularly in the prime

---

<sup>1</sup> Labour force participation rate (LFPR) is defined as the number of persons in the labour force per 1000 persons. Persons who are either working (or employed) or seeking or available for work (or unemployed) during the reference period together constitute the labour force.

<sup>2</sup> The Work Participation Rate (WPR), which is defined as the percentage of total workers to the total population

childbearing age, not only remain out of the labour market but also most of the women who do enter the workforce wait to complete family size before entering the labour market. Recently, UN Women Discussion Paper by Raveendran (2016) observed that the participation rates of women and men belonging to households with small children up to the age of three move in opposite directions with increasing number of children. This study further observed that labour force participation rates of men in households with small children are relatively high as opposed to the participation rates of women in such households, which are fairly low. Similarly, in recently released draft copy of World Bank's World Development Report (2018), it is observed that the gradual decline of social safety net, lack of incentives and deleterious impact of technological changes on the world of work are causing reduction the female workforce participation.

According to 68th round of NSSO data, only 38.4 per cent of rural and 19.6 per cent of urban women in the reproductive age bracket (15 to 49 years) were in the workforce. And in the prime reproductive age (20-29) only 34.2 per cent of rural and 17.8 per cent of urban women were workers. Work participation peaks are achieved by rural women (49 per cent) and urban women (27 per cent) in the ages of 35-39 years. Besides social norms, low levels of education and skills, lack of maternity benefits and childcare and elderly care facilities on the supply side and a general lack of opportunities and discrimination against younger women, particularly newly wedded or potential mothers, on the demand side, could be some of the important reasons for the low participation of younger women in the labour market.

The highest labour force participation is from amongst the poorest women from the Dalit and Tribal social categories. Women from these social categories not only have the highest work participation rates but also face poorest nutrition and health parameters. All women, particularly poor women, have dire need for maternity protection, child-care support and public provisioning of their socially productive roles that they play in the public and private domains.

Maternity benefit or work-linked maternity support, which encompasses several provisions including leave, wage compensation, nursing breaks as well as strictures against discrimination of women on account of reproduction, is an important tool that levels the playing field for women in the labour market. However, comprehensive review of the maternity benefits in India concluded that the maternity benefit cover is restricted largely to the tiny segment of formal workers in the organised sector who form a miniscule percentage of the total female workforce. Coverage of even organised sector workers is segmented and incomplete (Lingam & Kanchi, 2013).

Maternity Benefit schemes in India have been in existence for over five decades, yet the vast majority of Indian women do not get any maternity entitlements as the legislation does not apply to the unorganised sector. Workers in agriculture, unorganised manufacturing and services and informal workers in the organised sector are thus without maternity cover. Schemes such as the Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY), with a focus on the poor pregnant woman with special dispensation for states having low institutional delivery rates, provides a one time maternity assistance as an incentive for institutional delivery and transportation allowance. The Indira

Gandhi Matritva Sahyog Yojana (IGMSY) for pregnant and lactating (P & L) women was introduced on a pilot basis in selected 52 districts in all States/ UTs across the country. This is a centrally sponsored scheme in which conditional cash transfers (CCTs) are to be made directly to the beneficiaries. There were exclusionary eligibility criteria and serious implementation gaps. Lingam & Yelamanchili (2011) showed that the conditionalities would result in the exclusion of 48% of deserving pregnant women from the benefits of the IGMSY. However, contrary to research evidences and policy pronouncements in May 2017, the Ministry of Women and Child Welfare, Government of India kick-started a pan-India maternity benefit scheme titled Pradhan Mantri Matru Vandana Yojana (PMMVY) in all districts of the country w.e.f. 01.01.2017 under which the eligible beneficiaries get Rs. 5,000/- and the remaining cash incentive as per approved norms towards Maternity Benefit under Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY) after institutional delivery so that on an average, a woman gets Rs. 6000/-. The scheme is applicable only for one pregnancy event and to women who have not availed any other maternity scheme. The objectives of the scheme were announced as providing wage loss compensation for working mothers, so that women can take time to rest before and after delivery, and improving health seeking behaviour of pregnant and lactating mothers through the cash incentive. Most crucially, where the IGMSY was open to women for the first two live births, the Maternity Benefit Programme (MBP) 2017 is restricted to only the first live birth, halving the number of beneficiaries.

Using this background and social context, this paper aims to examine the access and coverage to Janani Suraksha Yojna (JSY) and other state-specific maternity protection to these young women workers and mothers who are gradually withdrawing from labour force participation. Specifically, we will investigate the distribution of access by regions, educational status, wealth quintiles, social and religious groups and employment status.

To address our research question, we study recently released National Family Health Survey-IV (2015-16) data on population (both male & female), health and nutrition for India and each State / Union territory. NFHS-4, for the first time, provides district-level estimates for many important indicators. Out of 699,686 women respondents, we analyze the data of 1,03,2,147 mothers who have given birth to one or two children during the last five year as recorded in the NFHS-4.

We use a fully parametric estimation of a multinomial logit model to examine the access and coverage to JSY and other state-specific maternity protection and will capture the heterogeneity to access the maternity entitlements by regions, educational status, wealth quintiles, social and religious groups and employment status.

The preliminary analysis of aggregate NFHS-4 data indicate that, women with 10 or more years of schooling (%) has increased from 22.3 percent in NFHS-3 to 36 percent in the recent survey. This positive development is accompanied by drastic fertility decline from 2.7 in NFHS- 3 to 2.2. in NFHS-4. However, the survey also provides macro evidence of decline in female labour supply. It is interesting to note that the decline in female labour supply is also accompanied by gradual increase in the access to maternity benefits schemes in NFHS-4 compared to NFHS-3.



The rise in access rate is higher among women in rural areas than in urban areas. Out of 36.4 percent women respondents, only 21.4 percent and 43.8 percent in urban and rural areas have reported access to maternity benefits schemes, respectively. The access is very poor among socially marginalized groups than women belonging to non-socially marginalized groups. Using the robust identification strategy, the study will take in account the individual women specifics observable characteristics vis-a-vis region, district and state level covariates to explore the state-specific heterogeneity in the access of maternity benefits.

We believe that empirical results drawn from this study shall be of value added to the existing scholarship to provide insights female work participation, significance of maternity protection on the one hand and the efficacy of the PMMVY in providing maternity protection and positive child survival outcomes.

**Note: The data analysis is ongoing.**

## References

- Lingam, L. & Kanchi, A (2013). Women's Work, Maternity and Public Policy. Ministry of Labour & Employment, New Delhi and ILO, New Delhi. Unpublished report.
- Lingam, L., & Yelamanchili, V. (2011). Reproductive rights and exclusionary wrongs: Maternity benefits. *Economic & Political Weekly*, 46(43), pp. 94-103.
- Raveendran, G (2016). The Indian Labour Market, A Gender Perspective. UN Women, Discussion Paper No. 8.
- Shastry, G. K. 2012. "Human Capital Response to Globalisation: Education and Information Technology in India." *Journal of Human Resources*, 47 (2): 288–330.
- Pieters, Janneke. 2010. "Growth and Inequality in India: Analysis of an Extended Social Accounting Matrix." *World Development*, 38 (3): 270–281.
- MGI (McKinsey Global Institute). 2015. The Power of Parity: Advancing Women's Equality in India. Global Report.
- Agénor, P., J. Mares, and P. Sorsa. 2014. "Gender Equality and Economic Growth in India: A Quantitative Framework". OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development) Economics Department Working Papers, No. 1263, OECD Publishing, Paris.
- Sapkal Rahul (2017). "From Mother to Daughter: Do Equal Inheritance Property Laws Reform Improves Female Labour Supply and Educational Attainments in India?", *Asian Journal of Law and Economics*, De Gruyter, vol. 8 (1), pp 1-36.

# **A Critical Interrogation of The Role Of Self-Help Groups In Securing Livelihoods And The Rehabilitation Of Former Devadasis In Belgaum District Of Karnataka**

**Lavanya Shanbhogue Arvind**

MPhil Research Scholar, Advanced Centre for Women's Studies, SDS, TISS, Mumbai

lavania.shan@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

This paper, drawn out of my original M.A research, interrogates the role of self-help groups in the rehabilitation of former Devadasis in Belgaum district of Karnataka. The paper also seeks to contextualise larger systemic structures that stand in the way of complete rehabilitation. The paper will bring out the linkages between how self-help groups enabled self-employment of Devadasis in the informal work spaces in the Belgaum district of Karnataka.

In 1991, the Karnataka State Women's Development Corporation set up the Devadasi Rehabilitation Programme in collaboration with MYRADA, an NGO in the region, in a bid to eradicate the Devadasi practice. Although The Karnataka Devadasi (Prohibition of Dedication) Act was passed in 1982, the practice of dedicating young Dalit girls as Devadasis to the Yellamma temples in the region continued well into the 1990s. The challenges in rehabilitating these women included providing sustainable livelihood options for women who were almost entirely illiterate and unskilled owing to the fact that they had all been dedicated as Devadasis at very young ages. During the process of this rehabilitative exercise, the Mahila Abhivruddi Mattu Samrakshana Samsthe (MASS) was formed as a membership organization of ex-Devadasis to facilitate rehabilitation. Their main goal at that time was to eradicate the system and to secure livelihoods for women exiting the Devadasi practice. They are operational even today and their aim is vigilantism to ensure that no revival of the Devadasi system takes place, securing livelihoods, rights and justice of the former Devadasis and the Dalit community in Belgaum, Karnataka.

Karnataka was one amongst the last states to legally abolish the Devadasi practice in 1982 followed only by Andhra Pradesh in 1988 and Goa in 2003. Owing to the plummet in economic benefaction, temple patronage and the need for ritualistic services, the Devadasi in the recent past, often operated in ways similar to that of a commercial prostitute, but remained outside the purview of the Immoral Traffic Act because the practice enjoyed religious sanction. With the abolishment of the practice in 1982 in Karnataka, the Devadasi became even more vulnerable. There was an increase in trafficking specific to women dedicated as Devadasis because of their perceived 'readiness' as sex workers and they now became susceptible to arrests under the Immoral Traffic Act. Until then, owing to religious sanction, girls and women dedicated as Devadasis were not considered criminals but for the very first time they operated outside the religious institution and were therefore liable for legal intervention. Caught between the crossfire

of two kinds of laws, namely the abolishment of the Devadasi practice and the susceptibility to be arrested as a commercial prostitute, combined with the increased risk of being preys to traffickers, the Devadasi seemed to be cornered from all sides.

It is in this context that one needs to scrutinise how the state, the voluntary sector and the women themselves have brought about two major outcomes and these include: a) the facilitation of the exit of several thousands of women in Karnataka, 3600 in Belgaum alone (as per official records from the Karnataka State Women's Development Corporation) from the Devadasi practice, b) the large scale collectivisation of ex-Devadasi women to eradicate the Devadasi system, keep a constant check on its revival in the region as well as assist both ex-Devadasis and other dalit women in the region to secure their livelihoods through the formation of self-help groups initially and a larger membership organization eventually.

In 1997, around 3600 women dedicated as Devadasis organised themselves to form a formal large-scale organization Mahila Abhivruddhi Mattu Samrakshana Samsthe (hereafter called MASS) that worked towards the eradication of the Devadasi practice in the region. This formation was part of the withdrawal tactic of the Devadasi rehabilitation projects of Karnataka State Women Development Corporation (KSWDC) and MYRADA. The organization received funding support from Oxfam NOVIB. The organization MASS also assisted the Dalit community by providing loans and subsidies for livelihood promotion and education. One of the immediate and primary strategies to provide opportunities for income generation to former Devadasis was to organise them into self-help groups. Members contributed small regular savings over a few months until there was enough capital in the group to begin lending to those in need. Apart from micro-credit, the self-help groups worked on a range of welfare activities including the protection of vulnerable women and children from various kinds of discrimination based on religion or tradition such as the Devadasi traditions, human trafficking, child marriage, violence against women and children. Therefore it maybe stated that the sole reason for the existence of MASS is to prevent more dedications, to completely curb the practice as well as to ensure financial and other kinds of assistance to former Devadasis and her children (MASS, 2017).

In 1997, when MASS was established, the Devadasi practice was still prevalent, this despite the abolishment in 1982 brought about by legislation. For 15 years, rehabilitation took place at a smaller scale, involving smaller groups of women collectivised into self-help groups (SHG). The SHGs enabled solidarity formation between women. MASS believed that the common experience of oppression and common anxiety, grief and the pervasive uncertainty of it all would bring the women together.

Initially 65 self-help groups were formed in the region. The membership fee was set at Rs. 500/- and women could borrow from this corpus to engage in income generating activities and/or for educational purposes for their children. After many meetings and discussions amongst the former Devadasis, 509 villages that were part of Belgaum district around the region collectivised and

formed the membership organization MASS, not as a federation of self-help groups but as an organization in which any former Devadasi could join in her individual capacity.

Post the formation of MASS and over the years, several steps were taken to bring about measures that had long-term economic security as an end goal. The organization promoted more than 300 SHGs of former Devdasis in many blocks including the Raibag and Athani block where the Yellamma temple is located. Most of these blocks are locations where former Devadasis live, however a few of them include other Dalit and backward communities. MASS was able to support, on an on-going basis, the financial needs of its members. Often they mobilise funds for housing finance. The various SHGs mobilises its own funds for providing working capital. Further funds are made available for starting an education fund for the benefits of the children of members. In 2005, a death relief fund was created for funding support in order to perform the last rites of the family of the members and also to provide relief to family of the members. After the death of the member, Rs. 2,000/- is being paid as relief amount. Other need-based support funds are also made available from time to time, such as funds for flood relief. For 730 members, a cumulative loan of Rs. 40 lakhs was given for various income generation activities. 253 odd working capital loans amounting to Rs. 45 lakhs was disbursed at a rate of 12% p.a. For these loans the repayment rates are well over 99% with low-delinquency. With the help of this money, some of the women were able to purchase livestock such as goats, cows and buffaloes, while others were able to purchase agricultural land.

MASS entered into various strategic tie-ups so that its members, all former Devadasis, could avail of microcredit. The organization signed an MOU with NABFINS (Nabard Financial Service Limited) to lend micro finance loans. Over 1200 members from more than 100 self-help groups were linked to NABFINS and received over 1.2 Crores as micro-finance loans. The US based Asset India Foundation too supported MASS with the disbursement of Rs. 50/- lakhs. Other tie-ups include MILAAP Social Ventures Indian Private Limited, Bangalore and Micrograam Social Development Foundation, Bangalore. More than 1500 members from over 160 SHGs were supported through these initiatives. In order to secure themselves and for the purpose of risk mitigation, all the members have been covered by various insurance schemes. Further the organization provides educational loans to the children its members. Through various concerted efforts, the organization had negotiated a Devadasi pension from the Karnataka state government. A survey was carried out to identify the beneficiaries and this pension is an on-going scheme. The organization also supports more than 2700 members in ensuring issuance of various identification documents such as ration cards.

This study finds that this collectivisation that began as self-help groups played a pivotal role in their lives. Women stated that the inadequacy of vocational training and skills enhancement that were targeted interventions at the level of the individual failed. Therefore in order to achieve economic security through creation of sustainable livelihoods, the women had to collectivise and

therefore created self-help groups that eventually turned into a grassroots' movement and resulted in the formation of MASS, a membership organization of former Devadasis which enabled them to assist one another.

In developmental discourse women-led SHGs as a medium of microfinance is gaining momentum in the endeavour to alleviate poverty of the marginalised sections. Alongside the mobilization of women into SHGs, strategic partnerships with key organizations for availing microcredit too played an important role in the rehabilitative exercise. The organization MASS and the former Devadasis themselves self-help groups is a story of female agency.

# **HRD Programs And Women Executives: Are The Current HRD Initiatives Right For Women Executives?**

**Liji James**

IIM Kozhikode, FPM Student

lijij10fpm@iimk.ac.in

## **Purpose of the study**

The purpose of the study is twofold. The first purpose of the study is to explore the reasons for slow transitioning of women middle managers to senior management positions. The second purpose is to investigate if the current HRD programs overcome the barriers faced by women executives and identify gaps.

## **Background of the study**

HRD is a “process of developing/unleashing human expertise through Org. Development (OD), and Personnel T&D for purpose of improving performance” (Swanson,2001, p.304). The individuals whose performance is being targeted to improve are considered to have similar developmental needs inside an organization. But the career trajectory for women and men executives may not be the same. The developmental needs may be different and therefore to unleash the full potential of women in the organization, the developmental initiatives for them have to be looked from a different perspective.

Globally the percentage of women managers in senior positions is very less and it is growing at a languid pace. At global level only 24% of senior management posts are held by women and the level of women in senior management has increased only 3% from 2012 to 2016 (Thorton, 2016). There is heterogeneity in this percentage within developed and developing nations. For example, Russia has about 45% women in senior management positions while that in US and Japan is 21% and 7% respectively, among developing nations Philippines and China has 39% and 30% women in senior management while India has only 16 % women in senior management (Thorton, 2016). The ILO Company survey in 2013 conducted by Bureau for Employers’ Activities in developing regions, investigated the percentage of women at different managerial level. It was found that the gender balance of most the companies deteriorated as it moved from middle to senior executive level (in most of the companies the gender balance was better while moving from junior to mid-level or it was almost similar). This gives some indication that the transition from middle management to a senior management position for women is problematic and a matter of concern. Hence it would be interesting to explore the reasons behind this slow transition.

Lyness and Thompson (2000), provide evidence that climbing the corporate ladder is not the same experience for both men and women and that the trajectory of women executives’ success is different than men and women. In this light, it would be interesting to investigate how far are the

current HRD programmes in congruence with the developmental needs of women. For example, Conge (2010) describes action learning initiative as one of the formal leadership initiatives for mid to senior level managers. These are developmental approaches whereby participant learns by working through current organizational issues. Van Vianen and Betchtodlt (2010) reported that senior managers favored male subordinates for challenging assignments as opposed to female subordinates. This indicates that women are not likely to get fewer stretch assignments as compared to men. In this respect, action learning initiatives become much more crucial for women than men for their progress.

The study is conducted in two phase. The first phase is a literature review which explores the reasons for slow transitioning of women middle managers to senior management positions. The second phase investigates the current HRD programs catering to developmental needs of women executives and tries to understand how they are addressing these issues.

### **Research Question**

**The research aims to answer the following question:**

- What are the current barriers and facilitators for career advancement of women middle to senior management positions?
- How are current HRD programs addressing the issues faced by women executives?

### **Research Design and Method**

#### **Literature Review**

To identify relevant papers, we searched the database of Business Source Ultimate and PsycARTICLES and Google scholar. We used relevant keywords such as Women/Female executives/managers, Gender and Management, women and Management, etc. To maintain the quality of papers, we restricted our search to full text with reference available in peer reviewed journals and were limited to English language. The range of years was not bounded to avoid the bias or ignorance of relevant papers. Duplicate papers were discarded from the list of papers leading to 54 unique papers. The papers were filtered further by reading abstracts of each paper. This step helped in eliminating papers which were falling beyond our scope. Finally 32 articles were used for the literature review. This literature identified the facilitators and barriers to the career advancement of women middle managers to senior management positions. The review is done for both Western and Indian context.

In this review, we get some interesting understanding of forces at play. The literature review explored answers for following question: What are the factors which act as barrier and facilitators for women in middle management for their career advancement? Many studies have looked at the obstacles and advancement in career trajectory of women managers from various angles. There are few studies which also look at issues and challenges faced by middle women managers. The

review aimed to investigate reasons that women managers face difficulty to move to senior levels. Also, it would look at the literature to explore the facilitators or strategies which aided women to reach the top management level.

Our review finds that the barriers for women middle managers are gender stereotyping of the managerial role, gender bias at the workplace, lack of access to the informal network, social barrier and lack of opportunity. The facilitators, which aid women in career advancement, are their skills and social support.

The second phase of the study will look at the approaches adopted by companies to aid women executives. Secondary data would be collected to understand how the current HRD programs aimed at women executives cater to their professional growth. The sources include company websites, consulting firm websites, scholarly articles and magazine articles.

### **References:**

- Chawla, S., Chawla, S., Sharma, R. R., & Sharma, R. R. (2016). How women traverse an upward journey in Indian industry: multiple case studies. *Gender in Management: An International Journal*, 31(3), 181-206.
- Conger, J. (2010). Developing leadership talent: Delivering on the promise of structured programs. *Strategy-driven talent management: A leadership imperative*, 281-311.
- De Pater, I. E., Van Vianen, A. E., & Bechtoldt, M. N. (2010). Gender differences in job challenge: A matter of task allocation. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 17(4), 433-453.
- Lyness, K. S., & Thompson, D. E. (2000). Climbing the corporate ladder: do female and male executives follow the same route?. *Journal of applied psychology*, 85(1), 86.
- Swanson, R. A. (2001). Human resource development and its underlying theory. *Human Resource Development International*, 4(3), 299-312
- International Labour Organization (2015) , *Women in Business and Management: Gaining Momentum: Global Report* Retrieved from [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms\\_316450.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_316450.pdf)
- Retrieved from: [gtw3.grantthornton.in/assets/IBR-Women\\_in\\_business-Final.pdf](http://gtw3.grantthornton.in/assets/IBR-Women_in_business-Final.pdf)



# **Influence of Organizational Commitment and Subjective Well-Being on Work Engagement of Nurses**

**Lima Raj**

PhD Scholar, Department of psychology, Sree Sanakaracharya University of Sanskrit, Kalady, Ernakulam, Kerala

**Dr. K. Manikandan**

Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Calicut, Kerala

limaraj@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

Kerala is rich with well equipped, modern specialty hospitals. In addition, nurses from Kerala are highly popular across the globe for their skill and dedication to the nursing profession. Like any other industry, health sector is undergoing broadest set of changes and also facing severe competition in every aspect of its service and private health care institutions are indeed more concerned about profit as well. The development and maintenance of efficient work force is a major concern particularly in healthcare organizations. Nurses are considered as the backbone of any healthcare system for their honorable unparalleled service. Hence it is one of the basic prerequisite of organizational management of healthcare institutions to monitor and sustain the level of personal and organizational factors that has a direct impact on the quality of performance of nurses. The present study is undertaken to understand the influence of Organizational commitment and Subjective well-being on Work engagement of nurses. Data was collected from a total of 200 female nurses working at both government and private hospitals. Two-way ANOVA was used to examine the interaction effect of subjective well-being and organizational commitment on work engagement. The results revealed that work engagement is being significantly influenced by organizational commitment and subjective well being of female nurses.

## **From Zari Work To Zero Work- Unraveling The Crisis Of The Invisible Crafts Women Of The Zari Hub Of Bauria Area Of West Bengal.**

**Malinee Mukherjee,**

UGC-Senior Research Fellow, Women's Studies Research Centre, Calcutta University, Kolkata  
malinee.mukherjee@gmail.com

One of the most puzzling paradox of the economic trend in the recent years of India is the falling participation of women in the labour force despite the country's educational and economic growth. According to the current ILO estimate, the LFPR for women aged 15 and above shows a gradual decline from 31.2% in 2011-12 to 31.1% in 2013-14 before falling to 27.4% in 2015-16. Though there have been multiple explanations on the causality of these steep decline, some as positive some as negative, but this macro data reveals a hidden truth that somewhere, somehow there is a disturbing shift in the labour position and labour identity of the women of our country just like their male counterpart. And when this crisis of underemployment, unemployment or more correctly the crisis of livelihood that is embedded deeply in the daily domesticity of a so called home maker, comes into play then it problematizes the intermingling notion of their labour, class and gender identity. The present paper, is based on the concrete micro study of the lives of the particular group of home based women zari workers who have a specified location in the geographical, political, religious and economic stratum. More specifically it posits on a small scale in depth empirical study based on the primary observation of the purposively selected 52 households of women workers from the locality of Zari hub of Bauria area of Howrah, West Bengal.

### **Objectives**

Based on the narratives and every day realities of the women workers, two fold objectives have been framed that have an empirical as well as theoretical and political approach. The first objective is a feminist understanding of the trajectories of livelihood concern of the women zari workers of the Bauria area from post globalization to post demonetization. It will look into the effect of the market change and market failure not only on the overtly visible parameters of well being index but on the intimate contours of household relationship, kinship pattern, of power positions, of inner subjectivities and consciousness. The gender dimensions of household study of zari workers when situated in the larger structural analysis of livelihood crisis of piece rate zari industry have unleashed numerous labyrinth of power relations that are beyond the essentialized notions of third world women's economic marginality.

The second objective is to look into the invisibility and unrecognition of the women zari workers in comparison to the male workers. It is a feminist critique of the impact of women's consciousness towards the craft that fits seamlessly in their every day household chores of cooking, cleaning, washing and child caring. It will look into women's agency, entitlement and

bargaining power, and women's own perception towards their contribution in the household.

The politics of the domesticity of women's labour has been polemically dissected by Maria Mies, who showed that the social definition of women lace workers of Nasarpur as dependent housewives result in clubbing of the productive lace work in the casual parlance of leisure time activity, accounting for their dual exploitation by patriarchal and capitalist forces. While Mies has studied the interface between the dynamics of global capitalism and patriarchal ideology, my concern has been with the consciousness of the women crafts worker about their labour identity which ironically gets reaffirmed in the present livelihood crisis. These women can interestingly be called 'shadow workers' or the 'pseudo workers' those who remain silent in the darkness of domesticity invisible in the market far away from the active public male domain of mobility, collectivity and bargaining. They are not taken seriously in the official statistical record of informal workforce. Ironically they themselves consider them as home makers, but who contribute substantially in pulling their household out of poverty. The question of a separate labour identity and labour position of these women opens a very problematic discourse of feminist interpretation. As it is the men of the house whose work gives the identity to the entire household, including the women. In case of households based on zari work, it is the men who are taken as the official household head, as it is the men who are visible as working in a semi organized basis doing the craft of zari work, it is the men who work on a collective basis. It is the men, whose loss of livelihood results in newspaper headlines and scholarly debates. In this junction of visibility vs invisibility when comes the all-encompassing crisis of livelihood loss, the binaries of male and women workers gets somehow diluted. One of the primary area of intervention of the present work, is to highlight on the strategic change of the labour position of women zari workers compared to the male workers in the wake of retrenching zari work and diminishing wage. While men can opt for alternative livelihood like low skilled manual labour, or migrate elsewhere women in the 'patriarchal bargain' fail to do so. Both are the losers of the wake of market failure, but men are identified, while women are not.

### **Theoretical lens**

The present paper offers a seismic shift from the conventional neo classical understanding of labour behaviour as an utility maximizing factor which proclaims that individuals behave in similar manner in family, market and state rationally pursuing their self interest and that sexual division of labour as a simple outcome of rational choice and economic efficiency. Though recent neo classical theories suggest that varied social institutions mediate these individual choices, the present paper presents a break from the economic explanation of labour behaviour and the impact of unemployment on well being index. There have been multiple economic and psychological studies on the non pecuniary costs of loss of job, but the Feminist narratives of unemployment of the home based so called third world women' workers is a relatively unexplored terrain of studies. The theoretical lens through which the present paper is based on is Socialist Feminist analysis that will look into the livelihood crisis of women not merely as an economic reality, but as a cultural, ideological materiality that operates through multiple power grids. It will look into the women

workers and the household as the complex web of relations, where the individual entitlement and subjective position of each and every member gets refabricated over the time, presenting a departure from the Beckerian concept of household as a unitary, welfare maximizing economic unit. The gender relationships, the well being and happiness index and the relative contribution of each and every member will be examined through the prism of materiality of livelihood crisis. This analysis will be situated with wider debate of the interface between symbiotic link between capitalism and patriarchy raised by Heidi Hartmann, Maria Mies and Nancy Folbre to name a few. Sylvia Walby's notion of public and private patriarchy in conjunction with Maithreyi Krishnaraj's work on Women Craft Worker's will add on the critical appreciation of the paper.

### **Methodological note**

The present paper is broadly based on feminist epistemology, which aims to look into the lived experiences and the phenomenological aspects of the women zari workers from Feminist Standpoint perspective. As Sandra Hardings has pointed out of the 'epistemic privileges' of a marginal group in picturizing the nuances of their realities, the methodological aim of the present endeavor is to bring forth the 'own account' deliberation of the women workers as blatantly as possible. The present work being a Feminist analysis of the livelihood crisis in the context of women workers poses structural analysis of power, control and contestation that are mediated through multiple forces of immediate and outside control. The paper is based on 'testimony based' hypothesis testing. In other words, rather than relying on statistical correlations to support or reject the hypotheses about women's marginal labour position here an attempt is made on asking women for their own accounts of how the change in their labour positions are made and the impact it had on their lives. Based on semi structured in depth interview of 52 households of women zari worker that are purposively selected on the basis of snowball sampling along with the interview of male zari workers, survey of the area and visits to development agencies like the Municipal corporation, NGOs, and lastly on the basis of the meta analysis of the literature survey the Feminist understanding of the livelihood crisis of zari industry and its reconfiguration on the intra household dynamics are found out. Based on the women respondents narratives about the change in their economic contribution in the household along with the shifting economic position of men, the theoretical account of their lived realities are made by taking the note from Feminist Standpoint perspective. The subjective interpretation of the 'lived experiences of each respondent along with other household members helps in framing a myriad set of interlocking variables that influences the lives of women directly and indirectly.

The 'perception' of women respondents is correlated and contrasted with the perception of other significant family members to explore the underlying configuration of factors that gave rise to the opportunities and constraints that the women workers considered important like market forces, values, beliefs, norms, kinship pattern, family structure, stages of life cycle, educational background, mobility and access to market and public places, religious factors to name a few. Consequently along with women's personal testimonies, secondary information which helps to illuminate the deeper level of analysis was undertaken.

The present paper accounts on the observation, analysis and interpretation of the following key variables-

1. The trajectories of the income decline of women zari workers alongside the male workers.
2. Change in the quality of life and well being index along with the declining earning potential of women.
3. Shift in the labour position of women zari workers. Alternative livelihoods for home based women zari workers compared to male zari workers.
4. The change in the demand and supply side of zari market from post globalization to post GST and its impact on women zari workers.
5. Distinction in skill upgradation and enhancement opportunities of women and male zari workers.
6. Perception of women themselves about their pertinent contribution in the household along with the change in their earning capacity.
7. The varied entitlements and structures of constraints of women zari workers like personal entitlement ( age, religion, educational qualification, marital status), Family entitlement ( number age and occupation of family members) Health entitlement ( disease and disability if any) along with the intra household power dynamics.
8. Agency and autonomy of women zari workers compared to that of male zari workers in accessing. Visibility and recognition of women zari workers in relation to men zari workers. The structure- agency duality, the question of choice and choicelessness, of bargaining power and decision making.

To give a brief conclusion, the narratives of women workers in the light of livelihood crisis, presents a wide array of questions that are beyond simplistic deductions. The studies of these 'neo subaltern's can be interpreted variedly. It brings along the question of human agency vs subjectivity, of survival strategies vs increasing vulnerability, of new functioning vs depleting craft, of coping strategies vs irregular and uncertain income, of hope vs deprivation and destitution, of private vs public patriarchy and last but not the least of happiness vs endemic poverty and precarity.

# **Women In Masculine Jobs – Women’s Experiences In The Professional Selling Area**

**Manasi Vahia**

Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Deonar, Mumbai.

Mp2017mls005@tiss.edu.in & manasi\_vahia@rediffmail.com

## **Background**

Opportunities to enroll more women at work have found an economic agenda, social and developmental agenda. The Millennium Development Goals (Target no. 3 – Promote Gender equality and empower women), ILO’s Female labour force participation rates and the like have induced the various economies of the world to bring about infusion of women at the workplace, consecutively spurring the economies ahead. Despite of the initiatives pooled in by many nations and organizations with their women friendly policies, the gap between the anticipated and actual changes in the labour force participation rates across the world makes researchers speculate the causes. ILO’s report on Women at work, 2016 states ‘Overall change i.e. reduction in gender gaps in employment are virtually absent between 1995 and 2015.’

India is the world’s second most populous country. Out of this population, 48.5% comprises of women. The gender population gap starts at birth. For every 100 boys born nationally, 89 girls are born. Overall, the labour force participation rate for women is falling: from 37% in 2004-2005 to 28% in 2016. This implies that half of the potential talent base in India is under-utilized (Saadia Zahidi, 2010). With the given dynamics in economics of labour participation of women, it deems important to delve into the reasons of such a drop. Various studies point into a range of reasons that lead to a drop in participation by women in workforce (Rahul. L, Hema S, 2013, Sher Verick & Ruchika C., 2014). The relationship between women’s engagement in the labour market and broader development outcomes is complex. Women’s employment may be driven by necessity on the one hand, or be the result of increasing educational attainment, changing societal norms and available employment opportunities on the other (Ruchika Chaudhary, 2014). In general, when women do work, they tend to be engaged in low-paid and low productivity jobs (ILO, 2011). Thus, the widespread entry of women into the labour market is not always a desired situation since it may not lead to giving them an access to decent jobs. An analysis of 142 countries shows that women tend to be overrepresented in the lowest paid occupations (ILO, 2016).

Another shift that is observed owing to changing labour trends is more women entering occupations that were traditionally male dominated (Myron Gable, May 1987). Male dominated occupations are those that occupy 25% or fewer women (United States Department of Labor, Women’s Bureau). Alternatively, an ILO report on Women at Work, 2016 demonstrates in most of the countries analyzed, there has been little reduction in occupational segregation. Out of the occupational categories in the report, women entering the occupational categories of ‘Clerks and

service workers’ and ‘Shop and market sales workers’ has increased. This exhibits a space for women in the listed male dominated professions. The space created opens a box of opportunities as well as challenges. Professional selling posits a career for women wherein they can earn more, have a great deal of freedom and high level of training (Douglas L. Fugate, Philip J. Decker, Joyce J. Brewer). Challenges surfacing in the domain throw light upon few areas such as arrangements to be made for travelling (especially for married women with children), power sharing, tokenism, motherhood, sex role stereotyping and the like (Myron Gable, May 1987). Some other researchers also examine the role of organization’s HR policies and processes in not only hiring women but also retaining them (Douglas L Fugate, November 1988) This study intends to throw some light upon the women’s experiences of male dominated occupation of selling.

### **Objective**

Occupational segregation by sex occurs everywhere, causing labour market rigidity and economic inefficiency, wasting human resources, preventing change, disadvantaging women and perpetuating gender inequalities (Richard A., 2001). The purpose of this research work is to explore the work experiences of women in one such profession, namely Sales. The research will attempt to investigate professional selling as a viable career for women given the challenges and opportunities it bestows. The areas that will be examined include the reasons that the women interviewed chose the career, challenges and opportunities that the career per se puts forward to them and challenges and opportunities put forward by their immediate work environment, organizational policies and last but not the least the market itself. The purpose of this research is to investigate the issues faced by women in such a profession under study and the opportunities that await those that haven’t yet considered it as a profession.

### **Method**

An in depth interview with women currently in the profession of selling is proposed. The method suggested will enable to bring out the work experiences of women in the profession.

### **Keywords**

Women, Male dominated occupation, work experience sharing, challenges, opportunities, professional selling.

### **References**

- Dozier, R. (2017). Female Masculinity at Work: Managing Stigma on the Job. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 41(2), pp.197-209.
- Anker, Richard. 1997. “Theories of Occupational Segregation by Sex: An Overview.” *International Labour Review* 136 (315).
- Chaudhary, R. and Verick, S. (2014). Female labour force participation in India and

beyond. Geneva: International Labour Organization.

- Fugate, D., Decker, P. and Brewer, J. (1988). Women in professional selling: A Human Resource Management perspective. *Journal of Personal selling & sales management*, VIII, pp.33-41.
- Gable, M. and Reed, B. (1987). The current status of women in professional selling. *Journal of Personal Selling & Sales Management*, VII, pp.33-39.
- Olsen, Wendy, and Smita Mehta. 2006. "A Pluralist Account of Labour Participation in India." Working Paper Global Poverty Research Group.
- Saadia, Z. and Herminia, I. (2010). *The Corporate Gender Gap Report*. Geneva: World Economic Forum.
- Schwab, K., Samans, R., Saadia, Z., Leopold, T. and Ratcheva, V. (2018). *The Global Gender Gap Report*. World Economic Forum.
- Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, *Statistical Yearbook India 2016*, "Table 2.1 Area and Population by States (Census 2011)," (2016).
- Catalyst. *Quick Take: Women in Male-Dominated Industries and Occupations*. New York: Catalyst, May 30, 2017.
- **Webliography**
  - <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/in.html>
  - [https://www.dol.gov/wb/stats/nontra\\_traditional\\_occupations.htm](https://www.dol.gov/wb/stats/nontra_traditional_occupations.htm)
  - <http://savogroup.com/blog/women-in-sales-enablement-seema-tailor/>
  - <https://www.medreps.com/medical-sales-careers/top-women-in-medical-sales-be-prepared-for-challenges>



# **Young Women Workers in Textile and Garment Sectors - A Global Concern**

**Prof. N.Manimekalai**

Director and Head, Department of Women's Studies, Bharathidasan University, Tiruchirapalli,  
Tamil Nadu

nmanimekalai@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

Indian Labour market depends largely on textiles and garments sector next only to Agriculture. Textile plays a major role in Indian Economy and it contributes 14 per cent to industrial production and 4 per cent to GDP (ii) With over 45 million people, the industry is one of the largest source of employment generation in the country. The industry accounts for nearly 15 per cent of total exports( Technopak, Make in India, News articles, Ministry of Textiles, Aranca Research 2017). Given the continuous failure of monsoon, conversion of land for non-farm use, global players occupying the cultivable land to non-cultivable purpose, etc majority of the marginal and small farmers from rural area are being forced to leave in search of livelihood to urban areas. It is a distress migration and those who have left the villages often join the textile and garment factories. Tamil Nadu has the textile belt covering around more than six major cities including Tiruppur, Coimbatore, Erode, Karur, Dindigul, Madurai etc. Women aged 18–25 make up 80% of the factory workers in the global garment industry. Their long hours of hard work have helped to create booming economies and large export industries for countries like Bangladesh, Indonesia, Vietnam and China.(Melanie Scalfie, 2017) Both men and women work in such garment, knitting and spinning industries and there are different schemes to attract the less skilled women and girls. Though female labour force participation is on the decline since 2015, the textile sector continue to provide more employment for women (IndiaSpend 2016) . With such prospects, the dark side of the story is how the young women and girls are being exploited in the garment sector. A study was conducted on issues of adolescent girls in garment sectors in Tamil Nadu revealed that the girls are being brought right from their school going age and get registered under “Sumangali Scheme” or Mangalya Scheme, denoting the meaning of marriage. The gender question is that there is no such scheme for boys or male workers. The male workers have relatively better freedom in terms of mobility, freedom to exit etc. But girls are enrolled under a contract for three years and stay as residential workers, so that will be available for work at any time. There are various dynamics in the recruitment process and the girls are influenced by their peers and parents to join such work.( Manimekalai&Gayathri 2010) More than peer pressure, poverty, lack of belief in education particularly girls’ education, food insecurity and physical insecurity for the adolescent girls in the absence of parents, drop out from school due to non-availability of schools within the village, and above all the income and safe accommodation and food from the parental perspective. The study on the issues of Adolescent Girls and young women workers in Tiruppur garment sector conducted with 125 girls enrolled under the Sumagali scheme

revealed various issues the women workers faced at the work place and the health and psychological problems faced in terms of sexual exploitation , physical and mental torture, poor working conditions, no social security etc. The participants were working under the Sumangali or Camp Labour Scheme ( as currently referred to) whose economic and social background speaks volumes about their vulnerability. The garment sector cannot keep their eye on reducing the other input cost but only on Labour and hence, continuously research upon the cost reduction strategies, which could be possible only by various methods of labor exploitation. As Karl Marx pointed out there has always been a reserve army of labour and once the enrolled girls and women leave due to dissatisfaction of the working conditions, or marriage or health reasons, there is always a waiting pool of labour which is positively exploited by the Garment sector. There are different pattern of employment being offered to women and girls. (i) Daily commuting category where the transport is being run for about 50 Kms radius to pick the workers (ii) Residential workers where the young girls are being enrolled under Camp Labour scheme and remain as Apprentices not as laborers though they actually treated as workers and perform all work being done by adults and (iii) workers who migrated in families and all the family members being working in garment factories. The most vulnerable category is (ii) where there is lack of hold for parents on the nature of working conditions, payment, over time, and other kind of work that the employers demand. There is no information available for the girls about the payment details. The salary is being transferred to the parents directly. The young women and girls all over India and from dry districts of Tamil Nadu are the participants in the category (ii), with poverty being the main issue driven them to such work. Employers perceive young women as more productive in the types of jobs available in the export sector because of their supposed ‘nimble fingers’, their obedience and because they are less prone to worker unrest; the perception that they are better suited to tedious work; and their reliability and easiness to train relative to men Braunstein, E. (2000).. Young women are also perceived to be cheaper than men to employ because it is assumed they are less skilled, and not the primary earners in their households (Randriamaro (2006): Quoted in: Esplan, E., and Brody,A. (2007).

Interestingly enough, it was observed that the young women and girls are being enrolled as apprentices who are below 14 age and others are appointed as per the Factory Act. However, there is no transparency on the social security and safety net. No leave for accident or sick, and if taken leave, no wage. Three fourth of participants in the study, responded that have 100 percent preference to get back home, and around one fifth held a partial preference for the reasons that the economic necessity to support through their income. They do not get permanent employee status ever and that is the reason why the contract for three years is being made. Even if they continue for want of economic support, they will be absorbed as fresh labourers without counting their earlier three years service. The working conditions and work environment at the garment sector brings several health issues such as respiratory diseases, bronchitis and other infections. The working conditions, troubles and sexual favour demand from co –workers and others, sexual harassment etc force the women and girls suffer with mental and psychological health issues in the study area. Gita Menon,(2010) a clinical psychologist held in her article ‘Cracking under

stress<sup>1</sup> in Frontline on Oct 2010 that suppose a supervisor or floor manager abuses the girls working in garment sector in front of others, or they are called out at night for sexual exploitation, or so on, they could take sudden decisions not thought out earlier. The studies revealed that the major health problems among the garment workers were musculoskeletal disorder, cardiovascular, respiratory, gastrointestinal, gynecological, ophthalmological and nutritional problems and mental illness (Lillypet et al 2017). In the present study, as high as 72 per cent of them stated that this pressure often manifests in both verbal and physical abuse directed towards them. 12 per cent of the participants have reported to have longing for visiting home or missing their parental love/care that leads to Psycho social problems. Long working hours, especially for girls who have psychological problems associated with their menstrual cycles on the one hand and are forced to stand for long hours as part of their work on the other, can produce extreme physical exhaustion and stress. They suffered with depression, home sick, anxiety, emptiness, frustration etc. and do not cope up with the work demands of the factory. Such issues has resulted in behavioral change issues and finding asylum with male co workers and get into relationship which have further pushed the girls to vulnerability. The Overall Composite Labour Security Index scores stand at '0.22' which is graded as 'worst' indicating that the condition of Camp labourers has been poor without any security. The workers are in formal industry but get treated very much as casual/contract labourers, denied and deprived off getting the legally entitled minimum wages and statutory benefits. Girls have been taught to believe that cuts and pains are normal and part of the learning process. Nearly one third (32 percent) do not have first aid facilities in their factories in which more than one fourth of them (28 percent) do not have any awareness on the components of 'safety equipments'. Concerns of women and young adolescent girls, their workplace safety, security, health and psycho-social needs and interests have remained marginal in this study. Girls are prone to work-related illnesses and disorders which include: headaches and stress-related fatigue, back ache, irregular menstrual cycle, repetitive strain and injury, loss of weight, respiratory problems, urinary infections which is a work place hazard. The freedom to have personal space and communication with the family members and friends is restricted to the female laborers working as 'Camp labourers'. Even while going out for purchase of personal things, they are closely monitored and close scrutiny is the order of the day. Still worse, there is no mechanism for the workers to air their grievances. The workers have no forum to express their undue wage cuts, denial of leave, denial of treatment etc... It is found in this study that devaluation of girl's education, gender disparity in education, challenges in accessing vocational trainings or skills and structural issues in skill building of rural poor especially adolescent girls increases their vulnerability in labour market. In this study, the labour market trend in the context of Camp Labour Scheme, clearly, reflect social attitudes that consider women's work to be inferior to that of men. Gender bias which is the learned outcome of socialization in family where the society played a part in influencing the factory environment in the textile industry. Unhealthy and unsafe working conditions, discrimination at work, gender-based violence at work and living space are complex issues, rooted in gendered power relations. Gender discrimination in wages has been justified for loss of productivity due to absenteeism for child and elder care and other domestic responsibilities and reproductive roles. The crowding of

young and female workers allowed employers to extend and employ patriarchal controls in the name of 'protection or safety' over employees. These included camping workers within factory compounds, exclusive and separate regulations and restrictions with regard to working hours, and leaving company campus, reward and punishments systems, and the use of male supervisors to oversee women/adolescent girls and to monitor the completion of assigned tasks, which often are not as per the regulations of factory act or any other labour regulations.

Camp labourers languish in low skill, poorly paid work casualised and marginalised in production process. The general perception on women's work is that apart from their nimble fingers, women's expertise does not lie in skilled operations. Diversification of economic opportunities for women workers need not necessarily have positive implications for their socio economic and psychological wellbeing, a case in point is various schemes like 'Sumangali, Submangala, Thirumagal Thirumana Thittam' (Marriage Assistance Scheme) using regressive 'customs and traditions', which attracts adolescent girls. The scheme under which the adolescent girls are being engaged in the labour market has not been addressed by the State on the reasons that it offers employment to millions of girls who hail from extremely poverty ridden households. Hence it was all advocated to regularize with social security. But the practical conditions from both the demand and supply sides are different where not all the women wish to continue to work nor the employers depend on such workers as they have the surplus labour under reserve army category. With the public hearing being done by the State Commission for Women, Commissioner of labour assessed the situation and some regularization has been introduced. Thanks to several NGOs who are working in different regions to fight of the rights and able to influence through judiciary better working conditions and wage payment. But the exploitation of different forms continue to happen behind the curtain.

## **Unorganized Women Workers and Cooperative Movement**

### **Dr. Medha Purao Samant**

Managing Trustee, Annapurna Mahila Mandal, Mumbai; Secretary, Annapurna Mahila Cooperative Credit Society Limited, Pune  
dr.medha@annapurnapariwar.org

### **Abstract**

Unorganised sector contributes to India's national income in a large scale. There are mainly women workers in this sector who work hard to make the ends meet for their families. They do not earn fixed wages or any social security. They are uneducated, many a time unskilled labour hence fetch little income as compared to the hard work that they put in.

Their interests are not protected by their employers if any. Most of such women have to buy and sell their services or labour at a poor price. They do not have any bargaining power due to the fact that they have to take home their daily wages at the end of every day.

Cooperative movement is a very good tool for such women who are equal in many ways like low / no skill, no bargaining power, no social security etc.

By coming together they can work on a common agenda to get a better wage / profit out of their labour / services. To have a better bargaining power and some social security.

A good cooperative organisation without any political interference and with a good leadership can work towards a better wage, bargaining power, skill improvement and social security for its members.

- Unorganised sector cooperatives can make a credible alternative to private sector manufacturing / service units.
- Key challenges for workers' cooperatives
- Key factors which make cooperatives successful

Annapurna Pariwar is a group of 5 Developmental Organisations working in Pune and Mumbai since 1993 and covering 1000 slum pockets. Its main aim is to empower poor women and their families in terms of finance, education, health, etc.

Annapurna Mahila Mandal, Mumbai a Charitable trust was set up by Padmashree Prematai Purao and Com. Dada Purao in the year 1975, which was the International Year for Women. Padmashree Prematai Purao is a freedom fighter from Goa, was a leading woman activist in the sixties and a recipient of many national and international awards.

Com. Dada Purao was a Bank Employees Leader.

18 years later the daughter of Padmashree Prematai Purao and Com. Dada Purao, Dr. Medha Purao Samant set up Annapurna Mahila Mandal, a Charitable Trust in Pune in 1993.

She formed a group of 9 vegetable vendors who were borrowing from the private moneylenders at exorbitant rates of interest. They were under the clutches of local moneylenders in spite of presence of many banks and financial institutions in Pune.

She gave the initial capital of Rs. 9000/- as the first loan to the members of the first group of borrowers in Pune.

Annapurna Pariwar started in the course of time a package of various services for the benefit of the slum dwellers, which are completely need-based.

Annapurna Pariwar has 5 independent Developmental Organizations working under it. The various projects which render a package of diverse services to the urban slum dwellers are run under these 5 organizations. Thus, Annapurna Pariwar endeavors to enrich the lives of the poor through a comprehensive developmental approach.

1. Annapurna Pariwar Organization & Services
2. Annapurna Mahila Multi State Co-op Credit Society Ltd. - Micro Finance
3. Annapurna Pariwar Vikas Samvardhan. - Micro Insurance
4. Vatsalyapurna Service Coop Society. - Day Care Center
5. Annapurna Mahila Mandal, Pune. - Vidyapurna Project, Dada Purao Research & Training Institute
6. Annapurna Mahila Mandal, Mumbai - Working Women's Hostel

1) Annapurna Mahila Multi State Co-op Credit Society Ltd. is a Multi State Credit Co-op Society giving small repetitive loans to poor self-employed women and men by forming their Joint Liability Groups (JLG). The organization gives microfinance without any security or guarantee and enjoys a 100% recovery rate.

2) Microfinance Loans are given to the members for business, education, house repairs, asset creation & old debt repayment.

The loan size ranges between - 10,000/- & 1,00,000/-

The SME- I Loans are given to graduated Members for building houses or business expansion.

The loan size ranges between - 1,10,000/- & 2,00,000/-

The SME-II loans are given to graduated members for business expansion.

The loan size ranges between - 2,10,000/- & 5,00,000/-

Annapurna has generated the savings of members on which they are paid interest.

Annapurna Pariwar believes that microfinance is the most important need of the poor. Microfinance includes services like micro loans, micro savings, micro insurance and Adharpurna old age savings Programm

In addition to microfinance Annapurna Pariwar has been imparting training in financial literacy to its members. Annapurna Pariwar educates clients in a consistent and creative way.

2) Annapurna Pariwar Vikas Samvardhan is a not-for-profit company, owned and run by the members of Annapurna Mahila Multi State Co-op Credit Society Ltd.

Annapurna Pariwar Vikas Samvardhan insures them against death, accidents and health hazards. Every borrower and her family is insured for Rs.72,000 for health problems plus on death, a loan write-off and Rs.15,000 assistance for the family. On the death of a family member of the borrower, an emergency relief of Rs.3,000 is given. This is against a contribution of Rs.675 per annum, per family.

Annapurna Pariwar has launched a long term savings program called "Adharpurna" for its members from 1st April 2016.

This will be for the old age security of its members.

This program will ensure a regular payout to its members when they become 65 years old till the end of their lives.

3) Vatsalyapurna Service Coop Society runs Day Care Centers for the children of domestic servants and other self-employed women in slums.

4) Annapurna Mahila Mandal, Pune implements Vidyapurna Project. It gives scholarships to children of single mothers (widows/destitutes/divorcees) so that these children can pursue their education and have a better future.

Dada Purao Research & Training Institute is being run in the name of our founder Late Com. Dada Purao. This Institute undertakes research studies and various activities exclusively for promoting and encouraging Students & Researchers for studying Micro-finance & Micro-Insurance. It also conducts lectures, seminars, and workshops for disseminating information and knowledge on subjects related to microfinance. It also publishes books.

5) Annapurna Mahila Mandal, Mumbai the first organization in Annapurna Pariwar runs a Working Women's Hostel at Vashi, New Mumbai.

# **The Labour Side of the Story: Informalization and New Forms of Mobilization of Women Workers**

**Meera Velayudhan**

Policy Analyst, RULSG, CDS, Trivandrum

meera\_velayudhan@hotmail.com

## **Introduction**

In the globalizing circuit of capital, less attention has been paid to the labour side of the story, both in academic and policy levels. Millions of workers in Asia are making a living at different points of this global circuit of capital. In a way, it also points to the trajectory of development and labour and the specific ways in which labour struggles developed, post 1980s in particular, as in India. There are fewer chances of the 'traditional industrial working class' emerging and at the same time, people cannot survive without relating to capitalist labour in some form or the other. This process is not a voluntary process but a coercive one, dispossessing them in varied ways of their traditional common resources- be it land or skills, knowledge, with the tertiary labour expanding, in particular through women's participation. The social cost of labour falls on the individual workers, as the employers do not bear costs of health, unemployment and by bringing in new labour norms and regimes, make huge profits. In the neoliberal sweatshops, characterised by informalization of labour, vulnerability, insecurity, with low wages, lack of basic facilities, lack of individual and collective rights, is a contrast to the organized working class. It is not that there are no labour laws or regulations covering workers, they remain limited and workers do not have power and institutional tools to protect themselves. The process is also highly gendered. Workers are also fragmented, depriving them of the power and means to protect themselves. Hence workers struggles are also no longer following the usual model of working class mobilization. They are emerging more as social movements of the working poor in diverse forms, in workplaces, urban centres- a contrast to the tripartite industrial working class, trade unions (institutionalized labour) and worker based political parties- almost a kind of 'universal' model.

## **State, Capital and Changing Labour Movement**

The post liberalization period in India saw shifts in the labour landscape: privatization, deregulation, closure of public sector industries and closure of sunset industries- base of trade unions in formal sector, growth of high technology driven industries owned by transnational corporations. Its key features were contractualisation and informalization through subcontracting and casualization of labour (Harris White, Gooptu, 2001). The 1980s saw widespread industrial strikes and unrest in public and private sector in the face of changing industrial relations. More decentralized forms of bargaining began to emerge end 1980s and also newer forms of unions in major industrial towns such as Bombay (Mumbai), Chennai, etc. Diverse regional labour management arrangements too arose. These led to decline in strength of the traditional political



party affiliated trade unions (Bardhan 2001) and opening of spaces for new forms of unions in the informal unorganized sector (Mohanty, 2008). Studies pointed to possibilities of organising across the ideologically divided labour constituencies (Sobin George, Shalini Sinha,) and 1982-2003 saw newer organizations such as SEWA, AICCTU, LPF, representing regional labour constituencies of political parties and NGOs, while varied unionization among permanent (West Bengal) and contractual labour (Haryana, UP, Delhi) too were noted.

The 1980-1990s impact of globalization saw changes in relations between state, capital and labour owing to withdrawal of state from its redistributive role, increasing repressive labour policy enactments, struggles of workers, weakening of the of labour movements relations with Left governments and parties (RoyChowdhury, 2003). At the same time, the working class movement responded by building broader coalitions and partnerships to impact social policy- Committee of Public Sector Trade Unions (CPSTU), Joint Action Front of HMS, AITUC, CITU centred in Bangalore (Shyam Sundar, 2006). Co-ordination committees of labour unions at sector levels and platform for organized, unorganized, agricultural labour to fight privatization and anti labour policies were also forged. Post 1990s, there were all India strikes almost every year. Un affiliated trade unions too formed a federation of New Trade Union Initiative (NTUI) at enterprise levels, challenging the product market competition as argument to cut down costs. (Mohanty, 2009). Conflict of interests between unorganized and organized workers in this federation was cited by a study (RoyChowdhury, 2003), and actions were directed more at policy changes and state action. Denial of trade union rights and drive for labour flexibility through contract labour were the main reasons for labour struggles and organization in the post reform period (Sundar, 2006). Resisting anti-labour measures (retrenchment, VRS schemes) at micro-levels were less successful (Hensman, 2001). Overall in the labour movement, there as a shift in emphasis to social security and labour welfare, recognition of scheme based workers, for skill based work opportunities, etc. Firm level struggles extended to automobiles, aviation, electronics, food products, garments- sectors exposed to global market fluctuations. Outsourcing of production had also led to the entry of diverse socio-political and religious institutions ( Church, Kudumbasree, Panchyats) in the mediation between capital and labour in the post reform period ( Neethi P, 2008, 2012, 2014)) in recruiting, controlling, managing labour, as in Kerala. These have led to powerlessness of workers but also subtle forms of resistance and forging of solidarities across units by women. The Unorgnaized sector workers associations with regional and global affiliates, emerged as a strong lobby and movement, leading to the Unorganized Sector Workers Social Security Bill enacted in 2008 (Mohanty, 2009)

### **Social Protection, Shift in Politics of Labour -Kerala**

Historically, in the context of Kerala, through mobilization-electoral and mass struggles- and forging of a broad based alliance of poor peasants, agricultural labor and workers into a political constituency, combined with state led redistributive programs- land reforms and formalization of labor relations-provided the basis for Kerala agrarian transition and protective labour legislation, particularly for the traditional industries- the agro-processing coir and cashew-industries in the

1970s against mechanization and decentralization of production, the expansion of public and co-operative sectors, minimum wage law, statutory bonuses in industry, institutionalizing collective bargaining. Later, comprehensive welfare measures extended to agricultural workers and to informal sector- construction, beedi, fisherfolk, headload workers- an extensive public distribution (food), health care, education as part of 'social development'. A decline in militancy and state mediated solutions to problems in the last decade- was evident in the historically volatile Kuttanad (witnessing only two major actions by KSKTU in 1982,1997) and Palghat areas (Velayudhan, 2016), although union membership did not decline. The coir workers in Alappuzha, in the face of relocation of traditional industries to low wage areas in Tamil Nadu, settled for a comprehensive restructuring plan involving price deregulation, mechanization, extension of co-operative sector and skill development.- termed as a 'social consensus project', to 'reorient mass movements to participate in a strategy for expanding the production base itself' (Isaac, TM & Mohan Kumar, 1991).

Welfare funds which only the toddy tappers enjoyed since 1969 as part of their role in early radicalization, was extended in 1977- as the Kerala Labour Welfare Fund- to plantations, small factories, shops, co-operative institutions in a changed political environment with split in trade unions along political lines, witnessing unionization rivalries in informal sector in particular. Public policy in support of the poor- unique – arose in 1980s in the form of welfare funds covering headload workers (urban), fish workers, artisans, handloom workers, motor transport, clerks working with lawyers, also the sectors where women workers predominate such as coir and cashew. In the 1990s, seven more welfare funds were added, in the form of collective care arrangements - an institutional model of collective contributions by workers, by the employers (a statutory requirement in most cases) and the state, ensuring some social security at the end of the working life. Where a welfare fund did not provide old age security, pension fund allocations were made in the budget itself (Kannan, 2001, 2002.). Despite this achievement, a majority of workers in the informal sector remain outside the coverage of welfare funds. The low share of funds is glaring in the case of agricultural workers where women's work participation rates are higher. Where unions play a role in entry into the labour market, employers sometimes collude with unions to restrict number of registered workers, with a section of unregistered workers, excluded from welfare funds.

Alongside the institutionalisation of major trade unions as political entities, other forms of organisations emerged since 1980s. This has led to a range of localised discourses within these social and cultural organisations, NGOs, women's collectives, co-operatives, institutions of labour mediations even as the meta narratives shift. This points to a shift in the politics of labour and the language of class and since the People's Planning Campaign for democratic decentralisation since mid 1990s, led by Left, CPI- M in particular, agency has moved away from the trade unions to a plurality of organisations and serving a range of objectives, but linked with local governance. There is a shift away from exclusive collective bargaining by workers to collective social activity, eg kudumbashree, neighbourhood groups such as ayalkootam, MNREGA forums and other forms

of associational activities. Identities have shifted beyond that of workers to that of citizens and involve a range of rights be it as women or as governmental categories such as SC, with the neighbourhood and local as the axis. Caste and Community forums have also transformed, playing a more modern social and political role in the lives of workers, union members, party activists or office bearers, impacting political mobilisation and shaping the multiple identities of workers, their lifeworlds and aspirations. The sole emphasis on class has been replaced by a governmental discourse on development, initiated by the People's Planning Campaign in mid 1990s, with notions of "development, self reliance, individual capacities, collective local response and empowerment to address opportunities and challenges." etc., replacing the same.(Velayudhan,2016).

### **Liberalization and the enterprising self**

An illustration of this self governing citizen and enterprising self extended to labour and is highlighted in a study of retail shopping malls in Calcutta, how this reshapes individual subjectivities and where workers seek individualized responses and personalized strategies to systemic or structural related problems of the work place and economy, somewhat negating the role of state in public policy which gives employers an opportunity to abdicate its responsibility to workers and their wellbeing. Limited number of studies exist on individual identity of such workers, subjectivity, social and political perceptions as part of neo-liberalism and enterprise culture (Gooptu, 2009). This includes cultivation of personality traits and self presentation and communication in an increasingly feminized sector-where embodied performance and commodification of the workers body- controlled by the employer- are part of the enterprise culture. The worker, facing an insecure and unprotected labour market and newer forms of socialization at the work place, turns into a neoliberal individualized self responsible for her own self presentation, self management and self advancement. However, the neoliberal subjects have diverse identities, depending on their location: caste, community, region, space and through the specific forms of gendering and the nature of the public sphere. These impact the ways in which the workspace is experienced. The political economy of workspace in Kerala, in terms of presence and absence of certain work spaces and politically in terms of experiences of unionization and organization, have a different history in Kerala. Gender division of labour within the family and how domestic and workplace intersect with each other need to be considered. How women workers look at social change, what they wish to talk about and what is significant for them, how they perceive their own spaces: their everyday life, how they experience caste, and multiple oppression within workspace, are important areas of discussion and enquiry. (Jenny S, 2012)

Studies suggest the links made between the local and the global by extending the focus of cross border production circuits to the hinterlands within a nation. A study of the cashew nut processing industry in Kerala pointed to the network of clandestine home based cashew processors, illustrating the less visible local nodes of global cashew circuit. Also explored are the limited options and choices of informal workers owing to gender, health, age and financial liabilities. Few studies have looked at conditions of labour and gender relations in the commodity chains such as

one on Knitwear industry in Tiruppur (Heyer, 2013) while others have argued that sites such as the home need to be considered in terms of their role in shaping the dynamics of the chain and studies on circuits need to go beyond the production units (Kuzhiparambil,Asha, 2016).

The retail sector has been cited as a booming sector by studies and Calicut has been listed among the fifty cities of organized retail boom. The retail sector drew low income, low education and low skill workers seeking employment (Shabnam and Paul, 2008). Few studies on political economy of space address the process of urbanization and the spatiality of labour and women's work. In Kozhikode, for example, the labour came from the peripheries of the city or when the city expanded, they were forced to move out of the city to newly formed working class settlements, many pushed out of their own land to rented accommodation, to areas resembling working class ghettos. The new upper middle class, gulf migrants occupied the city spaces. The new spaces of consumption are also the new spaces of labour. Some of the women workers came from nearby districts such as Idukki, according to sales girls who lived in hostels provided by employers of Kalyan Silks and Silky Mall. (Jenny S,2012)

A few narratives from this study highlight the lifeworlds and work of informality.

Fareeda was working in a small retail shop and had lost her job. Her mother had undergone treatment for cancer and they had been living in their sister's place for the medical purposes. Fareeda's mother was a domestic helper Fareeda's mother had three daughters and Fareeda is the youngest one. Fareeda's father left the family and eloped with another woman when Fareeda was born. She has never seen her father and doesn't wish to see him. Her mother brought up all of them by going for domestic help. Her sisters were married at an early age. The eldest one is not in touch with them anymore. Fareeda and her mother were staying with her sister and brother-in law. As Fareeda put it :“ it was really difficult for Umma to manage the house alone. Brother in law rarely used to give us anything for the expenses. Umma had to work hard to bring us up ,I passed SSLC and was confused what to do. One day, on the way back from market, I met one of Umma's friend, a man who used to arrange domestic helpers to the nearby households. He suggested Umma to send me to this new shop in Mittayitheruvu.. ‘She is anyway doing nothing in the house, she might as well go there, simply stand there for a while and earn a little money also’ he said.”

I was 15 then. I used to work in the shop for more than 15 hours in some days. I was close to everyone in the shop and I really liked being there. After school, shop was something which brought me a lot of friends. I never wished to go back home. I used to reach home around 8'o clock. My sister switches off the light at 8'o clock saying that she doesn't have money to pay for electricity. Umma comes back from work and sleep by then..... My brother-in-law used to disturb me a lot. My sister thinks I like that man too. I hate that man. We only had a bedroom and a kitchen...Umma and I used to sleep in the kitchen. He sometimes used to come and put his hand around me while sleeping. I did not know how to resist. My sister knew about it.... We left. I have asked for some money from the owner and paid the security for a rented house. We moved in there after a while.”

Fareeda's mother explained the reason why she chose to stay with the brother in law. "It was difficult for me to lead a life without a man. I thought of marrying my eldest daughter to a man who can protect and assist us. But he turned out to be a complete jerk. He comes home drunk and accuse me of sleeping with other men. He doesn't like me going out and working. He says I go out to seduce men. 'Would you do that if I were your father-in-law' I ask him. It is when he crossed the limits we decided to leave for my daughters sake. But now I am weak. I need his help with the hospital. He is the only man in the family". The son in law's mother belonged to the Mukkuva Muslim fishing caste.

At the Penkootum (ref) office, were Shoshamma and her mother Mary. Mary is around 80 and Shoshanna around 50. Her daughter is a sales girl. Mary was a domestic helper. Shoshamma, a cleaning staff of one of the shopping complexes in Calicut City. Shoshanna was thrown out of her job for asking for a hike in her salary.

"I used to clean the latrine with my hand when it was blocked. They used to give me Rupees 1000 per month. When I asked them to increase a little, they asked me to leave."

Shoshamma and her mother are converted Christians. Her daughter had finished graduation through the distant education system and now works as a sales girl in one of the retail shops. When the meeting took a little longer time, she kept worrying about getting late to the church.

"Not that, I believe in church or anything. If I attend all the gatherings, church would help me to get my daughter married. So at least till then I have to attend all the prayer meetings".

A sales man in one of the small retail shops in Calicut mentioned how the women of Mittayitheruvu are from 'abnormal' families, where the men from normal families would never send their women to work in such a set-up. They find that the big malls are relatively secure compared to the open-spaces of Mittayitheruvu.

The work spaces are replete with stories of exploitation.

Yes, we have to punch in when we come in the morning, sometimes even if the bus they send is late, we are marked late. We have to punch before going to the toilet, and punch when we come back. It takes 5 minutes to reach the ground floor where the machine is kept, and this five, ten minutes are put together to make us work an extra day. Sometimes, the machine has technical errors and we are forced to work one more extra day.

We get 10 minutes lunch break and 10 minutes to go to the washroom, but if we are dealing with a customer we are not supposed to leave them. Sometimes I hold my pee for so long that, it is difficult to smile at the customer and when they leave, the HR manager comes and scolds me. It is all about performance you know, we just have to smile and please them, no matter if your kids are sick and hospitalized, no matter if your back hurts and you want to sit down somewhere- we are expected to act like machines.

This bastard owner, who watches us from Dubai through his Computer. They have fixed camera everywhere, they watch us everytime, if we sit down for a second also, he calls up in the extension and abuses us”

“Have you ever questioned this?”

“What if they ask me to leave? Whoever questioned it, had to leave” (Jenny S, 2012)

According to the Kerala Shops and Establishment Act, none of them are supposed to work for more than 10 hours including over time, for which they should be paid double the amount. They are entitled to take at least 4 days holidays a week, excluding maternity leaves and four casual leaves. All these laws are violated.

Women began to move into the textile retail sector from the 1990s, replacing the men who left for daily wage work which was more remunerative. The market trend also favoured women workers as they targeted the female customers. A study of the textile sales sector in Trivandrum corporation (PE Usha [www.cds.ac.in/krpcds/report/UshaP.E.pdf](http://www.cds.ac.in/krpcds/report/UshaP.E.pdf)) held that in the three different categories of shops studied, 90% of the sample of women workers interviewed in one category belonged to OBC community and 10% to Nair community, with over 90% being in the age group 18-22 years and the rest 22-25 years age group. 70% were SSLC, 20% PDC, 10 % without SSLC education. 20% were Tamil speaking. All were unmarried and average family size was at 10. Salaries ranged from above Rs. 2000 (for 10% of the workers), about 40% receiving wages between Rs. 1000-2000, and 50% earning below Rs.1000 per month. The average years of work was 2.5 years .

In another category, 90% of sample workers were Nairs, 10% were Ezhavas, majority in 18-22 age group, 40% were above SSLC, 30% below SSLC and 10% PDC and above. All were unmarried and received wages below Rs.2000 per month. The average service period stood at 3.5 years. The average family size stood at 11. In the third category of shops studied, 30% were Christian, 10% Muslim and rest OBC, Nair, SC. 40% were below 18 years of age, 40% 18-22 years and 22% above 22 years age. 50% were below SSLC educated, 20% above SSLC, 30% having PDC. 80% were unmarried, 20% married and with average family size of 9. About 50% received above Rs.1000 salary and rest below Rs.1000 per month as salary. The average service period was 2.3 years.

Among all the three categories of shops, 40% sample of women workers save a little (gold), 16.6% save through chitti companies, 6.6% have postal savings, 3% have more than one form of savings. Women work longer hours than male workers, earn lower wages, have few toilet facilities and other breaks than men, and travel ( by bus) longer distance than men for work. 75% women stayed in rented houses, 8% owned houses, 7% stayed in houses of relatives. Most wished to continue working and none who quit working, got another job. Over 86% got the jobs through contacts while 13% got employment through advertisements. No increments are paid as per law as minimum wage act is silent on yearly increments. ( check-any updates?) No contract or

employment orders are signed. Women interviewed were insecure not only at job level but were insecure about life in general. Families too, although aware of their insecure work conditions, sexual harassment during travel, were generally insensitive or scolded them for returning late from work (Ibid).

### **Women Organizing**

The 1990s saw a shift in the nature of the Left women's organization and movement. A movement that was dominated by working class (coir, cashew workers predominating-predominantly women) and agrarian labour, began to transform, from mid 1990s, with the democratic decentralization of local governance and the emergence of newer forms of collectives, new local womens leadership- elected panchayat members who came from varied backgrounds, from literacy movement, from youth movement or educated women from political party families. Fewer women from the women's organization were put up as candidates for the local bodies elections (Velayudhan, 2000). This process was integral to the shift in politics of labour-from a sole focus on class to wide range of objectives, involving collectives, focusing on the local. Given this context, the earlier organic link of the trade unions with the local, (eg ward committees) and including civic issues, does not prevail anymore. The 1990s also witnessed new social movements of dalits and tribals and the emergence of a range of women's groups, issue based, that began to question the nature of development and lack of inclusive growth, despite many positive human development indicators. Besides, new social movements, such as Chengara land struggle, were in conflict with some of the existing trade unions. It was only post 2003-4, that civil society groups, including women's groups began to engage with local governance institutions. Labour itself remained an area of lesser concern, although there was a proliferation of studies on women's work in Kerala since then.

Among the early forms of organization of women workers was the Penkoottu, as early as 2005 in Kozhikode- when men working in the shopping complexes began to be replaced by women workers and sales women from small shops at Mittayitheruvu got together to discuss their everyday issues. Viji, its leader and Secretary Penkoottu, who had earlier worked with Anweshi, recalls that the Asangaditha Meghala Thozhilali Union was formed around the discussions on unorganized sector social security bill when a woman worker intervened to say that she did not know what was being discussed.

“ What I immediately need is a toilet in my shopping complex. I hold my pee for hours. To reach the common toilet in bus stand i have to spend Rs.10 every time. I get 3000 per month. Am left with very little money after spending so much on transportation. Can we discuss that?”.

This gave rise to the right to toilet strike. Only Silky complex had a pay and use toilet used by many women workers who travelled by bus to use the facility. Women's march in the city for public toilets led to Silky complex closing down its new toilet. Job security was the next issue to be taken up involving a woman sweeper in Silky complex who was paid Rs. 1000 per month, of which Rs.200 was paid to the corporation which collected the waste. As her husband was

hospitalized and in ICU, she could not manage with her wages, she spoke to the employer about the Rs. 200 cut by corporation and the employers suggested she take a few days off. She did not get her job back although she had been working there for a decade. Penkootu intervened and she received some compensation (Jenny S,2012). Another struggle was that of sales girls of a shopping mall- following the news of RP mall shutting down, without any notice to the workers. To their surprise, the women workers found that the owner was from a Delhi group/company. The male workers, some who belonged to traditional unions, warned the women from taking any action and family members too objected, but the women refused to move out of the complex without compensation.

Penkootu organized on other demands such as safety in public spaces by forming groups to prevent sexual harassment of women on the streets and specific shops or companies. In March 2014, struggle for right to sit was organized, giving textile shop owners time to respond positively. The women of Kalyan Sarees, Thrissur joined AMTU in December 2014, six women punished and transferred to distant places for having led the struggle without notice or consent. They were prevented from entering shop premises and threatened with suspension, leading to an indefinite strike in January 2014.

### **Supplyco Women Agitate**

About 30 women involved in packaging of products at various Kerala Civil Supplies (Supplyco) outlets in Kozhikode launched a token strike at the regional office of Supplyco in Kozhikode district, the demands including implementation of minimum wages. 36 women work on contract basis at 12 Supplyco outlets in the state. Supplyco refuse regular payments arguing that it could not afford more than two packers per outlet. “There are four of us working in the packaging section in every outlet but only two get wages, which we divide among ourselves. We have been included in Employees Provident Fund (EPF), but we have to pay to the EPF only once in two months.” A woman worker from the Peoples Bazaar outlet in Kozhikode said, ‘I joined Supplyco 20 years ago, there are people with around 30 years experience as well. When we joined, the wages were paise seven per packet, whatever the size and weight, and now it is 50 paise.that is the increase in 30 years.usually, we take home not more than 2500 per month.but under the new rules, we need not be paid unless the packet we made is sold, and the wages come down if packet is not sold. If business is low at Supplyco, our wages automatically go down.” Supplyco outsourcing the packing of spices such as fenugreek, cumin, mustard – the items packaged in small quantities and many packets can be made from just one kilogram of each item. This has further affected the wages of women packers.

The washer women who were evicted from Muthalakkulam 21 years ago under conditions that they would be provided appropriate housing, live in a dilapidated school building in West Hill. That they do not even have proper toilet facilities adds to their misery.The march led by Penkootu president P.Viji, warned the authorities of more protests if the problems of these women are not solved at the earliest.A saleswoman, who was dismissed from a popular textile



outlet in Kozhikode, without following proper procedures, too joined the protest demanding justice. The strike organized by Asanghatita Meghala Thozhilali Union-AMTU, registered as a trade union in January 2016(The Hindu, 25 Feb, 2016).

### **Nurses Assert**

Although public health care system expanded since 1960s as universal health care in Kerala, with liberalization, from mid 1980s, a profit driven private sector began to surpass the government, with single doctor clinics and small nursing homes giving way to large hospitals. In a highly competitive industry, strategies for management of revenue and cost reduction ( since low cost health care was available in well spread out government hospitals),led to cuts in nurses salary for cost reduction and profits.

Although nurses are skilled workers, this is not recognized by the industry. The presence of community organizations as employers, values in workplace such as nobility and service were promoted through socialization by family and church. The principles of ‘moral economy’ gender and religion defined the subjectivity of nurses for long. Although private hospitals came under the Industrial Disputes Act, an IRC was set up only in 2012, as nurses were not unionized.

With the change in the social profile of the nurses in recent years, the influence of the community organizations began to wane and the United Nurses Association (UNA) gained over other unions, expanding in central and north Kerala, drawing its state level leadership from nurses who had earlier experiences in student and youth organizations such as DYFI. Strikes were organized in different hospitals since 2010, initially led by voluntary organizations and later with the organization of nurses under UNA, it also began to engage with unemployed, apprentice and nursing students. A Nurses Parents Association was also formed do address educational loan repayment issues collectively.

A disturbing aspect is the inadequate presence of women in leadership despite their large scale participation in struggles. Family constraints and lack of leave from duty, limit their participation in meetings. Their low visibility in social media debates during the recent struggle, points to male dominance in discussions. Also, like the traditional unions, the women’s organizations also did not come forward to support the nurses and their strikes in particular. The nurses strike energized other workers such as teachers in unaided private schools and employees of private financial institutions to forms independent unions in Kerala. (Ref. BL Biju, Angels Are Turning Red, EPW, Vol. 48, Issue No. 52, 28 Dec, 2013)

### **Discussion**

About creating a social floor-

1. Minimum social security
2. Minimum conditions of work. (Kerala Shops and Establishment Act,2015)
3. Some of the constraints of unity of the emerging new social movement unions and traditional

unions relate to definitions of membership and decision making processes. In the former, retrenched, unemployed, retired former employees find a place even as the form of engagement is direct action and campaigns. This creates possibilities of linking with the community at local levels- panchayats, corporation, municipality governance structures and to plan joint actions to face casualization, outsourcing and varied forms of re-organization of work, unemployment, housing, etc. Varied forms of union structures may be a way to face the challenges posed by informality.

4. An obstacle is the legalism of the trade unions that holds the law, not as a site of struggle, but as a framework within which struggles must be fought and with declining militancy of labour movement (and high unemployment), this legalism gets entrenched in the labour movement and contrasts with the direct actions of new social movement unions.

## **Collective Action and theory of Change**

### **A Case Study of Two Largest Women Producers Collectives of India**

**Dr. Mushtaq Ahmad Malla**

State Project Manager (J&K) in ActionAid India

[mushtaq.ahmad@actionaid.org](mailto:mushtaq.ahmad@actionaid.org)

“Nothing, arguably, is as important today in the political economy of development as an adequate recognition of political, economic, and social participation and leadership of women”

*(Amartya Sen, 1999).*

#### **ABSTRACT**

By using a retrospective mixed methods based case study approach, this paper examines the ‘theory of change’ of two of the oldest and largest women producers collectives of India – ‘Special Project for Sustainable Business Development of Innovative Coconut Based Micro-enterprises for Holistic Growth and Poverty Alleviation’ (SUBICSHA), and Rural Women Distribution Network (RUDI). Taking livelihood generation, economic outcomes, and women leadership as basic parameters, the paper argues that a strong and consistent promotional support, and careful and progressive planning and execution has made these collectives as unique models of socioeconomic and political empowerment for thousands of illiterate, poor and vulnerable women. One, through women’s control on collective hierarchy – membership, governance and operating systems. Two, shifting lines of women wellbeing – progressive outcomes in their human, social, economic, personal, physical and organizational capitals. Three, impact multipliers – improved local economy (commodity, livelihood and product markets). Moreover, being inconsistent with the rhetoric of rural poor and vulnerable women being incapable of running large business, this paper argues, that over more than ten years of business, though slowly, both these collectives have progressed from pre-promotion, incubation and growth phases, and reached to expansion stage. The paper contends that no doubt the current expansion and global market competitiveness of these collectives is slowed by lack of highly trained professional staff and capital shortage, their biggest achievement lies in their unique model of theory of empowerment. They have emerged from nothing at one point of time, to sustainable business models with women leadership and sustainable livelihood generation of women, while being well fitted within the local economy.

# **Does Gender Equality Invigorate the Growth and Development in India?**

## **Evidence from Worldwide Studies**

**Dr. Neha Tomar**

Post-Doctoral Fellow, Department of Humanities, Delhi Technological University, Delhi

**Dr. Seema Singh**

Associate Professor of Economics, Delhi Technological University, Delhi

ntomar77@gmail.com

### **Background / Problem**

India has emerged as one of the fastest growing economy in the world as per the Central Statistics Organization (CSO) and International Monetary Fund (IMF) and it is expected to be one of the top three economic powers of the world over the next 10-15 years, backed by its strong democracy and partnerships. Although India is growing in many spheres but yet gender equity is not the part. This is quite abysmal as women are prerequisite for the development of any nation. All over the world, educating and empowering women has proven time and again to be the catalyst for rapid socio-economic growth. According to Census 2011 women constitute almost half of the India's population i.e.48.5%. Females have a share of 48.1% in the urban population and of 48.6% in the rural population. Women are quite integral part of the nation and have a major role to play in the development of the nation. According to World Economic Forum's Gender Gap Index 2017, India ranks 139 in the economic participation of women which is down from 136 last year. It was due to fact that on an average, a woman in India is estimated to earn less than quarter of annual income earned by a man. She gets paid only 60 % of what her male counterpart gets for similar work. In India, the workplace gender gap is reinforced by extremely low participation of women in the economy (136 out of the total 144 countries covered) and low wages for those who work (136th ranking for estimated earned income).

Although India has achieved rapid economic growth during the last two decades but still gender disparities remain deep and persistent in India (Duflo 2012, World Bank 2012). Many studies both theoretical and empirical states that women are of crucial importance to process of introducing innovations into markets, they create employment (including self-employment) contributing to overall wealth creation in all economies (Brush 2006). An increase in female employment could significantly boost growth and per capita income. (ILO -2015 and ILO -2014). According to Booz and Co. (2012) estimate that, if female employment rates were match male employment rates, the GDP of the United States would increase by 5 per cent, of Japan by 9 per cent, of the United Arab Emirates by12 per cent, of India by 27 per cent, and of Egypt by 34 per cent. Globally, 812 million of the 865 million women who have the potential to contribute to their national economies through employment live in emerging and developing countries.

Women's participation in the labour force has become a key policy issue, particularly in

developed economies that face a rapidly ageing and shrinking workforce (Steinberg and Nakane, 2012). Furthermore, increasing female employment rates may be a key step in those economies that continue to suffer from significantly lower medium-term growth expectations (Elborgh-Woytek, 2013; Cuberes and Teignier, 2012 and 2014; Esteve-Volart, 2004; Klasen and Lamanna, 2009, Heintz; 2006). According to recent McKinsey report 15 gender equality indicators were tracked for 95 countries. The study found that, if women participated in the economy at a level identical to that of men, it would add up to US\$ 28 trillion or 26 per cent of annual global gross domestic product (GDP) in 2025. With more women in the labor market, an economy makes greater use of its productive potential.

The higher and greater gender equality, in turn, as indicated by the relevant literature, is likely to have a significant and positive effect on economic growth (Forsythe, N., Korzeniewicz, R.P., & Durrant, V. (2000)) The primary pathways through which gender systems affect growth are by influencing the productivity of labour and the allocative efficiency of the economy (World Bank 2002).

The above studies give justification for including women in development and economic growth has. It is important to note that while gender equality will help bring economic growth, economic growth will not necessarily bring gender equality. Advancing gender equality requires strengthening different dimensions of women's autonomy: economic and political autonomy, full citizenship and freedom from all forms of violence, and sexual and reproductive autonomy (Alpízar Durán 2010).

### **The Solution/Research Objectives**

Therefore, the purpose of this paper is to highlight the important role of women to play in economic development of the nation. The paper addresses three questions: What is the evidence base to support that investing in women is beneficial and pivotal? What are the major constraints on realizing the full potential of women in the process of economic development? How these constraints can be unblocked?

### **Design/Methodology/Approach**

The research is based on the literature collected from journals of international repute such as Oxford University Press, Sage Publications, Emerald, Taylor and Francis etc. and Working papers of World Bank, United Nation, Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, Asian Development Bank and International Labor Organization and International Monetary Fund.

### **Findings**

Women's empowerment and economic development are closely interrelated. The development of nation itself bring about women's empowerment whereas empowering women will bring about changes in decision making, which will directly impact development. There is a need to create

full, decent productive employment opportunities for women and access to finance, as well as continue to provide social protection, and more importantly promote and value women.

### **Research limitations/implications**

The study will have important implications for further designing of new policies and giving new insights to the role of women in the economy.

### **Originality/Value**

Although not entirely new but will bring new insight towards empowerment of women and sustainable development.

### **Keywords**

Gender Inequality, Economic Growth, Economic Development, Women and Economy.

### **Paper type**

Literature Review article.

### **References-**

- Alpízar Durán, L. Keynote speech at High-Level Roundtable (2010) "The implementation of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, the outcomes of the 23rd special session of the General Assembly and its contribution to shaping a gender perspective towards the full realization of the MDGs". 54th session of the UN Commission on the Status of Women, United Nations Headquarters NY, March 2010.
- Bradshaw Sarah, Castellino Joshua and. Diop Bineta (2013) Women's role in economic development: Overcoming the constraints Background paper for the High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda
- Booz and Company (2012), Empowering the third billion women and the world of work in 2012
- Cuberes, D.; Teignier, M. (2012). Gender gaps in the labor market and aggregate productivity, Working Paper No. 2012017 (Sheffield, UK, University of Sheffield).
- Duflo Esther(2012), Women Empowerment and Economic Development, Journal of Economic Literature 2012, 50(4), Pages-1051–1079, Retrieved From-<https://economics.mit.edu/files/7417>
- Elborgh-Woytek, K.; Newiak, M.; Kochhar, K.; Fabrizio, S.; Kpodar, K.; Wingender, P.; Clements, B.; Schwartz, G( 2013)Women, work and the economy: Macroeconomic gains from gender equity, IMF Staff Discussion Note SDN/13/10 (Washington, DC, IMF).
- Esteve-Volart, B. (2004). Gender discrimination and growth: Theory and evidence from

India, STICERD Development Economics Papers (London, London School of Economics).

- Forsythe, N., Korzeniewicz, R.P., & Durrant, V. (2000) Gender Inequalities and Economic Growth: A Longitudinal Evaluation. Economic Development and Cultural Change
- 48, Pages-573-17. Retrieved From- <http://unsdsn.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/130520-Women-Economic-Development-Paper-for-HLP.pdf>
- Heintz, J.( 2006). Globalization, economic policy and employment: Poverty and gender implications, ILO Employment Strategy Papers 2006/3 (Geneva, ILO).
- International Labour Organization (ILO); Organisation for the Economic Co-operation and Development(OECD); International Monetary Fund (IMF); and World Bank. 2014. Achieving stronger growth by promoting a more gender-balanced economy, Report prepared for the G20 Labour and Employment Ministerial Meeting, Melbourne, 10–11 Sep. (Geneva, Paris and Washington, DC)
- Klasen, S.; Lamanna, F. 2009. “The impact of gender inequality in education and employment on economic growth: New evidence for a panel of countries”, in Feminist Economics, Vol. 15, No. 3, pp. 91-132.
- UN report (October 16, 2014), Synergies between sustainable development and gender equality undeniable, policy change needed: Focus on women’s rights, capabilities, leadership and unpaid care work Date, Retrieved From
- <http://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2014/10/world-survey-2014-press-release>
- The World Bank Policy Rt -21776 , January 2001, Retrieved From-
- <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/512911468327401785/pdf/multi-page.pdf>
- World Bank.( 2001). Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press; Washington, D.C.: World Bank.
- World Bank. (2011). World Development Report 2012: Gender Equality and Development. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

# **Childcare and Employment Experiences of Young Mothers in Public and Private Sectors: Case Studies from New Delhi**

**Neha Wadhwa**

Doctoral Scholar, School of Social Sciences, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai  
neha.wadhwa1304@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

This paper utilizes the phenomenon of unpaid work of childcare as a lens to shed light on the everyday interaction between the private and the public spheres of the lives of young, employed mothers. The paper presents four selected cases of young mothers grappling with the daily negotiations of childcare and employment. These particular cases have been selected based on the criteria that these four mothers are employed in varying occupations, within the organized sector of the economy. They also exemplify the usage of varied childcare support options both within and outside the household. Narratives of young mothers were collected through multiple in-depth interviews and they help explain the impact of these everyday negotiations on the lives of these women. Theoretically this paper will address the gap of considering the experiences of these women analytically and unearthing the dynamics of multiple social institutional structures which construct them.

## **Background**

It is common in the Indian scenario that the mother is held „responsible“ for the child's welfare and development almost unilaterally, especially in the early years of the child's life (Kakkar, 1978). She is the one who primarily sets up systems of childcare, monitors their efficacy, ensures their sustenance and steps in when there appear to be any glitches. Even though, gender seems to be the primary institutional structure defining the mother's role, it will be naïve to ignore its interactions with other social institutional structures. The work done by mothers would be determined by various elements of intersecting social structures, like her educational and skill level, familial composition and hierarchical norms, religious and ethnic beliefs regarding childcare, her pre and post-partum health, material standing of the household, economic stability and the capacity to hire help, caste norms regulating familial roles, inherited social capital etc. These multiple social structures work simultaneously in obvious and oblique ways which naturalizewomen's unpaid work and inherently make it invisible – not just to the rest of the familial members and rest of the world but also to themselves.

With household work being labelled as their naturalized task, it then follows that women's education and skill acquisition is not something that has been historically prioritized by families. However, education and skills are one of the primary determinants of the employment opportunities these women can access, which then partially determine the material resources of



the household and the options of childcare the young mother can opt for. In the cases considered in this paper, all the young mothers inhabit varying employment positions and relations, the reflection of which is apparent in the childcare systems they have constituted for their children. These cases will provide descriptions of employed women's tasks at work as well as multiple chores within the household, including childcare, on any given day – making explicit the how the maternal workplace and household are in a constant interaction with each other every single day.

Away from the realm of the household, these young women are part of institutional structures of organized work that contribute to the economy. These women inhabit the roles of skilled workers who get their salaries from the „surplus“ they help their organizations or bureaucratic offices produce. It is these salaries which contribute to the sustenance of the household and are essential to the childcare effort, hence establishing the Marxian dialectic of production and reproduction. Feminist-Marxist theorists have argued for a long time now that in these processes, it is the women, as mothers and as employees, who occupy the most disadvantageous positions (Ghosh, 2011; Neetha, 2007; Delphy, 1984; James and DallaCosta, 1974).

Academically, there has been a moderate amount of attention given to understanding the impact of parental work on childcare in middle class homes in urban India and the most widely studied theme has been the impact of maternal employment on childcare and domestic work. (Ramu, 1997) On a closer look, it becomes obvious that these studies are at best, intermittent, mostly clustering around the 1980s and those done relatively recently have been done based on varied and divergent disciplinary perspectives. Some of these studies present useful and insightful analyses of national and state level data. Most of these existing analyses are not able to explain the lived realities of people, in this case parenting and childcare in middle class homes. These quantitative facts then need to be supplemented with qualitative studies that could provide reasons and explanations for the current structure and functioning of childcare options and their interaction with parental employment constraints. Few sociologists, anthropologists and psychologists have used this approach (Seymour, 1999; Donner, 2008; Trawick, 1992; Uberoi, 1993; Canella and Viruru, 2004; Chopra, 2008; Kakkar, 1978) and have made important contributions to the field of family studies in India.

To understand the current scenario within which women's work is embedded, it is important to contextualize the experiences of childcare which these women have shared with me in their narratives. Indian middle-class households cannot be spoken of, in isolation from the public sphere of state politics and legislation, economy and the continuous stream of socio-cultural changes brought about by the state's move away from welfare and towards capitalistic urbanization and globalization. Adoption of the Structural Adjustment Programs (SAP) in 1991 made the creation of human capital extremely important, putting the onus on households for providing adequate labour. This has created a tough conundrum to resolve as the services (especially health and education) which help reproduce this adequate labour are becoming harder to access, especially for households with lesser economic resources. Along with the ever-increasing privatization of essential resources there is the contrasting reality of the state being a

signatory to multiple international conventions where it has adopted ideas based on entirely western notions of what childhood might be.

Besides largely unfulfilled international commitments, the state has its own programmes like the Rajiv Gandhi National Crèche Scheme for Children of Working Women<sup>1</sup> (RGNCS) (2006) and the Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS) (1975) which are mostly used by the non-urban sections of the population and have been known to have major shortcomings as well. This self-contradicting stance of the state, affects national and state level policy programmes for children and parents through inefficient and insufficient piecemeal policy mechanisms. It is a common observance amongst the critics of India's social policies that they are often targeted towards very specific groups of people, like only new mothers, without considering that it is difficult to disentangle the individual from their context of everyday life.

Neetha and Palriwala (2009) observe that post-independence, the provisions made by the first few Five-Year Plans only scratched the surface in terms of denting the actual issues of poverty, hierarchical and distributive inequality, child labour, social justice etc. and mostly benefitted male citizen-workers in the organized sector. On the other hand, the issues face by women never came to the fore (till the Towards Equality Report, 1974) as other problems were deemed as problems of national importance. Facing the consequences of patriarchal short-sightedness, women workers had to make do with very few benefits like lack of a maternity leave (till 1961), lack of crèches or flexible timings. This, they say „..... reiterated the tacit and overt distinction between male paid workers/employees and female family carers.“ (ibid.) However, passing bills in the Parliament did not guarantee the implementation of these provisions, especially with the federal structure of the Indian state.

While there is a large body of work that has focused on the trends in India's social policy and programmes, internal incongruities (other than the lack of implementation) have rarely been elaborated, the implications of gendered ideologies and the absence of care concerns have not been integrated, and their link to informal, private and familial systems of care have not been analyzed. (Neetha and Palriwala, 2011)

This paper therefore will address the gap in knowledge generation by explaining how reified forms of social policies work for young women who have taken up employment in the organized sector. One of the most prominent policy measures relevant for these women is the Maternity Benefit Act, 1961. It is provided by the Indian state to support new mothers and many changes and additions have been made to it since its inception. Intended as an act that would be used ubiquitously by women all over the country, employed in formal or informal sectors, the Act has not been the pillar of support it should have been, mostly due to corruption, lack of awareness and activism and lax implementation. The Indian Parliament in March 2017 passed an Amendment to the Maternity Benefit Act and extended the maternity leave to all employed women to a period of

---

<sup>1</sup> RGNCS caters to the children in the age group of 0-6 years from families of working mothers with a monthly income of less than Rs.12, 000

26 weeks. This means that now, the entire financial strain of offering a woman employee fully paid maternity leave for six months is on the hiring organization. This step might turn out to be counterproductive because it might hurt the prospects of these women by painting them as economic liabilities. The state also has no provisions to recognize and address the need for childcare after the maternity leave has ended. Formation of legal norms to be adhered to by crèches and professionally run day-care centers has been on the anvil since the last five years.

Therefore, there are many instances to show that the Indian state, since the time of independence has been hesitant in recognizing the contribution of women's paid and unpaid labour – both at the organizational level and within the private domain of the household. This ideological environment is prominent in macro-public discourse. This ideology of naturalization and invisibilization of women's labour further trickles down into business organizations and households, interacting with personally held beliefs and forming normative behavioural patterns for individuals. Institutional structures like familial power hierarchies, caste, class, lingual and ethnic background etc. all collude with the larger societal situational structures to keep the social location of women near the bottom of the benefits-pile.

With the help of the cases considered in this paper therefore, I will address the following gaps:

1. To empirically document and present to an audience the sheer amount of labour these women engage in, on any given day
2. To objectively evaluate the various extra-household support mechanisms available for young mothers
3. To explain the workings of various social institutional structures, in the public (employment) and the private (household) domains, and their impact on the lived experiences of these women

Methodology:

These narratives of young mothers were collected as a part of a larger doctoral project focused on understanding the daily interface of childcare work and systems of parental employment. It is a phenomenological enquiry, exploratory and interpretive in nature and attempts to uncover societal dynamics in the personal and public spheres by understanding lived experiences of the participants. Households, in the larger project were selected on the dual yet intersecting criteria of „category of maternal employment“ and „familial composition of the household“ – which were important factors in determining the childcare options caregivers have access to. Within these households then, multiple in-depth interviews were held with primary caregivers for children. Also, similar interviews were held with public stakeholders in childcare like crèches, day-care centers and HR professionals.

For the purpose of this paper, I have chosen to present four particular cases of young women, employed in the organized sector as their lived experiences would provide for a close vantage point to understand the daily negotiations they make (within and outside the household) to provide care for their children. With some of the women participants claiming in their narratives

“everything we do is only for our children.” – this goes to show how childcare work is the adequate lens to examine the unpaid and invisible labour which happens within the privacy of a household. Part of this statement “everything we do...” also includes the paid work these women engage in. Therefore, examining childcare in these urban households is an apt place to being to understand the contours of contemporary paid and unpaid work for women in the organized sector of the Indian economy.

## **BIBLIOGRAPHY:**

- Delphy, Christine, 1984, Patriarchy, Domestic Mode of Production, Gender and Class, in *Close to Home: A Materialist Analysis of Women’s Oppression* (Amherst, University of Massachusetts Press), pp. 259 – 267, translated into English by Diana Leonard
- Ghosh, Jayati, 2011, The Challenge of Ensuring Full Employment in the Twenty-First Century IN *The Indian Journal of Labour Economics*, Vol. 54, No. 1, pp. 51-68
- Kakkar, S. 1978. *The Inner World: A Psychoanalytic Study of Childhood and Society in India*. Oxford University Press, New Delhi, India.
- Neetha, N. and Palriwala, R. 2009. *India Research Report 3: The Care Diamond: State Social Policy and the Market*. United Nations Research Institute for Social Development. Published by UNRISD, Geneva, Switzerland.
- Neetha, N. and Palriwala, R. 2011. *Stratified Familialism: The Care Regime in India through the Lens of Childcare*. IN *Development and Change*. Vol 42(4). Published on behalf of International Institute of Social Studies, The Hague. Published by: Blackwell Publishing. Oxford. UK.
- Donner, H. 2008. *Domestic Goddesses: Maternity, Globalization and Middle-class Identity in Contemporary India*. Ashgate, Hampshire, England.
- Ramu, G. N. 1997. *Paid Work, Married Women and the Family in India*. IN. Judith Frankel. (Ed.) *Families of Employed Mothers: An International Perspective*. Garland Publishing. New York. USA.
- Trawick, M. 1992. *Notes on Love in a Tamil Family*. University of California Press. California. USA.
- Uberoi, P. 1993. *Family, kinship, and marriage in India*. Oxford University Press. New Delhi. New York.
- Chopra, R. 2008. *Family, Gender and Masculinities*. IN. Ranadive, J. D. (Ed.) *Democracy in the Family: Insights from India*. Sage Publications. New Delhi.

# **Women and Forest: Understanding the Changing Gender Relation among the Kondhs in Odisha**

**Nikita Mishra**

Development Studies from Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

nikitamishra049@gmail.com.

## **Introduction**

The access to land and forest is critical to the lives of the tribes (also known as adivasis) and other forest dwelling communities in this country. Forests not only meet their everyday requirements but also form an integral part in their social and institutional arrangements. According to various studies 50-80 percent of the food requirements of the adivasis are being provided by the forest resources (Fernandese 1993:51; Jodha 1995). On one hand, the forest has helped the tribal communities in maintaining their sustenance and on the other hand, the tribes have helped in conservation and protection of forest thereby establishing a symbiotic relationship with each other. Any slight change in the characteristics of the land and forest has affected the symbiotic relationship between them which has eventually led to the social disruption among them. Over the years forests are rapidly declining in terms of both quality and quantity. A lot of factors like overexploitation, ecological degradation, commercialization, and privatization and encouragement of establishment of MNCs have been found responsible for their rapid depletion (Barik: 2000). These have led to the marginalization of tribal communities in general and alienation of tribal women from the forest in particular. Women in tribal areas are at the utmost loss when there is a change in the forest management as their dependency on the forest is higher than their male counterparts. As the provider of food, fuel, and water to the family, women have an important stake in the preservation of forest and combating forest degradation. Gender relation is a crucial factor in the management of land and forest and it points to the invisibility of women. These invisibility compounds of poverty, shortage of food, fodder, fuel and the greatly increased workloads of the forest-based women (Kelkar & Nathan, 1991:13).

## **Women in the Forest**

According to the FAO report, *Women Feed the World*, in Sub African and Caribbean countries, women produce 80 percent of total basic food stuffs, while in Asia, they provide for 50 to 90 percent of labour for cultivation of rice and in Southeast Asia, Latin American and Pacific countries, women's home garden represents some of the most complex agricultural system known. Women are considered as original food producers throughout the world and they continue to be the central to the food production system in the global south in terms of work they do in the food chain (Shiva, 2010: ix). Conservation of seeds, growing of the food for domestic process, preparing, storing and processing of the food, gathering of the forest products, collecting fodder and fuel and providing labour in all the stages of the agriculture are the works that are performed

by women on a daily basis throughout the country. Studies have shown that women in the tribal communities enjoy a superior position than their counterparts in the rest of the country as well with the men within their community in respect with following conclusions –

1. The tribal societies are considered to be free from the domestic and community violence and the reproductive power associated with them,
2. Women enjoy a more of an equal status with men even if they have less access to cultivable land, if the particular area has a deep forest cover. Since the practice and possibility of foraging is quite high in these areas, women are economically independent and less dependent on the agricultural produce.
3. They are considered to be the source of traditional knowledge which includes insights on medicinal plants, herbs, roots, and tubers and value of biological diversity to management of particular resources.

Women's knowledge of the forest as the social resource is considered as to be useful for the effective management of the resources. In the tribal societies, there is no definite division of labour between the women and men. For instance, women among the Kondh community of Odisha are involved in all the forms of agricultural activities such as foraging and timber cutting, shifting cultivation and settled agriculture. Thus, when the domestic work is taken into account, women in this community performs a substantial majority of the family labour and contribute hugely to the family economy. Similarly, Kondhs have their own village council known as the 'Kutumb' consisting of the village head known as 'Nayak', Jani, Disari and Bejuni and all other elderly members of the community, who takes the important decisions relating to the village and the community as a whole. Though the leader of the village is often a male, the council is also headed by women. Especially bejuni, who is the ritualistic head and disari who is the healer of the community are considered as the most respectable women in the community. Women in this community are still able to keep gender relation relatively balanced as compared to other tribal communities in the country. They still have the power of making decisions regarding the usage of the resources according to the need of their families and the community at large. However, women in this community are gradually experiencing changes in the culture and gender relation. There are various reasons which have contributed towards this such as imposition of 'mainstream development' in forest management which have restricted women's space and exalted in the domestication of labour, widespread imposition of colonial education through missionaries and other religious outfit and later by public and 'secular' schooling, devaluation and neglect of traditional insights that women possess relating to the maintenance of biological diversity to the management of particular resources, feminization of the agriculture due to migration of male members and their lack of property rights and the conceptual inability of the economists, scientists and the researchers to define women's contribution in the agricultural sector and thereby furthering their invisibility in the same. With the spread of formal state institutions like panchayats, tribal women are facing difficulties in maintaining the position of power that they used to enjoy within their community as the state is favouring the centralization of greater patriarchy. Thus, women now are struggling on two fronts; firstly, against the rising patriarchy within and outside their community and secondly, against the centralization of forest which was

once their source of power and authority. The various forms of development process have created a new form of dominance over women that has devalued and invisibilised their capacity as producers thereby treating them as 'others'. Therefore, perhaps women have always been in the forefront struggling for the liberation from the imposed 'development' process. The women in the Kondh community have their own methods through which they are trying to negotiate and resist the pressures they are facing from the state and other institutions as well as the pressures from their male counterparts. For instance, resisting the forest officials from plantation of the eucalyptus trees in the village or boycotting the member of the community who has helped the outsiders in planting the above. The custom, rules, regulations, festivals, religious activities, and even marriage among the Kondhs are all related with the farming practices. For them forest is beyond the food security or livelihood, it is their way of life. They believe in process of nurturing and restoring the ecosystem as they see the forest as a source of their existence.

### **Implementation of Forest Rights Act**

Tribal women across the country who conserve the forest are fighting for the legal ownership under Forest Rights Act, 2006 (FRA) which guarantees rightful ownership of tribes and other forest dwellers over forests and land. Though FRA recognises the inheritability of the forest, it does not speak about women's inheritance to land in particular. This makes women's rights to forest quite vulnerable. Further the development of forms of individual property through the implementation of FRA significantly destroys the residual land rights of women in the adivasi communities. Land as the private property of the men (whether held by them communally or individually) is an important factor in development of the overall control of the men on the resources (Kelkar & Nathan, 1991). As mentioned above, though there is no definite division of labour between men and women in the Kondh community, the non-owning status of the women (meaning patrilineality) along with patrilocality ensures that women are the only non-owning producers. Today the Kondhs are facing a clear trend towards destruction of women's rights in property, cultural degradation, and route towards the establishment of patriarchy when the concept of private property is being established by the state. The traditional rights which were enjoyed by the women in the community are being eroded under the onslaught of commercialization and privatization whereby land acquisition by various actors has not only taken away the resources from their hand but has also introduced various forms of vulnerabilities. Often the forest and land policies such as FRA implemented by the state, despite their commitment towards gender equality, deny women their just entitlements towards empowerment and in fact get overruled by the socio-cultural norms that are preminent to men. Women's access and control over resources can not only change the ideology and structures of patriarchy within the household and community at large but will also help them in acquiring power to pursue productive and sustainable livelihood.

### **Objectives**

The objectives behind this paper are

- To understand the extent of women's contribution in provision of food and livelihood through an analysis and their role and status in management of forest resources.

- To understand about the gender relation focusing on the management of forest resources particularly within the Kondh community that are characterised by the cultural valuation of women's economic, political and ritual roles and absence of institutionalised male control.
- To understand the process of changing gender relation in the community as the socio-economic and political restructuring is taking place within them
- To understand whether the state policies have been able to promote gender equality and women's economic empowerment in reference to access and rights over the forest resources.
- To understand various negotiation and contestation strategies utilized by the tribal women in the Kondh community with the state and non-state actors to put forward their needs and demands.

## **Methodology**

The study is carried out in the Rayagada district of Odisha. Rayagada is situated in the southern part of the state with 38.6 percent of its area being covered with forest. It has a predominant tribal population of 57.52 percent, among which Kondhs formed the majority. The study is qualitative in nature and will follow the case study method in tracing down the experiences of the tribes in general and women in particular in order to understand how they are negotiating with the change and vulnerabilities associated with the change in the forest relation and management. The methodology further includes the collection of data from the secondary literature and review of the literature available in the English as well as in Odiya languages. The analysis of the study will also take into accounts the narratives provided by both tribal men and women in order to strengthen the methodological approach. The tools for the study will include open ended interviews, PRAs, and focus group discussions.

## **References**

- Barik, B.C. (2000). *Resource Management and Contours of Development: Reflection through Macro-Micro Narratives*. New Delhi: Rawat Publications.
- Fernandes, W. (1993). *Forest and Tribals: Informal Economy, Dependence and Management*
- Tradition. In Mrinal Mittal (ed). *In Continuity and Change in Tribal Society*. Shimla: IIAS.
- Jodha, N.S. (1995). Common Property Resources and the Environmental Context. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 3278-3284.
- Kelkar, G., & Krishnaraj, M. (ed.) (2013). *Women, Land and Power in Asia*. New Delhi: Routledge
- Kelkar, G., & Nathan, D., (1991). *Gender and Tribe: Women, Land and Forest in*



Jharkhand. New

- Delhi: Kali for Women.
- Kelkar, G., Nathan, D., & Walter, P (ed.) (2003). Gender Relations in Forest Societies in Asia:
- Patriarchy at Odds. New Delhi: Sage Publications.
- Shiva,V.(2010). Staying Alive: Women Ecology and Survival in India. New Delhi: Women Unlimited.

## **Invisible Cottage Industries in North East India: Brewing Rice Beer as a Source of Livelihood among Women in Urban Informal Labour**

**Padmini Sharma**

MPhil Scholar, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Guwahati

psharma\_357@yahoo.com

North-East India has been a land of rich cultural and ethnic diversity. The economy has mostly been agrarian in nature possessing myriad indigenous traditional and cultural practices across the region. There is diversity across and within each state where one would come across different livelihood activities being carried out in urban and rural spaces. In urban areas, Westernization in the service sector has not only led to emergence of new and evisceration of old jobs but has even served to attract migrants from rural areas for mostly 'mindless repetitive jobs' as highlighted by Braverman (1998)<sup>1</sup> in service driven economy. In this, some who are working outside the category of formal or organized economy are seen to be engaged in self-employment in legitimate or, illegitimate and/or, legal or, illegal activities<sup>2</sup>.

The rice beer, this research focuses on, has been an indigenous drink of North-East India since time immemorial. This is prepared across all the states where each state follows its own method of preparation and is also known by different names, like Sulai in Assam, Apong in Arunachal Pradesh, Laopani in Nagaland, Haspani by Ahoms and so on. The rituals of taking this local beer also differed across the states and were basically confined as a part of one's own consumption or offering during occasions or celebrations. However, with emergence of urban spheres, say considering Guwahati, a city of Assam, this indigenous drink has assumed a different purpose mostly of commercial in nature. The growing urbanization of the economy has led to simultaneous growth of class structures where some sections of the population are seen to belong to the affluent category, some in the middle class and majority in the lower class category. Consequently, such class division has also led to segmentation of the market in terms of demand for certain goods and services. In other words, emerging service sector in urban spaces has led to urbanization creating different classes of people who are in turn, leading to market segmentation thereby, creating demand for new goods or services in the economy. One such good that has been created or in other words, transformed from the indigenous drink and has served as an integral part of formal or informal labour's leisure activity is that of local rice beer. This demand is seen to be prominent among labourers working in usually lower and some from even middle categories of the job pyramid. Their inability to have access to high end brands in alcoholic beverages has led to the mushrooming of invisible or hidden cottage industries brewing rice beer or what is known as Sulai in local language.

---

<sup>1</sup> See Braverman 1998 'Labour and Monopoly Capital' for his notion on growth of service economy.

<sup>2</sup> Keith Hart (1971; 1973) has classified different categories of informal/unorganized economy. In which he has drawn fine lines between legal and legitimate activities as well.

These days the local rice beer is gaining prominence in many parts of the city. This local rice beer is usually manufactured or produced within a household unit, in other words, it can be claimed as a cottage industry. Cottage industries or home based industries are usually considered to be invisible in nature however, within this segment there are many industries across India<sup>3</sup> that can be further classified under either visible or invisible home based industries. What differentiates North-East India from rest is that the home based work is mostly in the form of self-employment (known as self-employed home based work) where unlike other home based workers, these workers are working independently and not as a part of any global or national supply chain (known as sub-contracted home based work). What seem to be interesting are the producers of these beers who are generally seen to be tribals including both hill and plain tribes and women in particular. This industry is seen to be thriving both as a single source of livelihood as well as a supplementary source of income for many women self-employed workers. It then becomes interesting to understand the working of this industry through informal work where different dimensions relating to the value chain will be evaluated to emphasise how these women self-employed home based workers are managing their respective industries. A Functional Analysis<sup>4</sup> of the value chain will provide an insight to the technical operations required from primary production to final consumption in addition to the structure of cost of production and income involved.

It raises an inquisitiveness to evaluate the work organization of this industry and the nature of work through women's perspective. In this, the industry can be firstly understood in the broader context through the different schools on informal economy, that is, the Dualists<sup>5</sup>, Structuralists<sup>6</sup> and/or, the Legalists<sup>7</sup>. Secondly, the work organization and nature of work will be evaluated through the traditional as well as contemporary sociological perspective of industrial work. Thirdly, women perspective in informal economy will be evaluated against a backdrop of scholarly work on women and informal economy<sup>8</sup>. Furthermore, since the industry is mostly concentrated in the hands of tribals, some reflection on ethnicity and informal economy will also be highlighted.

Furthermore, the research would also like to highlight the conflict between this activity as a source of income and the ethical practices involved as some can claim this activity to be of illegitimate in nature. Though there are writings where this indigenous drink has been claimed

---

<sup>3</sup> Chen and Sinha (WIEGO, 2013) has classified home based activities as labour-intensive activities in textiles, garment, and footwear manufacturing industries as well as skilled artisan production and in terms of high-end modern industries, including manufacturing of airline and automobile parts, assembly work in electronics, and packaging work in pharmaceuticals.

<sup>4</sup> See Value Chain Analysis for Policy Making by Food and Agriculture Organization, 2013.

<sup>5</sup> Dualists school of thought on informal economy comprises of Hart 1973; ILO 1972; Sethuraman 1976; Tokman 1978

<sup>6</sup> Structuralists school of thought on informal economy consists of Moser 1978; Castells and Portes 1989

<sup>7</sup> For Legalists, work of Hernando de Soto Polar 1989, 2000 will offer an insight into the informal sector through underground economy. It can be used in this context as the research will also question the ethical practice involved.

<sup>8</sup> For women and informal labour works by Martha Alter Chen (2007; 2012), Rina Agarwala (2013), Naila Kabeer (1994; 2002; 2008; 2011; 2013)

to be possessing several medicinal properties<sup>9</sup> however, there has also been other research<sup>10</sup> that shows the composition of this local beers are usually not balanced on account of which it can have serious implications on an individuals' health whether he/she is aware of such implications. In this, the research is particularly interested in understanding the legal dimensions involved. This will be evaluated in context to the role of state and other legal authorities towards such informal work. This in turn will be contextualised to see the vulnerability of all the women home based self-employed workers engaged in these kinds of services. In context to this issue, questions emerge highlighting is it an illegitimate activity? Are these women workers aware about the ill effects of their products? How do they perceive their work and the products they produce? Why do these women workers carry out such operations despite such activity being looked down in society? Whether their work is legalized? These questions can further contribute towards policy dimensions to safeguard the interest and security of all these workers.

### **Research Objectives:**

The research is concerned with the rice beer industries of Guwahati run by women self-employed home based workers. The objectives of the research are as follows:

- To understand the work organization of rice beer cottage industries
- To analyze the working and labour conditions of women engaged in these industries
- To analyze the living conditions of women engaged in these industries
- To analyze the value chain of these industries

### **Research Questions:**

- Based on the above research objectives, the following research questions have been drawn:
- How do the women organize this work in their homes?
- Why do they see it as a source of livelihood?
- What are the working conditions of the women workers?
- What are the living conditions of the women workers?
- What is the cost of production?
- How is the value chain of this industry structured?
- How do they perceive their work? Are they engaged in multiple source of income?
- What kind of health issues do they face in their work?

---

<sup>9</sup> See <http://morungexpress.com/rice-beer-vanishing-tradition/>

<sup>10</sup> See <https://michaelrucker.com/functional-supplements/rice-wine-health-benefits/amp/>

- How do they operate in the broader informal economy?
- What kind of legal dimensions are involved in this regard?

### **Research Methodology:**

The research is conducted in areas of Guwahati (a city of Assam) and Shillong (a city of Meghalaya) located in North-East India. Both the cities being capitals has served to attract migrants from different locations. The women labour mostly engaged in these cottage industries comprise of plain tribes in case of Guwahati and hill tribes in that of Shillong. So, it raises an inquisitiveness to understand why and how this segment of population have to take up rice beer brewing as a source of income or livelihood for their family. Furthermore, taking two regions will also help in highlighting the differences in working and living conditions of these women labour in their respective informal economies.

Being an exploratory study, qualitative methodology has been used to examine the social world through its participants (Bryman, 2012, p.380). The underlying motive behind such an approach has been to gain a deeper insight into the experiences of the respondents. Under the regime of qualitative research, phenomenology approach been used, as it helps in viewing a phenomena through the lived experiences of the respondent. As Langdridge (2004, p.274) states, ‘the emphasis in all phenomenological investigations is the ‘world in its appearing’, that is, people’s perceptions of the world they inhabit’. As the focus is to understand the meaning of work through the perception of the women labour involved in these industries, this approach entirely fits into the purpose

Furthermore, the hidden or invisible nature of these industries makes it difficult to tap the resource persons involved and hence, the researcher will focus on snowball sampling along with purposive sampling to tap the respondents. Data will be collected using unstructured in-depth interview, being guided through the experiences of the respondents. The respondents’ narration will also be cross checked by the interviewer to ensure that the former’s interest has been understood in its true essence. The interview will be audio recorded with prior permission of the respondents, so as to gain an in-depth understanding of their experiences during the stages of translation and transcription. For analyzing the data, thematic approach will be used, whereby, from the transcribed data, several sub-themes will be derived and these will be, at a later stage, clubbed under a respective parent theme. With respect to ethics in social research, the researcher will follow strict principles of informed consent and confidentiality. The principle of confidentiality, concerning the identity of the respondents will be strictly followed and repeatedly ensured at the beginning and end of interview.

## **Economic Empowerment of Women and the Criminal Justice Delivery System in India**

**Dr. Paramita Majumdar**

Independent gender expert, Dwarka

drpmj2017@gmail.com

### **Background**

During the last two decades, changing social norms in India have brought large number of women into the paid workforce. Paid work has not only given women economic independence, it has also developed a sense of autonomy, cultivated new capabilities and has been an avenue for greater participation in public life for thousands of women in India. Since the Malimath Committee recommendations to overhaul the fundamentals of the criminal justice system in India and making it inclusive, the criminal jurisprudence has been a matter of debate and recent review. And with the Justice J S Verma Committee proposing amendments to the laws relating to crime against women in 2012 and indicating the marginalization of women in the criminal justice system, there has been a change in the overall approach including recruitment of women. There has been a series of policy developments since then. The initiative and efforts of the Government in ensuring that the criminal justice system meets the needs of women has been commendable. Women's entry and rising representation in the legal profession has been one of the most remarkable social changes in recent years. According to Chambers & Partners, which ranks lawyers and law firms, there is a steady rise in woman listing in India - from 12.5 per cent in 2010 to 17.34 per cent in 2015. The actual strength of total women police has increased approximately three times from 57,466 in 2008 to 1,40,184 in 2017 according to BPRD data. However, due to the deeply embedded patriarchal practices and attitudes towards women in the criminal justice system, the pace of change has been very slow. For example, though there has been increase in the actual strength of women in police, there is a tendency to engage women police only in situations like security checks and other specialized duties relating to women, but unless they are assigned frontline duties in the police stations, there would not be an impact on the community as a whole. 27% female judges in the lower judiciary across India, 10 % in high courts; less than 1% in the Supreme Court represent the skewed representation of women in judiciary. It cannot be emphasized enough that a criminal justice system will only be effective when all its component parts – police, judiciary and prisons, represent and serve all. Moreover, with steep rise of incidents against women such as cyber-crimes, sexual harassment at work place, acid attacks and rapes in recent years there is an urgent need to completely integrate gender issues in organisational policies so as to open new avenues for women's paid work. The goal of gender mainstreaming to promote full access to justice and participation of women in the justice system remains distant.

## **Objectives**

In the present paper, an attempt has been made to analyze the workforce participation of women in the criminal justice system since 2012, identify the challenges faced by women and to review the recent policies and mechanisms in place to safeguard the rights of women.

## **Methodology**

In achieving the above-mentioned objectives, the present paper draws on secondary data, national policies that promote women's paid work and is based on review of findings from a number of research studies, published reports etc. that highlights women's experiences of the criminal justice system. Although small in extent, the paper is an attempt to review the work on gender justice so as to remind gender advocates and policy makers to continuously review, critically assess and re-visit the existing policies, programmes and budget so as to audit the extent of gender mainstreaming achieved.

# **Gaay Leke Jane Vali Auratein – Begging or Caste-Based Urban Occupations?**

**Pournima Arvel**

MPhil - PhD Research Scholar at Tata institute of social Sciences, Mumbai  
pournima.arvel6@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

What is the common understanding of beggary for us? Every day people who are staying, sleeping on the street, sometime outside a temple and standing at signals – these are beggars. But living on the street, and asking for alms – are they not different categories? The Nagpanthi Dori Goshave mostly travels with cows that are considered holy and use these animals as a legitimate source of income. These people, mostly women, sit outside temples. Mostly the women are between 25-35 years not younger. They participate in this activity and this is broadly called caste-based begging.

In the general context of begging, all begging and homeless women are coming into the one context but this creates 2 types of stereotypes - begging and homelessness. In begging there is another category I found through my original research: this is the caste-based begging in the Maharashtra context; and the communities involved in this occupation largely belong to the NT-DNT [nomadic tribes and de-notified nomadic tribes]. Generally, however, and as per beggary law, all those people who are found to be staying on the street are labelled beggars and arrested. I suggest through my research that this generalization needs to be unpacked along with the challenge to stereotyping that happens.

Caste-based occupations are also hierarchically organized, and this is a different set of contexts from those of unemployment, mental illness and homeless poverty, disability, human trafficking and so on that have already been identified in research as contexts. In India caste plays a very important role in societal organization, economic structures and criminalization, and caste-based begging must be understood in all of these contexts. Women of the NT-DNT communities I studied carry multiple burdens and are the financial support for families which are back home in the village, while still being burdened by patriarchy too. This challenge to the generalization of 'begging', 'homelessness', 'being-on-the-street', 'criminality', 'migrant', 'nomadic' is what I have studied and wish to present through my focus on this community of women. Beggars are not a homogeneous category and this occupation is also caste-based occupation in Maharashtra; this is an example of how caste works. Beggary needs to be understood in the unorganized sector as a caste-based occupation, because they produce *punya* as commodity for customers just like any other labour, and earn money, so the beggary law does not fit this caste occupation.



## **Paid and Unpaid Work of Dalit Women in Mumbai and Pune**

**Pratibha Kamble**

Doctoral Scholar, Dept. of Economics, Sathye College, Mumbai  
pratibhamar@gmail.com

### **Abstract**

In 1987, Vidya Gaikwad from Pune, had to get married at a teen age, to a man with poor financial conditions. To overcome this financial constraint, she had to work as a tailor for her livelihood. Eventually her social circle increased and she started as a real estate agent on a commission basis. This went forward to her becoming a builder and construction icon. This, to tell sounds like her successful professional story but personally her husband wasn't very acceptable of her boldness and entrepreneurship and that led to him to pulling her down so much so that he started doubting her relationship with their own son. Not only was the relationship with business colleagues doubted by gender, so was her financial reliability, and she had to sell her land at lower market prices to overcome social rejection.

### **Interplay of Caste, Class and Gender**

All this is to explain that Dalit women in India are the Dalits among Dalits. They suffer from four-fold oppression: Because of gender because of patriarchy, Caste "the untouchability", economic deprivation as they are underpaid and primarily hail from the poorest and most marginalized communities and political powerlessness- due to non- acceptance and non-participation in decision making. Care work of Dalit women remains invisible, unrecognized and unremunerated. In the Mumbai and Pune, majority of recycling women workers are from Dalit communities.

Not only this, but she must face discrimination and deprivation due to social approach of male preference leading to poor accessibility to food, water, sanitation, education, health coupled with domestic violence.

The question is- is this the kind of treatment we deserve?

We as women have been conferred with many rights constitutionally. but as a trend, practice intellectual slavery of patriarchal thoughts. In my opinion, Intellectual slavery is the mother of all slaveries. This intellectual slavery is a result of imitative practices of the Varna system.

Initially due to lack of income for even running the basic routine life, women from the lower classes had "liberty" to go out and work. However, as the available opportunities increased and we moved towards a more socially acceptable environment, we started imitating the treatment given by the so called higher-class men to their women. With increasing acceptability of upper caste values, increasing restriction on Dalit middle class women is visible. Not only does she have a compromised personal and social life but a sub-standard financial life wherein she

cannot decide the mode of earning or how the earned money can be spent and saved.

Dr. Abashed Ambedkar said, “I measure the progress of the community by the degree of progress which woman have achieved”. He said to achieve and accelerate this progress; men's education should be persuaded side by side with women's education. It is surprising that this thought remains neglected even in today's apparent liberal Indian educational discourse. This is because of issues of class exploitation, poverty and the inefficiency of existing state policies to bring about educational reform. Also, the social system is somewhere responsible for this- There is a close link between caste endogamy and ideological subordination of women through imposition of customs and rules that control and circumscribe her and sanctions her sexual oppression- the patriarchal injunctions of Manu smriti lays the basis of gender inferiority.

Breaking all the pre-set social norms Dr. B. R. Ambedkar's ideas on women liberation rest on a sociological, rational and moral critique of the graded system of caste inequality and challenges the truth and knowledge of its overarching legitimizing agent-Brahmanical Hinduism. He said and everyone will agree that we don't just have to take up elementary education but have to excel in whatever we do. There is no other divine power as self-confidence. You need to labour hard and long to achieve. There is no such thing as innate intellectual superiority or stupidity. Be self-disciplined. Cultivate the capacity to put in hard work.

Now, the other side to it is despite an available education system why are we not having satisfactory progress of women? This is because of an old set mentality of prejudiced way of looking at a girl. We all in our minds, irrespective of our educational qualification, financial status, professional credibility- have a set of things that we have arbitrarily decided are for a woman and another set for men. I am not saying that we have not crossed the boundaries of these fences at all but we have not reached the peak. The idea of Dalit women liberation is not to just set a few examples but to empower each woman and make her independent as a person and intellectually.

A district court lawyer Advocate Shalini Suryawanshi (age 33years), Dr. Shubhangi Kamble (age 39years) and Pradnya Gaikwad (age 30years) are all young Dalit professionals who have entered their respective fields and are sound in their areas of expertise. However, despite their educational qualification and professional excellence, they are always subjected to the face of doubt purely because of their gender and more so due to caste. The caste causes discrimination on their heredity capability and the gender questions their emotional and intellectual abilities for proper judgment- making the framework of a Dalit woman more vulnerable to failure or suboptimal success.

### **Challenging Internal and External Patriarchy**

There is another set of women who have taken up entrepreneurship not by choice but by circumstances, say due to unemployed father/ brother, dependent husband or widowed status. In my fieldwork, I found this category of Dalit women is more concentrated in the areas of BDD Chawl, Lower Parel, Dilail Road, Worli, Chembur, Tardeo, Ghatkopar, Govandi, Mankhurd in Mumbai and Yeravdaand Maharwadas in Pune. These people are in specific

denied any financial help in the form of loans by banks or other small-scale money-lenders because of 2 reasons: lack of assets for mortgage and their non-glamorous appearance and caste background.

To crawl out of the system, it is essential for Dalit women must realise from within realize that as per Constitution of India, we are equal. Dr. B. R. Ambedkar said “Never regard yourselves as untouchables or inferior based on gender, live a clean life, dress yourselves as touchable ladies. Never mind if your dress is full of patches but see that it is clean. Attend more to the cultivation of mind and spirit of self-help. Do not feed drunkard spouses and sons. Send children-both boys and girls to school. Instill ambition in them. Inculcate in their mind that they are destined to be great. Remove from them all inferiority complexes. Don’t hurry to marriage. The paternal duty lies in giving each child a better start than the parents have. Having children more than you can financially support is a crime.”

#### Babasaheb Ambedkar’s Contribution towards Affirmative Action for Women

To bring about changes in the unequal patterns Dr. B. R. Ambedkar raised the issues on a debate in 1938 as an MLA. The constitution of India bestows the same rights to the woman as to the men. To ensure that these rights are not denied, there is special representation given to Dalit woman. As to ensure healthy status amongst women, the state introduced Maternity benefit Bill during Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar’s tenure as a labor minister.

In the current climate, social equality may come off as a fiction but we must accept it as governing principle enshrined in the Constitution of India.

The discourse on resource gap and definition of resource itself should be informed better with perspective of social justice, distributive justice and gender justice. Along with social acceptability, policy reforms which suit the economic, social and educational empowerment of Dalit woman must be brought in. Awareness about access of state sponsored schemes and programmes needs to be done through Neighborhood Resource Centers that the women have access to. Provision of state infrastructure for use, management and control of woman would ensure these schemes effectively. Communication media must highlight Dalit women entrepreneurs, professional women, community leaders as role models so that many more Dalit Women and girls get inspired to make their mark in different sectors of the economy. There needs to be an all-round urgency, willingness and commitment by the government and the civil society to bring about radical change in the mind set of people to challenge socio-economic and political exclusion.

To end this, as a feminist the idea is not to establish a sense of superiority as compared to men amongst woman but to create a sense of inclusive, oneness and equality. As members of Dalit community, Dalit feminists want the upliftment and empowerment of not just woman but also men, and for them to come united, is necessary to rise and break all shackles of caste, class, race, religion and ethnicity. It is the need of the hour to look at the Dalit women as national resources that have been overlooked for 5000 years of caste patriarchy.

# Securing Women Workers' Rights at Workplace

**Pravin Sinha**

PhD, Delhi,

dr.pravinsinha@gmail.com

## Abstract

The women accounts for half on India's population, however their participation in labour market is about 23 percent. Most of the said workforce is concentrated in the informal economy working as non-documented workers. In spite of the fact that the Constitution as also laws grants various protection to women workers, they remain non benefitted by the same. The women's ecosystem is immensely influenced by the social structure as also cultural values. The stereotyping of women and her contributions have received negligible recognitions as they are considered as secondary to the man's roles. The existing laws, that has origin of the factory system under a foreign colonial government, has perpetuated this notion. The Indian state and its policy makers too have perpetuated the traditionally held position towards the women and its contributions. The liberalization of Indian economy and prominence to the services sector, has brought concerns of the women workers to the center stage. Increasing number of women in the world of work and their demands for equal rights have caused friction between man and women. The traditional values and roles are being questioned, more so by the women population. The situation is no different in the case of membership based organizations (MBOs) such as trade unions, cooperatives, etc. The paper, using qualitative survey method, would examine the working of MBOs and their approaches towards effective integration of women functionaries in positions of power. There are however, a number of cases wherein the efforts of women functionaries have resulted in positive outcomes. For example the Gharelu Kamgar Union of Kanpur has used the instrument of RTE to encourage domestic women workers to seek its membership. Similarly, the AIUFWP (Saharanpur), SEWA (Ahmedabad) and NASVI (Patna) have been promoting producer's cooperatives as a tool for empowering the women workers. The Central trade Unions Organizations (CTUOs) with support from GUFs and TUSOs are empowering their women functionaries to occupy decision making positions in trade unions.

## References

- Ahuja, Ram (2014): Social Problems of India, Rawat Publications, Jaipur
- Bakshi, P. M (2013): The Constitution of India, Universal Law Publishing, New Delhi.
- Crosby, Michael (2005): Power at Work- Rebuilding the Australian Union Movement, The Federation Press, Sydney
- Fairholm, Gilbert W. (1993): Organisational Power Politics - Tactics in Organisational

Leadership, Praeger Publisher, London

- Padia, Chandrakala, Edt. (2015): Feminism, Tradition and Modernity, Indian Institute of Advanced Studies, Shimla, Himachal Pradesh
- Ruxton, Sandy, Edt. (2004): Gender Equality and Men - Learning from Experience, Oxfam GB, Oxford, UK
- Sinha, Pravin (2004): Dilemma of Organising IT Workers, Participatory Development Unit / FES, New Delhi
- Sinha, Pravin & S.C. Srivastava (2013): Containing Workplace Conflicts - Role of Social Partners, The Booklines, New Delhi.

# **Women, Work and Empowerment: A Case Study of the IT Sector**

**Priyanka Dwivedi**

Research Scholar, Bangalore University

priyanka.dickencharles2005@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

Paid employment has been identified as one of the most effective channels for ensuring empowerment of women. Despite the widespread assumption that paid employment leads to empowerment of women, there has been very little empirical research to establish this relationship. Studies[1] have revealed that women who work have a greater likelihood of higher empowerment than those women that do not, but the strength of this relationship is dependent on the context. The conditions under which employment takes place are significant in determining whether paid employment leads to empowerment. Research by Assad et al (2011)[2] has highlighted that the relationship between employment and empowerment is not a linear one. The barriers that stand in the way of women's control over their lives and equality are too complex to be overcome by paid work alone. Many a times, structural factors like poverty push women into low skill, poorly paid work options that afford no security and no scope for empowerment. Thus, it needs to be examined when and how paid employment would lead to empowerment of women and when it would not.

In sociological research, resource dependency[3] states that women's socio-economic resources determine her intra-house negotiating power. Fewer economic opportunities and multiple socio-economic constraints limit women's intra-household negotiating power, hence their ability to mitigate or defend themselves from domestic violence[4]. Kabeer (2011)[5] introduced a distinction between objective and subjective dependence, with objective dependence largely coinciding with economic dependence. With the bargaining position that women obtain on account of economic dependence, it gets retranslated into empowerment. However, the caveat is that 'choice to work' or 'compelled to work' are contexts that demand reflection before inferring that work delivers economic independence and empowerment[6]. Resorting to paid employment on account of structural factors such as poverty and family needs or being forced to undertake employment by a dominating spouse or family members will not result in economic independence as there is no scope to exercise control on her earning and income. Thus, work will yield empowerment only when work is taken as choice to earn an income and when she is able to exercise her control on her earnings. This will engender a sense of economic security as her access to resources and bargaining position is in part determined by her economic security.

My research is set in the background of Information Technology industry in Bangalore. Acclaimed as the poster child of arrival of New Economy, IT industry is considered to be non-discriminating and an equal opportunity employer for both men and women, minorities and

handicapped all alike. It is characterized with several distinguishing features such as high degree of integration into the global economy; distinctive and apparently employee friendly human resource policies; women-friendly work environment and attractive option for female graduate engineers. The emergence of Information Technology industry in mid-1990s has unveiled a potential employment opportunity for women in this sector congenially befitting their job environment and offering, in principle, least gender discrimination.[7] Its employment potentiality provides inspiration to female students to take up technical and professional courses with an eye on the job market. This is evidenced in the participation of women in the IT industry which has been rapidly growing as compared to other sectors of the economy. The increased business requirement, diversity of skills and competencies has posited IT sector as a major job creator with handsome pay packages.

With the onset of globalization, values of Gender Inclusivity, Diversity and Equality became the buzzwords in the corporate world coupled with an increased awareness that women are equally talented and competent in performing the jobs professionally. IT industry best represents the ethos of globalization wherein the values of equality, inclusivity and diversity have actually become a business imperative.

However, this story is not all fair as it seems. According to NASSCOM-Mencher(2009) report[8], there are large differences among companies while adopting the inclusivity measures. Most reviews reveal that, notwithstanding overall satisfactory gender-neutral pursuit by this sector, an optimal level of gender inclusivity is still to be achieved, especially at the senior level. Gender inequalities and discontentment are very much present among the women employees in this sector along with the gender-based social constraints. Even with more and more women graduates entering into the workforce, it is noticed that the Information Technology is still a male-dominated industry, a result of masculine culture developed over the years that tends to exclude or marginalize women. The women employees are considered important and most suitable to fill the shortage of talent, for cost advantage, for brand building, for better understanding of customer requirements and to realize higher profit margins. This kind of segregation and classification has led to a 'Feminization' of certain category of jobs and imposition of 'Glass ceiling'[9]. The intersectionality of working conditions and work timings, family and societal obligations also present many hindrances to women when compared to men. The theoretical aspect of individualization in the workplace is palpable but at the societal level, patriarchal strategies dominate on the Indian psyche.

This implies that it is not naturally obvious that economic independence will translate into empowerment for women. It is acknowledged that the growing role of IT in India's economy and the focus fold with which the industry is driving around is in part owing to the fact that they are accommodating more women in the workforce. The Indian IT industry has set benchmarks and been the initiator of pioneering work culture for women employees, more than any other industry in India; it has also launched several initiatives which are tailored to women in their workplaces.[10] With these characteristics, IT industry is a befitting field to study the relationship

between work and empowerment. Understanding women's participation in IT industries is important for understanding how women are participating, than just how many are participating.

My study aims to explore the lives of women IT professionals and investigate whether their work empowers them to act in their own agency. It is a common understanding and presumption that economic independence will lead to empowering women but research to establish this relationship has been very limited. My research intends to fill this gap. In my investigation, I aim to investigate the extent to which the policies of inclusion and gender parity, which is the protocol for HR policies in IT sector have actually been successful. I will investigate on where do women locate themselves in the opportunity structure of IT industry. Further, I will probe into the reasons why very few women are able to move up the ladder and reach top management positions in the IT sector despite the 'equal' space that it represents in all aspects.

There is a need to reflect whether IT sector offers a gender-neutral workspace, and if so, is there a need for replace it with gender sensitive workspace. It is noticeable that in the recent past NASSCOM has instigated IT industry to take certain measures for gender responsive needs. My research will identify whether strategic gender needs have been addressed by the industry. Starting from here, I will further investigate on how empowered are these women professionals using the empirical indicators of decision making and determining important choices that define their identity and agency. How and to what extent employment engenders a sense of cognitive empowerment among women.

In order to get a qualitative insight, I will use Ethnography method to study and collect information on the social experience of women professionals in the IT sector. Ethnography will enable me to attempt to fully understand as much as possible about the experiences that women are facing at the work place. The method involves extensive field work and intense familiarity of a group or community through immersion into culture and draws on a family of methods involving direct and sustained contact with human agents, within the context of their daily lives (and cultures)[11]. This will enable in deeper understanding of changes in individual's conduct of life in terms of decision making, participation and independence.

Within the ethnography approach, this research will be predominantly a qualitative research with certain quantitative inputs. To ensure the reliability and validity of the study, the study will follow the triangulation method of balancing qualitative and quantitative methods. Triangulation[12] refers to "the combination of methodologies used in the study of the same phenomena". Quantitative research strategy simply means "a research strategy that emphasizes quantification in the collection and interpretation of data"[13]. Quantitative research[14] method will be used to collect information from women professionals regarding their problems such as conflict, job stress and discrimination. My research design will be Descriptive and Diagnostic in nature as it makes an attempt to explore whether paid employment translates into empowerment in the wider social experience for women in terms of decision making, participation and making strategic choices.



With this approach, my exploration is poised to bring useful insights into the IT workspace and guide recommendations that may have the potential to fill in the missing gaps, address the issues of feminization and glass ceiling and enhance the presence of women at important positions in the IT industry.

## References

1. Upadhya, Carol and Vasavi A.R, Work, culture and Sociality in the Indian IT Industry: A Sociological study, Report submitted to Indo-Dutch Programme for Alternatives in Development, NIAS, Bangalore, 2006.
2. Assad, R., H. Sholkamy and C. Krafft (2011) Is Work Empowering for Women? Evidence from Egypt. Mimeo.Social Research Centre, Cairo.
3. Kabeer,N.,S. Mahmud and S. Tasneem (2011). Does Paid Work Provide a Pathway to Women's Empowerment?Empirical Findings from Bangladesh. IDS Working Paper No. 375. Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex.
4. Kandiyoti, D., (1988). Bargaining with Patriarchy, *Gender and Society*,2(3)
5. Kabeer, N. (2011). Contextualizing the Economic Pathways of Women's Empowerment. Findings From a Multi-Country Research Programme. Pathways Policy Paper. Institute of Development Studies, University ofSussex, Brighton.
6. ibid Assad et al .p 16
7. Nayyar, Deepak,Globalisation:What Does It Mean for Higher Education?, *Economic Political Weekly*, 42(50),2007.
8. NASSCOM-Mencher, Gender Inclusivity in India: Building Empowered organisation. New Delhi: NASSCOM, 2009.
9. Arfken, D. E., S. L. Bellar, M. M. Helms,The Ultimate Glass Ceiling Revisited: The Presence of Women on Corporate Boards", *Journal of Business Ethics*, 50 (2), 2004, 177-86.
10. ibid 8
11. ibid
12. Denzin, N.K. (1978). *The Research Act* (2nd ed.).New York: McGraw-Hill.
13. Bryman, A. (2008). *Social Research Methods* (3rd ed.).Oxford: Oxford University Press.
14. Ibid

## **Breaking Boundaries- Women In The Non-Traditional Sector**

**Radhika Uppal**

Azad Foundation, New Delhi, India

**Amrita Gupta**

Azad Foundation, New Delhi, India

amrita.gupta@azadfoundation.com

### **Background**

The concept of development that emerged in the neo-liberal era of free-market, globalization and liberalization opened new avenues in the form of work available for women, push for equal economic participation and options like micro-credit that aimed to economically empower women. However, despite these opportunities that began about four decades ago struggle for gender parity in economic participation, gendered division of labour, gender pay-gap and gender blind economic policies are still a reality. This has happened because, the popular conception of development projected by the neo-liberal era of free market economy aimed at giving women ‘choices’ within an existing social order rather than transforming the power relations thereby limiting the full participation of women in the economy.[1]

The United Nations High Level Political Forum report[2] reiterates how social norms are an impediment in achieving overall development. These social norms create obstacles for women to achieve their full potential and contain them within socially expected roles, giving little space for transcending beyond them. This is catalyzed by women’s lack of awareness of their rights and a non-conducive environment to access and exercise the same.

Critics of neo-liberalisation have commented that it has led to a ‘feminisation’ of labour, accompanied by a deterioration of working conditions – casualisation, flexibilisation, violation of international labour standards and low wages (Moghadam 2005). The United Nations Population Fund report, (The State of World Population, 2017) states that “Once in the paid labour force, women everywhere find themselves earning less than men for the same types of work; engaging more frequently in unskilled, low-wage labour; or spending less time in income-generating work and more time in unpaid caregiving work at home”. In fact, the prevalent occupational segregation by gender wherein women’s work is accorded a lower ‘value’ than men’s work has furthered the push for lower wage, long and often unsafe working conditions and more casual work. Such occupational segregation actually reiterates and reinforces the unequal gendered power structure prevalent in society and gendered norms where women are relegated to the “private-reproductive” while men to the “public-productive” domain of work.

Though these barriers and glass ceilings have been broken by a few, a majority of women (particularly from disadvantaged communities) continue to be deprived of equitable economic

opportunities and per-force participate in gender stereotyped professions in addition to holding the multiple burdens of domestic and reproductive responsibilities which go unaccounted and hence undervalued. As per United Nations report World's Women 2015, in developing countries women on an average spend 50 min extra daily on paid and unpaid work and 3.10 hour extra in unpaid work as compared to men. Such a situation therefore becomes counterproductive to the concept of gender equality and decent work for all women and men and has an overall negative impact on economic growth.

India is currently ranked 108 out of 144 (dropped 21 places from last year) countries in the Global Gender Index as per the World Economic Forum Report, 2017 which is reflective of the persistence of gender inequalities even after seven decades of independence and close to three decades of liberalization. This poor performance is linked to the low and shrinking participation of women in the Indian economy. India is ranked amongst the ten lowest countries (136 out of 144 countries covered by the report) for women's workforce participation as per this report. Internally, India's female labor force participation rate was only 27%<sup>[3]</sup> in 2014. The rate has declined over the last decade from 37% to 27%. In contrast, the rate in the neighboring South Asian countries such as Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Nepal, Pakistan has either remained constant or increased during the past decade which reflects poorly on the Indian situation.

The Indian situation is a classic example of how the gendered nature of workforce participation and unequal labor market impedes women from succeeding in the neo-liberal market where they are forced to compete on common grounds despite being in an unequal social structure that subjugates and discriminates against them. The inequality of opportunities faced by women in accessing and exercising even their basic rights, intensifies the disadvantageous position of women in a free-market capitalist economy which is solely concerned about individual gains and profits.

In the backdrop of this bleak scenario, this study draws on narratives of women from India who despite the challenges, have tried to break the occupational segregation of work and enter into non-traditional livelihoods (NTL)<sup>[4]</sup> such as professional driving, electricians, masons, amongst others. As women challenge the status quo (in this case around gender stereotyping of work) and enter into 'non-feminine' domain of work, they do exercise their choice but what are the implications of this choice and how do they negotiate at the level of family, community, market, state and navigate through the challenges faced to create their own identity with dignity, will form the core thought of this paper. The study will focus on the NTL option namely professional driving (including driving all-women cabs, driving for a multi-national cab aggregator cab company (Uber), working with five-star hotels, private companies, households, amongst others.

## **Objectives**

The study aims to present the challenges faced, strategies employed and lived experiences of urban resource poor women working as professional drivers including commercial cab drivers across the varied spectrums of their lives such as at home, community, their self-development and

how this enabled a shift in thought, articulation and body image from ignorance to awareness, from silence to speaking out, from hesitation to confidence and from conformity to assertion in these women. Through the transformational voices of professional women chauffeurs, the study will showcase how they have become ‘drivers of change’ literally and metaphorically.

Even though neo-liberalism stresses on “individual choice”, it does not challenge the prevalent social order and existing power relations which affect an individual’s ability for decision making. The study explores through women’s narratives how these women, negotiated such a crucial decision to enter into a non-traditional domain of work which is dominated by males (professional driving) and moving out of the confines of the community to public spaces is full of challenges wherein they are fighting gendered social roles and restrictions (around work and mobility for women) within the family and in the community.

Further, it also tries to understand the struggle of women employed in the transport sector when they take on the road in a situation where there is a lack of basic civic infrastructure which creates unsafe working conditions which are often not conducive for sustenance. The absence of clean public toilets (daily as well as during menstruation days), street-lights in the night, emergency response in case of car-breakdown, harassment on the street amongst others and how women negotiate through these struggles while being employed as professional drivers.

### **Research Methodology**

The paper uses a qualitative methodology, namely case studies of professional women drivers to capture narratives of their transformation as they overcome initial hindrances, are able to exercise their agency and challenge gendered boundaries, in a hitherto closed workspace for women and even at home. These case studies are of drivers trained by NGO Azad Foundation (Azad) and provided employment opportunities in partnership with Sakha Consulting Wings Pvt. Ltd. Sakha, based on the social enterprise for profit model, provides safe private chauffeur and cab services for women by women.

Azad Foundation registered as a Trust in 2008 with the primary goal of giving resource-poor women the opportunity and access to their right to livelihood with dignity in a hitherto closed workspace. Breaking patriarchal norms regarding gender stereotyping of work (categorization of work as feminine and masculine) and creating opportunities that will enable women earn remunerative livelihoods with dignity was the catalyst towards starting this organization. With this objective, Azad started its core program- Women on Wheels (WoW) with the aim of training and empowering resource poor women to become professional and commercial chauffeurs while it’s for profit sister company Sakha provided remunerative and safe employment options to women trained by Azad. In this way Women on Wheels also offered safe and alternate transport options to women travelers in selected urban cities.

Azad takes a twin approach to address problems of unemployment, poverty and gender bias facing young women in urban slums across several cities in India. The headline focus is on

bringing non-traditional livelihoods to these women, enabling them to earn a decent living and change their economic status through training in professional driving. Integral to this, is an empowerment programme that is seen as essential for giving women the voice, confidence and tools to overcome the multiple barriers they face. Driving is a highly male dominated occupation and women drivers constitute a challenge to gendered notions of work and skills; the training in both technical and life skills (provided by Azad, along with sustained emotional, financial and social support) aims to create mobility, remunerative income, as well as a sense of confidence and identity for these women. This rights-based approach enables women to overcome structural barriers and challenge the status quo by giving them the ability to negotiate with a range of stakeholders at home, community, market and state.

The case studies will capture women's narratives of transformation, the role of their training in Azad and how working in a non-traditional livelihood option has helped them negotiate their boundaries and create a space for themselves in an ever-changing neo-liberal world.

## **References**

1. Cornwall A, Gideon J and Wilson K (2008), Introduction: Reclaiming Feminism: Gender and Neoliberalism. IDS Bulletin, Volume 39 (6).
2. <https://www.empowerwomen.org/en/who-we-are/initiatives/sg-high-level-panel-on-womens-economic-empowerment>
3. [http://epod.cid.harvard.edu/files/epod/files/shramshakti\\_posters.pdf](http://epod.cid.harvard.edu/files/epod/files/shramshakti_posters.pdf)
4. Non-Traditional Livelihood refers to livelihood practices<sup>2</sup> that help women break stereotypes emerging from the intersections of gender, caste, class, religion, sexual orientation, disabilities and other marginalities and oppressive structures, within a dynamic context of space and time. NTL increases the set of viable livelihood choices available to women and give them access and control over skills, technology, market, mobility and resources. It creates economic stability along with psychological, social and political empowerment. Some examples of the same include training women to become drivers, masons, electricians etc.

# **The Travails Of Doing Business On The Streets Of Aizawl: A Gendered Perspective**

**Rama Ramaswamy**

Assistant Professor, Department of Commerce, Mizoram University, Aizawl  
ramswamy@mzu.edu.in

Local street markets play a crucial role in livelihood security and are at the epicenter of local commerce. Street entrepreneurship has always been subsumed under the realm of informal economy and till recent times ignored and disdained. However, in refutation of the early views on informal entrepreneurship as simply a residue or leftover from an earlier mode of production and as a disappearing phenomenon, research studies in recent times have depicted them as entrepreneurs possessing entrepreneurial attributes, traits and qualities.

Informal sector is an expanding phenomenon in the contemporary global economy. It is estimated that out of global working population of about three billion, nearly two thirds (1.8 billion) are informal workers (Jutting and Laiglesia, 2009). According to the ILO (2002), the informal sector accounts for 93 percent of the total workforce in India. Moreover, in all developing regions, self-employment comprises a greater share of informal employment (outside agriculture) than wage employment, specifically; self-employment represents 70 per cent of informal employment in sub-Sahara Africa, 62 per cent in North Africa, 60 percent in Latin America and 59 percent in Asia. The self-employed constitute 52 per cent of non-agricultural informal employment in India (ILO, 2002). Notably nearly one-third of the work force in India's informal comprised women, and these women contributed to 20 per cent of the GDP of India (National Sample Survey, 2005). It is evident that Informal entrepreneurs can no more be considered at the fringe of the Indian economy and relegated as insignificant.

Street vending is one of the world's oldest and most widespread occupations. Researchers have found that street vending; despite the problems it faces is a growing phenomenon in both developed and developing economies. In most of the Indian cities, the urban poor survive by working in the informal sector. Poverty and lack of employment in the rural areas and smaller towns drive large numbers of people to the cities for work (Bhowmik, 2007).

The present study covers Thakthing street market, the largest street market in Aizawl, located in the southern part of Aizawl city, extending from Kulikawn to Sikulpuikawn on Saturdays. The Saturday street market in Mizoram is popularly known as the 'Zing bazaar'. The history of this street market can be traced to the early 1980s when around twenty street vendors sold vegetables on the pavements of the road from Sikulpuikawn to Thakthing Tlang. The market comprises predominantly of tribal women selling their wares on the busy street. All kinds of products from clothes, toiletries, household electrical appliances, footwear, clothes, vegetables, fruits, cereals etc are sold on the pavement by the street vendors. Farmers from far flung villages arrive in the market on Friday night to sell their vegetables in the street market and stay on the pavements often with their children till late Saturday evening.

The word Thakthing means cinnamon, denoting that cinnamon as widely grown in this hill. The stretch from Thakthing to Thakthing Tlang is closed for vehicular traffic from the early hours of Saturday morning as the customers start streaming in from the wee hours of Saturday morning. The peak hours of the market are from 7-11 am when the street becomes crowded with customers.

### **Objectives and Methodology**

This paper provides insights on socio economic profile of the entrepreneurs, their business practices and the challenges faced by the women selling vegetables on the streets.

The present study covers Thakthing Street market, the largest street market in Mizoram, located in the southern part of the capital city, Aizawl. The study is based on primary data collected through field research by administering a structured questionnaire/schedule to a sample of 196 entrepreneurs (out of about 400 entrepreneurs selling vegetables) in the street market of Thakthing on Saturdays during July to December 2015.

### **Findings**

Women entrepreneurs played a dominant role in the zing bazaar comprising about 96 per cent of the sample entrepreneurs. The street entrepreneurs were not organised under any association. Though the literacy rates were high (90 percent), 50 per cent of the respondents attained only primary level of education, about 30 per cent completed secondary level education and eight per cent possessed college degrees. Farmers comprised about 30 per cent of the sample entrepreneurs. It was observed that these farmers dwell in far flung villages in the hinterland of Aizawl and arrived late at night on Fridays to sell their vegetables in the zing bazaar. They unloaded their vegetables from the Tata Sumo vehicles and piled them on the pavements or outside the shutters of shops or parking spaces of residences on the streets of Thakthing and huddled with their children alongside. In the absence of designated sheltered place for them, weather conditions posed many hardships on them.

It was distressing to note that only 40 per cent of the sample entrepreneurs owned weights to measure vegetables whereas the others usually placed stones or other measures to measure the weight of vegetables. About 67 percent of the entrepreneurs procured vegetables produced in Mizoram whereas 33 per cent sourced vegetables produced outside Mizoram. The most significant infrastructural constraint faced by the entrepreneurs was 'lack of transportation' followed by 'lack of shelter in extreme climatic conditions' and 'high cost of transportation.' 55 per cent of respondents selected a place on basis of close proximity to friends or relatives, parking spaces or corridors of acquaintances' homes whereas 28 per cent selected a place which had closer proximity to customers. Public sanitation facilities were not available to these women and usually they accessed the houses of local residents for personal hygiene and sanitation.

Thakthing zing bazaar is at the epicenter of local commerce, providing livelihood to the entrepreneurs and meeting the weekly needs of the people of Aizawl and these entrepreneurs should not anymore be considered as at the fringe of the society. The researchers have chalked out suggestions to mitigate the challenges of the entrepreneurs and enable the market become a vibrant hub of commerce.

# **Socio-Economic Exclusion and Discrimination Of Women In Domestic Work And Sanitation Work (Scavenging)**

**Ravi A Gajbhiye**

**Kavita Chohan**

TISS Mumbai

kavya.chauhan85@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

Women in domestic work face exclusion and discrimination in India. Absence of a law and policy for domestic workers and sanitation workers add more disadvantages. A Very few studies on domestic workers are available on exploring discrimination and exclusion. Mostly SCs and STs, OBCs women work in domestic work. SCs women are not allowed to work in Kitchen because of untouchability. OBCs women are allowed in some extend to work in household work.

India's social structure is based on caste system. It decides one occupation and social status; birth fixes it. It is a hierarchy of caste and sub-caste. A privilege for one caste is the disadvantage for another caste. Women are found in lower in the hierarchies of castes. SCs, STs Women are more suffered from the variety of difficulty in earning their livelihood. Women working in domestic workers mostly come from SCs, STs and OBCs, castes. The finding of the study suggests that practice of untouchability in occupation is relatively higher with SCs. SCs women in domestic work assign 'cleaning and washing jobs, they do not permit to work in a kitchen. There is no policy and law to control discrimination and humiliation in this occupation. But there is an only positive outcome that they want good education and future for their children, their children are first generation learner and women in domestic work inspire from Dr. Ambedkar thoughts in hoping to change the prospect.

Theoretical assessment of urbanization and discrimination:

- Pune based deputy director, Medha Khole, a Brahmin, has filed a police complaint against her cook, Nirmala Yadav, backward caste (OBC) caste. The complaint is that Nirmala Yadav is not a Brahmin, at the time of appointment she said, she is Brahmin. Only Brahmin housemaid cooks 'pure' meals on death anniversaries and festivals of Gauri ganpati. Thus, Nirmala, a maid, has ruined norms and ritual, Khole says "I got to know her real caste recently and I felt that my God was desecrated. The Akhil Bhartiya Brahmin Mahasabha initially came out in Khole's support. Most important is that police have lodge the case against Nirmala yadav for impuring gods of Brahmin.
- Other incidents of domestic workers, Vimala Mangade said, I belong to SC caste, earlier nobody hire me as a cook. Before hiring they ask my caste name. According to Kiran Moghe, chairperson of Pune Union of Housemaid and Domestic Workers, "Discrimination



on caste lines is still followed.

- An Ahmedabad based NGO has given an advertisement for sanitation workers, inviting application from General category candidate, upper caste Hindu, Muslim and christen communities are giving preference will be given to members of upper castes like Brahmins and Kshatriyas and Patels, Jains, Vaniyas, Parsis, Saiyads, Pathans and Syrian Christians. Picture of this add went viral on internet. It triggered protest among higher caste, they attacked on this NGOs, is saying how can we work as a sanitation worker. Muslim bohari said they are ancestor of Paigaber, how can we work. Many upper castes including Hindu, Muslim and christen said that, it is a job of lower caste people SCs. In the advertisement director of NGO, Prasad Chacko's put the signature claiming to promote social equality. The members of the Brahmo Samaj, Police Lok Seva Raskshak Samiti and NSUI – claimed that the motive was to promote enmity between different groups. This adds is meant to point to equality said by Govind parmar, a lawyer. He pointed out that why only Scheduled caste does this job, why not other castes? Making city clean is the responsibility of SCs only. NGOs said we wanted some positive change to end discrimination against sanitation workers? But what we learn from it?

It is much argued that the caste system has now invisible from public spaces, due to development. It is now only confine to private spaces. But it is partly true. The caste system presence in both public and private space, one may argue about intensity of the caste system. 'The working community of sanitation workers, scavengers and domestic workers are the public manifestation of the caste system.

### **Objective**

To understand the socio-economic exclusion of women in domestic work

To explore various incidents of discrimination of women in domestic work

### **Methodology**

This paper will use secondary sources of data to explore discrimination and exclusion. Published and unpublished paper will be used to theorize exclusion in domestic work.

# **The Precarity among Women Workforce in Handloom Sector at Sualkuchi, Assam**

**Reshmi**

TISS, Mumbai

reshmi.haque230@gmail.com,

## **Abstract**

Women are the key drivers of rural economy; they are influencing the transition of whole economic setup. It is widely acknowledged that informal sector is the primary source of employment for women in developing countries and Indian context, handloom industry is the second largest industry after agriculture which provide employment. Traditionally, the role of women is limited to household and domestic issues only. But, in new century, women are striking hard on old patriarchal and stereotyped views and making their own way in employment and labour market. Nonetheless, it is stark reality that despite being well qualified they are facing the challenges of stereotyped perception and prejudice, which is deeply rooted in this male dominated society. The present study based on precarity faced by women handloom weavers at Sualkuchi, Assam. At Sualkuchi about 85% household livelihood is based on handloom weaving, in which 80% weavers are women. Demographically, in weaving women weavers are dominant but still their condition is precarious. This paper identifies the challenges faced by women weavers due to their gender issues. It explores that women are facing differences in domestic work also and treated as commodity. It is found that these women are predominantly belong to scheduled cast, scheduled tribes and minority community. These women face struggle at workplace as well as domestic work. In addition, this study shows that how stereotype views work as an impediment before their supervisory role; it seems women weavers always considered as docile worker to get done more work. The study raises unique concern that despite being skilled women weavers are always kept in the bottom line of hierarchy. The article discusses their common challenges through various theoretical framework and presents a holistic overview of the subject. This study underscores that without addressing the problem of women workers, we cannot empower our half population, who are struggling for their equal rights. This study reveals that women workers are exposed to job related insecurity due to maternity.

This paper reveals some major reasons which force women workers to work in handloom industry are economic necessity, unemployment, poverty, low income, low literacy and large family size. Social restriction and obligation are curtailing their wings to fly high. The study reveals that few women weavers have desire and skill to become entrepreneur but due to socioeconomic constraint they fail to do so; despite their painful journey they are endeavoring to get social recognition and suitable place. The study found that rudimentary technology, debt, competition with power looms

and reluctance by the government are the common constraint in front of their development and empowerment. Handloom weavers exposed to high risk with their health, while they are doing work. Weaving process require long static work, which causes various occupational diseases and study shows that women weavers are more fragile to these diseases. The stress of playing balancing role as parent and employee is sometime causing breakdown, feeling of low self-esteem and alienation.

The present study collect data through snowball sampling method; the responses of women weavers were collected through unstructured, in-depth interview and open-ended question.

## **Women In Workplace: Gender Issues**

**Ms Ruby Ahluwalia,**

IRAS, Govt Of India

ahluwaliaruby@hotmail.com

### **Abstract**

Having been born to my parents as their first child after 4 miscarriages had put me in a so called advantageous position. It was after 2 years that my brother was born. We grew up in a very equitable eco system wherein I was always treated in a way which never made me feel or think about gender differences. I grew up to study, play and do all extracurricular activities ie swimming, horse-riding and skating. Never ever was I put to a disadvantage because I was a female gender. Therefore, I also learnt to treat people as human beings without any gender specifications. It still does not cross my mind as to how I talk or behave amongst my male or female colleagues. I did my Research in Economics from Lucknow, in Uttar Pradesh comparatively a small town 30 years back. And then qualified for Civil services in 1986. Having becoming a part of Indian Bureaucracy, I joined the Department of Railways in 1988 and performed my duties in various capacities in small and big places. Inspected stations and other aspects of railways in the day and night. In this organization also, I never felt discriminated against, by any authority. It does not mean that I did not come across men who did not behave inappropriately but it never looked like it was organized discrimination against my gender. I thought I knew how to deal with any kind of inappropriate advances by anyone and thus it never formed any scars whatsoever. In fact, many a times I came across some kind of discriminatory behavior from women bosses which was more authority related. Most women may find it difficult to appreciate or promote competent younger women compared to younger competent males. Women see younger women as competition and thus put them down. This is a mental construct which in my opinion also needs attention. It gets formed at a very early age in women because of the ecosystem in which they grow in. When young girls are brought up in an environment of abundance, wherein they are told that they are 'ENOUGH' as themselves, they develop lesser insecurities and thus find solace and strength from stronger and more competent women around them rather than seeing them as threat. This environment of mutual trust and faith is important for women to grow up in. The Government of India as an entity does not discriminate against women in any which way. There is equal pay for equal work and women are exposed to similar opportunities if found to be equally competent at all levels. In my personal experience I have noticed women being found to be more reliable in their work by their superiors. However, I have also found that most women think of being a 'high performer' in their work and being committed to their families as mutually exclusive. Thus, at times they do not take up opportunities of higher responsibilities and do not dream that high in their work environment. In my personal experience I have not found this equation to be true. I have never shied away from any opportunity which

came my way just because I was a woman. Once I had turned down a foreign assignment of a long period as my children were small and I did not think I would be happy leaving them behind. That was a personal choice I made out of prioritizing at that point of time. With the age of the children and the gravity of the situation the priorities kept getting redefined and a fine balance could be maintained. As a result, today I neither blame my children nor my job for not giving enough time to one at the cost of the other. I am grateful to my family and my work both, to let me become the person I am today. I am of the opinion that the fight is of the strong and the weaker ones whether amongst human beings or animals. Till the time women are considered to be weaker they will be discriminated against. And women will be considered to be weaker only if they are weaker. If God has equipped, both men and women with similar intellect and physical capabilities then what is it, that makes women feel weaker? It is that environment in which girls grow that makes most women feel weaker. In quite a few tribes the women are considered absolutely equal and are brought up in a safe environment of trust. Even today there are states in India where girls blossom as they would like to. Most women are able to work and move around in these states without fear. It is high time that we do not waste time in asking and begging for equal rights. The days of going to the roads and protesting and asking someone else to give us freedom and equal rights are over. Freedom is not begged or grabbed, it needs to be achieved through developing platforms where we encourage women to get together and become productive partners in the economy. We need to create spaces where girls can learn, where their skills can be honed, where they learn to read and write. We have to create safe havens for the girls to grow in. And we need to do it ourselves. The Government seems to be doing its bit. We as women need to take the baton in our own hands and utilize each 'right' that exists. We need to ensure that in all kinds of jobs there are 50 % women. We need to ensure at all times there are at least 50 percent women on the roads walking, there are 50 % sales women, there are 50 % buyers, there are 50 % women travelers, 50% bus drivers, conductors, police, army personnel and 50 % politicians. Every girl around you needs a little bit of support We have to start with US and NOW.

## **Gender Inclusion and Information Technology Industry**

**Dr. Ruby Ojha**

Professor and Head, Department of Economics, SNDT Women's University, Mumbai  
ojha.ruby@gmail.com

### **Abstract**

As per the Media Reports of Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion (DIPP) Statistics, Department of Information and Technology, Union Budget 2017-18, the global IT & ITeS market (excluding hardware) has reached US\$ 1.2 trillion in 2016-17. The global sourcing market increased by 1.7 times to reach US\$ 1.73-1.78 trillion in the same year. Growing at 7.5 per cent of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (7.7% in 2016) this industry in India is likely to reach US\$ 2.50 trillion by 2020. India remained the world's top sourcing destination in 2016-17 with a global share of 55 per cent. Indian IT & ITeS companies have set up over 1,000 global delivery centers in over 200 cities around the world. The main reason behind this phenomenal growth is India's cost competitiveness in providing IT services. India is approximately 3-4 times cheaper than the US in the global sourcing market.

The planners' efforts undertaken to develop the information technology sector in India have yielded good results in terms of export earnings and established the country's credibility in international markets. India is also gaining importance for its intellectual capital as several global IT firms have set up their innovation centers in India. India has the highest proportion of digital talent in the country at 76 per cent whereas; the global average is 56 per cent.

Indian IT's core competencies and strengths have attracted significant investments from major countries. The computer software and hardware sector in India attracted cumulative Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) inflows US\$ 29.825 billion from April 2000 to December 2017, according to data released by the Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion (DIPP).

However, the main role of this sector seems to generate foreign exchange for the country rather than focusing on providing linkages for overall economic development to the whole economy. If we make a reasonable assumption that access to computers (and to computer-based electronic communications) is empowering, then 80 per cent of the Indian people who do not have access to computers and who do not have good enough English education for computer use will not be considered as empowered. The exclusion of majority of Indian population from the 'information age' raises questions about politics and culture of software that are important not only to India, but to the entire world.

Number of working women in India is highest in the world. Out of total working population of approximately 400 million, 30 to 35 per cent are women. Out of these women, a large number is working in unorganized rural areas. Only 20 per cent work in urban India, a very small fraction of

which works in the organized sector. Whatever is the number of educated, English speaking working women in urban India is largely due to the growth of the IT-BPO industry, which is one of the largest recruiters of a qualified workforce in recent times. This study aims at finding out how inclusive has been India's IT/BPO sector, with respect to women.

It is a general understanding that women, who throughout the history of technological development in Agriculture as well as in the industrial sector, have been displaced from their traditional work, are now gaining advantage from the growth of the Information Technology Industry. One welcome change is witnessed in the Indian IT sector that it employs women in large numbers.

The fact is that the advantage of working in IT sector is available only to English speaking young urban women and it is also alleged that women are employed only in low paid jobs in this industry.

The need of providing equal opportunities to women was felt first of all in North America in nineties. As most of India's leading IT-BPO companies were closely working with large global companies, they also became part of implementation of their gender inclusivity policies. This is why IT-BPO companies have been among the first to realize the impact of gender inclusivity on business success. On the other hand, the disadvantages of odd working hours, exploitation, insecurity, lower salary, displacement from service when pregnant, discrimination in promotion etc. are the problems which women in Indian IT sector face and that is needed to be explored.

## **Objectives**

Considering the scenario mentioned above main objectives of the study are identified as follows:

- i. To discuss the socio-economic profile of women in Indian IT industry.
- ii. To analyze the problems faced by women in Indian IT industry which are detrimental to the industry's inclusive growth from gender perspective.
- iii. To make suggestions for making the Indian IT industry more and more gender inclusive.

## **Methodology**

The study is based on the primary data. The data were collected through questionnaires from 200 women working in IT industry of Mumbai city for analyzing the problems faced by women in this industry which are detrimental to the industry's inclusive growth from gender perspective. For selecting the respondents, non-probability sample method was used. Women were selected randomly from various firms functioning in IT sector at different levels. The data were analyzed using SPSS. Simple statistical tools like percentage, averages, Chi square, regression were used and the analyzed data were presented in tables and charts using MS Excel.

## Summary of Findings

### Socio-economic Profile

Out of 200 women working in IT sector contacted for collection of data, 80% were in the age group of 21-30. 9% women were even below the age of 21. Only 11% women were above the age of 30 years out of which only two women were above the age of 40 years. This shows preference of the employers for giving jobs to younger women.

68% women were unmarried which shows that women with family responsibilities are less inclined to take up employment in IT sector as the pressure of work seems to be high due to time bound projects. This suits to the employers also.

The sample working women were highly educated. They possessed degrees like B.Tech/BE /MCA, MTech / ME, BSC IT, CA, MBA, Ph.D., Master in Finance etc. though 70 respondents had non-technical degrees. The organisations where they were working are, IRIS Business Services Ltd, Idea, Jabong, Lawruuee Infotech, Computime Consultancy Ltd., Global Info Services, ACC, Flipkart, Big suns Technology, Global Info Solutions, Modelert Builders Ltd and Vodafone.

Out of 200 respondents 57 (28.5%) had less than one year of experience in their job. 62 (31%) had 1-3 years of experience and 57 (28.5%) had 3-6 years of experience. Only 24 (12%) women had experience of more than 6 years. Thus more than 60% of the total respondents were having experience of less than three years. Designation-wise their number is given in following table. The table shows that more than 75% of the respondents were working as team members or trainees.

Particulars	No of respondents	Percentage
Trainee	46	23.0
Team Member	107	53.5
Team Leader	29	14.5
Project Leader	9	4.5
Senior Project Manager	9	4.5
Director or above	Zero	-
Total	200	100

### Family Support

Data reveal that out of 74 (37%) women who responded to the question of family support, 54 unmarried women said that the family has given them full freedom to pursue their career and do not have any expectations for carrying out domestic responsibilities. Whereas these numbers for married women, including one divorced, were only 20. The data show that about 40% (54 out of 136 total) unmarried and 33% (20 out of 62) married women get full support of the family in



pursuing their career. These results are not very encouraging.

85 women (42.5%) who responded that family has given them freedom to pursue their career and helps them to carry out domestic responsibilities, 59 were unmarried while only 26 were married. These women are not completely free from the family responsibilities but get help from the family members in carrying out the same. The number of married women getting family support is less than that of unmarried women.

11 women (5 married, 5 unmarried and 1 divorced) replied that family expects them to compromise at work place for carrying out domestic responsibilities. Even worse was the response of 16 women who say that families wants them to work because they earn but show nagging behavior when it comes to fulfilling family responsibilities. 6 women were working against the will of their family members as the families want their working women members to quit the work for carrying out domestic responsibilities.

We have got the encouraging trends in analysis of the question related to reasons of working. Out of 200 respondents, 180 have reported that they are working for Career Aspiration or for Own Identity or any other reason. Only 23 women were working due to Financial Compulsions. 10 women were even found working because of family pressure.

When these women were asked about why did they select the IT sector most (33%) of them selected the option of better growth prospects. Other preferred options were good work culture (13%), better remuneration (12%), good office ambience (11%), or work is suitable for women (9%). Most of these women were even trained in the same field and had decided to join this industry from their students' days itself.

### **Office Support**

Most of the respondents (89%) found their senior office staff members encouraging and understanding or helping. 22% found them neutral. Only 9% women reported negative attitude from their seniors like - being discouraging and fault finding or making work more or even making fun of them. Subordinates were also mostly found helping (46%), obedient (18.5%), courteous (18%). 17.5% women found their subordinates neutral. Only 6.5% women found that their subordinates resent working under a woman boss. 2% women thought that subordinates do not listen and only 1% found subordinates making fun. In general respondents found the office environment very considerate (20%), good (50%) and ok (19%). Only one person found the office environment bad.

When the respondents were asked about the working hours 37 % women found that suitable. 43.5% women responded that even flexi hours are possible. 18.5 % felt the working hours are not different from any other office. Only 10.5% felt that working hours are not suitable for women.

### **Gender Inclusion**

When the respondents were asked whether IT sector has provided good earning opportunity for

Women, 84% responses were affirmative. For most of the respondents (26.8%) reason for saying yes to the question was better growth prospects in the industry. The second most important reason found by 23.8% respondents was flexible and accommodating nature of the industry. About 15% women found the industry good for women. Other reasons reported by the respondents were equal treatment (12.5%), booming industry (9%), better salary (8.3%) and 4.8% thought that the working environment in the industry is good.

The sample respondents were asked about their understanding of gender inclusion. Most of the women (47.5%) considered equal opportunities to men and women as gender inclusion. 39% respondents felt there should be no gender bias. Other responses were active participation of women in all fields (5.5%), freedom to work as men (3%) and women should not feel left out (2.5%). Women also responded to whether working environment is gender inclusive in their office. 75% felt that the environment is gender inclusive but 22% did not feel so. Six women did not respond to this question.

Women also responded about why they felt that their office is gender inclusive. They found it so because large numbers of women are employed in the company (26%), anti-sexual harassment norms are in place in this company (27%), all the applicable social security benefits are provided to men and women on par (29%) women are generally employed on permanent basis and not on contractual basis (17%), there are provisions for maternity/paternity leave or long break for child education without loss of any benefit of continuity in service and it properly implemented also (37%), flexi leave policy (19.5%) and transportation policy (19%).

After getting such positive response about gender inclusive environment the question was asked whether women working in their organization are able to utilize their full potential. 83% of the respondents gave affirmative answer.

About gender discrimination it was found that maximum discrimination takes place in shift allotment and work distribution. Other important ways to discriminate are found in assignment of lucrative assignments and promotions. Besides, in training opportunity, monetary and other benefits, foreign tours and in salary also discrimination was observed.

Women generally faced problem of frequent working beyond the working hours and odd working hours in IT industry. Some women also reported various types of discrimination, lack of social security measures; contractual nature of work, glass ceiling, no personal security and frequent touring within and outside the country as general problems faced by them.

## **Conclusion**

When we consider that percentage of these educated women, both married or unmarried, from the educated, career-oriented families staying in the most modern Indian city of Mumbai who are getting fair support from their families in pursuing their career is so less, it shows that patriarchal mentality of even this strata of the society is yet to change. Women's work still gets the secondary

status when it comes to bear the family responsibilities. This clearly indicates that working women even in urban educated class are facing the double burden as the society does not seem to value their contribution besides the money that they earn.

However, the office support was found reasonably good and gender inclusive. Very few women found problems in working environment due to family responsibilities, glass ceiling, less opportunities to perform higher roles, voluntary attrition of working women due to marriage, children or relocation etc. Discrimination was also reported in shift allotment and work distribution, assignment of lucrative assignments and promotions, training opportunity, monetary and other benefits, foreign tours and sometimes in salary.

When the respondents were asked to give suggestions for improving the situation, 13 women said the industry is great as it is, 86 did not respond and 7 did not know what to say. However, 58 women suggested that equality of gender and age should be there at work place. Gender sensitization for better behavior of men in helping to juniors and flexi hours were suggested by some. Overall it can be said that urban educated working women are facing more problems at home than at workplace.

## References

- Agarwal Ranjana 'Digital Technology and Women Empowerment Employment Dimensions in India ' www.
- In Focus, "Gender Inclusivity and Diversity in the Indian IT-BPO Industry Building on women Power, Newline November 2008.
- India Call Center Jobs- Advantages, Disadvantage and Future BPO Trends by Swati Category- Bussiness and Finance, Post Date 23-06-2008.
- NASSCOM (1999), The Informaiton Technology Workforce, India's National Association of Software and Service Companies, New Delhi.
- NASSCOM Mercer, "Gender Inclusivity in India" Building Empowered Organisations, year 2008, New Delhi.
- Shahi Avinash "88% Women Subjected to Sexual Harassment at Workplace in IT Sector Survey, Date- 8-12-2011.
- Suryanarayana, M.H. (2013), Inclusive Growth: A sustainable Perspective, United Nations Development Programme, 55 Lodhi Estate, Post Box No. 3059, New Delhi 110003, India
- Suryanarayana, M.H., (2008), "What Is Exclusive About 'Inclusive Growth'?" Economic and Political Weekly, October 25, 2008.
- Mcmillin, Divya C (2006) "Outsourcing Identities: Call Centers and Cultural Transformation in India", Economic and Political Weekly January 21, 2006, PP-235
- Ghotoskar, Sujata (2006), Review Article - Gender and Work in the 'Digital Economy' in

Gender and the Digital Economy: Perspectives from the Developing World” edited by Cecilia Ng and Swasti Mitter; Sage Publications, New Delhi/Thousand Oaks, London, 2005; published in Economic and Political Weekly, April 22, 2006, pp 1517

- Chitre, Vikas (2003), “Global Slowdown and the Indian Economy”, Economic and Political Weekly May 24, 2003, PP-2056
- Morris, Sebastian (2003), “Competition, Regulation and Strategy: The Information Technology Industry”, Economic and Political Weekly, August 16, 2003 pp - 3494

# **Understanding Perceptions and Experiences of Aspiring Teachers: A Comparative study between D.Ed. and B.Ed students**

**Ms. Rupali Sakpal**

Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

rupali.sakpal88@gmail.com

## **Abstracts**

This study tries to understand Teacher Education programmes in India. In Teacher Education programmes, are Dipolma in Education (D.Ed) and Bachelor of Education (B.Ed) programmes are going in India. These two programmes are professional programmes to want become a Teacher. D.Ed is programme will do after twelfth standard and B.Ed programme will be do after graduation. The objectives of this study are to understand the background and aspirations of the students who want to be a school teacher, second is examine the reasons of their motivation to be school teachers. Third objective is to understand their experiences with the teacher education programme, with regard to curriculum and pedagogy and ways in which they have impacted them.

This study base on qualitative methodology. In-depth interview method used in this study. Sixty-seven interviews are written in narrative writing. In four colleges conducted 67 interviews in Public and private sector.

The rational of the study tries to present a deep understanding about Teacher Education programmes. The D.Ed and B.Ed are basic progarmmes for the teaching profession. This study tries to understand the reasons why student-teachers want to become a teacher. Their understanding about this programme, curriculum and pedagogy and also what is their thinking. It looks their perspective. Often generalisation that 'teaching is last option for most people' is made randomly by people. This study tries to see and explore teacher education programme's implementation in the colleges and understand it through the voices of the student-teachers and teachers educators four colleges in Mumbai. Teacher education policies are the Indian Education policy, Justice Verma Committe Report (Volume 1, August 2012, MHARD), National Curriculum Framework for Teacher Education, 2009 (NCFTE), National Curriculum Framework, 2005 in India. If the future policy makers or the Indian government want to envolve or bring about changes in the policies, these studies would support to them by demonstrating the needs and realities of teacher education in the country.

Findings of the study is government college D.Ed. students-teachers want to do this programme is because of secure government job. In this programmes female students are coming they; have low socio-economics background. In this programme mostly women are enrolling it. Because after the marriage, they can easily handle family responsibities with work. For example; they can give tuitions, teach in private classes or start tuition classes from their homes. And if they get job at school, as school working time also less; they are easily handle family responsibilities also.

## **Work, Domesticity and Domestic Workers: Recent Developments in Kolkata**

**Samita Sen**

Professor, Jadavpur University

samitasen@yahoo.co.uk

### **Abstract**

The presentation will focus on feminist debates, which have sought to address and substantially reformulate the question of reproduction. Beginning with Rosa Luxemburg's attempt to address colonialism through the concept of 'enlarged reproduction', Marxist Feminist scholars have sought to explore how reproduction of labour as well as the labour of reproduction may explain the dilemma of women's work in contemporary (and prior) stages in capitalism. In recent years, the changing nature of work has given more impetus to earlier debates over unpaid housework of the 1980s. Thus, affective labour as a subset of immaterial labour, and the new concept of care work seek fresh insights into shifting frontiers of labour and commodification, such as surrogacy. Given that feminism opened up the category of 'work' most productively in the history of that category and that it continues to do so, how far are these new issues and debates relevant to current questions before us? At present, labour studies is dominated by the question of the future of work, which appears to have great traction with earlier feminist concerns about rethinking value and visibility of labour. If there is not to be, as historians will assert with confidence, an end of work, are there already fundamental changes in the nature of work? How may the entry of more and more of the work of social reproduction into exchange relationships affect future landscapes of labour?

In the past few decades, there has been increasing visibility of domestic workers in many countries across the world. In India, numbers of domestic workers have been increasing and there is increasing emigration of women domestic workers to other countries. Moreover, India has been among countries resistant to regulation in this sector.

While most sources agree that the numbers are increasing, the informal nature of employment has rendered any accurate estimate difficult. In 2009-10, the NSSO counted 2.52 million domestic workers; this increased in 2011-2012 to 3.9 million out of which 2.6 million were women and 1.3 million were men. There are other estimates, of which ILO, NGO and trade union figures vary between 7 to 50 million and all sources agree that the majority are women. One recent estimate suggests that 23 per cent of women workers in West Bengal are domestic workers. Various studies have shown that for poor urban women, domestic work is an immensely significant occupation. In part as a result of the intervention of the ILO and in part because of expected political dividends, domestic workers have very recently begun to command the attention of policy makers and trade unions. The proposed paper will focus on West Bengal, specifically city of Kolkata, and based on my recent research project (2013-2015).

The twin aspects of feminization and informality- the nature of the worker and the work- has in recent years defined the contours of paid domestic work. Generally speaking, domestic workers could be defined as either informal or formal depending on the characteristics of employment in different contexts. For instance, in some countries, such as South Africa, certain categories of domestic workers are counted in the formal sector, even though they are distressingly ill paid. They are enumerated in employment statistics, often covered by labour laws, not regarded as illegal and are not included in campaigns against the informal sector. In the Indian context, most of paid domestic work is in the informal sector, which is to say, contracts are verbal, perceived as unskilled, commanding low wages, unregulated working conditions, with low entry and exit barriers, not covered by labour laws or social security measures. There has been some movement in the last few years- domestic workers have been covered by minimum wage legislation in nine states; there has been sector-specific legislation in three states; the growth of placement agencies has led to some measure of organization; in one state there is law in place to regulate the agencies; in most states, there is the beginnings of associations and trade unions and increasing lobbying for more state regulation. Kundu and Mohanan suggest a process of 'formal informalisation' given the decline in the rate of casual employment and the simultaneous increase in the rate of self-employed and regular workers. The greater availability of regular employment, they argue, indicates some amount of formalisation of informal activities. Many of the rapidly growing sectors in urban economies such as small-scale manufacturing, trade, commerce and entertainment activities have shown this trend of 'formal informalisation'. There is also a trend towards an extension of the net of state regulation, which is witnessed in several sectors within the erstwhile somewhat undifferentiated informal sector such as construction, vending, transport sector workers and so on. Ritajyoti Bandopadhyay prefers the term 'un-informalisation' to distinguish this process from the very different formalization undertaken in large-scale industry in late colonial and early independent India. It has been argued that such processes are mutually beneficial- registration and taxes benefit the state and facilitate governance, legal and social protection and support services, however rudimentary, can only improve the lot of low paid informal sector workers. According to Martha Chen, for informal wage workers, formalisation could mean obtaining a formal wage job or formalising their current job with a secure contract, workers' benefits, membership in formal trade union and social security. For domestic workers, minimum wages, registration and social security will mean an extent of formalization.

The paper proposes to examine these changes in the context of Kolkata and there are clearly major implications. The paper will focus on three elements: informality, mobility and politics.

**Informality:** In case of state regulation and collectivization, West Bengal, far from leading the way, lags considerably behind. Successive state governments have refused to include domestic workers in the minimum wages schedule, despite directives from the central government. At present, several trade unions have applied for registration, but the Labour Department is quoting the definition of 'trade' in the Act to refuse all comers. Nevertheless, wages have improved, claims to annual bonus more widely recognized, though the number of holidays may vary, the

principle is now accepted by many employers.

Even though it is impossible to find data that disaggregates different arrangements within domestic work, our micro-study suggests that the increase in numbers have been disproportionately in the segment variously called 'part-time' or 'live-out', which indicates workers, who live in their own homes, and work for part of the day in one or more employer households. For the purpose of this paper, we shall call them 'day workers', who tend to be less susceptible to the values of dependent relationships and are therefore willing to bargain for better conditions. In this segment, we find that despite the high degree of informality, there are also some contrary tendencies.

**Mobility:** There is considerable mobility within the different segments within domestic service. Workers appear to shift between live-in and day work depending on availability of jobs, level of wages and their own living arrangements. Very young girls (as low as 7 years age) may come from villages to work as live-in workers in the city and they move between village and city, in and out of domestic work jobs several times in their lives. There are multiple migrations and multiple shifts across segments of the domestic work market. The demand for flexibility (and perhaps the rising wages) has also given rise to changing arrangements within specific segments.

**Politics:** The traditional constituency of the trade unions, formal manufacturing sector workers, has been shrinking rapidly and this is truer of West Bengal. In the last decade or so, central trade unions have realized the importance of unorganized workers and, more specifically, women workers. The CITU for instance (not in West Bengal so much but nationally) now claims that its women membership outstrips men's, placing it at about 60 per cent of the total. This is perhaps because of their recent efforts to organize Anganwadi and other 'Scheme workers'. The initiative was taken by AIDWA and later the unions moved under CITU's banner. Several domestic worker unions were also first organized by the AIDWA and are now in the process of transferring to the CITU. The effort at a National Platform for domestic workers is gaining ground because of the trade union's recognition of the sheer numbers. The gender question in trade unions in India remains a troubling one. In Kerala, for instance, we have had in recent years challenge by women workers to established central trade unions as male preserves and complicit with employers. In West Bengal, there is deep unease with the question of domestic workers' organisation. CITU is the largest TU presence in West Bengal- and they have remained largely unconcerned with women workers. Their women's wing is entrusted with the organisation of women workers, specifically, women domestic workers. However, this is not a problem of the Left Front alone. The new government has not marked any change in policy. There is still a resistance to legislate or allow formalization in this sector.



# **Workplace Discrimination Against Women in the Formal Sector: Bias in the Quality of Work in the Metropolitan Cities of India**

**Sampriti Biswas**

In Charge, Research & Innovation; Assistant Professor of Economics, Vidyasagar University; Kolkata  
samdellab@gmail.com

## **Background**

Discrimination in the workplace might come in myriad forms; it can be sexual, it can be against the disabled, against aged and so on. Although Article 39 (d) of the Indian Constitution ensures all countrymen of equality where adequate means of livelihood is concerned, it is often not conformed to. In the social sciences, we do not find any comprehensive measure of job quality; it is an issue which is sometimes tried to be tackled from different directions. But it is a problem that often does not find any sufficient direction. There is also very little data available where qualitative bias in work against women working in the private firms of India is taken into consideration. Globally, economists have a tendency to give more importance on certain aspects of work like wages or other fringe benefits associated with a job to understand the desirability of a particular job (Dahl, Nesheim and Olsen, 2007). According to the global report of ILO (2011), women suffers globally from discrimination in job availability, pay as well as work conditions to participation in the decision making process. It is an issue that has been neglected for long and not given its due importance.

## **Discrimination and laws**

Article 15 of the Constitution of India prohibits any discrimination on the basis of caste, race, religion, place of birth or sex. In spite of that, women are discriminated at the workplace (formal sector) and it is also noticed that poor quality work is meted out to them which is often below their skills or qualifications (Ruwanpura, 2004). The work which they obtain is of inferior quality both in terms of intrinsic as well as extrinsic quality. It means they have a capability to perform and carry out work requiring higher problem solving skills as well as other complex issues but are not given out the same. This is in comparison to the work given out to the men who work in the same company by the management. The women are not only dissatisfied with the quality of the work but also face glass ceiling effect, less opportunities to be in the decision making process and have a say in the administration (Weiler and Bernasek, 2001). The Maternity Benefits Act 1961, The Equal Remuneration Act 1976 or The National Rural Employment Guarantee Act 2005 tackles different issues of discrimination in workplace against women it fails to capture the qualitative bias in the work given to women.

## **Method**

A sample of 100 women working in the middle to upper tier of different industries in Kolkata (IT, media, analytics, public relations, advertising, teaching, insurance and banking) in the formal

sector (private companies) was questioned with a questionnaire comprising of 45 questions pertaining to their education, skills, family background and work. The respondents were in the age group of 25-55 with at least three years of work experience. The entire survey was carried out in March to April 2016 in different important cities as Kolkata, Delhi, Mumbai, Chennai, Hyderabad, Pune, Bangalore, Bhubaneswar and Patna. The survey was conducted in two ways; the first one was done face to face with the respondent. The others were mailed the questionnaire and were given a stipulated time period to complete the same and mail back.

## **Conclusion**

The respondents, especially the married respondents claimed that they have definitely faced a bias in the quality of work that was assigned to them in comparison to that given to their male colleagues having similar educational qualifications or skills or experience. They have little or no say about the quality of work that is given out to them and usually even after questioning their 'superiors' they have to carry the same out. Also, it has occurred mostly within the very first year of joining the company that they worked for. Consequently, this bias has not only acted as a barrier to go higher up in the company but has also, in the extreme case, has forced a good percentage of them to resign. This has in turn led to not only financial problems but also psychological problems such as severe depression and alienation. With a significant literature gap and inadequate laws protecting women for this kind of problem in India, much attention is required by policymakers and planners as well as the scholars to address as well as highlight this issue.

## **Reference List**

- Becker, G.S., 2010. The economics of discrimination. Chicago. University of Chicago press.
- Bhatnagar, D., 1988. Professional women in organizations: New paradigms for research and action. *Sex Roles*, 18(5-6), pp.343-355.
- Budhwar, P.S., Saini, D.S. and Bhatnagar, J., 2005. Women in management in the new economic environment: The case of India. *Asia Pacific Business Review*, 11(2), pp.179-193.
- Dahl, S.A, Nesheim, T and Olsen, M.K., 2007. Quality of Work: concepts and measurements. Institute for Research in Economics & Business Administration. Bergen, Norway.
- Mammen, K. and Paxson, C., 2000. Women's work and economic development. *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 14(4), pp.141-164.
- Ruwanpura, K.N., 2004. Quality of women's employment: A focus on the South. Discussion Paper 151/2004. International Institute for Labour Studies.
- Williams, C.L. ed., 1993. *Doing "women's work": Men in nontraditional occupations* (Vol. 3). Sage Publications.

- Weiler, S. and Bernasek, A., 2001. Dodging the glass ceiling? Networks and the new wave of women entrepreneurs. *The Social Science Journal*, 38(1), pp.85-103.
- Cowling, M. and Taylor, M., 2001. Entrepreneurial women and men: two different species?. *Small Business Economics*, 16(3), pp.167-175.
- Sturm, S., 2001. Second generation employment discrimination: A structural approach. *Columbia Law Review*, pp.458-568.
- Lee Cooke, F., 2001. Equal opportunity? The role of legislation and public policies in women's employment in China. *Women in Management Review*, 16(7), pp.334-348.
- Weiler, S. and Bernasek, A., 2001. Dodging the glass ceiling? Networks and the new wave of women entrepreneurs. *The Social Science Journal*, 38(1), pp.85-103.
- Budhwar, P.S., Saini, D.S. and Bhatnagar, J., 2005. Women in management in the new economic environment: The case of India. *Asia Pacific Business Review*, 11(2), pp.179-193.

# **Making Visible the Invisible: Women Artists and Herstory**

**Saptam Patel**

Assistant Professor, Amrut Mody School of Management; Ahmedabad University

saptam.patel@ahduni.edu.in

## **Abstract**

In view of the present art world scenario, the question about the standing of the women artists has been posing an important question about their contribution to the art world and acceptance for them in return. It raises concern over the anomalous and disparaging relation between the art world and the women artists in context with art as knowledge. The ‘power’ called the history of art has always been the forbidden fruit for most of the women artists of all times. Although women have never been away from the course of creation of art – the ‘knowledge’, the invisibility of women from the history making process of the art demonstrate that they were denied power. While women have played the role of the ‘affect’ for men artists most of the times, it is also true that they never could equip their own selves to depict the ‘self-affect’ in the process of creation of the ‘knowledge’. The fact that the historians, gallery curators and the auction houses prefer the male endowment than ‘the other’ talent we are forced to think about the standing of women artists and their art work in the world of art.

The paper is an attempt to study how gendered the art world has been since centuries. The contemporary art scene does see ‘the other’ marking its strokes on its canvas, however, women artists end up as secondary contributors and rewardees. Apart from a query into the very nature or gender of art, the paper is also an attempt to assess the way in which women, their body and their experiences have been portrayed by men for years. Also, how this portrayal was questioned by some of the early modern, feminist women artists and produced the art in the form of self-portraits that challenged these conventional depictions. These contemporary and fresh representations not only produced a renewed art, but also shook the art world and the art historians who doubted the premise of greatness and sufficiency of the women artists. While the women artists created a new form of ‘knowledge’ in terms of the ‘self and subjectivity’, they also impressed their struggle to sculpt a name for themselves as deserving to be a part of the process of creating and re-creating art. Although the scenario is changing but it is moving in inches. From the times unknown to the present, women across the globe have been the contributors to the world of visual arts in miscellaneous and interesting ways, yet. Thus, in spite of the fact that women had always been a vital part of the world of art offering diverse perspectives of creative expression, they were and are been kept away from the popular stories and figures of art by either dismissing their participations in the creative world or by masking their contributions.

The word in the title of the paper refers to the story – ‘herstory’, a heterodox introduced by Robin Morgan in her *Sisterhood is Powerful* in 1970. The neologism ‘herstory’ was coined during the

second wave feminism as a means to question and as a need to reinterpret the male-dominated scholarly proposition called history. While oxford dictionary defines the term ‘herstory’ as ‘history viewed from a female or specifically feminist perspective’, the term has been an attempt to look at the story of women from an altered angle. This feminist revisionism happens to restructure the bygone annals that were thought to have disparaged and dismissed the contribution of women in the history making process.

In case of the herstory of art, we must admit that from the time when Linda Nochlin titillated the art as well as the academic world by asking a question “Why have there been no great women artists?” (1971) to some more than three decades later when the same question “Have there now been any great women artists?” (Clark, Folgo and Pichette, 2005) tantalized our world’s art historians, there seems to have no progressive change in the outlook and treatment of the second sex (Beauvoir, 1949) in the art world. A similar inquiry was made by B E White (1976) who tried to scrutinize the invisibility of women artists and role of art historians in defining a premise of greatness for the inclusion of women artists in the art history. Not as recently as 1986, that we find women artists on the canvas of the history of the western art, where we find the inclusion of no fewer than fourteen women artists in the Janson’s history of art textbook (1986). This moved a little further to forty two women making a total of seven percentage of identified and recognized women artists in comparison to her male counterparts (Janson, 2001). There was no difference in the scenario of the history of Indian art with not more than a few women artists being included in the mentions as early as the middle of the twentieth century. It started with Amrita Sher-Gil and only a few other who constituted the first generation of women artists of India with many more to follow and make their names at the International front like Anjolie Ela Menon, Amina Kar, Rekha Rodwittiya, Arpita Singh and Nilima Sheikh later.

Even when a few women artists managed to make the world speak about their success stories, there have been many who have not been able to overcome the insurmountable impediments to reach the highest platforms of world art. It holds itself true even today what Nemser had to say long back that women cannot be wives and mothers and be taken seriously as artists (1975). Moreover, even as they succeed, most women artists do face more than their share of struggle owing to their gender and the accompanying social, physical, psychological, biological and economic limitations. A German artist Georg Baselitz, who is noted as the pioneer of German Neo-Expressionism, said in one of the interviews taken by Der Spiegel, “Women don’t paint very well. It’s a fact..... They simply don’t pass the market test. As always, the market is right (2013).” Here, we are not talking about the renaissance period, we are talking about the twenty first century where such remarks not only seem simply slaughterous but also force us to think about the standing of women artists and their art work in the world of art. Moreover, it also makes us review the correlation between the art world, the art by women and the women artists of our world. Women Art Revolution (WAR!!!) is also posing a similar question addressing the issue of discrimination of gender, sexism and colour in the global art world. Regarding the same, Nochlin said,

Why have there been no great women artists? The question is crucial, not merely to women, and not only for social and ethical reasons, but for purely intellectual ones as well. If, as John Stuart Mill so rightly suggested, we tend to accept whatever is as “natural,” this is just as true in the realm of academic investigation as it is in our social arrangements: the white Western male viewpoint, unconsciously accepted as the viewpoint of the art historian, is proving to be inadequate. At a moment when all disciplines are becoming more self-conscious – more aware of the nature of the presuppositions as exhibited in their own languages and structures – the current uncritical acceptance of “what is” as “natural” may be intellectually fatal. (Nochlin, 1971)

It is equally thought-provoking to see the journey of women artists through the lens of the self-portraits that they resort to as a result of the denial to using other models as a subject. The critics and scholars indicted women who portrayed nude self of being narcissistic for the very simple reason that they used their own selves as subjects for their paintings. It is interesting here to note that although men have been continuously using themselves for subjects, they were never called narcissists for the same. Men, who had been indulging in self-portraits, even portraying women as their ‘deemed subjects’, were never accused by critics as self-possessed, while whenever women saw themselves as beautiful or indulged in self-portraits, they have been unfailingly charged as self-indulgent (Rideal, 2002). Not only did the feminist artists depicted the sensuousness in their self-portraits but also did the same to many of their other nudes and women subjects. They did not hesitate in exercising their sexuality as and when they wanted to amuse themselves. The avant-garde feministic stance of the third wave feminism was also very clearly noticed as these artists are seen predominantly ‘celebrating their female self’. The art produced, therefore, is a complete deviation from the traditional portrayals of the nude women. Lippard (1976) mentions about how when a woman makes use of her sensuous and beautiful body, she becomes the one ‘occupied with self-love’, which speaks about the introduction of self and subjectivity in these paintings. The feminist art adamantly defined the difference between the sex and the gender, so much so that some of the times the models are feminine and yet not the same. The portrayals presented the aspects of femininity and womanhood from a different perspective with a new context of women representation in the art world. The women subjects became the ones who were empowered and took the front seat as against traditional and idealized portrayals of women, whether nude or not, where women were just a centerpiece of attraction. As against the time when most of the depictions of women, except for those that were made by modernists, were idealized and resembled the conventional women who were typically good looking, strikingly feminine, young and subservient kinds, feminist art portrayals were an antithesis to them, in fact questioning or judging the viewer with a confronting gaze. They have been seen as quite different from the past renderings of these women who were taken as mere objects of desire. Thus, these representations of women suggested an urge of the young women artists who were involved in and evolved to “being, becoming and belonging” (Mathur, 2010)

All this being said, we don't need to ask where is herstory in art? In spite of the feminist art movements, Guerrilla Girls posters and hard efforts to disrupt the conventional representations of the female bodies and women subjects, we have not been able to sweep the discrimination on the grounds of gender and colour out from the art world. Even today, art markets belong to men. It is male talent which is appreciated, both in terms of money and value. It is the male art which is exhibited and preserved.

Where do women artists stand in the MOMAs or MOCAs of our world? Do women artists exist in Sotheby's or Christies? The answer to this crucial question cannot be short and straight forward that it's a battle actually, one who deserves wins indeed. There has been an eclipse, and this eclipse has been long enough so as to make the mend of its consequences literally impossible for many years to come. The phase not only eclipsed the physical but also the psychological and spiritual grounds of female identity hitting a damage that seem eternal even to the most optimistic feminist.

## **Feminization of Low Paid Work – Condition of Grassroots Workers in the Health Sector**

**Seemi Zafar**

Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi

zafarseemi@gmail.com

### **Background**

Public health reforms embarked upon since the 1980s have aimed at making state health systems more cost efficient. Since the 1990s, globally there has been a shift away from state owned provisioning system, to a private led and public private mix provisioning. The overarching goal is reducing the public health bill. Estimates by academicians point out how salaries appropriate as much as 70 – 80 percent of state health budgets, leaving a minuscule share for health infrastructure and other inputs, which has serious implications for quality of health services provisioning. A solution to the problem has been offered through reforms which have propagated alternative mechanisms of recruiting manpower like – hiring staff on temporary contracts, outsourcing employees through a private agency, and engaging staff as honorary volunteers. All these modes have entailed mass scale casualisation of health personnel, and a conversion of existing permanent jobs to informal jobs.

Workers in all these forms of employment are paid very low incomes in comparison to regular employees, and have no job security or long term pension benefits. However, even among these casual workers, the most debilitating condition has been of the large army of women workers deployed at the grassroots level. The health sector recruited a significant number of women as ASHA workers with the launch of NRHM in 2005 - who were accorded the status of honorary volunteers. These women were hired for facilitating institutional deliveries and increasing immunization cover in order to tackle the high rates of infant mortality (IMR) and maternal mortality (MMR). Over the years, the responsibilities of ASHA workers have increased manifold with successive community based health plans and schemes. Against all these responsibilities ASHA workers are not paid a salary, rather a token honorarium – initially fixed at INR 1000, and further piece rate payment against targets achieved for institutional deliveries, family planning etc.

This process of casualisation of women workers constitutes one of the gravest forms of gendered exploitative and discrimination of women from poor background and often from socially excluded communities. While inadequate compensation is one crucial aspect, there are no opportunities for promotion or growth. Invariable, these women resorted to protests against health ministry for raising their benefits and rates payable. The discrimination becomes more blatant as we see their position in hierarchy of workers and how works becomes casualised at different levels. While health workers on top of hierarchy, namely doctors, nurses and technicians' positions have transformed into contract posts, but those below – namely sanitary workers, nursing orderlies, laundry attendants, dietary department, ambulatory services have been outsourced to private



contractors. And below them at grassroots level, we find that women workers have been hired at low wages or as volunteers. Even the status of a worker has been denied to them. Such nomenclatures aids in justifying the inadequate remuneration these women get, and gross misuse of women's labour. Thus women, who already face numerous social and structural barriers in accessing equitable opportunities in employment are being further excluded and bear the greater brunt of cost cutting practices by the government. In most cases these women belong to extremely poor households who are reeling under acute financial crisis. In present times, when rural economy is in complete shatters, a significant number of ASHA recruits' salary is the sole incomes in which their families survive. The work is physically demanding requiring them to cover many households in a day, often in extreme weather conditions, and in many cases by putting themselves in danger and threat of sexual and physical abuse.

Interviews with ASHA workers reveal how there is no uniform system of payment, and different states have different rates and salaries. This further creates discrimination among the ASHA workers, where some are better rewarded and others very less for the same quantum of workload. Over the many years the workload of ASHA workers has increased tremendously, and they are entrusted with newer responsibilities like participation in census enumeration and election duties. Together the ASHA, Anganwadi workers and Auxiliary Nurse and Midwife (ANM) - an army of women workers constitute the base of public health system, and have been credited for India's achievements on lowering infant mortality rates, maternal mortality, immunization cover, facilitating institutional deliveries, and family planning. In return they don't even get paid government prescribed minimum wages, rather a meagre honorarium. These form a significant number of mostly educated women workers who have very low earnings and constitute the bottom end of hierarchy. Thus there is a definite feminization of workforce at the lowest paid posts in the health sector.

The government reinforces stereotypes against women by providing nomenclatures like 'volunteerism' which further perpetuated the low status of women in society, as their labour is not even identified as 'work', while much of the male staff constitutes the salaried group. Thus instead of creating more jobs and avenues for women's empowerment, the government has reduced the existing permanent government jobs by converting them into contract or casual jobs. Workers at lower end of bureaucratic hierarchy are being pushed into the informal economy through these reforms, where women share a major brunt of these neoliberal reforms. Much of these issues have been raised through health employees' trade unions, whose strength and bargaining power has considerably weakened with casualisation.

## **Objectives**

The present paper come out of a larger qualitative study which examines the implications of health reforms for services provisioning within a Delhi based hospital. Among different areas of health reforms, reforms in human resources have seen some major transformations in employment processes and withdrawal of government from these obligations. Since 1980s a significant

number of health workers are being hired on temporary terms – either on contract, or through outsourced, or under new nomenclatures like volunteers. This paper exclusively examines the iniquitous effects of casualisation on women grassroots health workers, and finds evidence of highly exploitative labour relations to which these women have been subjected. The present paper will critically look into three dimension of workers casualisation namely -

- Building an understanding of the different forms of employment arrangements through which women grassroots workers in health are engaged
- Understanding the perceptions of women workers about their work and dynamics of piece rate payment
- Analysing the disparities in the incomes of women grassroots workers across different states, and social gradient in gendered experience of such discrimination

## **Methods**

In-depth interviews were conducted with ASHA workers for understanding the dynamics of their casualisation. A total of 32 ASHA workers were interviewed between August 2017 and February 2018 in Delhi. The researcher also had several interactions with trade union representatives of women groups, and other health workers trade union which have been demanding the regularisation of all casual workers. The researcher participated in the rallies and observed meetings organised by them.

Further, the study is supplemented by extensive review of literature from other academic studies on ASHA and Anganwadi workers, and data from government records for a better understanding of many aspects concerning women's work and issues around them.

## **Conclusion**

The health sector, by its nature is a human resource-extensive sector, and requires a large army of workforce for fulfilling the mandates of public health. In such a scenario the government's preoccupation with policies of retrenchment and reduced financial commitment to social sectors produces negative and exploitative terms of work. Reforms in recruitment of healthcare staff shows a 'casualization' of workforce with a class and gender dimension, whereby the already vulnerable fractions of the society are being further marginalized. The gross misuse of women's labour in the name of 'honorary volunteers' or through low paid job creation constitutes institutionalised social exclusion and discrimination. Women at different levels of hierarchy are seen grappling with different nature of vulnerabilities – for a female doctor and nurses, contract positions bring job insecurity and lack of promotional opportunities. Among outsourced workers there are very low incomes, and exploitation in the hands of contractors. And at grassroots level, ASHA and anganwadi workers who often hail from poorest and marginalised strata of the society are fighting for their recognition as workers and basic minimum wages. Women's rise to employment opportunities is often described as pathways to modernisation, empowerment and emancipation. However with globalisation, structures of women's oppression are being reinforced and there is definite feminization of labour in the name of national development.

# **Exploring Perpetrators' Motives of Sexual Harassment at Workplace: Seeing and Understanding Things through the Victims' and Observers' Lenses**

**Ms. Selvi Nadar**

Doctoral Scholar, Tata Institute of Social Sciences

**Prof. Sasmita Palo**

Centre for HRM&LR, Tata Institute of Social Sciences

spalo@tiss.edu

## **Introduction**

Over the past few decades, there has been a growing acknowledgment of the increasing incidences of sexual harassment in the workplace. In India, the Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act was enacted in 2013, and since that many as 1,971 cases of sexual harassment of women at workplace were registered in four years till December 12, 2017, or one case every day. Cases reported increased by 45% from 371 in 2014 to 539 in 2017 (till December 12, 2017)<sup>i</sup>. As per the ILO Committee on Gender Equality (2009), women do face many problems in their workplace apart from that they also face sexual harassment for which they don't get protection and benefit too.

Researchers have found that sexual harassment experiences are negatively associated with job-related outcomes, psychological health, and physical health conditions (Chan et al. , 2008). Sexual harassment is seen as an occupational hazard in the organizational sector. Almost 35% of women from different age groups and hierarchy faced sexual harassment and still it remains an invisible form of crime (Maillette & Scalora, 2002).

## **Objective of the study**

The current study aims to explore the reasons of sexual harassment of women at workplace through the victims' lenses.

## **Theories Adopted**

We have adopted three theories viz. evolutionary, socio cultural and organizational model to explore reasons for sexual harassment at workplace.

## **Research Methodology**

We have adopted Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) form of narrative inquiry as it is the most appropriate methodology to understand and explore the experiences of women gone through the sexual harassment at workplace. The narratives encapsulates personal and human dimensions of experience over time. Narratives are presented in form of stories of lived experience (data), then are co-constructed as a means of capturing the multifaceted and nuanced understandings of sexual

harassment cases. In our study, narratives include both first-person and second person accounts of sexual harassment. The personal telling of narratives represents a powerful and evocative way of (re)presenting stories of sexual harassment. However, it may be inherently difficult and agonising to tell one's own personal story of sexual harassment. There are serious political, social, and personal implications of "speaking out." There are alternative ways whereby the "speaking out" process can be appreciated. One such alternative approach to the personal telling of a sexual harassment narrative is to let someone else tell one's story about the event. Such stories are presented in case study format.

There were 11 respondents participated in the research. Demographic profile of the participants are given in Table 1. The male participants spoke on behalf of the victims who were not open to speak to the researchers in public about the harassment they have gone through.

Table 1. Demographic Profiling of the Participants\*

Case	Name	Gender	Industry	Yr. of Exp.	Designation
1	Vanita	Female	Entertainment	12	Executive Production
2	Jayanthi	Female	Education	08	Asst. Professor
3	Madhurima	Female	Banking	13	Secretary
4	Sneharika	Female	Banking	05	Executive Sales
5	Anshima	Female	Airline	05	Cabin Crew
6	Bhavyashree	Female	BPO	10	Team Leader
7	Jayantha	Male	IT	13	SSO Lead
8	Arvind	Male	Airline	03	Cabin Crew
9	Pankaj	Male	Health Care	17	Head IT
10	Prakhar	Male	Event Management	09	Event
11	Vasant	Male	IT	06	Business Analyst & Consultant

*Note: \* Names of the participants are distorted to protect their identities*

## Results.

Results of the narrative inquiry with eleven participants indicated the following reasons for sexual harassment cases at work place.

- Men sexually objectify women. Women are perceived and treated as an instrument of sensual pleasure. Sexual harassment is viewed as the inevitable and natural result of sexual urges of a man. Men get the feeling of pride while flirting with women
- Patriarchal notion of the society extends to the workplace. It is responsible for woman's subordination at workplace.
- Men perceive powerful and competent women as threats to their masculinity. It endangers

their manhood and causes them to be pushier with women in the workplace. There is an urge to control women particularly at the entry level.

- SH is a manifestation of personal inadequacies of men which they try to mask by harassing women.
- The gender stereotype rivets certain beliefs about the psychological traits and characteristics of, as well as the activities appropriate to, men or women. The general belief that women's domain is in the home. Whenever the belief is slandered, men takes a belligerent position.
- Feeling of insecurity begets as more and more women join the work force and prove themselves more capable and proficient.
- Perception about occupation; women deserve to carry out traditional jobs not the high flung managerial one.
- Women are considered to be weak and feeble, so men try to take advantage of it by harassing them.

When the respondents were further inquired why women do not report the cases, most of them replied that women have a fear of the society, so they will not disclose such cases to others. Most of the women are not confident with the complaint mechanism in their organization and they also had the fear that the complaint committee would be in favour of the harasser. They would also fail in maintaining confidentiality and thus unsuccessful in stopping the abuse. This was the reason why they desisted from reporting the harassment to the higher authorities.

## **Conclusion**

In our research we expected that none of the theoretical models viz. evolutionary, socio cultural and organizational model would be either totally supported or totally rejected. The evolutionary approach (natural/biological theory) is primarily a motivational model; the organizational approach stresses facilitating factors; and the sociocultural model focuses on power differentials of males and females, male motivation to maintain this differential, and female socialization to acquiescence. It is found that the socio cultural model yields the greater explanatory power to explain the causes of sexual harassment. This is followed by followed by the organizational and biological model. The life circumstances of a few respondents present them with a quandary because they need to work for economic reasons and reporting of sexual harassment cases involve a threat to their job security and career progress.

Sexual harassment is not just about sex or sexual desecrations. It is more about exercise of power. And when a woman encounters comments about her physique, pestering for dates or unwanted attention and appreciation, it harks back her of the fundamental inequity in the workplace. Hence it is the responsibility of all concerned to deal with this injustice with women at workplace.

## References

- Clandinin, D. J. and Connelly, F. M. (2000). Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Chan DKS, Lam CB, Chow SY, Cheung SF. Examining the job-related, psychological, and physical outcomes of workplace sexual harassment: a meta-analytic review. Psychol Women Q. 2008;32(4):362–376. doi: 10.1111/j.1471-6402.2008.00451.x.
- Hatch-Maillette, M. A., & Scalora, M. J. (2002). Gender, sexual harassment, workplace violence, and risk assessment: Convergence around psychiatric staff's perceptions of personal safety. Aggression and Violent Behavior, 7(3), 271-291. DOI: 10.1016/S1359-1789(01)00043-X
- <http://factchecker.in/45-rise-in-sexual-harassment-cases-at-workplace-over-3-years/>

# **Social Security Schemes in India for the Informal Sector with Special Reference to the Urban Female Domestic Worker**

**Shanti Neela**

Phd. Scholar, Department of Economics, S.N.D.T. Women's University, Pune;  
shantijayantacharya@gmail.com

## **Introduction**

The informal sector represents an important part of the economy and certainly of the labour market in many countries and plays a major role in employment creation, production and income generation. In countries with high rates of population growth or urbanisation, the informal sector tends to absorb most of the expanding labour force in the urban areas. Informal employment offers a necessary survival strategy in countries that lack social safety nets, such as unemployment insurance, or where wages and pensions are low, especially in the public sector. Statistics on the informal economy are key to assess the quality of employment in an economy and are relevant to developing and developed countries alike.

According to the ILO, workers in the informal economy comprise all workers of the informal sector and informal workers outside the informal sector. Employees in the informal sector comprises all persons who, during a given reference period, were employed in at least one informal sector enterprise, irrespective of their status in employment and whether it was their main or secondary job. An informal sector enterprise is defined as an unincorporated market enterprise wherein neither the enterprise nor its employees are registered.

Informal employment outside of the informal sector comprises persons who in their main or secondary jobs were (i) own account workers (working and producing for self-consumption); (ii) contributing family workers (those who helped without a formal employment contract) and (iii) employees holding informal jobs, whether employed by formal sector enterprises, informal sector enterprises or as paid domestic workers by households. (ILO)

## **Informal sector in India**

In India, the informal sector is also known as the unorganised sector. The definition recommended by the National Commission for Enterprises in the Unorganised Sector (NCEUS) is

- Informal Sector
  - The unorganised sector consists of all unincorporated private enterprises owned by individuals or households engaged in the sale and production of goods and services operated on a proprietary or partnership basis and with less than ten total workers
- Informal Workers/ Employment

- Unorganised workers consist of those working in the unorganised sector or households, excluding regular workers with social security benefits provided by the employers and the workers in the formal sector without any employment and social security benefits provided by the employers.
- Informal economy
  - The informal sector and its workers plus the informal workers in the formal sector constitute the informal economy.

As per the Report on Employment in Informal Sector and Conditions of Informal Employment 2013-14, predominance of informal employment has become one of the central features of the labour market scenario in India. While the informal sector contributes around half of the Gross Domestic Product of the country, its dominance in the employment front is such that more than 90% of the total workforce has been engaged in the informal economy. There is an increasing interlink between the informal and formal economy. (Labour Bureau, Government of India, 2013-2014)

Most people enter the informal economy, which is characterised by low productivity and low pay, not by choice but impelled by the lack of opportunities in the formal economy and an absence of other means of livelihood.

### **Women working in the informal sector in India**

According to the 68th round of NSS conducted during 2011-12, the share of the informal sector in employment was – rural 75.2%; urban 69.1% and rural+urban 72.4%. among these the share of women was – rural 72.7%; urban 63.6% and rural+urban 69.2%.

In 2011, the Workforce Participation Rate at All India level was 25.1% for females and 53.26% for males. Workforce participation rates for urban males is 54.6% and urban females is 14.7% compared to 54.3% for rural males and 24.8% for rural females.

The data for persons employed in the informal sector is still not proper. While the 68th round of NSS conducted gives the share of urban informal employment as 69.1%, the WIEGO Working Paper N0. 7, using the same set of data has come to a figure of 80% of all urban employment as informal. The number for males is 80% and for females is 82%. The largest concentration of women urban workers was in the non-trade services followed by manufacturing. Apart from this the percentage of urban women engaged as domestic workers increased from 31% in 1999-2000 to 39% in 2011-2012. (Chen & Raveendran, 2011)

### **Women working as domestic workers in India**

According to the ILO, domestic workers comprise a significant part of the global workforce in informal employment and are among the most vulnerable groups of workers. They work for



private households, often without clear terms of employment, unregistered and excluded from the scope of labour legislation. It is a highly-feminised sector with 80% of all domestic workers being women. (ILO)

Their work may include tasks such as cleaning the house, cooking, washing and ironing clothes, taking care of children or elderly or sick members of a family, gardening, guarding the house, driving for the family and even taking care of household pets. Of the tasks listed above, gardening, guarding the house, driving for the family and taking care of pets mostly falls to the men who get employed by households. The rest of the tasks are performed mostly by women domestic workers.

A domestic worker may work on a full or part-time basis, may be employed by a single household or by multiple employers; may be residing in the household of the employer (live-in worker) or may be living in his or her own residence (live-out worker).

At present, domestic workers often face very low wages, excessively long hours, have no guaranteed weekly day of rest and at times are vulnerable to physical, mental and sexual abuse or restrictions on freedom of movement. Exploitation of domestic workers can partly be attributed to gaps in national labour and employment legislation and often reflects discrimination along the lines of sex, race and caste. (International Labour Office, Geneva, 2013) (Chen & Raveendran, 2011)

Domestic workers are not a homogenous group. The Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (no. 189) reflects this when it defines ‘domestic workers’ in Article 1 as:

- The term ‘domestic work’ means work performed in or for a household or households;
- The term ‘domestic worker’ means any person engaged in domestic work within an employment relationship;
- A person who performs domestic work occasionally or sporadically and not on an occupational basis is not a domestic worker (ILO, 2011)

The Urban Working Age Population has been estimated as 15+. Women domestic workers formed 13% of all urban employment and 17% of all urban informal employment. (Chen & Raveendran, Urban Employment in India: Recent Trends and Patterns, 2011). Based on the data of the Urban Employment in India, women domestic workers form 2% of all the urban women population and 10% of all urban women working population, both calculated as every one of the age of 15 and above.

Domestic work has been identified as the biggest source of employment for unskilled poor women who belong to the lower classes of society – lower as in economically and socially. Most the population of domestic workers are in the urban areas where the rising middle class and the increasing entry of educated middle class women into the labour force has created an unending

demand for this type of support to look after the unpaid work that women do inside the household.

The survey of literature shows that the domestic workers are mostly from the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe sections of society. They are also in most urban agglomerates migrants from rural areas. This sector of the economy is the most vulnerable since they are poor, mostly belong to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe communities, illiterate or have had minimal schooling. The kind of work done by them is heavy in physical requirement which means that the length of time for which they can continue to do this job is limited. There are no job contracts, it is completely informal, and the working conditions are totally dependent on the nature of the employer. The living conditions are bad; they live in shanty towns with no or poor sanitary conditions which make them prone to health problems. At the same time, the domestic worker is also aspirational for her children and wants to give them a good education and take them out of this life which she considers a bane and one in which she has come in for want of a better option. Add to this the fact that in most cases, she is not just adding to the meagre family income but may, in fact, be the sole or the main bread winner.

### **Social security schemes for the informal sector in India**

According to the release of the Press Information Bureau of the Government of India, the Government has enacted the Unorganised Workers Social Security Act, 2008 for the formulation of suitable welfare schemes for unorganised workers on matters relating to (i) life and disability cover, (ii) health and maternity benefits and (iii) old age protection. In Part II of this Act, in clause (2) sub-clause (n) 'domestic workers' have been specifically included as part of "wage worker". (Unorganised Workers' Social Security Act, 2008). The Bill tries to equalise the status on social security between the formal and the informal sectors. (Majumdar & Borbora, 2013)

### **Social security schemes for the women domestic workers in India**

Even though the Unorganised Workers Social Security Act, 2008 specifically includes "domestic workers" in its ambit, there are problems in its coverage to make it completely meaningful. (Unorganised Workers' Social Security Act, 2008). The problems that has been identified that make a comprehensive legislation and social security protection difficult are:

- Lack of clarity in the definition of who is a domestic worker and what does domestic work mean
- The dispersed nature of the workers and the invisibility this creates that makes it difficult if not impossible to identify and measure the number of domestic workers in any area
- The informal nature of work contracts that does not specify the jobs to be done and the exact amount of wages for each of these jobs
- The ambiguity in the employer-employee relationship and the fact that the place of work is a private household.

In August 2016, the Union Minister of Labour and Employment announced the plan to extend the Employees State Insurance (ESI) facilities for domestic workers on a pilot basis in Delhi and Hyderabad. (Neetha, 2017)

The Domestic Workers (Regulation of Work and Social Security) Bill, 2017 has been introduced in the Parliament to improve working conditions and provide social security by setting up rules, Boards and Funds. (Lok Sabha, Government of India, 2017).

### **Objectives**

This paper aims to focus on the social security provisions provided by the state to the informal sector specifically to the urban women domestic workers.

#### **The main objectives are:**

1. To study the social security provisions available to the urban informal sector in India
2. To study the social security provisions available to the urban female domestic worker in India

### **Research Methodology**

This paper is based wholly on secondary research. The researcher will base the findings on the study of the different social security legislations enacted as well as the scholarly articles on this subject. Since the focus is on a macro level provision of social security i.e., the focus is on the supply side, no attempt is being made by the researcher to get primary level data on the extent of actual usage or inclusion.

## **A Study of Women's Lived Experiences of Leadership at the Workplace: A Feminist Study of Organizations**

**Ms Shashikala Mudgal**

Researcher, Advanced Centre for Women's Studies, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai  
shashikala.mudgal@tiss.edu

Leadership is not a position or a person but a process of influence, often aimed at mobilising people towards change—for example, in values, attitudes, approaches, behaviours and ideologies. Leadership therefore can be exercised by individuals located in the middle or at the bottom of organisations, by people without formal authority as much as by CEOs and prime ministers.

When one asks people about leadership they often nominate performances of toughness or 'greatness'. And 'greatness' is an adjective that is almost always applied to men. Constructions of modern leadership remain, 'irredeemably masculine, heroic, individualist and normative in orientation and nature'

While leadership is an overused term today, how it is defined for women, the context within which it emerges and how it changes over time remain elusive. Moreover, women are exhorted to exercise leadership, but occupying leadership positions for women comes with challenging issues of acceptable behaviour for women in these positions and what skills women are perceived to need to be successful leaders. These complex and conflicting ways in which leadership is enacted are to be identified and the complexity and nuance of women's leadership examined.

There is no monolithic "women's experience" of leadership. Women always have a race and an ethnicity, so a discussion about gender without reference to race and ethnicity (or vice versa) is simplistic and can be misleading.

Other factors profoundly shape women's experiences as well, such as socioeconomic status, disability status, sexual orientation, gender identity, and age. **For the social scientist**, this poses a complex challenge. How do we account for all these variables? How do we gather and analyze data in a way that reflects the true diversity of women's experiences? Empirical research that reflects this complexity has been growing, but challenges in scope and methodology limit our ability to generalize from many of these studies.

India continues to rank third lowest in the proportion of business leadership roles held by women for the third year consecutively, according to a global survey by Grant Thornton – **Women in business: New perspectives on risk and reward**. Only 17 percent of senior roles are held by women in India. The survey of 5,500 businesses in 36 economies further adds that 41 percent of the Indian businesses surveyed have no women in leadership roles, 7 points higher than the last year.

## INDIA GENDER GAP

- India ranks 114 th out of 134 countries covered by the Global Gender Gap Index that measures the magnitude and scope of gender-based disparities in the country.

Overall, **the labour force participation rate for women is falling**: from 37% in 2004-05 to 28% in 2016.

At the global stage, Grant Thornton's data shows developing regions continue to lead the charge on diversity with developed economies lagging behind. Eastern Europe performs best, with 38% of senior roles held by women in 2017 and just 9% of businesses with no women in senior management. Meanwhile the MINT economies (Mexico, Indonesia, Nigeria and Turkey) saw the most improvement, with the proportion of senior roles held by women rising from 24% in 2016 to 28% in 2017 and the percentage of businesses with no women in senior management falling from 36% in 2016 to 27% in 2017.

The survey also reveals that only 7 percent of the senior management (CEO/ Managing Director) roles were held by women in India. The most common roles held by women in India are Human Resources Director (25 percent) and Corporate Controller (18 percent).

## ISSUES OF WOMEN AND WORKPLACE:

- The gender pay / leadership gap; Personal choices are never made in a vacuum. Organizational, cultural, economic, and policy barriers shape both men's and women's choices and opportunities. Women's underrepresentation in leadership has been framed as a deficit in which something is holding women back from becoming leaders. Initially described as a glass ceiling—the symbolic wall women hit at mid-management levels—barriers to women's advancement can also be thought of as a labyrinth.
- Stereotypes about Leadership/ Sexual Harassment This is not surprising: Stereotypically male characteristics—independence, aggression, competitiveness, rationality, dominance, objectivity—all correlate with current expectations of leadership (Crites et al., 2015)Implicit, or unconscious, bias occurs when a person consciously rejects stereotypes but still unconsciously makes evaluations based on stereotypes. Stereotypes about Race and Ethnicity ; Gender and racial stereotypes overlap to create unique—and uniquely powerful—stereotypes.
- Corporate Masculinities; The masculine nature of organizational cultures The question that still remains is how masked masculinity blocks women s careers. The basic argument of the gender-in -context approach is that differences between men and women at the start of their careers accumulate over the years, basically as a function of a gendered organizational context.
- Lack of networks and mentorship ; Access to influential networks is critical to moving up the leadership hierarchy. Some studies have found that the social capital gained from

networking with influential leaders is even more important for advancement than job performance (Eagly & Carli, 2007; Hewlett et al., 2010). Research suggests that, although women and men are equally likely to have mentors, women may benefit less than men from this arrangement, especially in the areas of salary and promotions.

- Caregiving and women's choices; Balancing work and family responsibilities is one of the most challenging obstacles for women seeking leadership positions. Differences in women's and men's earnings also contribute to the leadership gap. When two parents are in the workforce and one has an option to reduce or even leave employment, the higher-paid spouse is likely to continue working. That person is still most often a man:

Despite progress in the last 30 years relating to the more equal participation of women in the corporate world, it is still a worldwide phenomenon that companies' management positions are composed predominantly of men (European Commission, 2013; ILO, 2010).

As a consequence, a political debate has arisen internationally about how to improve women's share of management positions, causing many countries to introduce female quota legislation or voluntary measures to prevent discrimination (European Commission, 2012b).

Though evidence on this matter is mixed (De Cieri, 2009) many studies suggest that companies may increase their financial performance by integrating more women into important decision-making processes. However, excluding women from positions of power is not only a question of ensuring a company's competitiveness, but also a question of social justice and equal rights for women and men within and beyond organisational boundaries.

Therefore, the career advancement of female managers, defined in terms of vertical movement, and the identification of factors favouring or hindering female career prospects are of major relevance for organisations and society. The debate about discrimination against women in the workforce has occupied the thoughts of scholars and practitioners for many decades. As part of this debate the women-in-management research field emerged in the 1980s and started to establish itself as an important scientific area devoted to addressing questions of gender inequality in management. In particular, since 1986 when **The Wallstreet Journal first used the term 'glass ceiling as a metaphor** for an invisible barrier that blocks women's vertical career advancement, an extensive discussion about the under representation of women in positions higher up the hierarchy, and the underlying reasons for this issue, has commenced (Morrison, White, & Van Velsor, 1987; Schmidt, 2004).

Numerous factors that explain the scarcity of women in management positions have been identified, among which the most prominent ones are women's isolation from male-dominated networks, the scarcity of female role models and mentors and the challenge in reconciling conflicting time demands between family and career.

## OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY:

- To critically evaluate how women in leadership positions are conceptualized / discussed in Management and feminist writings; Is there any convergence in these narratives..?.
- To document how ‘Masculinities’ play a role in defining women’s career advancements and the systemic norms and structures that drive the gendered nature of workplace; especially their aspirations for senior leadership positions.
- To understand Women’s experience and everyday negotiations in mid and senior management positions in terms of what stereotypes of sexism they have encountered in their professional careers and mobility.
- To study the workforce diversity in both public and private organisations by studying the organizations and employees awareness of employee diversity.
- To comprehend a woman’s perspective of work, nature and politics at work and how in their conscious being identify themselves in their contributions to work in the present context of leadership

In pursuing this line of inquiry and interrogating the very definition of leadership and exploring its different forms, expressions and manifestations, one has to engage with women in leadership positions and their everyday negotiations.

The theme of women and the professions past and present offers an opportunity to explore how professional work has often demanded that women’s leadership is understood in different ways to that of their male counterparts. Yet the argument is that while we might oppose traditional constructs of leadership, women have a strong interest in the broader phenomena of leadership. How have women influenced and changed the public agenda and improved the life experiences of the people around and following after them? Precisely because leadership has become such a powerful discourse, with people at all levels of society being urged to undertake more leadership, **it is vital to deconstruct, interrogate and re approach leadership from a feminist point of view.**

Building on this notion of multiple Masculinities; Researcher seeks here to identify and explore some themes and emphases in feminist work that are of central importance to leadership. These include the following.

1. A determination to focus on power and privilege, especially manifestations of structural power in gender relations, which often escape attention.
2. A commitment to, and interest in, non-hierarchical relations in the ways groups and organisations are formed and run and in the way research is done.
3. An interest in those areas of public and private experience that traditional patriarchal accounts tend to obscure.

4. Enactment of reflexivity in research methods and seeking to empower others through research; owning one's own context and recognising how that affects what we see and say; and a preference towards 'textual multiplicity' in writing.

## **METHODOLOGY –**

Qualitative Study of mid-level and senior- level women of these sectors (women in mid/senior level leadership positions )

- Experienced women with their individual biographies, their start and journey of the career path.
- Apparently the themes also involve a sensitive topic of sexuality; (delve into themes of HR policies and Sexual harassment related issues)
- A shift in the discourse from discrimination to that of 'Othering'
- Make the research relevant in trying to understand the invisible nature of masculinity, by doing which I only intend to strengthen the Feminist Idea.

The purpose of this study is to examine the experiences of women who are at the mid-level, aspiring to senior-level, or in senior-level positions aiming to be in Governing boards and how they make meaning as leaders and change agents; Feminist scholarship has provided a new paradigm for inquiry that is well suited for a study aimed at understanding how feminist perspectives and generational differences influence the leadership and change practices of women administrators.

## **Conclusion :**

The research aims to understand explanations for the fact that the glass ceiling is such a persistent phenomenon. Why is it that women still form a small minority of top managers/ Board members? Current trends in management theory and practice seem to contradict the idea that they have difficulty reaching higher management functions. The number of female managers have dramatically increased but only in few sectors, managers make public statements in which they express their concern for the lack of female top managers; current management ideologies reflect values that are stereotypical, and women are proclaimed as the new managers of the 21st century. Why is it then these developments have not resulted in any actual changes in the proportion of women in higher management?

We may therefore characterize modern organizational culture as 'Masked Masculinity'; Masculine values are still dominant but they are marked by an ideology to which most managers pay lip service to. This implies that women are still excluded from top management because of the subtle workings of gender schemas.



# **Nursing and Informalisation: A Study of Medical College and Hospital: Punjab**

**Sneha Baldeo Makkad**

M.Phil Research Scholar, Women and Gender Studies Department, Ambedkar University, New Delhi (In Collaboration with Center for Women's and Development Studies, Delhi)

snehamakkad@gmail.com

## **Introduction**

The informalisation of labour within the public-sector workforce along with health sector has increased all over. This has been a result of cut in government expenditures, pressures of privatization, and other global forces. The 'World Bank's Development Report 1993: Investing in Health' offered many reform policies for the health sector in developing countries. It included cut back in the public health expenditure, increased role of private sector in service provisioning and introduced flexibility in the recruitment process to save the 'non-salary component' (World Bank, 1993). Due to this, over a period of time contracts have changed from short term to long term fixed duration contracts which have made employment less secure (Basu, 2016). In the process of reform, gender is also an important axis of health sector reform but it has been largely ignored (Standing, 2000). The overall share of informal workers within formal health care institutions has increased in over past two decades. It has been shown that by 2012, there were more than 200 workers were appointed by different private agencies in public hospitals of Kolkata. This area has not been researched in detail yet so there is no larger visibility about size, profile, gender and caste composition of these workers (Roy, 2018). Women constitute a large part of the informal labour, even in the health sector, which continues to remain invisible. There are lacunae of visibility of underpaid women health workforce such as nurses working in public sector hospitals. Many public hospitals have created more contract based jobs instead of permanent jobs. Due to such informalisation of labour which leads to contractual work, women face and experience vulnerable working conditions (Mckay, et al 2012). In the health sector the highest numbers of qualified women are present in nursing. Punjab is one of earliest states of India to initiate contractual jobs in the public sectors such as health and education. Further, this informalisation has shifted from low skilled job (Group D/IV workers) to core and skilled health workers like doctors and nurses (GOI, 2004). Hospital nurses are one of largest women workforce in the health sector that has formal qualifications but has faced significant neglect within policy frameworks as well as research. Nurses play very significant role in providing multiple services at hospital setting including provisioning of care and management. This spread of informal employment excludes them to have regular employment of their right. Such situation makes them to work on terms and a condition which does not provide them secure working life. Such process of informalisation of labour subordinate's identity and status of nurses in hospital setting and create

dynamics in working relationships. This process reinforces underpaid labour and exploitation at working condition of nurses.

### **Objectives of the Paper**

The purpose of this paper is to understand how in Punjab, the government tertiary hospital post-reform policy has impacted the nursing workforce which is one of largest women workforce within the hospital. This paper is carried out with the objective to understand informalisation process within a formal organization and understand how nurses are recruited, retained and deployed in the hospital.

- To study the nature of changing employment arrangements of nurses working in a public sector hospital.
- To study the impact of changing employment arrangements on the nursing workforce in terms of their working conditions

### **Methodology**

Hospital settings are very complex organizational structures and very little research has been done in this area as yet. So this was an exploratory qualitative study conducted in Punjab. After reforms in the mid –nineties, the health sector in Punjab was affected by economic compression which had a major impact on the overall employment scenario. The study has been conducted in one tertiary hospital of Punjab named Government Medical College and Rajindra Hospital, Punjab. As is the case with all government hospitals, this hospital had highest number of contract staff nurses. The duration of conducting field work was four months (15th Oct 2016 to 13th Feb 2017). For this study, interview schedules, non-participant observation and discussion have been used as some methods to understand working conditions and experiences of permanent and contractual nurses, the kind of working relationship contract staff nurses have with other health workers across different hierarchies, histories and changes within hospital and associated structures, services as well changes in nursing structure and increasing contract services within hospital. Government hospitals are the kind of organization that remains very guarded. Further, this is an organizational setting which involves medical professional power, symbols of technology and modernity, hierarchy of health workforce. Due to this, process to get permission from Medical superintendent and Nursing superintendent was challenging and critical in nature.

### **Findings**

The data analysis shows that at present there are 343 contract staff nurses in total, working in Government Medical College and Rajindra Hospital of Punjab. It found out that since 1998-2002 recruitment of nurses on permanent basis has been reduced. In 2004, Punjab state government decided to recruit nurses and paramedical workforce on contract basis. In 2006 the first batch of nurses got recruited on contract basis by third party agency named Aman Trust. This was the first recruitment where the hospital was not involved directly in recruitment process. This group of

nurses was not entitled to any leaves like other permanent nurses. In 2010 with lot of efforts and struggle by nurses, contract staff nurses were recruited directly by the hospital under DMER (Directorate of Medical Education and Research). In 2010 within four separate calls 210 nurses were recruited on contract basis. Further again recruitments happened on contract basis under DMER in 2011, 2012. Their contract was on an annual basis and would after 364 days. This study shows that the number of regular permanent nurses is declining fast and the number of contractual staff nurses has increased significantly. This indicates that the pattern of employment and values and norms of recruitments has changed in the public hospital. It has introduced a 'non standard form of employment'.

Further, it is evident from these findings that process of informalisation of labour has had a major impact on working conditions, mainly in terms of increased deductions of their wages. Though there has been recruitment of nurses in huge numbers on contract basis, their world of work and professional growth has become very limited. Their presence has been used to balance shortage and gaps of nurses within wards or manage workload. It has been found that nurses working on permanent basis receive their salary according to 5th Pay Punjab Commission, while government hospitals are containing costs through salary cuts of the contractual nurse workforce. The study of contract staff nurses and permanent staff nurses shows that contract staff nurses are highly underpaid. Indeed, this study discovered that contract staff nurses receive a salary 4.6 times lower than permanent staff nurses. Such working conditions and low wages force them to work in private clinics after their shifts to sustain themselves in a city and support their families.

It has been seen that contract staff nurses are stuck with clinical care work, supervision of nursing students, and clerical work. They do not receive opportunity to work in more advance departments where different technologies are getting handled.

Data shows that contract staff nurses do not have chance to get promoted unless they become regular employee in the hospital. There is stagnation in context of career mobility within hospital setting.

Further, the data indicates that skilled professionals like nurses are not entitled to benefits and wages like other permanent nurses. This current scenario of wages for contract staff nurses has created one class and group of underpaid nurses working in public hospitals.

This cost cutting process and process of informalisation shows that this trend of engaging contract workers in 'low skilled jobs' has shifted to high skilled 'core areas of skilled work' in government hospital. This process has impacted their working conditions and increased the exploitation of skilled women workers working in government hospital as nurses. This marginalization and exploitative working conditions have had a detrimental impact on their professional identity as nurses within a public hospital.

This paper is based on my M.Phil dissertation titled, "Nursing, Public Sector Hospital and

Changing Working Condition: An Exploratory Study of a Medical College and Hospital, Punjab”. This M.Phil was in duration of August 2015-January 2018, Ambedkar University, New Delhi.

**References:**

- Standing, H., (2000). Gender a missing dimension in human resource policy and planning for health reforms, Human resources for health and development Journal (HRDJ) ,4(1), 4.
- <http://uhc-india.org/uploads/SituationAnalysisoftheHealthWorkforceinIndia.pdf> As Access on [14th July 2016]
- McKay, S. et al., (2012). Study on Precarious Work and Social Rights. Working Lives Research Institutes. Retrieved from: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4438657/> As Access on [20th August 2016]
- GOI. (2004). Health Sector Reform Initiatives from Nine States. New Delhi: Bureau of Planning, DGHS.
- World Bank. (1993). World Development Report. New York: Oxford University Press
- Roy, B., (2018). Growing Informalisation of workforce and public sector hospitals in India, mfc bulletin2018, <http://www.mfcindia.org/curissue.pdf> Access on [16th May 2018]

# **Female Labour Force Participation & Enterprise Development: Role of Self Help Promoting Institutions (SHPIs)**

**Dr.Sunita Jadhav**

Department of Economic, Economics Department, Sophia College, Mumbai  
sunitajadhav98@gmail.com

## **Abstract**

IMF Chief Christine Lagarde and Norway's Prime Minister Erna Solberg, mentioned that raising women's participation in the labour force to the same level as men can boost India's GDP by 27 per cent. They further state that helping women stay active in the workplace while raising a family is key (Press Trust of India, 2018). In the light of the above mentioned facts, this paper analyses the relative efficacy of the various Self Help Promoting Institutions (SHPIs) in the promotion of micro entrepreneurial activity in Mumbai using Multinomial Logit (MNL) Model framework. Our study attempted to assess the extent of entrepreneurial development achieved by women – as members of SHGs/JLGs promoted by different organisations in Mumbai. Section 1.1 introduces the concept of gender participation gap in the labour market and highlights the importance of increasing the female labour force participation. Section 1.2 describes how encouraging female entrepreneurship will increase female labour force participation in a country with a culture that perpetuates traditional gender roles and has limited employment opportunities. Section 1.3 examines the relationship between the institutional setting and entrepreneurship development. It lists out institutional factors influencing female entrepreneurship. Section 1.4 explains methodology and model used for study. Section 1.5 covers discussion on the important findings and statistical results for the Multinomial Logit (MNL) Model. Section 1.6 presents analysis of the statistical results. Section 1.7 concludes the paper highlighting the need for further research to thoroughly analyze not just the choice of self employment by the Self Help Group (SHG) /Joint Liability Group(JLG) members of microfinance programmes but also its overall impact on labour force participation by the SHG/JLG members.

## **Employer branding with a focus on Employees' Retention**

### **Dr. Sunita Kaistha**

Associate Professor, Jesus & Mary College, University of Delhi; Co – Founder: Women Work and Health Initiative, (WWHI) New Delhi.; Founder: The Society for Working Life (SWL)  
sunitakaistha@gmail.com/skaistha@jmc.du.ac.in

The abstract is a part of research and findings conceptualized from workshops conducted in various companies under the project of SIGN (Sweden India Gender Network) in India.

### **Rationale**

Research shows that corporations that are gender equal are more profitable than other corporations. It is of great importance for researchers and actors in their interaction with companies to be open-minded trying to understand the companies' daily reality, the rationality and the context in which, the companies work.

But it is also of special importance to give insight into that which can be beneficial for the value of the employer brand to be a more gender-aware employer. This will contribute to make the workplace more attractive, aiming for a more gender mainstreamed organization in order to retain and attract the best-suited manpower for tomorrow.

There is unassailable evidence that women's work is marred by a gender-based division of labour and discrimination. Women are often made to occupy informal, casual, temporary, low-paid, self-employed and 'mummy-track' jobs; they experience discrimination in the wages they receive and in access to social security benefits. Women face particular challenges stemming from their dual role as caregivers and breadwinners, and the lack of recognition given to their care responsibilities.

There is practically one labour market for women and one for men. The labour market is also vertically gender divided with women in lower level positions and men in higher positions. The structures in a work organization are often seen as gender neutral, as independent of whether the organization's members are women or men.

### **Objective**

The lack of competent labor is one of the major worries for most companies. Competent and effective personnel, sharing a common vision, are essential for a profitable long- term success. Due to demographical changes, urbanization and new values amongst the next generation, the competition to find the right workforce continues to increase.

Success in today's business climate is inherently linked to having an Attractive Company, with personnel who are motivated to devote their competence and skill to the enterprise. However, in

a changing paradigm with new challenges posed by globalisation, high attrition rates and economic slowdown, it is important to understand what constitutes an attractive company.

## **Background**

### **Gender Segregation and Gender Marking at the Workplace**

The gender structure of the workplace is normally determined by generally shared perceptions of which requirements are posed by various jobs and by notions of which skills are possessed by women and men. Such qualities do not necessarily come from the individual; they may also be associated with what a particular job attributes to the individual, such as power, status and pay. Consequently, women worldwide choose occupations (such as Teachers, Nurses, social workers) not on the basis of market rationality and profit maximization as their male counterpart, but also because of values and expectations about mothers and caregivers that are emphasized in the socialization of young girls.

A child is categorized as a boy or a girl on birth and immediately evaluated within a normative “two-sex model” This categorization will, directly and indirectly, affect the person during their life. Depending on others’ perception of the person’s sex, expectations will be placed regarding skills, interests and behaviours. This division affects the individual’s self-perception and view of their abilities, capacities, choice of education and career path (Westberg, 1998). Society and workplaces are gendered meaning that there are external and internal expectations upon each and every person based on the perceived sex.

Notions and ideas about what is feminine, and masculine legitimize the placement of women and men in different occupational categories or the same occupational categories, but with the content differently defined. This leads to notions that “female” qualifications and qualities differ from “male”.

So, gender marking takes place by a process in which the qualifications and characteristics of an occupation become associated with gender. This gives us an idea of which gender a person should have for a particular job. Gender marking becomes apparent when occupations become female or male. In theory, gender segregation may be seen as a result of gender marking of qualifications, characteristics, occupations and work functions. However, there is interplay between the gender-segregated society in which we live and the gender-marking process, one result of which is that the conditions that lead to gender marking change over time.

Gender based power structures are not static since society, norms and values change over a period of time. Structures arise out of social relations and are therefore the result of actions by individuals and groups. Gender is thus viewed not as something that is being constructed, by ourselves and by others in constant interaction, within the framework of the structures that surround us. Organisational structures need to be understood and analysed as gendered systems. Different forms of organization have different gender-political effects.

## **Methodology**

Methodology: ‘Participative Dialogue Workshop’

No: of Participants: 25 to 30 (including Swedish trainers)

(At least 2 representatives from each type of organization) (5 to 6 Companies to participate)

Profile of Participants: Representatives from senior management, middle management, employee – blue collar, Trade Union representative, researcher, ngo

Types of Organization: Engineering, Telecom, IT, Education

The objective of the workshop was to introduce methods and tools (processes and structure) to help in employer branding, that is to make the organization more sustainable and attractive for the future work force. The steps in the work organization which are significant –the individual’s performance, recruitment and promotion which is possible only with a dynamic interaction between individuals, organizations and institutions associated with social and economic activities.

The relevance of the workshop, which was both action- oriented and practice based, was that researchers and actors work with practitioners to find solutions and new approaches to problems regarding rapid turnover and creating a school for systematically upgrading skills of the lower level employees, as a strategy for employee loyalty, as well as to retain the employee in the long run. This action-oriented approach contributes to get results drawn from practice in collaboration with practitioners.

## **Workshop Format**

-The workshop is introduced by the facilitators– taking 2 to 3 questions related to the topic under consideration. For example the questions could be: 1) how can employees be retained in the long run. 2) How can the work be made more attractive? 3) How can work be integrated into your employer brand?

How can one generate interest or make it an “attractive” company; especially in Companies in manufacturing / and in areas where ‘women are not attracted to’?”

-The workshop started with four half-hours lectures about some of the methods/tools used in the Swedish/Indian contexts in Organizations to facilitate in making work and workplaces attractive for both men and women. One of the example used the concept of employer brand and attractive work as a basis for a collaboration involving gender issues in a change process. To support the process, pictures, anecdotes, and provocative arguments were used to contribute to a more active interaction.

-Another example; “Equality within” is a method for initiating a change in the gender field in different types of organizations. The aim is to achieve an awareness of the individual on how perceptions have an impact on women and men in everyday life. It's about knowledge or insights



that can function as tools in every day gender equality work that is helping to operationalize gender and gender order in the daily work. The method helps to keep the questions always up and putting "gender glasses" on the organization's employees.

Through this approach the implementation of a solution rarely is a problem because the "solution" is a result of questions raised by the rationality based on the practice. In an action-oriented and practice-based approach context, there is a mutual learning among all stakeholders and it is intended that the individuals should have the opportunity to learn from their own prerequisites.

### **Participatory dialogue method**

The participative dialogue option used in the workshops is to give all participants the opportunity to be heard regardless of gender and hierarchical position and all that is said should be regarded as of equal value. Dialogue conference, based on three group discussions can be held in a fixed order. As an example, the first can be for homogeneous groups, the other can be held in diagonal groups and the third and final in "home groups" (such as people from their own workplace). After the three discussions the results from the three group discussions are used as a platform for ideas and action plans.

The methods and tools were adapted to the Indian context. All training courses were contextualized to organizational cultures as well as to society, norms and customs in the country.

Innovative processes in the context in which they were used, were part of the inputs from each Company so that one can learn from each other.

### **Conclusion**

The focus of the workshops was on developing a gender lens and thereby sensitizing personnel on issues of gender. This not only creates equal opportunities for men and women, but can translate into a huge advantage by attracting the best people for the job. One finding amongst the used measures for assessing more attractive work, shows that there are many benefits to being a more gender-aware employer. It contributes to make the workplace more attractive by aiming for a more gender mainstreamed organization. This means that we attract and retain the best manpower for tomorrow, whether man or women.

It is suggested that companies that care about gender equality will undoubtedly have advantages in the competition for labor. One of the features that distinguish good employers is that they create a good working climate, for both men and women. The concept of 'doing gender' can be used to explain what is happening in practice within a company. It can be seen as an ongoing activity and interactive action made between men and women, between men and between women. Furthermore, "doing gender" is an ongoing activity involving interaction between individuals, an interaction that creates cultural and intangible features that can be difficult to identify and intangible for evaluation

The qualities perceived as attractive for a young and single person are perhaps not the same as those for a person in a family situation or for older persons. A non-reflecting management that disregards contemporary expectations of more gender equality within the family and ignores measures for increased work-life balance takes the risk of not being perceived as an “employer of choice” for well-educated and talented individuals who are underrepresented in the organization.

Contributing with a gender perspective in the employer branding process is a first step to becoming attractive to a more diversified and thereby larger target group.

If one is to find the essence of the above descriptions of the two fields – employer branding and gender equality – and name the common denominators, these could be said to be: relations, interaction, career opportunities and life balance.

# **Visible and Invisible Labour: An Ethnographic Study of Women in Traditional Entertainers Community**

**Dr. Surbhi Dayal**

Indian Institute of Management, Indore, India

surbhid@iimidr.ac.in

The present paper focuses on the Kanjar community of northern India. The Kanjar community practises sex work as a traditional occupation and the whole family economy is based on the labour and earnings of unmarried sex worker daughters and sisters. Other members of the family are also involved in occupations related to prostitution such as dance bar workers, pimps etc.

Kanjars are distributed in twelve states of India but they are highly concentrated in Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh and Haryana. In the state of Rajasthan Kanjars are mainly concentrated in Alwar, Bharatpur, Jaipur and Dholpur districts. It is worth mention here that these districts are high risk areas for 'sex work' in Rajasthan.. The habitations of Kanjar community are largely in the rural areas although there is a small population inhabiting the urban areas as well. At present, they are designated as scheduled caste in the four aforesaid states.

Kanjar families are unique in nature, as most of the girls remain unmarried and pursue sex work or work in dance bars in metropolitan cities or visiting Middle Eastern countries in dance troops for the survival of their families. The paper discusses the role of family in initiating sex work and cultural references which encourage a girl child to choose a life as sex worker instead of married life. It sheds light on the socialisation process which empowers a girl entering into sex work and weakens a girl who is getting married. Paper further focuses on how an unmarried women's labour as sex worker is recognised and appreciated by the community but domestic labour of married women is invisible. Married women take care of the household work and children of unmarried sex worker women but as her labour is domesticated labour her status becomes lower in comparison to the unmarried sex workers. Unmarried sex worker has rights of decision making, right to property while married woman is denied from accessing these rights.

My central research method is ethnography. Due to the nature of mobility of sex workers and their work it becomes multi-sited ethnography. There were three sites in India and one in Middle East where I followed my respondents. Four major sites under study where I followed my subjects were Alwar district in Rajasthan, holy cities of Mathura and Vrindavan in Uttar Pradesh, Mumbai in Maharashtra and Dubai. The research employed reflexive ethnographic methods. Specifically, the method included observation of participation and in-depth interviews.

The findings of this paper challenge the dominant normative notion about women, their chastity, honour and purity that marginalise and stigmatise sex workers and gives higher status to married women. However, in the case of Kanjars, unmarried sex worker's status becomes higher in comparison to married woman as she is the sole earner of the family.

# **Are Women-Run Dairy Co-Operatives A Success or Failure in A Rural Scenario?**

**Swaathylakshmi M P, Paul Jebaraj, Prashanth H R, Shantidani Minz MD, Carol Devamani, Bhavya Balasubramanya**

Rural Unit for Health and Social Affairs, Christian Medical College, Vellore  
swaathylakshmi.m@cmcvellore.ac.in

## **Background**

Women, who constitute 71 percent of the labor force in livestock sector as against 35 percent in crop farming, play a crucial role in dairy sector of India. Women in rural areas are often neglected and made invisible in official statistics, even though they work for long hours inside and outside their household as an unpaid labor. The co-operatives, as a balancing model to the discrepancies of the market regime, have helped women organize and mobilize for joint action and achieve better bargaining power as buyers and sellers in the marketplace.<sup>1</sup> According to the International Labor Organization, a co-operative is defined as an “autonomous association of persons united voluntarily to meet their economic, social and cultural needs and aspirations through a jointly owned and democratically controlled enterprise”.<sup>2</sup>

The economically weaker sections of the society are empowered by the initiative of co-operatives in rural areas of the developing countries.<sup>3</sup> Co-operatives are a sector started voluntarily and functions democratically by giving importance to the moral element as well as the material one which benefits and secures the daily needs of the people in rural.<sup>4</sup> Co-operatives, being an integral part of the Indian rural economy, have both direct and indirect impacts on agricultural growth and rural development.<sup>5</sup>

The development and advancement of co-operative industries are affected by the gender issues such as imbalance in employment, job status and earnings, and unequal rights in employment. Around the world men own social, political and economic powers over women, yet to attain equal opportunities a long path is required to be traveled before becoming truly gender reactive, especially in co-operatives.<sup>6</sup>

Women empowerment over the years has played a vital role in human development and also in poverty reduction leading to enhanced productivity and higher growth trajectory.<sup>7</sup> Dairying by domesticating animals, one of the oldest traditions among millions of rural households is an integral part of farming systems from time immemorial.<sup>8</sup>

Dairy co-operatives have provided a podium for the rural women to reveal their abilities and skills through their activities. The gender interventions based in the program planning, improved women's status in family and society by increasing their employment and income.<sup>9</sup> The 17 District Co-operative Dairy Producers' Unions covers around 30 districts in the state of Tamilnadu. The milch animals under each of these unions are provided with free veterinary health

cover, artificial insemination and the supply of balanced cattle feed. Women in the dairy sector are being called upon to organize women dairy producers' co-operative societies in their respective areas, in order to empower them economically. There are nearly 1210 women dairy producers' co-operative societies functioning in Tamil Nadu.<sup>10</sup> According to the data received from the Deputy Registrar (Dairy), Vellore, a total of 32 dairies are registered under K V Kuppam block till date. Among the 32, 10 are women-run dairy co-operative.

A study done by Virendra Singh., et al (2017) has highlighted that these women farmers face various hurdles to run dairy co-operatives with constraints such as social, personal, psychological, economic, political, technological, organizational and infrastructural. The study also concluded that other serious perceived constraints were lack of awareness about advantage and facilities provided by the Government and dairy unions for rearing animals, lack of knowledge about the women rights for their empowerment, illiteracy, lack of affordability to purchase feed additives and concentrates, high cost of veterinary medicines and inequality in issuing.

The Rural Unit for Health and Social Affairs (RUHSA) was the first rural development programme initiated in 1977 by the Christian Medical College and Hospital (CMCH), Vellore. RUHSA is a Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) that aims to promote the sustainable health and development of poor rural communities by implementing and facilitating health and development programmes. The K. V. Kuppam block was selected as the site of RUHSA because one third of the 110,000 people belong to a scheduled (low) caste or live at or below poverty line. In 1998, RUHSA implemented the women's self-help group programmes as a means of improving the sustainable health and development of poor rural women within the K. V. Kuppam Block. The SHG programmes aimed at promoting the economic and social development of the poorest rural women. To ensure the growth of the SHGs, RUHSA motivated the members to strive for self-sufficiency and sustainability. RUHSA'S aim is to provide them with skills and knowledge needed to access resources previously unavailable to them. To date, RUHSA has been involved in offering numerous community based services to the disadvantaged including the following: Promoting literacy, developing vocational training, empowering the poor, improving the health and nutritional status, promoting women's development, developing community organizations, promoting environmental protection, implementing sustainable programmes.<sup>11</sup> This study aims to understand the challenges faced by women in women-run dairy co-operatives and to understand the ways they have overcome these challenges in K. V. Kuppam block, under RUHSA'S services.

## **Rationale**

The rationale for the study is to recognize the challenges thrown by neoliberal ecosystem to women-run dairy co-operatives and to list down the strategies undertaken by women to face it.

## **Objective**

- To describe the profile of women involved in women-run dairy co-operatives in K V Kuppam block.

- To explore the various constraints faced by the women in women-run dairy co-operatives.
- To identify various strategies and factors associated with success in women-run dairy co-operatives.

### Study Design:

It is a community based cross sectional study with a qualitative component. Mixed methods using a semi structured Questionnaire and In-depth interview will be used

**Study area:** K.V.Kuppam Block.

**Study population:** The target population will be members of women-run dairy co-operatives, K.V.Kuppam Block of Tamil Nadu, South India.

**Study duration:** The study duration is April – May 2018.

**Study procedure:** The number of women-run dairy co-operative established in K.V.Kuppam block till date is 10, among them there are 8 currently functioning and 2 non-functioning co-operatives. All 10 women run dairy co-operatives will be selected for the study. A semi structured interview will be conducted among the women of the milk co-operative. The interview will focus on socio-demographic details, indicators for success and failure, strategies and tactics for success and constraints that leads to failure. Hard indicators are pure facts that can be measured directly, whereas soft indicators are less tangible conditions that must be measured indirectly. Another set of terms is quantitative measures and qualitative indicators. Hard indicators will be measured by financial reports and structured questionnaire and the soft indicators by interviewing the members. The following table consists of the hard and soft indicators that will be measured.

### Hard Indicators<sup>12</sup>

DIMENSION	HOUSEHOLD	COMMUNITY	BROADER ARENAS
ECONOMIC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Control over income</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ownership to assets and land</li> </ul>	
SOCIO-CULTURAL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Freedom of movement</li> <li>• Less/no discrimination of girls and women</li> <li>• Commitment to educating daughters</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Participation in extra-familial groups and social networks</li> <li>• Following patriarchal norms</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Access to broad range of educational opportunities (either for daughter or self)</li> <li>• Positive media image of women's role and contribution</li> </ul>
INTERPERSONAL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Decision making</li> <li>• Education and finance</li> <li>• Control over sexual relationships</li> <li>• Childbearing decisions</li> <li>• Access to contraception</li> <li>• Control over spouse</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reduction in dowry practice</li> <li>• Self selection of spouses</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Education of girls and employment</li> </ul>

DIMENSION	HOUSEHOLD	COMMUNITY	BROADER ARENAS
	selection and marriage timing • Freedom from domestic violence		
LEGAL	• Knowledge of legal rights • Domestic support for exercising rights	• Effective local enforcement of legal rights	• Laws supporting women rights • Access to resources and inheritance
POLITICAL	• Knowledge about political system • Means to access political system • Exercising the right to vote	• Support for specific candidates or legislation • Representation in local government bodies	
PSYCHOLOGICAL	• Self-esteem • Self-efficacy • Psychological well being	• Awareness of injustice • Potential of mobilization	• Sense of inclusion and entitlement

## Ethics

Information sheet will be provided to the participants. Informed consent will be obtained from the group. Individual details and the options will be kept confidential

## Analysis of Results

The quantitative data will either be entered in excel or Epi-data and analyses will be done by using SPSS. The qualitative interview will be recorded both on tape as well as on paper by recorders. In order to reduce bias, the audio recording will be transcribed into English from the local language ‘Tamil’ manually by two independent researchers. The transcribed results will be analyzed using Atlas-ti software based on the sub-themes and themes about the challenges faced by women co-operatives and the strategies and tactics they exercise to face the challenges.

## Conclusion

The study’s outcome will benefit both marginalized women from the vulnerable community and police makers involved in co-operative societies. Findings of the study will assist women who want to start up a dairy co-operative.. Similarly, the policy makers can recognize hard and soft indicators for success and failure of ‘women run dairy co-operatives’ in rural settings. New policies can be initiated to empower women in rural setting through similar dairy co-operatives.

## Reference:

1. Srinivasiah.,&Chellakuamr, A. (aug 2016). Role of Dairy Co-operatives in Village Development of Karnataka State. IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM), Volume 18(Issue 8), ver.I, 23. Retrieved April 4,2018.
2. <http://www.ilo.org/empent/units/co-operatives/lang--en/index.htm>

3. Awotide, DiranOlawale (2012) "Assessment of Women's Participation in Co-operative Societies and its Determinants in Yewa North Local Government Area of Ogun State, Nigeria", Asian Journal of Agriculture and Rural Development, Vol. 2, No. 3, pp. 344-350
4. Rananavare, A. M. (1964). The Role of Cooperative Societies in the Economic Development of India.
5. Dr. Rabi N. Patra and Mahendra P. Agasty, "Co-operatives, Agriculture and Rural Development: Role, Issues and Policy Implications" IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS) Volume 13, Issue 2 (Jul. - Aug. 2013), PP 14-25
6. Thapa, B. K., (july, 2016). Gender Issues in Co-operative Societies of Ilam. Journal Of Advanced Academic Research (JAAR), 3(II), 27. Retrieved April 5, 2018
7. Kornginnaya, MrsSudha. "Women Empowerment through Participatory Strategies – A Study." ccr.ica.coop/sites/ccr.ica.coop/files/attachments/1.5%20Sudha%20K.pdf.
8. Rajeshwaran, and GopalNaik. Dairy Production in India Rises by a Historic 6.25% in 2014-15: A Boon or a Bane? . JUNE, 2016, p.3
9. Virendra Singh, S.K. Rewani, Sunil Rajoria and Saini, G.R. 2017 . Constraints Faced by Women Dairy Co-operative Society Members in Jaipur, Rajasthan, India. Int.J.Curr.Microbiol.App.Sci. 6(12): 2612-2618.
1. Doi:<https://doi.org/10.20546/ijemas.2017.612.302>
10. G.Krishnamoorthy, And Dr. R.Arunmozhi. "Problems & Prospects Of Co-Operative Dairy Producers Of Dharmapuri District." Journal Of International Academic Research For Multidisciplinary, I, No. 2, Mar. 2013, pp. 66–68. ISSN : 2320 – 5083.
11. karakontis, K. and Pearson, S. (2004). Women's Self Help Groups: RUHSA.
12. Kantachote, K., Mallick, A., Polster, R., & Roets, K. (2013). Indicators of Women's Empowerment in Developing Nations. In Workshop in International Affairs.
13. Malhotra, A., & Schuler, S. R. (2005). Women's empowerment as a variable in international development. Measuring empowerment: Cross-disciplinary perspectives, 71-88.



# **Gender Equality in German Higher Education**

## **Analyses and strategies to increase women's participation**

**Dr. Sylke Ernst**

Head of Gender Equality Office, Kassel University, Germany

sylke.ernst@uni-kassel.de

### **Abstract**

Gender equality policies in German higher education have contributed to progress in women's participation in the last decades. The development is slow and still the percentage of woman decreases with increasing academic qualification level. Gender equality contributes to the quality and societal responsibility of research. This approach is widely acknowledged but at the same time we face backlash and resistance against gender equality policies and against gender studies.

The presentation provides examples from Kassel University on efforts to develop a gender equal and family-friendly culture for all members of the university. Achievements established so far are related to the status of gender equality in academia in Germany and Europe.

### **Representation of women in academia: Vertical segregation**

Research and higher education institutions are gendered settings. This becomes visible in the scissor-shaped curve that describes the phenomenon called the "leaky pipeline". One can observe that the share of women declines as they advance in the academic career. As women progress through a typical academic career path, they become increasingly under-represented compared to men. Data from Kassel University reveal that on average across all studies undergraduate students and graduates are close to equal distribution. Amongst the PhD graduates we observe 45 % women and the share of women declines to 29 % for all professors and 17 % for grade A position professors. The comparison of Kassel University with the average of German universities reveals that in Kassel the share of female PhD graduates is below the German average whereas the share of female professors is above the German average of 23 %. Compared to other European countries the amount of grade A professors in Germany is well below the average of 20 %.

The Glass Ceiling Index (GCI) is a relative index for the chance to be promoted to the next career level and to top academic positions. The higher the value, the stronger the glass ceiling effect and the more difficult it is for women to move into a higher position. The GCI at Kassel University is highest for grade A positions in engineering.

### **Representation of women in academia: Horizontal segregation**

Women and men tend to concentrate in certain scientific fields. While women are more likely to be found in fields like social sciences and humanities, men are more likely to study, teach or do

research in fields related to engineering or technology. In 2016 more than 40 % of male undergraduate students in German higher education are in engineering subjects compared to 12 % of the female students. While women are underrepresented in technical fields, men are underrepresented in the humanities. Stereotypical subject choice of students is therefore a real concern. This horizontal segregation can be observed in all European countries to a various extend. The share of women (ISCED 5-8) in mathematics, statistics and science is around 40 %. Women are underrepresented in engineering across all European countries, as well as in information and communication technologies, where only in Sweden there are more than 20 % female students. Women remain severely under-represented within the sub-field of computing (CEWS 2016).

Academic career remains markedly characterized by strong vertical and horizontal segregation even if there are important differences across European countries. The result is that viewpoints, experiences and needs of half the population is at risk to be overlooked or dismissed.

### **Working conditions in academia**

The structure of the workforce of Kassel University is being presented. Like in most European countries in the higher education sector, men are more likely than women to be employed as researchers, whereas women are more likely than men to be employed as administrative staff or technicians. A small percentage of researchers is working in permanent positions of a professorship while the great majority of research is being performed on fixed-term contracts. Women are more likely to work on fixed-term contracts and part-time, however not always due to their own choice. They mainly work in scientific fields where lower income and part-time contracts e.g. for PhD students are widespread. The impact of part-time employment on gender equality is under debate. Part time employment has potential benefits, such as boosting women's employment and offering an opportunity for both sexes to improve their wellbeing and work-life balance. At the same time part-time has the potential to intensify gender differences in pay, working conditions and career advancement over the life cycle.

She Figures 2015 is a source of comparable statistics on the representation of women and men amongst PhD graduates, researchers and academic decision-makers in Europe (European Commission 2016). The data also sheds light on differences in the experiences of women and men working in research – such as relative pay and working conditions.

Main findings for the European Union in 2012 are (European Commission 2016):

- Women researchers were more likely than men to be working part-time
- Women researchers in the Higher Education System were more likely to have 'precarious' contractual arrangements than men, such as fixed-term contracts of one year or less.
- The gender pay gap (in favour of men) affects the total economy of the EU, and is a particularly pronounced issue in scientific research and development.

- Women's presence amongst researchers is particularly low in two of the countries where the overall level of Research & Development expenditure per capita researcher is highest (Germany, Austria).

Higher education has a gender pay gap which needs further investigation. For the whole economy in Germany the gender pay gap amounts to 7 %. For universities respective data are not available but studies from single universities in Germany indicate that additional payments for civil servant professors are higher for male professors.

Gender equality policies have to take into account that uncertainties connected to the positions below professorship and the lack of long-term perspectives seem to foster the decision to leave research. This effect is relevant for women to a higher degree because of gender biases in working conditions. More women drop out at the three critical transition points of an academic career path than men (PhD, Postdoc, Independent Researcher, Professor).

### **Gender bias in academia**

As outlined before women are underrepresented in leading positions in academia. This may be due to the fact that women tend to meet working conditions that are less favourable for an academic career than they are for men. Gender biases have the potential to affect evaluation processes and can lead to unfair assessment of female scientists and lower their likelihood of receiving a grant (Brouns 2007). Such implicit and unconscious biases are held by individuals, they are rooted in socio-cultural norms and can accumulate with structural and organisational gender biases in research institutions. Gender bias in peer review has first been observed by Wenneras & Wold (1997). They found out that women had to be 2.5 times more productive in order to be evaluated the same as men when applying for medical grants. A meta-analysis of Bornmann et al. (2007) showed that among grant applicants men have statistically significant greater chances of receiving grants than women by about 7 %. The gender gap in the funding success rate is decreasing at the EU-28 level, though the success rate for men is still higher compared to women in 70 % of countries for which data are available (European Commission 2016).

### **Gender equality policies from local to national level**

The gender equality policy at Kassel University is influenced by international and national gender policies. It is widely acknowledged that gender equality contributes to the quality and societal responsibility of research and innovation. On the EU level gender equality is a founding principle and a self-standing objective with the triple goal of gender equality in scientific careers, gender balance in decision-making, and the gender dimension in research. Also on a national level gender equality policies focus on institutional change as a strategy aimed at removing the obstacles to gender equality that are inherent in the research system itself. The institutional change relates to human resources management, as well as to transparent procedures for funding, decision-making and research programmes. The main objectives of institutional change are to enhance women's

representation and retention at all levels of their scientific careers and to promote the integration of the gender dimension in research and innovation content.

In Germany the equal right laws of the federal states oblige higher education institutions to appoint equal opportunities officers and to implement equal opportunities target plans. In addition there is a long tradition in national funding programmes: For women researchers since the end of the 1980s shifting to programmes for institutional change. In 2006 top scientific bodies launched an „Offensive towards Equal Opportunities“, that offered helpful material for equal opportunities officers but had little influence in the scientific community (European Commission 2008). A university ranking based on gender equality criteria since 2005 (CEWS 2017) helps to rise commitment in universities. Policy discussions in German higher education often focus on work-life balance and family-friendly working conditions, whilst targets for gender balance and support schemes for leadership are less common.

The German Research Foundation (DFG) has integrated gender equality as part of the selection processes for research funding and offers additional lump sums for gender equality measures (DFG 2017). This initiative strengthened the general policy orientation related to gender equality in research and higher education: Competing universities and research institutes have to depict in detail how goals of equal opportunities for female scientists are implemented in their proposals. This turned out to be an effective measure to increase the opportunities of women in science.

### **Gender equality policy at Kassel University**

The governance structure of gender equality at Kassel University is characterized by the responsibility in the presidential board, implementation as a crosscutting issue, and the spirit of the bodies involved to accomplish the change in joint efforts.

The fields of gender action described in the current gender equality plan are the following:

- Organisational development and cultural change
- Gender and diversity in development of human resources and promoting junior scientists
- Advancement of women and equal opportunities
- Compatibility of family with work and study
- Gender and diversity in research and teaching

The gender equality plan refers to the agreement on a family-friendly university, the diversity mission statement, the equality plans of the 11 university faculties, and the gender equality concepts submitted in the context of national programmes like the „Professorinnenprogramm“. The „Professorinnenprogramm“ (2008 – 2022) is a national initiative financing additional professorships for women and supporting gender equality structures. The gender equality plan contains targets for the representation of women and it contains several measures in every field of action in order to reach the targets. One aim is to improve the active recruitment of women

professors to bring the share of women professors well above 30 percent and to rise the share of women in leadership positions. The equality measures comprise gender monitoring and consulting, mentoring for female students and researchers, dual career service and flexible child care as well as qualification to prevent sexual harassment and diversity training. Innovative measures such as the implementation of a professorship for gender/diversity in informatics in 2017 aim to develop the gender studies programme and to strengthen the cooperation between (STEM-related) gender equality policies and gender studies.

## **Perspective**

In Europe including Germany we observe backlash and growing resistance against gender equality policies and against gender studies. Research and discussions are directed to the causes of that phenomenon and question if this is simply a new wave of anti-feminist backlash. In any case there is a constant need to reflect on the strategies of gender equality policies and to improve gender equality as a strategy to deal with the backlash.

## **References**

- Bornmann, Lutz; Mutz, Rüdiger & Hans-Dieter Daniel, 2007: Gender differences in grant peer review: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Infometrics*, 1(3), 226-238.
- <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joi.2007.03.001>
- Brouns, Margo, 2007: The making of Excellence – gender bias in academia. In: Wissenschaftsrat (ed.) *Exzellenz in Wissenschaft und Forschung - Neue Wege in der Gleichstellungspolitik*, 23-42.
- <https://www.wissenschaftsrat.de/download/archiv/ChancGleichDoku.pdf>
- Bukof, 2018: *gender2020. Auf dem Weg zu einer geschlechtergerechten Hochschul- und Wissenschaftskultur*. Berlin.
- [https://bukof.de/wp-content/uploads/gender2020\\_broschuere.pdf](https://bukof.de/wp-content/uploads/gender2020_broschuere.pdf)
- Center of Excellence Women and Science, CEWS, 2016: *Geschlechtsspezifische Statistiken*, 2016.
- <https://www.gesis.org/cews/unser-angebot/informationsangebote/statistiken/thematische-suche/>
- Center of Excellence Women and Science, CEWS, 2017: *Hochschulranking nach Gleichstellungsaspekten 2017*. Köln: GESIS – Leibniz-Institut für Sozialwissenschaften
- <https://www.ssoar.info/ssoar/handle/document/52104>
- DFG, 2017: *Promoting Equal Opportunity*
- [http://www.dfg.de/en/research\\_funding/principles\\_dfg\\_funding/equal\\_opportunities/index.html](http://www.dfg.de/en/research_funding/principles_dfg_funding/equal_opportunities/index.html)

- European Commission, 2002: The Helsinki Group on Women and Science. National Policies on Women and Science in Europe. Brussels.
- <https://publications.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/773c11f2-fc7c-4681-827a-75a28635cc97/language-en>
- European Commission, 2008: Mapping the maze: Getting more women to the top in research.
- [http://ec.europa.eu/research/science-society/document\\_library/pdf\\_06/mapping-the-maze-getting-more-women-to-the-top-in-research\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/research/science-society/document_library/pdf_06/mapping-the-maze-getting-more-women-to-the-top-in-research_en.pdf)
- European Commission, 2009: The Gender Challenge in Research Funding: Assessing the European national scenes
- [https://ec.europa.eu/research/swafs/pdf/pub\\_gender\\_equality/gender-challenge-in-research-funding\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/research/swafs/pdf/pub_gender_equality/gender-challenge-in-research-funding_en.pdf)
- European Commission, 2016: She Figures 2015. Brussels.
- [http://ec.europa.eu/research/swafs/pdf/pub\\_gender\\_equality/she\\_figures\\_2015-final.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/research/swafs/pdf/pub_gender_equality/she_figures_2015-final.pdf)
- European Institute for Gender Equality, EIGE, 2016: Gender Equality in Academia and Research: GEAR Tool - Guide to Structural Change in Academia and Research Organisations. Vilnius, LITHUANIA.
- <http://eige.europa.eu/gender-mainstreaming/toolkits/gear/examples/gender-lectureship>
- Wennerås, Christine & Agnes Wold, 1997: Nepotism and Sexism in Peer-Review, Nature 387, 341-343.

## **Identities and Negotiations between Women Householders and Domestic Workers: A Case Study of Select Areas of Aligarh**

### **Dr. Tauseef Fatima**

Assistant Professor, Centre for Women's Studies, Aligarh Muslim University, Aligarh  
tauseeffatima21@yahoo.com

### **Shafey Anwarul Haque**

Research Scholar, Centre for Women's Studies, Aligarh Muslim University, Aligarh  
Haqueshafey@gmail.com

### **Introduction**

Indian women in rhetoric have always been treated with great honour and dignity. Also, their role in the construction of family and society too is considered pioneering. However, in reality, condition appears antithetical. Even today, when their participation and accomplishment in different walks of life has reached equivalent to men, stereotypes related to this class still prevail. Along with these conventional notions of patriarchy, they are discriminated, harassed and often oppressed not only by their male counterparts, but by women who belong to upper or middle class of the society. In different capacities, when we look at them, we will find that women in rural areas are more subjected to subjugation and community ridicule in comparison to women in urban areas as Arundhati Bhattacharya observes that rural women in India are less literate than rural men, and they suffer from both economic and 'information' poverty. She notes, "Rural women are vital and productive workers in India's national economy. There is statistical bias in under estimating the role of rural women in development. Women work for longer hours than men and contribute substantially to family income, they are not perceived as productive workers."

Keeping this scenario in mind, one can conclude that because of such vulnerable condition, rural women migrate to urban areas to work as domestic workers or daily wagers along with those who are living below poverty line and work in the same capacity. Moreover, globalization has also facilitated the high participation of women in the labour market resulting in the feminization and informalization of labour force. Generalizations cannot be made about the effect of globalization on women as there are contradictions and complexities. On the one hand, women's 'cheap' labour is manipulated and exploited by the neoliberal model of development, whereas on the other hand, gender constructions and hierarchies are negotiated and often dismantled, as suggested by researches in the field. Participation in the labour market includes both formal and informal sector of the economy. Data clearly supports the fact that out of the total women work force; a vast majority is concentrated in the informal economy.

The emergence of global free trade and global financial markets with the International Financial Institutions exerting pressure on the individual governments for deconstruction of social welfare, and the corruption and exploitation at national level have contributed into further marginalization of the poor and poorest among the poor, i.e. women. Partial withdrawal of state from public sector

such as health, education and employment is evident, having its impact on the status of women

Preet Rustagi estimated while using the poverty line provided by the planning commission expert group, that more than 300 million persons were poor in the country as a whole, with 220.9 million in rural and 80.8 million in urban areas- one half of them were women (110.6 million in rural areas, whereas urban poor women are calculated to be 40.3 millions) in 2004-05. This estimate terribly increased nearly to 800 million people living on less than USD 1.90 a day in 2013, according to a report of the World Bank. This percentage, it would not be incorrect to categorise, basically incorporates women working as domestic workers to earn their livelihood. According to a report published by the Economic Times, there were approximately 47.5 lakh domestic workers in India including 30 lakh women. International Labour Organization states, “Domestic workers comprise a significant part of the global workforce in informal employment and are among the most vulnerable groups of workers. They work for private households, often without clear terms of employment, unregistered in any book, and excluded from the scope of labour legislation.” It recognizes the nature of their work as cleaning the house, cooking, caring children, or elderly or sick members of a family, etc. which we also witness in and around our society. At the same time, these workers often become victims of physical, mental and sexual abuse, and also endure restrictions on freedom of movement and excessively long hours of work but low wages. This kind of harassment is believed to be an outcome of existing gaps in national labour and employment legislation, and also reflects discrimination on grounds of sex, race and caste.

In various states of India, even after various legal steps which labour and employment ministry promised last year, situation continues to remain unchanged and domestic workers still fall under the category of unprotected workforce. Moreover, in Uttar Pradesh, also there are no labour laws or separate boards unlike Tamil Nadu, Maharashtra, Kerala, etc. to safeguard them or to set out their service conditions. They are deprived of their basic rights, amenities and social security.

The underlining patriarchal construct of the society normalizes the notion that primary identity of a woman is attached to the household chores and responsibilities. It further creates pressure on working women with issues like dual burden, work-life balance etc. Women working in the formal sector with high income and comparatively ‘secure’ jobs depend on care providers, domestic workers. There exist debates regarding the definition of domestic worker, care providers among the scholars. The push factors for women domestic workers into this work are poverty, economic insecurity, illiteracy etc

### **Objectives of the Study**

The objective lies in examining the interdependence/reliance that exists between women who have different identities and lived realities within the framework of feminist standpoint theory. The aim is to understand the negotiations, hierarchies and power relations that exist between women belonging to different class interest. Does it get reinforced and strengthened or do we find a departure and deconstruction of the same? The standpoint of marginalized holds special significance, as marginalized groups has better and critical insights into the condition of their own



oppression. Feminist standpoint theory also asserts that oppressed have less biased and comparatively clear understanding of social realities as they get less benefits from the continued existence of relations of oppression. The study would look into how the 'domestic work done' is perceived both by the domestic workers as well as householders who employ these women? It is well evident that domestic workers either live and work in the premises of a single household or get employed by multiple households on part time basis, meaning thereby these women work in the domestic setting. Work done by these women is largely seen as undervalued, unskilled and poorly regulated with loose legislative protection. Therefore, it becomes crucial to examine how the two classes of women who are the receivers and doers of that work, view it?

Another issue to analyse is how concerned are women who comparatively belong to a privileged position to the issues of domestic workers? At both the international and national level efforts are made for safeguarding the rights and interests of domestic workers such as better wages, decent work, weekly day off etc. This study aims to observe the awareness and sensitization that women householders possess for the rights of the domestic workers employed at their place. It will also try to examine the awareness about the legal provisions that domestic workers have.

### **Research Questions**

- How interdependent are women with different identities and lived realities within the framework of feminist standpoint theory?
- How does the negotiations, hierarchies and power relations affect the both the classes i.e. householders and domestic workers?
- How does the employer (householder) and the employee (women domestic workers) look at the 'domestic work done'?
- How do the women of privileged class look at the issues and challenges faced by the women domestic workers?
- Are the householders aware about the vulnerabilities of the other working women in the unorganized sector?

### **Research Methodology**

The study would consider both qualitative and quantitative framework, to describe the problems and conditions of women domestic workers in Aligarh City of Uttar Pradesh, India. It would be designed to also look into the relationship between householders and domestic workers and their acclimation to the state of employer and employee. Women domestic workers would be the subject of the study, wherein a single women domestic worker would constitute the unit of analysis. Samples would be chosen through Purposive Sampling and primary data would be directly collected from the respondents with the help of in-depth interview and focused group discussions. Secondary data may also be used which would be collected from the related books, journals, government reports, internet and from the studies which have already been conducted. The Interview schedule consists of questions related mainly to different aspects of the women

domestic workers. The methods will be followed with a feminist perspective.

## References

- Tijdens. K, Lippe. T. V. D, Ruijter. E. D. (2003), “Working Women’s Choices for Domestic Help: The Effects of Financial and Time Resources”, Amsterdam Institute of Advanced Labour Studies, University of Amsterdam
- Nair. J. (2000), “Labour Legislation and the Women Worker”, *Women and Law in Colonial India*, 95-121
- Blofield. M. (2009), “Feudal Enclaves and Political Reforms: Domestic Workers in Latin America”, *Latin American Research Review*, Vol. 44, No. 1, pp. 158-190
- Zarempka. J. (2000), “Modern Slavery: Abuse of Domestic Workers”, *Off Our Backs*, Vol. 30, No. 7, p. 12-19
- Mather. C. (2010), “Domestic Workers: their time now”, *International Union Rights*, Vol. 17, No. 4, pp. 17-19
- Pape. K, Bonner. C, Budin. B. (2011), “ILO Convention on decent work for Domestic Workers: From Promise to Reality”, *International Union Rights*, Vol. 18, No. 3, pp. 10-11
- Blackett. A. (2012), “The Decent Work for Domestic Workers Convention and Remuneration”, *The American Journal of International Law*, Vol. 106, No. 4, pp. 778-794
- Mohapatra. D. (2015), “Female Workers in the Unorganised Sector in India” *International Conference on Studies in Humanities and Social Science*, Phuket(Thailand)
- Razvi. M, Roth. L. G. (2004), “Socio-economic Development and Gender Inequality in India”, Northern Illinois University
- Rustagi. P. (2006), “Women and Poverty: Urban-Rural Dimensions”, *Institute for Human Development, IHD Working Paper Series*, No. 35, pp. 1-30
- Bhattacharya. A, “Rural Women in India; The Invisible Lifeline on Rural Community” [www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/.../RuralWomen/ArundhatiBhattacharyya.pdf](http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/HRBodies/.../RuralWomen/ArundhatiBhattacharyya.pdf)
- “Who are Domestic Workers?” [http://www.ilo.org/global/docs/WCMS\\_209773/lang-en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/global/docs/WCMS_209773/lang-en/index.htm)
- “India has highest number of people living below poverty line: World Bank” <https://www.businesstoday.in/current/economy-politics/india-has-highest-number-of-people-living-below-poverty-line-world-bank/story/238085.html>
- “47.5 lakh domestic workers set to get legal status and minimum wages” <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/policy/47-5-lakh-domestic-workers-set-to-get-legal-status-and-minimum-wages/articleshow/61108494.cms>
- “Domestic Workers in India” [http://www.wiego.org/informal\\_economy\\_law/domestic-workers-india](http://www.wiego.org/informal_economy_law/domestic-workers-india)

## **Women in Agriculture and Allied activities**

**Vaibhav Bansal**

CSIR-NISTADS

biotech\_consultant06@rediffmail.com

### **Abstract:**

Changing contour specifically means moulding into a specific shape especially designed to fit into something else. As the topic says changing contour of women's paid and unpaid work, it simply suggest that women's have to fit into employment which will come once the women empowerment takes place. Now what does empowerment means? Empowerment means typically a multifaceted, multidimensional and multilayered concept. In other words we can describe empowerment as an action and the interaction of various factors including physical, socio-economical, political, psychological and attitudinal aspects. The empowerment of women is closely related to the development of women which automatically will change the contour of the women. The extent of empowerment of women in the hierarchy is determined by three factors such as economical growth, social and political identity and their weightage. The above mentioned factors are parallelly linked and interconnected with each other which imply that efforts in even one dimension remains absent or weak, outcomes and momentum generated by the other components cannot be able to sustain as they will not be able to manage any changes and upheavals. It is only when all three factors are addressed simultaneously and made compatible with each other then the women can truly become empowered like if one gene and chromosome do not get proper linked with DNA, this missing linkage may cause mutations or formation of tumor cells.

With the growing feminization of agriculture, there is a need to develop specific strategies for women in agriculture. Apart from conferring the land rights it is also essential for MWCD to work in close collaboration with the agriculture sectors to hone and develop their skills for strengthening their capabilities and capacity so that they can access to cheap financing strategies and other inputs. It is also equally important to strengthen organic farming which is very convenient for the women. This research paper will focus on the empowerment of women's into agriculture and other allied activities and the objective will be to analyze and interpret the data which will showcase the status of women in agriculture sector. It has been revealed from the data that more understanding will be required for getting a better insight of various schemes and strategies that have been implemented to achieve the goals of women empowerment.

## **Paid and Unpaid Work of Women in Home Based Job Work in Mumbai**

**Dr Vaijayanta Anand**

Associate Professor, College of Social Work, Nirmala Niketan, Mumbai

vaijayanta\_anand@rediffmail.com

According to the Fourth Annual Employment & Unemployment report (2013-14) three in four households (78%) had no one earning a regular wage or salary. The report also mentions that no more than 16.5% of workers earn a regular wage or salary. Contract and casual work have been growing at the expense of regular employment. the increasing informality in the organized labor market has blurred distinctions between formal and informal labour.

Contrary to the promises of successive governments to generate more employment opportunities, the reality has been more uncertainty, fewer jobs and even less security. In the decade 1999-2000 to 2009-10, while GDP growth accelerated to 7.52% per annum, employment growth stayed at just 1.5%, less than the 2% annual employment growth rate seen over the four decades starting 1972-73.

Job contracts with formal agreements and legal responsibilities (at least on paper) are becoming increasingly rare: About 93% of casual workers and even 68.4% of contract workers do not have any job contracts, according to a government report. Even among more formal wage/salaried employees, about 66% are reported to be working without a written job contract.

This refers to a workforce which is without any social security and employment benefits and whose labour rights (such as maternity benefits, paid annual or sick leave, overtime pay, right to unionise, etc.) are being diluted over the years in the name of “reforms”.

the casualisation of labour and the erosion of their labour rights are not just the results of a flawed model of development. This neoliberal model of development is also made possible by this despair in the countryside and increasing informalisation of labour. The burden of this “growth”, as is evident, falls on the most disadvantaged.

The trend is that of “vulnerabilisation of the labour markets”, as G. Vijay, an assistant professor at the School of Economics University of Hyderabad, calls it, wherein vulnerable sections of the labour force are consciously chosen as they would be materially and socially compelled to accept greater deprivation with least resistance to the dehumanizing conditions of informalization. The brunt of this casualization is borne by the women, most oppressed sections of society.

According to a 2011 paper of the International Labour Organization, 83.8 % of South Asian women are engaged in so called ‘vulnerable employment’. The work that these women are doing can in most cases be qualified as ‘casual labour’, piece-work such as the manufacturing of garments and other small items, produced within the restraints of the workers’ household.

Informal labour is generally qualified by the absence of decent labour conditions as recommended by the ILO and a lack of any sort of secure and sufficient wages. Women workers present a considerable share of this so called informal workforce, a share that has in fact risen substantially over the last 20 years. Precisely this increase in the informal economy has to be critical because it mirrors the developments in the formal economy. Obviously, women's employment in the official and recognized sphere of the formal economy has to be the desired aim of any economic policy directed at women workers. But while the percentage of women employed in the informal economy remains high, the number of Indian women engaged in formal, secure and recognized labour is still minimal. Only 14-15% of workers in the formal sector are women, their numbers hardly rising over the past years.

The concept of 'Decent work' has been elaborated in the documents of ILO as based on four pillars. The four pillars are: employment opportunities, legal rights, social protection and representative voice. The women home based workers are vulnerable among all the other workers. So they don't have recognition at all, no representation and no exclusive legal framework. Home based workers don't have any other employment opportunities as they aren't part of market like other worker domestic workers, vendors or hawkers; so here they have no clue of current market position or no idea about available options to them

In the different types of home based work i.e. self employed and sub contracted, sub contracted are more vulnerable and helpless as there is nothing here that is under their control. Sub contracted have to cover many non-wage cost of production such as cost of workplace, equipments, transport and mainly absorb the risk of production which includes delayed or cancelled orders, unreliable supply of raw material and delayed payments of the work done (Chen and Sinha, 2016). The research study of the women home based workers in Mumbai too faced the similar kind of exploitation where they have to bear the risk, they don't get payment on time, some of them have to travel to occupy raw material for which they aren't reimbursed, they don't even have means to contact the agent so there is no security of work, no legal rights

The study done by Informal Economy Monitoring Study in Ahmedabad showed that most of the women workers belonged to age group 40-60. And all the women workers were married. Ela Bhatt in her book, *Grind of work* says that because of women workers majority of the times are illiterates or semi educated. Having such education, they lose their bargaining power. They lose the opportunity of getting trained or shifting to any other occupation (Bhatt, 1989). In the research study conducted by WIEGO, it was discussed that having one small room as your working place as well as your home creates a lot of disturbances for the worker to work continuously. Small house hampers productivity as they can't take raw material in bulk, she can't work continuously using the same space as it is required for some other purpose too. They have to shift in between, make space for others to do their chores and this breaks the continuity of work (Chen and Sinha, 2016).

The present paper is based on the rapid assessment study conducted in few slum pockets in Mahul near Chembur, Mumbai. Majority of the women in these slum pockets are engaged in home based job work. The rapid assessment was followed by a detail study of 50 women engaged specifically in home based job work.

Some of the findings of this study can be highlighted as follows

- Women home based workers get paid on the basis of pieces produced. This is a common practice to exploit the workers as their working hours are not considered at all. This study shows that the women workers are not even getting paid as per the minimum wages act. They are working for more than 8-9 hours a day for which they hardly get paid anything. Soft toys workers get paid 30-40 rupees a day for seven hours, for sticking diamonds or stones they get paid 60-70 per day and women involved in papad get 160 rupees a day. All of these women put in skills which involves intricate physical work. This has been the rate since last 20-25 years. Majority of the women workers are involved in this work for more than 15 years now but there is no periodic wage increase. The wages that they are receiving does not even follow minimum wages guidelines. According to Minimum wages act, there should be minimum wage of rupees 267 for unskilled factory workers.
- Salini Sinha in her study calls the home Some of the ased workers as Industrial outworkers. The industries appoint these workers as they don't have to pay high amount for working space neither do they have to pay other deserved wages to the workers (Sinha, 2013). Soft toys and papad making women are employed as a part of outwork by big companies selling soft toys and papad at a huge cost in the market whereas here women are only paid 40 rupees a kilogram.
- It is difficult to trace who the employer is. It was observed that one woman of the community itself is the work provider. She travels to the agent and get work from him. Thus, here none of the worker knew who the agent is. No one could tell that how many middlemen are involved in this and who is the end employer. Also, if the woman doesn't come to give work then the woman workers have to assume that there is no work today. There is no record maintained by the women of the work done by them and the agents do not pay the wages regularly. Majority of the women except the papad workers said that they receive the payment as and when they ask for it. They assume that the employer has paid them correctly. The agent controls the quality of work by giving it back to redo it if s/he doesn't find it up to the mark. Here because of piece rated system, women don't get paid for the hours already put in by them.
- Arjun Sengupta defines that there are chains of employers, one middleman, one who provides material and one who is the owner of the brand or the company. Here too it became difficult for to identify the employer. The person may be home based worker from within the community, who provides material to everyone. she may procure the raw material from a agent; So there can be many chains of employers here in the home based work (Sengupta, 2007). There are many connections in between but no one is aware about

them. The quality of housing here plays a vital role in women's working conditions. As a worker, she is required to have enough light and space to work. But she doesn't really get good working environment as most of these houses do not have much of sunlight during the day; so women sit on the edge of the doors of the house to get enough light. They do not turn the tube lights on because they can't really afford to pay high electricity bill, and no one is going to reimburse it later on (Sinha, 2006)

- It was also seen that these women take credit from the agent which later on, he deducts from the wages. Here women had expressed that they the agent doesn't pay wages regularly, women ask for money as and when they require it. Women workers assume that agent is keeping a perfect track of amount due to women. Now when agent gives money to women, he gives it as a credit and not as wages. Thus, agent keeps workers money with himself and gives to her as if he is giving her as credit. Women workers don't get their own money and they remain in the cycle of debts forever.

Martha Chen discusses the same in her study where she says that, "They contribute to the household budget but also, by working from home, to the care of children and the elderly, to the quality of family life, and to the social fabric of their communities. They provide goods and services at a low cost to low-income people and the general public. They also produce goods at low prices for domestic and global value chains. They do not commute every day and often go to markets on foot or by bicycle, thus, helping to reduce air pollution and traffic congestion." (Chen and Sinha, 2016)

The casualization and feminization of the labour is manifested in many ways. The complexity of women in the labour force can be understood only if the intricate web of patriarchy, vulnerability of women and the new liberalized capital economy is unraveled. Millions of women remain confined in their households in the urban and rural households engaged in drudgery of household chores which remains completely unpaid and the added drudgery of back breaking job work with very little monetary gains. She contributes immense amount of productive work adding to the GDP but believes that her work is just time pass, unworthy and does not deserve any substantial remuneration. Growing phenomenon of home based work at one stroke labels productive, skilled work as casual, unskilled piecemeal work. This phenomenon also ensures that she remains isolated, voiceless and vulnerable. The fragmentation and alienation of work force in the present economy is epitomized by these women home based job workers.

# **Role of Women in Livestock Economy**

**Vijayamba R**

Junior Research Fellow, Indian Statistical Institute, Bangalore Centre

vijayamba1201@gmail.com

## **Background**

Feminization of agriculture is a phenomenon occurring in many countries of the world. There is an increase in proportion of women working in agriculture while overall proportion of people working in agriculture is decreasing. Land concentration and land scarcity have forced men to search other options of livelihood in towns and cities. This leaves women to play a major role in day to day subsistence and in tending livestock. Women are used as a tool in the family to withdraw or increase their participation in the labour force. When the economic condition deteriorates their participation in the labour market increases and when the economic condition improves their participation in the labour market decreases.

Female work participation rates in the rural side in India have been decreasing since post liberalization in India. Literature has pointed to a number of reasons like improving economic conditions, jobless growth, rising student population ratios etc. One of the reasons that tries to explain this phenomena is the invisibility of women's work. The definition of work does not capture all the activities of women, especially in the rural areas. For home based work there is lack of reliable statistics at the national and international level. Women's work in livestock raising is one such important economic activity which is not reflected well in the data. Some of the studies have inferred that women spend a significant time of their day in livestock raising. Women do not report livestock raising as a primary activity. If it is taken as a secondary and tertiary activity then the number of women engaged in it will be much higher. The number of women engaged in animal care is undercounted and the time spent by women in animal care is not reported as economic activity in the usual surveys.

The processes of production of goods and services and production of life are integrated. In this context women's unpaid work in livestock economy plays a very important role in social reproduction of labour and sustaining the household economy. Women's labour in livestock farming help the households to obtain income, employment, nutrition and inputs for agriculture.

Income from livestock sector is a key source of income and accounts for 15-40 percent of total farm household income in the country. The decision to provide labour for livestock raising, the operational tasks that women engage in and the time they spend on it may also depend on whether the income from livestock is very important to the household or is an addition to other sources.

Livestock value chains cover all the activities required to bring a product to final consumers passing through production, processing and delivery. When livestock becomes commercialised



men tend to take over. Men have better access to information because women have various constraints like illiteracy, far away places, household responsibilities. Though women do a lot of work in livestock raising their participation in extension services and governance of village dairies seems limited. It becomes interesting to know women's participation in value chains because it is outside the home based production boundary and involves obtaining information from external agents.

## **Objectives**

- To look into the participation of women in livestock and the factors affecting it
- To analyze the income accruing to the rural households from livestock farming and its relationship to the women's participation in livestock economy.
- To understand women's participation in livestock value chains and explore the factors affecting it

## **Methodology**

### ***Secondary data sources:***

National Sample Survey Office

The Employment and Unemployment Survey collects data usual principal, subsidiary activity, time disposition for the household members. Block 7 has follow up questions for persons with usual principal status activity code 92 or 93. Question 7 is about work in household dairy/poultry and 15 is about preparation of cow dung cake. Participation of women in livestock and the factors affecting it shall be analysed using this data.

Situation Assessment Survey in block 7 collects data on disposition of produce and value of outputs on farming of animals during last 30 days and block 8 collects expenses and other particulars of inputs on farming of animals during last 30 days. Income accruing to the rural households from livestock farming and its relationship to the women's participation in livestock economy shall be looked into from this data set.

### ***Primary data sources:***

Women's participation in livestock value chains shall be understood from case studies of two villages in the state of Karnataka. In 2016-17 Karnataka ranked 5th in the country with 15,185 number of Dairy Co-operative societies. It ranked second in producer members (in thousands) with 2463 after Gujarat which was 3456. With respect to milk procurement (thousand kgs/day) Karnataka ranked second with 6549 after Gujarat which was 18203 (NDDB 2017).

In 2012 the district wise density of livestock (no per sq km) in Mandya was 225 and in Kolar it was 203. Out of the 30 districts in Karnataka Mandya ranked 2nd and Kolar ranked 6th in this indicator. The total milk production (bovine and goat) in '000 MT in 2012 -13 was 287 in

Mandya which ranked the 4th highest and for Kolar it was 279 which ranked the 5th highest. (NDDB 2015).

Primary data for the study shall be collected from the state of Karnataka in one village of Kolar, Siresandra and one village of Mandya district, Alabujanahalli respectively. The village in Kolar is a semi dry village belonging to eastern Karnataka- Southern Plateau and Hills Region. It is a rain fed village supplemented by means of bore wells and drip irrigation. It is just 13 kilometres away from the Kolar Chikkaballapura district Co-operative Milk Producers Union Ltd (KOMUL). The village in Mandya is a wet village belonging to Cauvery irrigated region of Karnataka. Canals from Krishnarajasagar dam irrigate the village.

## **In Pursuit of a Brighter Tomorrow: Women's negotiations to work in a resettlement colony of Delhi**

**Yogita Naruka**

PhD Research Fellow, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai

yogitanaruka.88@gmail.com

This paper explores the struggles and negotiations of women in a resettlement colony to work and strive towards better lives as well as self-autonomy. It emerges from the ethnographic study done in a Bawana resettlement colony that came into existence post-demolition of one of the oldest slum clusters of Delhi thriving on the banks of River Yamuna. Relocation of slum dwellers to the periphery of the city was not mere physical marginalisation but also a major disruption to their livelihoods and employment opportunities. While most of the men either lost their jobs or struggled to travel distances to continue their old jobs, the majority of women were left with no sources of income of their own. Later, women managed to find jobs in the factories that came up in the vicinity of the colony. While mid-aged women continued in factories even at low wages, young women of the settlement explored newer and better opportunities that are less exploitative than workspaces like factories. This paper hence moves beyond the general discussion around struggles of women in work relating to working hours, wages etc. and brings out the aspirations of young women to explore newer work opportunities. The paper, therefore, has been divided into two broad sections. While the first section explores the struggles of women in exploring work opportunities post-resettlement, the second section focuses particularly on young women of the community and their aspirations to move into more structured workspaces with better job security. However, their physical, as well as social marginality, continually challenge these aspirations. These women, however, continue to negotiate and quest for a better future for them. The narratives hence reflect a transition of women of different generations from informal to formal work opportunities. Negotiations of young women also inform us about the ways young community members interact with the city from their marginal geographies and reaffirm their identity. Further, the choices of work that women make at present in the colony reflect strongly upon their aspiration for a newer form of living style and social identity, resembling that of urban middle class. Hence, this paper through an extensive analysis of the work preferences of young women and their constant struggle to make their ways into formal labour market aims to contribute to the existing literature on women and work.

### **Background**

Delhi has transformed rapidly over past decade. The city is the locus of economic and political activity and has always taken a centre stage in the urban development scenario of the country. However, past few years have been critical in the infrastructural development of the city. The

narrative of transforming Delhi into 'world-class' city gained momentum in 2003 when Delhi won the bid to host Commonwealth Games 2010. This agenda of 'world-class' city has guided most of the infrastructural projects since then and there has been significant thrust on developing city's street level infrastructure similar to that of international cities such as Paris and London. Slums obviously were a blot on this new imagery of the city and were needed to be removed.

Yamuna slum cluster was a prominent stretch of slums situated on the floodplains of River Yamuna that housed almost 35,000 working class families and a population of 1, 50,000. Almost 70% of these families were Muslims. The majority of the population residing in these slums belonged to the category of construction workers, who had been brought to Delhi by labour contractors during the Asian Games in 1992 (Bhan and Menon-Sen 2008). In addition to construction workers, there was a substantial population of wage labourers and informal workers like rag-pickers, rickshaw pullers, head-loaders and domestic workers, largely migrated from Bihar and Uttar Pradesh.

In the year 2004, this settlement was demolished for being a cause of increasing pollution in the Yamuna River and an illegal encroachment on the riverside. Demolitions were also aggressively pushed by then Union Minister of Culture and Tourism, Mr Jagmohan through his grandiose plan to build a Promenade along the riverside as a major attraction for tourists in Delhi. To fulfil these aesthetic agendas for Delhi, he recycled the language of dirt, disgust and beautification to paint an illegal picture of Yamuna Pushta slum dwellers (Mehra and Batra 2006). He eventually succeeded in clearing off this settlement by April 2004. Post demolition, evictees were resettled to three sites, Bawana, Holambi Kalan and Madanpur-Khadar, all of which were almost 30 km away from Yamuna Pushta slum settlement.

Resettlement resulted in the loss of employment and livelihood crisis for the majority of people in Bawana since it was at a distance of about 30 km from the Yamuna Pushta. After the resettlement people faced difficulty in travelling regularly to their earlier work locations. In the initial phase, there were no factories and other employment opportunities available in the Bawana town. Even if some work opportunities were available, the wages were substantially low here. This forced many people to continue their earlier jobs through regular travel. Travelling regularly to the workplace was not only time consuming for people but it added to a lot of physical hardship as people usually travelled in extremely uncomfortable ways.

Women were severely affected by relocation as they could hardly find any work opportunities in the vicinity and their earlier jobs were not accessible enough now. Later they found jobs in factories where working conditions were not conducive and wages were considerably low. Women who work in factories share that there are evident instances of discrimination in the factory spaces. Factory owners look down upon the people from the Bawana resettlement colony and they label them as 'colony people' in derogatory ways. They especially label women from the

colony as having 'low character' and consider that hiring women from Bawana colony would degrade the working environment. Padhi (2007) explains that many women were forced to enter in sex work and illicit distribution and brewing of liquors in the community post-resettlement. This has resulted in labelling of women from community as 'bad' or 'ill-charactered' and not being preferred to work in factories.

Further there are very limited home-based opportunities available to women. While in the Yamuna Pushta women had access to home-based work through nearby garment manufacturing units, in Bawana there were no such options. Whatever limited work is available is extremely physically exhausting and low paid. Few women who are involved in home-based work get it from the middlemen and are paid as low as paid Rs. 80/- for making 1000 pieces in which usually more than one member of the family is involved.

Educated young women however do not wish to enter into the jobs of factories and look for better employment prospects outside the community. They explore the opportunities available to them in the 'city'. The opportunities available to them includes sales person in malls, front office persons in institutions or companies, in restaurants as waiter/waitress. Young women find such opportunities as more dignified than working in the factories. Also, they feel that these opportunities can help them to escape the circle of poverty.

However, there are numerous challenges that stand in their way as they try to make their way in to alternative careers. First amongst is their physical marginality. Being situated at the margins of the city, travel time coupled with limited modes of transportation emerges as the biggest challenge. Anand & Tiwari (2006) argue that an accessibility as well as relatively lesser travel time to the workspaces increases the poor women's capability to earn and balance their work and household responsibility. However, a lack of reliable transport means to work place and more distance limits their capacities thereby bringing a significant drop in family's income and pushing the families into the circle of poverty more rapidly.

Social marginality and stigmatised identity of 'slum dweller', 'people from JJ colony', or 'colony people' also impacts young women's chances to find work opportunities. Young women share that they are often denied job opportunities due to stigmatised identity of being a resident of JJ colony. Discrimination for being a resident of a resettlement colony continues to haunt them. Discrimination might not be overt as earlier but still the people from community specifically the young men and women has to bear the stereotype of being a resident a resettlement colony. The discrimination has taken very subtle forms but it is still very much prevalent in the everyday life of people.

Young women in addition to physical and social marginality also bear the street sexual harassment and gender based stereotypical labelling from neighbours. Even as they negotiate the

barriers of travel and discrimination, fear of being harassed by alcoholic men, drug abusers on streets inside the community and men from nearby Bawana residential colony constantly disturbs them. In addition, most of the girls also have to face comments and derogatory remarks from other men and women from community who believe that girls going to at faraway places as morally incorrect. However, young girls continually challenge these stereotypes and persist for their self-autonomy.

## **Objectives**

In this paper, using the narratives of women from Bawana resettlement colony, I intend to initiate a discussion around following:

- Impact of resettlement on the livelihoods of women and their struggles for securing income new geographical locations that are usually at the periphery of the city.
- The way young women intend to break the cycle of poverty and aim towards their financial independence by escaping the informal labour market and making inroads into formal labour market by consistently negotiating with the challenges and restrictions that come in their way.
- What do new work preferences of young women inform us about the changing labour market scenario of the resettlement communities?

## **Research Methodology**

It is an ethnographic study spread over a period of three months in the field. The study aimed to explore aspirations of people and their struggles post-resettlement through close observation of their everyday life and detailed life narratives. My entry into the field was facilitated by a NGO, Jagori, working with women of urban resettlement colonies with the aim of supporting women's leadership and work with women's collectives through various participatory approaches like action research projects, resource mapping, social and safety audits and public hearing. My fieldwork entailed detailed interactions with the people in the community especially women about their experiences of demolition, resettlement and changes it brought in their lives. A prominent focus of enquiry was also on the changes that people have experienced with the community itself since they settled here at first after resettlement. These narratives of change capture the physical, social, economic and cultural developments that have taken place over the period of time. During my fieldwork, I have specifically spent time with young men and women of the colony to understand their aspirations regarding their career work and future lives. Their narratives reflect strongly on the way they continually challenge their stigmatised identity of 'slum dwellers' or colony people' and strive to make inroads to the formal labour market with decent jobs and formal education system. During my fieldwork, I have made use of tools such as interviews, focus group discussion and participatory research techniques such as social and opportunities mapping.

## References

- Anand, A., & Tiwari, G. (2006). A Gendered Perspective of the Shelter–Transport–Livelihood Link: The Case of Poor Women in Delhi. *Transport Reviews* , 63-80.
- Bhan, G., & Menon-Sen, K. (2008). *Swept Off the Map: Surviving Eviction and Resettlement in Delhi*. New Delhi: Yoda Press.
- Delhi Development Authority. (2007). *Master Plan for Delhi- 2021*. Delhi: Delhi Development Authority.
- Mehra, D., & Batra, L. (2006). Neoliberal Delhi Through the Lens of the Yamuna Pushta Demolitions. Retrieved November 25, 2015, from Academia : [https://www.academia.edu/1528598/Neoliberal\\_Delhi\\_Through\\_the\\_Lens\\_of\\_the\\_Yamuna\\_Pushta\\_Demolitions](https://www.academia.edu/1528598/Neoliberal_Delhi_Through_the_Lens_of_the_Yamuna_Pushta_Demolitions)
- Padhi, R. (2007). Forced Evictions and Factory Closures: Rethinking Citizenship and Rights of Working Class Women in Delhi. *Indian Journal of Gender Studies* , 73-91.

**TISS Mumbai**

V.N. Purav Marg, Deonar  
Mumbai 400 088, Maharashtra

**TISS Tuljapur**

Post Box No. 9, Tuljapur 413 601  
Osmanabad District, Maharashtra

**TISS Guwahati**

Tetalia Road, Behind Assam Science and Technology  
University, Jalukbari, Guwahati, Assam, 781013

**TISS Hyderabad**

SR Sankaran Block,  
TSIPARD Campus, Rajendranagar, Hyderabad



A Deemed University, established under  
Section 3 of the UGC Act, 1956

**[www.tiss.edu](http://www.tiss.edu)**